

4

THE ORTHODOX FAITH AND WAY TO THE CHVRCH

Explained and iustified :

IN ANSWER TO A POPISH
Treatise, entituled, *WHITE DIED BLACKE*;
wherein *T. W. P.* in his triple accusation of *D. White* for im-
postures, vnttruths, and absurd illations, is proued a trisler : And the
present controuersies betweene vs and the Romanists are
more fully deliuered and cleared,

By *FRANCIS WHITE* Doctor in Diuinitie and Deane of Carlile,
elder brother of Doctor *IOHN WHITE*.

The second Edition, enlarged by the Author.

CYPRIAN. Epist. 40.

*Qui mandatum Dei rejciunt, & traditionem suam statuere conantur, firmiter à vobis
& fortiter respuantur.*

CHRYZ. in Genes. hom. 5.

Κατακαλύψετε τὰς τῆς οὐραίας χάριτος, καὶ τῆς ἀποκαλύψεως τῆς ἀληθείας τὴν πνευματικὴν ἀσπίδα.

AUG. de Genes. ad lit. lib. 2. cap. 1.

Nullus reprehensor formidandus est amatori veritatis.



Printed at LONDON by *John Hauiland* for
WILLIAM BARRET. 1624.



TO
THE RIGHT
REVEREND FATHER
IN GOD, *RICHARD* LORD
BISHOP OF LINCOLNE,
My honourable Diocesan.



Ight Reuerend Father, it were no small happinesse to the Christian world, if true Religion might reigne as a Law, vnthwarted and not opposed, and the Orthodox faith, being perplexed and obscured by no questions and cauils, were onely published and not disputed.

For Religion and Faith may not vnfitly bee resembled to streames, or Wells of water, which of themselues being pure and wholesome, become muddie when they are troubled: so the former are made lesse pure, and many times defiled by tumult and contention. And euen as in inundation of waters, fields and medowes adioining are turned into mire: So when contention (compared by Salomon to the ouerflowing of waters, Prou. 17. 14) ouerspreadeth the greene Pastures of sacred truth, sundry parts of godlinesse are laid waste, and some filth of error adhereth to the same.

THE EPISTLE

Publius Minus,
Nimium altercan-
do veritas amitti-
tur.

* De Gen. ad lit.
lib. 9. cap. 8.

* Euseb. vita Con-
stantin. l. 3. c. 60.
& l. 3. c. 13. Greg.
Nazian. apol. su-
ge. Socrat. hist.
eccles. l. 1. c. 3. So-
zomen. hist. l. 1.
c. 15.
* Chrys. in Gala.
cap. 1.

* Hist. Rom. l. 3.
num. 8. pag. 353.

Auent. annal.
Boior. l. 7. p. 547.

Otho. Frising.
chron. l. 6. c. 36.
p. 127.

Contentions in Religion produce innumerable evils, whereof these are remarkable. First, while people are rapt into factions by heat and humour of contention, the very grounds and maxims of Religion vse to be shaken, and scarce any thing is left settled and indubitate (so farre as the subtiltie and pride of mans wit can preuaile.) Next, whiles one partie hastily opposeth another, it falleth out so, that each of them looking towards the aduerse Toner, doe proceed to some contrarie extremitie of doctrine, as dangerous many times, or perhaps more than that which they oppugne. And in this case it is verified which S. Augustine saith: * *It is difficult or hard for men, whiles they auoid one extremitie, not to runne peruersly into another.* Also, discord reproacheth and disgraceth Religion, and exposeth Christian faith to the opprobrie and derision of the world. By reason of that distraction which happened about the Heresie of Arius, the Fathers report that Christian Religion was brought vpon the Stage, and made ridiculous to the Pagans *. And Chrysostome saith *: *For this cause are we become a reproach to Iewes and Gentiles, because the Church is rapt into a thousand factions.*

The same also hath caused States and Common-wealths more vnwilling to harbour Religion. Libanius the Sophister, and other Pagans tooke occasion to incense Iulian to the extirpation of Christianitie, because the Empire was so much molested by the contentions of Christians. And Ammianus Marcellinus * reporteth, that the same Iulian was wont to say in reproach of Christians: *That no sauage beasts were so cruell one to another, as Christians were among themselves.* And vpon this occasion also was hee the more enraged against them. And Kingdomes and Common-wealths are sometimes embroyled and shaken asunder by discord happening about Religion. In the daies of Hildebrand, who raised a notorious schisme in the West Church, a Popish Bishop (alleged by Auentine) saith as followeth: *All right is confounded, and lawes are perished; there is no faith among men, no peace, no humanitie, no shame, no securitie, no gouernment, no rest from euils: All the world is in an vprore, and together by the eares; Cities and Countries are in armes, &c.* Otho Frising. (a credible Historian) reporteth: that the Christian world was enuolued in
so

DEDICATORIE.

so many miseries, embroiled with such mischiefe, oppressed with so great perils, and consumed with so lamentable destruction, arising from Ecclesiasticall tyrannie and discord; that nothing could be added to the present calamitie, and the horrible confusion of the times might well haue beene compared to the darknesse of Egypt. And our Countriman Thomas Walsingham in his Chronicle saith, that two hundred thousand people were slaine in the Garboile which followed vpon the schisme of Popes.

Tho. Walsing.
hist. Angl. in
Henric. 4. p. 420.

And besides the former euils of contention, these which follow are not to bee forgotten. First, Religion and faith, which of all other things should bee most certaine and indubitate, whiles it is questioned, beginneth to be doubted of: and discord in Religion nourisheth certaine seeds of Atheisme. Secondly, as plants which are often remoued, cannot take root and prosper; so points of faith and pietie, being remoued out of their old standing, or bended this way and that way, beginne to lose their reuerence and stabilitie in the soules of men. Thirdly, as in building, so in contention, one opponent gainsayng another, plucketh downe that which by a common labour and consent hath great need to bee builded vp. Fourthly and lastly, as it is impossible to follow guides whose backs are each to other, and their faces looke a contrarie way: so Gods people, whose right is to be lead by their spirituall guides, in one beaten path of faith and godlinesse, are with perill of their saluation distracted, (not knowing what to doe) when their leaders call them contrarie waies.

In regard of these and many other the like effects, it were greatly to be desired, that vnitie and concord, a chiefe badge and ensigne of true Christians, *Ioh. 13. 35.* and the maintainer of the safetie and prosperitie of the Church, might by some godly meanes or other, be established in the Christian world.

There is in these our daies a grieuous diuision, and a wall of partition among the Christians of the Western Region. The Pontificians of the one party, and the reformed Churches of the other, are in hostilitie: and it cannot be denied, but that the same threatneth perill to all parts, and the contention in regard of one partie, is vicious and faultie.

THE EPISTLE

Our Aduersaries complaine and accuse vs, that wee haue made and doe continue the breach. On the contrary, our conscience and deeds, together with the deportment of the Romists, and the publike Doctrines and proceeding of our Church, doe iustifie vs before God and men, that wee are innocent of this distraction. I am able to obserue onely two causes of the breach and diuision betweene vs, the one is about doctrine and manner of diuine worship, the other concerning the Monarchie of the Pope.

Durand. 4. d. 11.
q. 3. Quamuis sit
commune dictum
multorum, tamen
ex quo non est per
Ecclesiam confir-
matum, licitum
est opinari oppo-
situm.

Touching doctrine, I offer these particulars to consideration : 1. Sundry Articles about which our aduersaries and we contend, are not defined, at least explicitly, by the Romane Church ; and therefore it is vncertaine in what degree of difference we stand, touching these points. 2. Their Doctors and Schoolemen are not concordious and vniforme in their Tenet of those articles, about which they contend with vs : Whereby it appeareth, that their faith of the said articles is vncertaine. 3. In the most questions there be some great and eminent Pontificians, which in substance of matter agree with vs. 4. Precedent Churches doe not successiually and with an vnanimous consent, condemne any article of the publike doctrine which we maintaine.

Bernard. Anselm.
Prolog. cap. 10.
Iustus est, non
quia nobis reddit
debitum, sed quia
facit, quod decet
te summe bonum.
a De Trad. part.
3. de imag.
b Altifiod. sum.
l. 3. tr. 8. c. 4. q. 5.
Latria non debet
exhiberi nisi se-
cundum regulam
fidei : vnde men-
surari debet secun-
dum symbolum
fidei. Nisi habeat
illa conditiones
quae sunt in sym-
bolo, scilicet pa-
ternitatem & om-
nipotentiam, &c.
simpliciter prohi-
bitum est exhibere
latriam, pure
creatura.

And in the Popish doctrine I doe yet further obserue,
1. That moderne Pontificians maintaine sundry articles op-
posite to that which hath formerly bin beleeued by the most
eminent Doctors of the Romane Church. And among other
points, Bernard and Anselme directly oppose and condemne
the *merit of condignitie*, which all the Iesuits doe now pro-
pugna. Also it was the common Tenet of the Schoolemen
(as Peresius Ajala confesseth ^a :) that Images were onely
motuum obiectum, an inducing meanes, to moue people to
adore the Samplar, and no materiall obiect of adoration:
and Altifiodore saith ^b : *It is simply unlawfull to exhibit latria,*
or diuine adoration to any pure creature ; and diuine worship must
be measured by the Creed, and whatsoever thing wanteth paterni-
tie and omnipotencie, according to the first article of the Creed,
may not be adored with latria.

2. Sundry Popish assertions now obtruded, are manifestly
repugnant to the Tenet of the Primitiue Church ; to wit,
That

DEDICATORIE.

That the Popes iudgement is infallible : That hee is Lord ouer the whole Church, &c. That the publike Seruice of the Church doth best edifie in an vnknown language : That Lay-men may not without Papall licence reade the holy Scripture, &c. The Oecumenicall Councell of Ephesus^c, writeth in this manner to the Emperours, Theodosius and Valentinian: *Your Maiesties desiring that pietie may be confirmed, haue enioined the holy Synod to make a more exact prooffe of the Doctrines propounded, &c.* Hereby it appeareth, that in those daies, not onely particular Bishops and Popes, but the whole body and state of the Clergie were so farre subiect to Princes, as that these had externall authoritie to enioine and command them to serue Christ Iesus in their callings.

^c Concil. Ephes.
edit. Peltan. to. 4.
cap. 10.

3. Many of our aduersaries opinions are improbable, vnreasonable, and absurd. *The Scripture* (saith Cardinall Cusanus^d) *bath no greater authoritie to binde or absolue the faithfull, than the Church will. The definition of the Pope* (saith Gretsar) *is as authenticall as the sacred Scripture*^e. *Fornication in the Clergie* (saith Pighius) *is a smaller offence than mariage*^f. *To worship Images is meritorious*^g. *When the Pope deliuereth a definitiue sentence touching faith, the Spirit of God assisteth him infallibly in his conclusion, but not in his premises*^h. *He may privately thinke, teach, and write Heresie*ⁱ, and yet in his Consistorie he shall alwaies sententiate and define veritie. Hee may bee a lad of ten yeeres old^k, an ignorant and vnlettered Gull, vnable to write his owne name, or to vnderstand Grammar; and yet he is the sole Authentike Iudge of Controuersies in Religion, and the whole Church is obliged vpon the greatest penaltie, to beleue his definition. And in this case the Church is not gouerned by new Reuelation.

^d Cusan. Epist. 2.
ad Bohem. pag.
834.

^e Gretf. def. Bel-
larm. de Scriptu.
p. 1457.

^f Pigh. contr.
Ratisbon. loc. 15.

^g Andrad. orthod.
explic. lib. 9. pag.
284.

^h Stapl. Relect.
contr. 4. q. 2. no-
tab. 4. Caus. loc.
theol. 1. 6. c. 8.

ⁱ Bosius de sig.
Eccles. 1. 18. c. 6.

^k Caietan de au-
thor. Pap. & Con-
cil. cap. 9. Ban-
ner, Azor. Greg.
Val. Gretsar, &c.

^l Reade after-
wards in this
booke. p. 54. and
p. 64. Calland.

de offic. boni viri,
p. 39. De fide in
Christum mortu-
um & resuscita-
tum, de charitatē

Deo & proximo
collocanda, con-
trouersia nulla est.

Porro in his duo-
bus capitulis pie-
tatis summa con-
sistit, &c.

* They lay to our
charge, that wee
hold, God to bee
the author of sin.

That a regenerate
person hath not
free will. That iu-
stified people are
not inwardly clen-
sed from mortall

4. Some of our aduersaries (more ingenuous than their fellowes) confesse, that we beleue and hold the foundation, the summe of pietie, or maine and vitall matter of Religion.

Now in regard of the premises, it appeareth that our aduersaries haue no iust cause to embroile and disturbe the Christian world, and in hostile and barbarous manner to deale with vs for matter of Doctrin: considering that if they doe not falsifie our Tenet^{*}, and impose that vpon

sinne by grace. That Sacraments doe not conferre grace. That the Church militant is a Platonicall Idea. That every priuate and vnlearned Christian is a iudge of Controuersies, and an interpreter of Scripture. That the true Church visible hath no authoritie to determine controuersies of faith. That the Eucharist is onely a figure of Christ his presence, and an empty signe. That good works are not means of saluation. That we yeld no honour to the blessed Virgin, and other Saints, &c.

VS

vs which wee are free from, wee maintaine no publike doctrine, but such as hath formerly beene reputed Orthodox and Catholike: and is either necessarily, or at leastwise with greater probabilitie and apparence of truth, deriued from sacred Scripture, and from the Primitiue Councils and Fathers, than the aduerse Tenet defended by them.

The matter then, which principally and without present hope of reconciliation diuideth Christendome, is the pride and vsurpation of the Pope. And no doubt other doctrinall controuersies are subtilly kept on foot, to be a stalking horse for this.

When these maximes and theorems ensuing be considered, let each impartiall Reader reuolue with himselfe what is the true cause of the discord whereof I speake.

No Chapter, no booke (of holy Scripture) is Canonically but by the Popes authoritie.*

The Pope may place the (fabulous) booke of Hermes and Clement his Constitutions, among Canonically Scripture.*

The Roman Pontifex, by the right of true Religion, may command all men, touching all their particular affaires and actions, and he is the Lord of all temporall things^a. Who am I, or what is my fathers house (saith Pope Innocent 3.) that I should reigne more excellent than Kings, and hold the throne of glory? For it is spoken to me by the Prophet, Ierem. 1. I haue set thee ouer Nations and ouer Kingdomes, to root out and to pull downe, to destroy and to throw downe, &c.*

He is that statue in Daniel, which shall crush in peeces all the Kingdomes of the earth^b.

The Pope may depose Kings, (saith Thomas Bosius) for iust causes, and without any cause; because they be ignominious; yea, for their age, and for an iniurie offered to one Abbot^c.

It belongeth to Romish Bishops (saith our Countreiman Sanders) to pronounce the King an Heretike, and to declare that his subiects are exempt from yeelding all future obedience to him: and they (Popish Bishops) are to doe their endeouours, that some other may bee enthroned in his seat; and if subiects will not proceed herein according as they ought, (traiterously) then the Pa-

* Greg. 7. Apud Baron. tom. 11. an. 1076. Num. 33.

* Stapl. Relect. controuers. 5. quest. 2. artic. 4. pag. 514.

* Bosius de ruinis gentium, l. 1. c. 18.

* Innocent. 3. d. consecr. pontif. Max. serm. 2. p. 189.

^b Bosius de sig. Eccles. l. 17. c. 3. Ocho. Frising. chron. l. 6. c. 36. Romanum imperium, ferro in Daniele comparatum, pedes ex parte ferreos, ex parte fictiles habuit, donec à lapide præciso de monte sine manibus, excisum subruetur. Quid enim aliud lapidem sine manibus excisum, quam Ecclesiam, &c? Hæc, regnum, circa finem mundi quem pedes significant, ferreum propter martem, fictile propter conditionem, in ea parte quæ infirmior fuit percussit: dum Regem orbis non tanquam Dominum orbis uideri, sed tanquam de limbo, propter humilem conditionem factum fictilem, gladio anathematis ferire docuit. Ipsa uero quæ antea parua fuit, & humilis, in quantum monentem exciuerit, iam uideri potest, &c.

* Bosius de sig. lib. 17. cap. 4. pag. 406.

DEDICATORIE.

stors are to procure by any meanes whatsoever (poison, Gunpowder, massacre, &c.) that he which sits in the chaire of pestilence (the Lords anointed) may no longer reigne ^d.

^d Sander. de vi-
fib. Monarch. l. 2.
c. 4.

And what distaineth the King and maketh him an Heretike, or worthy of this fatall blow? *Hereseos incusatur & damnatur Fredericus, quod inter alia, Romanum Pontificem, ipsum anathematis vinculo astringere non potuisse dixerit* (saith Fazellus ^e: (The Emperour) Fredericke is accused and condemned of Heresie, because among other sayings hee affirmed, that the Romane Pope could not anatheumatize, (or by his curses deprive him of his imperiall dignitie.)

^e Fazell. de reb.
Sicul. l. 8. c. 2. p.
443. Vide Vesperg.
chron. an. 1012.
pag. 241.

And Papirius Masson saith: *The Pope being transported with vehement hatred* ^{*}, sent into France a certaine Archdeacon, with Breeues containing direfull censures, to be published against Philip then King, if he would not acknowledge himselfe subiect to Pope Boniface, as well in things ciuill and temporall, as in spirituall ^f.

^{*} Maiore odio in-
census, &c.

^f Papir. Masson.
de episc. vrb. l. 5.
vita Bonificij 8

Nicholas Saunders also saith: *The King ought to be deposed, if he will not blade it for Christ, Mat. 26. 25.* (that is, for the Popes tyrannie and lust) also if hee permit diuorces, or affirme vsurie to be lawfull, &c. Or if within his owne dominions he restrain the horrible and importable exactions and oppressions of the Pope: or if the King will not come at his call ^h: Or if he doe impair the immunities of the Romane Church: (that is, among the rest, will not permit Ecclesiasticall and religious persons to be lawlesse and exempt from ciuill obedience:) Or if he violate Sanctuaries, that is, doe not tolerate theeves and villanes when they runne to Cardinals houses, or other priuiledged places, thereby to euade the iust penaltie of their demerits ⁱ: Lastly, if the Emperour or King chance to tread awry in exhibiting complement to the Pope, it may hazard his safetie. Fazellus reporteth as followeth ^k:

^g Sander. de visib.
Monarch. l. 2. c. 4.
Pro Christo stringere, &c.
Theoderic. Niem.
de schis. papar. l. 2.
c. 7. Vltra palam
in curia Romana
exercebantur, &
non reputabatur
peccatum.

Torniel. annal. p.
161. A pontif.
maximo fuit dis-
pensatum, cum E-
manuele Portu-
gallicæ Rege, vt
duas successiue
sorores duceret: &
cum Katherina
Ferdinandi, &
Elizabethæ Re-
gum Hispaniarum
filia, vt successiue
duobus nubere
fratribus, Angliæ
Principibus.

^h Tho. Walsing-
ham. hist. Anglor.
in Edward. 2. pag.
79. Gulielm. Nu-
brig. hist. Angl. l. 2.
c. 16. Centum ho-
micidia inter fines
Angliæ à clericis
commissa (sub
Henrico secundo,
&c.) Tot millia

Fredericke came to Rome at the Popes appointment ^{*}, to whom Gregory (as the manner was) offered his right foot to be kissed by him. The Emperour (whether of ignorance or pride it is vncertaine) did scarce touch the Popes knees with his lips. This discourtesie entred (as it was meet) so deeply into the Popes breast,

talium, &c. ⁱ Papir. Masson. de Episc. vrbis l. 5. in Urbano 5. Scelerati homines grauissimis facinoribus perpetratis, ad Cardinalium domos fugere solent, legum nodis, & digno supplicio eximebantur. ^k Fazellus de rebus Sicul. l. 8. c. 2. p. 439. ^{*} Ex decreto Pontificis, Cui cum de more, &c. (a principio non fuit sic) Erroris lapsus, an superbia, incertum. Alius vt par erat in Pontificis, animo infederat, quia vt vnquam excidere potuerit.

that

¹ Sander. de visib.
Monarch. l. 2. c. 4.
Elizei gladius vi-
timo loco nume-
ratur, velut quem
effugere nemo
possit, etiam si
gladium vel Ala-
helis, vel Iehu ef-
fugerit: sic spiri-
tualis potestatis
censura evitari
nullo modo po-
test.

Baron. annal. rom.
13. anno 1196.
num. 14.

that he could neuer forget it, &c. And what might be the se-
quell thereof, (besides the storie it selfe) let the doctrine of
Nicholas Saunders¹ resolute vs, who saith: *Elizeus his sword*
is mentioned in the last place, (1 King. 19. 17.) as being such
which no man can escape, although hee haue escaped the sword of
Asabel and Iehu: euen so, the censure of the spirituall power can
by no meanes be auoided. And Cardinall Baronius hath a me-
morable sentence in maintenance of a most immane and
vnnaturall act against the Emperour. When young Henry re-
belled against his father, and deposed him from the Empire,
brought him (his father) to his end; and for five yeeres after his
death kept him vnburied: Who (saith Baronius) can denie but that
this was an eminent worke of pietie? And you haue no more cause
to blame this sonne, than to accuse one for putting bonds vpon his
father when he is mad, furious, and frantike, by meanes of some
deadly ague.

And from hence it may appeare, that the proper and ade-
quate cause of the discord and diuision of the Westernne Regi-
on of the world in matter of Religion, is the ambition of the
Romane Pontifex, and the pernicious doctrine of his fautors
and parasites*, held on foot to support the Papall throne.

There bee some which forbear not to censure Diuines of
our part, for continuing the breach in Christendome, and
maintaining controuersies in Religion. But I entreat these
censors indifferently to consider; 1. That the truth which
wee maintaine, is the common right of all Gods people as
well as our owne, and that in defence thereof, wee passe not
the bounds of our calling. 2. Other states of men are as
liable to the oppression of the Pope as the Clergie, and as vn-
able to beare it. 3. Let them repute with themselves, the acts
both of present and elder times. Could his excellent Maie-
stie (whose abundant clemencie his very aduersaries cannot dis-
semble*) bee permitted within his owne dominions, after
the most hatefull and mischieuous treason that euer was na-
med vpon earth, to impose an oath of ciuill obedience and
externall loyaltie vpon his owne subiects? And with what
impudencie, spight and folly, did the Romists oppose his iust
and necessary proceeding in this case?

But ascend wee to former ages: Were the States of this
Realme

* Papir. Masson.
de Episcopis vrbis.
l. 6. in Leo 10. re-
hearseth the speeches
of Leo, saying: Te
non tam quasi
Pontificem maxi-
mum quam vt
Principem Roma-
num, id est, Re-
gem omnium Re-
gem.

* Master Brierly
Apologie prefat,
pag. 8. We cannot
without note of
more than barba-
rous ingratitude but
acknowledge, that
under reuerendesse
and our gracious
disposition, whereby
since his Highnesse
first came into so
great opposition a-
gainst vs of the
state and time; we
haue yet neuerthe-
less bene (in re-
spect of former
times) mildly for-
borne, or but spar-
ingly dealt withall,
&c.

DEDICATORIE.

able or willing to endure the grieuous and continuall pillage and oppression of the Pope in this Kingdome? Surely, they complaine in Matthew Paris in these termes: *Satius nobis mori, &c.* It were more desirable for vs to die, than to liue in this oppression. And, England is become as a Vineyard, which the wild Boare (the Pope) hath rooted vp. Our Lord the Pope hath deuoured vs with his rauinous iawes, &c.

Rex Anglie Vallus Pope. Mar. Paris. pa. 844.

Now forasmuch as the calling of Bishops and Ministers in the Church, is to bee watchmen, 2 Tim. 4. 5. And spirituall combatants and souldiers against the enemies of truth, 1 Tim. 1. 18. they are not reprobable when they discharge that dutie wherewith they be intrusted. Chrysostome* hath a memorable exhortation to the performance of this dutie, saying: *Execute these things which concerne thine office, giuing occasion of discord to none. But if thou perceivest godlinesse to be impeached, then preferre not concord before veritie, but with a generous minde persist vnto death.* And Cyprian: *Boni militis est, &c.* It is the dutie of a good Souldier, to defend the Fortresse against the enemies and rebels of his Emperour. And holy Scripture declareth by Esau his example, that it is a perillous matter for one to forgoe his right in diuine things, for hee did for euer, and without recouerie, lose his birthright, because he once gaue place to the losse of it.

* Sup. Rom. hom. 22. Cassander de offic. boni viri. In concordia & pace concilianda; id cauendum ne quævis tranquillitas & quies (quæ etiam in summa seruitute & corruptissimo Ecclesiæ statu esse possit) pro Christiana pace suscipiatur. Ea enim demum vera, solida, & Christiana pax est, quæ cum Dei gloria & voluntatis eius executione coniuncta, & ab omni corruptela cælestis doctrinæ & diuini cultus distincta est.

This instruction and resolution (right Reuerend Father) hath wrought impression in mee. I neuer intended (being conscious to my selfe of many wants) to haue appeared in publike, disputing controuersies, but purposed to leaue this taske to persons of better abilitie. Neuerthelesse, occasionally, and through extraordinarie prouocation of a clamorous Pontifician, who hath beyond all measure insulted ouer a dead man, I am compelled (after a sort) to bee contentious. Saint Ambrose* saith: *Qui non repellit à socio iniuriam si potest, tam est in vitio quàm ille qui facit.* He which repelleth not an iniurie from his fellow, if he be able, is in fault as well as the other which offereth wrong. But a Brother, and the same such a one as suffereth wrong for a iust defence of truth, is more to bee regarded than any companion or common friend. And the same Father* also saith, *That one may bee called to account before God, pro otioso silentio, for slothfull silence, as well as pro otioso verbo, for idle wording or speaking.*

* Lib. 1. offic. cap. 16.

* Lib. 1. offic. c. 3.

And

And now, *Right Reuerend Father*, hauing vpon these mo-
tiues waded thus farre; I presume to offer these my labours
(though vnworthy) to the view *and patrocinie of your Lord-
ship*. The subiect of this Treatise (being controuersie) is of
such qualitie, as that none are so idoneous to be Ouerseers &
Iudges thereof, as the Guides and gouerning Pastors of the
Church; and the same being a defence of sacred truth, none
are fitter to bee patrons thereof, than the Bishops of the
Church. Saint Cyprian * hath said long since; *That the
Church is seated vpon the Bishops* (hee meaneth, as vpon the
greater columnes) *and by these Rulers euery act of the Church
ought to be guided.*

* Epist. 37. Inde
per temporum &
successionum vi-
ces, Episcoporum
ordinatio, & Ec-
clesiæ ratio decur-
rit, ut Ecclesia su-
per Episcopos con-
stituantur, & omni-
alia Ecclesia per
eosdem præposita
gubernentur.

Your Lordship is eminent in this order, and gracious with
his excellent Maiestie (by whom next to God we all liue and
breathe, *Lam. 4. 20.*) You are a father and friend to the Cler-
gie, ouer which God and his Maiestie hath placed you, and I
my selfe haue my particular station in your Diocesse, and
exercise my function vnder your episcopie. In regard where-
of, I thinke my selfe obliged, both to acknowledge your
faouours, and to select your Lordship to be my Patron. And
if this my seruice may proue in any measure profitable to the
Church, whereof I am a member, and gratefull to you and to
the rest of my superiours, I shall thinke I haue laboured to
purpose. Otherwise I must accuse my selfe of being ouer-
busie, and acknowledge with Saint Ambrose *, *That tacere
nosse quàm loqui difficilior est*: It is more difficult to know when
to bee silent, than to speake. And thus presuming no fur-
ther, I rest

* Eccl. 1. 1. c. 3.

Your Lordships in my best seruice,

FRANCIS WHITE.



The Epistle to the Reader.



Ince the decease of my brother D. White, there is published against him a libelling and despightfull Treatise, entituled, White died blacke.

The Author thereof (being a Romish Priest) undertaketh to demonstrate, that the Doctor in his booke called, The way to the Church, hath committed many foule and wilfull abuses; and in particular, corrupteth Authors, deliuereth manifest and confessed vnttruths; and in his disputing vseth many loose and absurd illations.

And to the perswading hereof, he proceedeth as followeth.

In the Epistles prefixed to his booke, and in sundry passages besides, he largely and loudly accuseth the Doctor, declameth and thundereth against him, with a whole volue of loose words: and boasteth and flourisheth before he come to the fight, of an absolute conquest and victory ouer him and his worke. The facing and verball ostentation of this Romist, is so impudent, that it putteth downe the Giant of Gath, 1 Sam. 17. (Onely his force and stature is meaner, his ioints and limbs are feebler, and his armour is lighter.)

When a certaine mercenarie Souldier did with many bold and impure reproaches exclaime against great Alexander, Memnon the Generall of Darius his armie, lent him a blow with his lance, saying, that he had hired him to fight against Alexander, and not to raile at him. And howsoeuer the verball clamors of this Romist are much applauded by his fautors, yet indeed they rather deserue stripes, Pro. 19. 29. than praises: and are nought else but windie and worthlesse stufte, of no more force to make a conquest of the

B

Doctor

Plutarch. Apothegm.

Doctor and his cause, than the prating of the Souldier was to dis-
sparkle the invincible armie of Alexander the Great.

2 In his progresse about the matter it selfe : This Aduersarie
doth not confute either the whole or any one continuat part of the
Doctors worke, as it lieth in order, but maketh a rapsodie, and se-
lecteth here and there instances and materials, which seeme ad-
uantageous to his purpose. And as the Amalekites, not daring to
affront the maine host of the Israelites, preyed vpon stragglers,
and such as were feeble and hindmost in the companie, Deut. 25.
18. So this Champion dissembleth, and passeth ouer the maine body
and firme testimonies and arguments of euery question, and
fasteneth his nailes vpon the more feeble ^a and lesse principall
branches.

3 This Aduersarie hauing without all modestie, taxed my bro-
ther of corruption, vntruth, &c. doth himselfe perpetually com-
mit the same offences.

In the front of his booke hee affixeth a select sentence out of
Augustine ^b, to make the Reader beleue, that this Father is a wit-
nesse for the Monarchie of the Pope: But he pareth off one clause
thereof ^c, which being added, sheweth that this great Doctor gaue
equall authoritie to the Church of Hierusalem and the Romane:
and made the Patriarchs of these two Sees, colleagues and
compeeres.

And thorowout his worke, he scarce frameth one sufficient or
tolerable illation and consequent ^d: and hee peruerteth the mea-
ning of all Authors ^e which he produceth. And, which is a cer-
taine argument of his cowardise and bad cause, in the most points
he dissembleth the proposition and assertion which the Doctor deli-
uereth, and whereunto hee completh his testimonies and illations:
And in place thereof, substitutes another proposition or sentence,
that so he may haue colour to say what he listeth. When Diogenes
^f beheld a wilde and vnskilfull Archer, he ranne to the marke,
thinking to stand there in greatest safetie: and if the Reader re-
paire to the true point and state of euery question, hee shall per-
ceiue that this obiector in most of his exceptions, roueth at a con-
trary marke, and fighteth against a Scar-crow, or Chimera of his
owne deuising.

4 This Romist pretendeth, that the allectiue or impulsue cause,
which awakened his sleepe Pen, and impelled him to writing,
was

^a Iustin. collo-
cum Tiph. Sole-
tis seu musca ad-
uolare ad exulce-
rata, si qua inter
plurima recte di-
cta exciderit vel
vnum quippiam
quod vobis displi-
cet, aut non satis
intelligitis.

^b Aug. lib. 2. con-
Peril. Don. c. 51.
Cathedratibi quid
fecit Ecclesie
Rom. in qua Pe-
trus sedet, & in
qua Anastasius ho-
die sedet.

^c Vel Ecclesie
Hierosolomitane
in qua Iacobus se-
dit, & in qua ho-
die Iohannes sedet,
quibus nos in Ca-
tholica vnitate
connectimur.

^d Reads part 3. of
this booke in the be-
ginning.

^e Observe in the
first part of this
booke, in sundry pa-
ragraphs, his abu-
sive dealing with
authors, &c.

^f Diog. Laertius
lib. 6. vita Philof.

TO THE READER.

was the euill deportment of the Doctor in his booke: But his manner of proceeding, to wit, his insinuations (among which this is notorious, that hee dedicateth his booke to the Vniuersitie of Cambridge) his derision, declaiming, calumniation, &c. and then his slender and emptie disputing, being onely popular, and not theologickall or scholasticke (and in no sort fitting these acute and iudicious persons, whom he presumed in his Preface to make his Peeres and Censors,) doe solemnly proclaime, that the essentiall reason of diuulging his Treatise, was to salue the credit of his Popish cause, with his owne partie: and hauing obserued the euill successe of his compartner A. D. (who opposed the matter,) he laboureth by popular and plausible pretexts, to eleuate the esteeme of the Doctors writings, which had wrought impression vpon many, and were likely to preuaile further.

This Cretensian is not ignorant, that vaine and instable mindes (whereof there are great plentie) doe greedily attend and affect that which is like vnto themselves: and perhaps he hath read, how when the Philosopher spake soberly to the people, they gaue him no audience, but playing the Minstrell, multitudes flocked about him, so all superstitious Romists are prone to credit the worst, concerning all them which are aduerse to them: and the most of them are inuened with hatred against vs. And our answer for our selues is not admitted to be heard or read by them^s: And thereupon to be accused by any of their owne partie, is to their proselytes a conuiction of vs. And it fareth with them as Tertullian^h said of the Gentiles: Linguam ad maleloquium, & aures ad receptaculum maleloquij: Their tongues are bent to euill speaking, and their eares are open to entertaine euill saying. And I may charge this Aduersarie, as Saint Augustineⁱ did a Manichee, that hee is one of that number, who stoned the messengers that were sent vnto them, Matt. 21. 35. Non ictibus saxeis, sed maledictionibus duris: not with knocks of stones (which present times and protection of gracious Princes permit not) but with hard and grievous words. He is according to the manner of the Seminarie, extremely slanderous^k: and without any knowledge, witnesse, or probability of the things obiected, crieth Beelzebub, Samaritan, glut-ton, &c.

Howsoeuer, wee may not desist from reprobuing error, because of the reproach of men; Esay 51.7. And the great Apostle pas-

Hier. Proem. l. 13.
in Esa. Nullus tam
imperitus scriptor
est, qui non inue-
niat lestorem fini-
lem sui.
Laert. in vita Di-
ogen. l. 6.

^s Septim. decre-
tal. lib. 5. tit. 4.
c. 6.

^h Tertul. de spe-
rac. c. 2.

ⁱ Aduers. leg. &
proph. l. 2. c. 4.

^k Plutarch. de
discr. adul. & a-
mic. Medius prin-
ceps parasitorum
Alexandri magni,
his praecepit, vt
audacter calum-
nijs inessent:
Quia est vulnus
sanauerit qui san-
ciatus est, cicatrix
tamen manet.

1 Cyp. Ep. 55. Si
id enitumur & elab-
oramus, ut possi-
mus Deo placere,
conuicia & male-
dicta humana de-
bemur contem-
nere.
m Cyr. in con-
cil. Ephesin.
n Ep. 55.

o Chrys. 1 Cor.
hom. 43.

p Ep. 52.

q Greg. Naz.

r Cont. Faust.
Manich. l. 13. c. 6.

fed before vs through good report and euill, 2 Cor. 6. 8. And Cyprian¹ complained in his daies of such as trauelled to Rome against him, cum mendaciorum merce, with a packet of lies: and Cyril^m saith, It is not possible to escape the venome of euill speakers, if a man bee neuer so vnblameable: But yet as Cyprianⁿ saith: Non qui audit, sed qui facit conuicium miser est: He onely is miserable that vttereth slander, and not they which are reproached. And (with Chrysostome^o) Wee maruell not if a Serpent spit venome at vs when hee is pricked: and wee more honour our valiant Captaines, when they returne with died garments from the conquest of their enemies. That certaine dishonest and malicious things (saith Cyprian^p) are bruited of him, I would not haue thee maruell, seeing thou knowest that this is perpetually the Devils worke, to teare in peeces Gods seruants with lies, and to conspurcate and vilifie their glorious name, with false opinions, &c.

5 This Popish Priest hath turned himselfe into many shapes, to make sowre appeare sweet, darknesse light, and euill good, and he applieth the best complements of fraud and Art which are in him, to extenuate the worth of his aduersarie and his cause; and to exalt and blandish his owne: Yet as a Pot-sheard couered with siluer, Pro. 26. and as dung mixed with perfume^q, so is the burden and substance of his worke. And I shall not wrong him in applying that sentence of Augustine^r, to his tripartite worke: Puerile ludibrium, muliebre iocamentum, aniculare deliramentum, continens initium truncum, medium putridum, & finem ruinosum: It is a childish toy, a womanish trifle, and an old wimes dotage: containing a blockish first part, a rotten middle, and a ruinous conclusion.

If God had ordained my Brother longer life, himselfe had beene best able (if this Treatise had come forth) to haue defended his owne worke, and to haue put this Alien to flight: But the diuine providence (which all things obey) disposing otherwise, and hee being now translated out of the Church Militant into the Church Triumphant; his owne trauels are ended, and his warfare is accomplished: And resisting and reprouing his Aduersaries in this world, must either cease, or be supplied by others.

Now had the Aduersarie proceeded in this matter with any moderation, I would not haue interposed my selfe, nor presumed in

TO THE READER.

in this ripe and lettered age to haue come in publike, neither had it needed. The defence of the faith and doctrine of the Church of England, dependeth not vpon such priuate mens labours, but is supported by firmer pillars and more solid bases. But the insolencie of this Romist was so abusive and intolerable, (presuming no doubt the Doctor being deceased, hee should neuer bee called to a reckoning) that many deemed it vnworthy for me, to suffer a Dog to pisse vpon the dead ashes of my well-deseruing Brother: and an impure sycophant (hauing all his force in his tongue as an Adder bath in his taile) to distaine and deride his iust deserts.

And being now engaged in this businesse, I intreat the Reader to consider these few things following.

1 That the veritie of doctrine, and the cause betweene our Aduersaries and vs, dependeth not vpon gawdie and audacious speeches of either side, but vpon substance and weight of things; and therefore he must not measure the truth of the cause by painted and glorious words, but penetrate into the matter it selfe. For as they which behold enterludes, doe not esteeme those actors to bee Kings and great Worthies, which play the parts and vtter the speeches of such; knowing that these things doe onely serue the scene: so it happeneth in our Aduersaries proceedings, when they stile themselves Catholikes, and their Aduersaries Heretikes, Nouellists, &c. and enrobe themselves with the habit of Antiquitie, succession, vniuersalitie, and the rest: here is a very Stage-play; Ther/sites acteth Achilles his part, and a Cobler beareth Hercules Club.

2 Take notice that I haue purposely and with premeditation abstained from replying to sundry opprobrious and abusive passages of this Aduersarie: not for want of matter to reply; but partly for that it irketh me to vse such demainor, as the indignitie of his abuses require: partly taking counsell from Saint Hierom, who saith: It auaileth not the cause, to remaigne them which haue wronged vs, or to requite our Aduersaries with the law of like.

Ad Pammach. &
Ocean. de origins
error.

3 I haue added to sundry passages of this Treatise, obseruations concerning the matters in question betweene the Aduersaries and vs; partly to make my labour more profitable to the Reader, which otherwise would for the more part haue beene taken vp in altercation and word-bate; and partly to notifie to the Reader, the

TO THE READER.

state of the question and true Tenet of each side: (which our aduersaries continually obscure and dissemble, placing a Chimera and counterfeit in stead thereof.)

4 I haue placed in the margent of my booke, the words of many Authors, whose testimonies I produce: partly to abbreviate the worke in the Text, partly to take away iust occasion of quarrell from the Aduersarie, about translation or other falsification; and also to benefit such persons as want the bookes of the said Authors, and to offer others a present view of that which I affirme.

5 In sundry questions I omit every weightie arguments and documents belonging to our cause, by reason the same are obvious in our worthy Writers, and are better and more fully handled and proposed by them, than they could haue bene by me.

6 If it seeme good to this Popish Priest to reply, it shall be iust for him to proceed according to the state of the question deliuered by me, and not to reply (as hee hath done in this booke) vpon an imaginarie Tenet. And I further presume, that in regard of his owne reputation (which is already impaired by this demainor) he will not trifle out the time in banding words, or collecting pretended contradictions, or peruerting assertions besides their meaning: Or snatch here and there, (as a dog lappeth Nilus) or diuorce and disioine one parcell of my sentences from another: But seeing that I haue proposed in each question perspicuous and distinct matter for him to reply vpon, which he cannot mistake, (vnlesse he intend to raise a smoke, and thereby to shelter himselfe:) that he will accordingly descend to the examination and reproving of that which is disliked by him, and maintained by me.

And now referring these my labours to the iudgement and conscience of each discreet and impartiall Reader: and submitting my doctrine and writing to the Church of England, whose obedient sonne I professe my selfe to be: I will descend to the particular examination of the Aduersaries proceeding.

Thine in all the offices of Charitie and Truth,

FRANCIS WHITE.

ANSWER TO T. W. P. HIS EPISTLE DEDICATORIE TO THE

most Celebrious and famous Vniuersitie
of CAMBRIDGE.

T. W. P.



Ingenious and learned Academians, I doe not present this my labour vnto you, intreating hereby your Patronage thereof: For how can I expect so great a fauour, since most of you dissent from mee in that Religion which is here maintained? Neither as holding this poore worke, for any Art therein, worthy your iudicious view, for I am not onely conscious to my selfe of mine owne weaknesse, but doe also greatly admire your piercing and cleere eyed iudgements. To you then I exhibit it, as appealing to the Mother (such is my confidence in your impartiall and euen censures) as Iudge betwene her sonne and my selfe.

Answ. Saint Augustine truly said ^a, *Paries dealbatus hypocrisis, foris tectorium, intus lutum.* As in a Mud-wall which is whited ouer, the outward crust is faire, and the inside dirt, so is hypocrisie and faining. If this Romist had dealt plainly, he should haue dedicated his booke to the *septem Dormientes*, ^b seuen sleepers, (for fancies are fittest for dreamers) and not to the waking and iudicious Academians: their spectacles are too true for his false eyes. But as Bargemen looke one way, and make their stroke another: so this Cretusian intending to gull his owne superstitious fautors, placeth the Academians in the front of his booke. But it is scarce credible, that a deceiuer which vttereth onely counterfeite coine, hath an intention to come to the Touch-stone. And the piercing and cleere eyed iudgement of learned Academians, is too euen and sincere a modell for a Romist to be measured by.

*Poeta cum primum ad scribendum appulit animum,
Id sibi negotium credidit solum dari
Populo ut placerent quas fecisset fabulas.*

T. W. For whereas my designed Adversarie at this present (to whom your Vniuersitie hath first giuen his education for literature, and since hath

B 4

graced

^a Sup. Psal. 103.

^b Antonin. lib. 1.
hist. p. 2. tit. 16.
§. 20.

AN ANSWER TO

graced him with the investiture of Doctorship) in answer to a Catholike Treatise (first penned by one of my fellow labourers in the Vineyard of Christ) hath written a most virulent and scandalous booke, entitling it, The way to the true Church. The which booke was found so full of corruptions, untruths, and other such base matter, that it was holden in the opinion of many great and learned Priests, rather worthy of contempt than answer.

^c Mat. 23. ad 150
apoc.

Ans^w. Gregorie Nazianzene ^c aptly compareth seducers to the filth Sepia, which muddeth the waters with a certaine blacke matter like unto Inke, that so it may escape the sight of the Fisher. T. W. P. doth imitate this filth, and endeouureth to make that muddie and blacke which is transparent.

D. White by his literature and paines, and by veritie of a good cause, discovered the weaknesse and falshood of the Romish superstition. The blow which hee hath given the Popish cause, offendeth and grieveth the fautors thereof: and they hauing vnluckily succeeded in their reply about the matter, T. W. P. doth now assay to salue and colour things with brauerie and boldnesse of words, and will make the world beleue, if they please to hearken to him, that light is darknesse, and white is blacke. But now to the matter.

T. W. By one of my fellow labourers in the Vineyard of Christ, &c.

^d Basil. Epist. 75.

^e Ripenc. com. in
Tit. 1.

Ans^w. Your fellow and you labour in the Vineyard of Christ, like those workmen of which Salomon speaketh, Cant. 2. 15. *The Foxes, the little Foxes, which spoile the Vineyard.* And whereas you reproach the Doctors booke, entitling it virulent and scandalous, I say with S. Basil, that things wholesome and good, appeare contrary to corrupt iudgements ^d: *Et quibus es puer, omnia quae offeruntur putida sunt, oris non elementi vitio* ^e: To such as haue a rotten mouth, each thing which is offered, seemes to haue a rotten taste, &c.

T. W. It was holden in the opinion of many great and learned Priests, &c.

^f Lib. 3. heret. 79.

^g Cyrill. lib. 7. cont.
Iulian.

Ans^w. *Mulus mulum scabit,* and they which forsake the law praise the wicked, Pro. 28. 4. And you receiue honour one of another, which God giueth you not, Ioh. 5. 44. But howsoever you iudge of your selues, you are indeed like the *Cantharides*, whereof Epiphanius speaketh ^f, *Forma auricolores, venenum eiacularantes*, Of a colour like gold, but casting forth mortiferous poison. *Quibus verbosa lingua est, cor verò obscuratum* ^g: Which haue a gaudie tongue full of words, but a blacke and darkened heart.

T. W. The Doctors booke was holden worthy of contempt, &c.

^h Aug. sup. Psal.
38.

Ans^w. Hucksters who intend to vtter deceitfull wares, will not sticke to disgrace better merchandise. But if the Doctors booke bee so meane and contemptible, how happeneth it that it putteth you to your shifts? and causeth you to flie to the *blacke Art* for weapons against it? And yet you haue still the worst, and must sit downe with losse: *Et dum vis esse prado, factus es prada* ^h, Whiles you seeke to rob another of his credit, your selfe are made a prey.

T. W. Master White not onely in the Preface of his booke, but also in diuers places of his second worke, vaunteth much of his sincere dealing: saying, *My Adversarie cannot present the Reader with one conclusion, one doctrine,*

T. W. HIS EPISTLE.

doctrine, one quotation, one line or letter, to make him really see wherein I have failed. This idle venditation of ingenuitie and upright dealing, hath awakened my sleepe pen, and given birth to this Treatise: wherein I undertake to make good that the very ground and burden of his first booke is meere corruptions and vntruths, and other such impostures, in the euisting whereof I am so secure, that I willingly make you Iudges, &c.

Ans^w. D. White being conscious to himselfe of his vpright meaning, professeth accordingly, that hee wittingly maintained nothing but the truth. Yet he neither assumeth to himselfe, nor any man else presumeth of him, that hee failed in no sentence, quotation, line or letter. This is ouer-swelling to be spoken of a greater man than D. White. Saint Augustine himselfe saith ¹, *In omnibus literis meis, &c.* In all my writings I doe not onely desire a pious Reader, but an ingenious Corrector. And the Doctor in the Preface of his second worke vttereth this confession: I acknowledge my selfe to be a man which may erre, &c. They may finde in such a multitude, possibly, some to proue that the diligentest Writer may bee ouerseene, but the substance they cannot discredit. And in that place which you obiekt, pag. 129. my brother speaketh onely of the Reply against his first booke, compiled by A. D. and saith that this Iesuit was not able, in that Reply, to present the Reader with any line, conclusion, &c. And whereas you affirme that the ground and burden of the Doctors booke, is corruptions, &c. and in euisting thereof you are so secure, &c. 1. I maruell that you leaue the substance, ground and burden of the booke vntouched, and doe onely carpe and snatch here and there at certaine parcels. 2. Your grand securitie of euisting, &c. is either in words onely, and you are compelled according to the saying of Tacitus, to succour your bad cause with audacious facing, or else that is verified of you, which Nazianzene saith ^k: *ὑπερηφανία ἐκ γνῶσεως*, Audacitie is the of-spring of ignorance. But if your securitie bee so firme, I intreat you that wee may vnderstand the bases and principles thereof. Sure I am, that D. White hath well dusted you, and in your reply, you are faine to put off blowes with brags, and setting words aside, you haue performed nothing, which may hold you from plaine running out of the field.

¹ *Præm. l. 3. de Trinit.*

^k *Orat. 7. p. 149.*

T. W. It is certainly reported, that desire of praise, a windie Meteor, &c. first innited Master White to support forsooth with his learned hand, the threatening and falling pillar of his new Church, &c.

Ans^w. This report was not hastily to haue beene beleueed or published, *Solet enim fama mentiri* ¹: Fame vseth to ouerreach. The true motiue of D. White his entring into opposition with you is deliuered by himselfe ^m in these words: *The condition of the place where sometimes I liued, transported with much superstition, and being importuned with Romish Priests and their bookes, and sometimes their libels set vpon the Church doores, drew vpon me a necessitie of doing what I was able.* This was the impulsie cause of my Brothers writing, which you should rather haue taken notice of, than despiightfully to haue forged a fabulous motiue out of your Nurserie of Tales. But say what you please: Doctor White entring into the number of Writers, furnished with three languages, and

¹ *August. Epist. 106.*

^m *Epist. dedic. of his second booke.*

with .

AN ANSWER TO

with much reading and varietie of learning, gained good respect and performed profitable seruice to the Church : your selfe obtruding your declamatorie and verball papers vpon the world, must expect after a while to haue the same consecrated to Vulcan, or spent in baser vse.

And whereas you prophesie the fall of our Church, as many of your brood haue done before you^a : assuredly you will bee deceiued (as your Progenitors the Gentiles^b were in the like.) And although wee doubt not, but that your good will and machinations shall euer be ready to further and contriue the ruine of our Church and State : (for, *Cui potest vester animus conferri, cui viperæ, cui aspidi* ? &c. To what Monster can we fitly compare your malicious mindes^c ? to what Viper ? to what Aspe ? &c.) Yet it is well with vs, that *malitia non habet tantas vires, quantos conatus*^d : Your malice is sundry waies bounded and controlled, and our Church is like to endure, *ad senectam & senium, & vsque in finem seculi* : to elder daies and old age, and the very end of the world : as Saint Augustine^e in the like case prophesied against the Gentiles.

T. W. *I doubt not but by the assistance of him, Qui in veritate educet iudicium, Esa 42. and by the ensuing discouerie of his calumnious forgeries, so to pricke the swolne bladder of his pride, as that all his frothy ostentation shall resolue to nothing, and that his writings like new found wells, being commonly in account onely for a yeere or two, shall for euer afterwards remaine neglected and contemned.*

Ans^w. Your presumption hath deceiued you, and your hope is proued like the Spiders web. For since the time that the terrible noise of your paper shot was heard, the Doctors booke hath received a new impression : and euen as white when it is compared with blacke, appeares more amiable, so your blacke mouth hath added esteeme to your aduersarie. Yea, like as perfume being bruised is more odoriferous, so the Orthodox way to the Church being more exactly tried and examined by meanes of your opposition, is become more acceptable and of better report.

T. W. *I hold it not inconuenient to giue some touch of that opprobrious tongue of his, &c.*

Ans^w. The Adage is well knowne, *Clodius de pudicitia* : A horrell declaiming of chastitie. No people vnder the Sunne may worse comtaine of opprobrious tongues than Romists. You spare no state, no age, no sex : Your tongues are your owne, and are set on fire from Hell. Yet your selues cannot endure to bee reprobued for your most palpable wickednesse. D. White liued in those parts where you daily exercised your trade of deceiuing, and hee beheld and felt your deportment, which (howsoeuer you glory) was scarce such as can endure the tribunall whither you appeale.

T. W. *And now, illustrious Academians, &c. make particular triall of the chiefe grounds of our Catholike Religion, and looke backe into the continuall practise of Christs Church, since its first being; and assure your selues wee shall not be found superstitious and blinde, &c. For how can they bee blinde who behold the articles of their faith with the eyes of all antiquitie ? &c.*

Ans^w. The Academians haue alwaies done as you require, and there-
by

^a Harding. Greg. Val. 3. d. 1. q. 1. punct. 7. §. 23. Saunders. de visib. Monarch. Epist. ad Pium 5. Nec parua spe ducor prope diem fore, &c.
^b Aug. Psal. 70. Ad certum tempus sunt Christi ani, postea redibunt idola, &c.
^c Chrysostom. 7. Rom.
^d Maldonat. com. Ioh. cap. 4. Qui Catholici sunt, maiore odio Calvinistas cateroque omnes hereticos prosequuntur, quam Gentiles, &c.
^e Aug. cont. Don. f. Sup. Psal. 70.

by finde you guiltie of Nouellisme. But with what face doe you call the Academians to antiquitie, when you daily corrupt their ancient monuments? and both forge and bring in counterfeits; and reiect and censure authentike records, and dallie with the Fathers as children doe with their babies?

Pammelius hath foisted into Cyprian a new sentence to proue supremacie^a. And the Romane edition of the first foure Councils, hath remoued out of the first Nicene Councell certaine words^x which formerly were authentike in all your owne editions. How many spurious and degenerous Impes hath Bignæus patched into his new Tomes of old Fathers? And because Gelasius condemneth the Heresie of Transubstantiation, you will suffer his workes to haue no being^y. And in like sort you deale with Epiphanius Epistle about Images, and with sundry other. Neither will you endure any generall Councell, if it make against you; as appeareth by the Councell of Chalcedon, session 16. and by the Councell of Constancē, which although it were confirmed by the Pope (as Caietan affirmeth^z) yet you reiect the same in certaine articles.

And because you say that you behold all the articles of faith with the eyes of Antiquitie; let vs intreat you to shew vs these articles in Antiquitie: *The authoritie of the Pope is greater than the authoritie of a Councell: and the last resolution of faith is into the Popes sentence: and his definition is as authentickall as the Scripture: Hee is Lord and Prince over the whole Church, &c. To obey the Pope, is necessary to saluation.*

Read to vs out of Antiquitie, *that the Latine vulgar translation of Scripture is authentickall, and not the originall. That Church seruice is to be used in an unknowne tongue: shew vs your amputation of the Eucharist; your doctrine of the merit of condignitie; auricular confession according to your fashion: The physickall efficiencie of the elements and words of Sacraments; Adoration of Crosse, and Images with Latria, &c.* Our Aduersaries haue a gift to see that in Antiquitie, the contrary whereof the Ancients themselves saw: and these men with bodily eyes can behold inuisible things, like one Ketellus, who (according to William Nubrigensis) obtained a gift to see Demils.

T. W. *Examine it by the rules of Gods sacred word, and for the true sense of the written word, recurre to the ioint expositions of the Primitive Fathers, &c.*

Answe 1. Your Doctors teach, that wee must receiue your Popish faith without examination^a: and that the resolution of our faith is into the authoritie of your Church and Pope, and not into the word of God^b. 2. None can vse the rule of the Scripture but Romists (according to your Tener,) and therefore you mocke the Academians, when you referre them to the triall of faith by Scripture. 3. Of sundry parts of holy Scripture, there is no common exposition deliuered by the Fathers^c. 4. The Texts of Scripture, *Matt. 16. and Ioh. 21. 15.* which you make the foundation of Papall supremacie, are diuersly expounded by the Fathers, yea, by sundry Papists. Shew vs this exposition of the Text, *Pasce oues, feed my sheepe, that is, according to Bellarm. beare rule over*

my

^a Cyp. de vni. Eccl. l. n. 4. vid. B. Bion. Chrit. subiect. pag. 65. Goulart. annot. sup. Cyprian.

^x Poffetio, appar. verb. Nicen. Concil. In the 6. Canon. Antiqua consuetudo seruatur per Egyptum, Libyam & per taptum, vt Alexandrinus Episcopus horum omnium habeat potestatem, quia & vrbis Romae Episc. parilis non est: *Id est Romane editione* hath exchanged these last words into, *in his Episcopi Rom. consuetudo est.*

^y Vid. Poffetio. Appar. verb. Gelasius.

^z Caietan. opus. de author. Papae, & Conc. l. cap. 8. Concilij Constantinensis decreta a Papa Martino confirmantur.

H. St. Angl. l. 2. c. 21. Obtinuit tale donum a Deo vt demone. h. beiet conspicabilis.

^a Scopl. Rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 1. p. 430. & 435.

^b Ibid. p. 434.

^c Read the Commentaries of Tolet. upon Luke. Iohn. Romans, Psal. 32. &c. B. Harm. Recognit.

my sheepe in a royall or Kingly manner, in all, or in two of the Fathers.

T. W. Remember that the most remarkable Protestants for learning, doe confesse that those Doctors are Patrons of our faith.

Ans. The notorious and impudent falshood of this assertion, is manifested by me in the second part of this booke.

T. W. Bee neuer perswaded, that since it is granted that the Romane Church was once the true Church, and the time of her reuolt cannot bee knowne, that the daughter of Babylon could euer so vnespiedly become a Babylonian strumpet.

Firmil. ap. Cyp.
Ep. 75. Iuste in-
dignor, ad tam a-
percam & manife-
stam Stephani
stultitiam, qui sic
de suo loco glo-
riatur, & se suc-
cessorum Petri
contendit, &c.
Vid. Concil. Affri-
can. c. 101. &
Can. 9.
Vid. Concil. Chal-
ced. sess. 16.
Vid. 6. Sinod. Con-
stant. c. 36.

Ans. 1. Tares were sowne by the enuious man in the field, and yet not espied vntill they grew vp, Matt. 13. 25, 26. And diseases and old age seise on bodies in an insensible manner. A wife may possibly play the Harlot, and yet by cunning Bawds and Panders, her lewdnesse may so farre be concealed, that some few persons complaining against her, shall not be heard. Yet the errors of the Romane Synagogue, and the vsurpation of the Pope, were espied and resisted; and for a time suppressed, and afterwards by strength of faction, and by corruption of times they preuailed. The Africans resist the Popes incroaching; and the time when the Romane Pontifex became vniuersall, is expressed in the storie. Adoration of Images, communion in one kinde, the precise number of seuen Sacraments, the article of Transubstantiation, the Latine translation, and Apocryphall Scriptures made authentically, &c. The time of the decreeing and making these errors authentical, is reported in the Church storie.

T. W. Divide not your selues from that most conspicuous Church of Christ which hath beene promised, that in all ages it should most gloriously appeare to the eie of the world: lest so in lieu thereof, as for the last refuge, you be forced to forge a Mathematicall and aerie Church, consisting of certaine imaginarie inuisibilists, impugned by the Fathers, since its being consisteth meerely of not being.

Tom. 4. Concil.
Suri. Laceran.
Concil. sub Iulio
3. Vidimus vim,
rapinas, adulteria,
incestus, omnem
denique scelerum
pestem, ita sacra
prophanaque
miscere omnia: ita
in sanctam nauem
eulam impetum
facere, ut pene
scelerum fluctibus
illa latus dederit,
& prope meris &
perfundata sit.
Vid. Joh. Sarisbur.
Polierat. l. 6. c. 24.
Et Stapl. Rel. cont.
1. q. 5. r. 5. pag.
158.
4. Vid. part. 1.
Chap. 3. §. 2. pag.
90. &c.
Aug. cont. Faust.
Manich. lib. 5. c. 2.

Ans. The holy Scripture foretelleth such a Church as shall be conspicuous in vertue and grace, and in preaching the Gospell, and holding forth the light of veritie to such as haue eares and eies of faith to heare and discern. But you tender vs a Babylonian strumpet swelling in pride and ambition, and detestable for auarice, treacherie and wickednesse. And indeed this visibilitie we detest. But it shall appeare hereafter in this Treatise^d, that we maintaine a perpetuall visible Church, and differ from you about the manner of the visibilitie onely: and your reproach of Mathematicall and aerie is calumnious and vaine, and concerneth not vs.

T. W. Suffer not an heteroclite sectarie, who reiecteth all regular, ordinarie and mediate vocation, (like another Melchisedech, borne without father and mother) to plant in your soules a new kinde of Religion, neuer heard of before, &c.

Ans. Deserter arguis militem: your selfe a runagate and exorbitant, reproach a souldier, who had his settled standing by lawfull vocation in the Church whereof he was a member. There is no vocation of Pastors in the world so corrupt and mangled as is the Romane: (as shall be manifested hereafter in fit place^e) and yet all their frame of Religion is builded vpon this rotten pillar.

^e Par. 1. Chap. 3.
pag. 115.

T. W.

T. W. HIS EPISTLE.

T. W. *Till a libidinous Monke by mutuell breach of vowes, had yoked himselfe with a lapsed Nunne, &c.*

Answ. 1. Luther in this case did no more than some of your Church haue counsell'd others to doe ^f: and then was commonly practis'd among your selues ^g. Cæsar Borgia, sonne to Pope Alexander the sixt, (This chaste Pope had sonnes) being a Cardinall and sacred person, did first murder his elder brother, and then forsooke his priestly order, and married with the Neece of the French King. And see other examples in the margent ^h. Now can you espie a moat in Luther, and not perceiue a beame in your selues?

T. W. *Finally, relinquish and abandon that supreme soueraigntie of the priuate reuealing spirit, &c.*

Answ. The spirit whereupon we build our faith, is publike, both in regard of the object and matter beleued, which is the Catholike and Orthodox doctrine of the Prophets, Apostles, and primitiue Church: and also in regard of the manner whereby wee receiue the same doctrine; which is, by the publike ministerie of the Church wherein wee liue, and by the publike preaching of the worthiest Pastors of the Catholike Church in former ages. But the spirit of your Church must needs bee priuate, both because it receiueth a traditionarie word vnknowne to former ages, and hath by humane authoritie enlarged the object of faith: and also because it resolueth faith into one mans definition, who is no Prophet nor sonne of a Prophet, and for the more part an vnlettered and vnsanctified creature (as shall further appeare in this Treatise ⁱ.)

T. W. *And thus, worthy Academians, leauing you to the censure of your unworthy sonne, &c.*

Answ. You are of his myserie ^k, who accustomed to feed his guests with fantastick dishes, or with the shadow of meat without any substance; for you perswade your fautors that you haue deliuered weightie matter, not vnworthy the view of those profound Academians, whose wisdom and learning is eminent, and honourable thorowout the Christian world: and yet in truth you present them onely with windie stuffe, meet for such as the Prophet Hosea speaketh of, saying: *Ephraim feedeth upon the wind*, Hos. 12. 1. And Saint Basil: ** Solo rore alantur cicada: Graphoppers are fed with nothing but with dew.*

^f Aeneas Syluius Epist. 307. Credimus te uel non in sulso concilio, si cum nequeas continere, coniugium queris. Quamuis id primo cogitandum fuerit, antequam initiretis sacris ordinibus: sed non sumus di omnes, qui futura prospicere valeamus. Quando hoc uentum est ut legi carnis resistere nequeas, melius est nubere quam vri. ^g Onuph. in uita Alexandr. 6.

^h Borgia, supplem. chron. l. 12. anno 1491. Cæstus, & Henricum coronauit, atque ei Constantiam Monachum in matrimonium collocauit. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Pap. l. 1. c. 33. Batillus Urbani nepos quondam nobilem n. o. nial. m. professam & iactantem, de monasterio uolenter rapuit & uolauit, &c. Nec propterea per Urbanum arguebatur, sed cum diceretur ei quod nepos suus Batillus uiuere in honore, feruit respondisse, Iuuenis est: licet tunc annum quadragimum peregisset.

ⁱ Pag. 142. ^k Eudo de stella vid. Willel. Nubrig. hist. Angl. lib. 1. cap. 19. ^{*} Epist. 107.

In



IN CANDIDISSIMUM
DOCTOREM DEFUNCTVM,
melos threnothryambeuticum.



N hic effigies albi Doctoris, amicti
Vndique vestitu niueo, pietate, nitore
Innocuæ vitæ, candenti lumine veræ
Virtutis, vultusque animique albedine summa.
Quem solæ tres lanificæ potuere sorores
Obscurare: alius candorem non maculauit
Fucatus color ullus. Inexorabile fatum,
Nec planè albatum potuit nigrare colorem.
Nam virtus candet post funus: amictus & * alba,
Veste hic, sidereo terras mutauit Olympo.
* Altera candescit cælo via lactea: mortis
Non valuit nubes hanc denigrare secundam.

* Amicti stolis al-
bis stabant in
conspetu Agni,
&c. Apocalyp. c.
7. v. 9. 13, 14. &
chap. 3. v. 4, 5. &
c. 6. v. 11.

* Prior ex lacte
Iunonis. Cael.
Rhodigin. p. 238.
Describitur & a-

pad Ouidium, l. 1. Met. Aristot. numerat illam inter metæora apparentia. Posterior ista ex lacteo scriptorum rore candidiss. Doctor.
qui in cælum ascendit, &c. Nec ipse immerito via appellatur lactea, qui lacteum illum scripsit librum, qui inscribitur, Lactea ad veram
Ecclesiam Via, &c.

—Sic, vndique candidus, illo
Dulcia defecta modulatur carmina lingua,
Funeris ipse sui cantator, cygnus.—

FRANCIS WHITE Doctoris
nepos, defleuit.



In T. W. fuco suo denigrantem candidissimum Doctorem, qui à germano suo in natiuam denuò reductus est albedinem.



*V*cator, quis fit, luci haud satis est, amarulentam
Pennam saginans stygeo veneno,
Dente arido corrodit mordicus, undique albicantem
Famam, nitentem maculans colorem.

*S*arcina, quisquis at es, plenum chaos & calumniarum,

*N*on candidatum potis es nigrare,

*U*ndique quem niueus decorauit amictus, atque lucens

Albedo, vultus, animique candor :

Albescens pietas : niueus color innocentiaeque :

Virtutis albens, lucidumque lumen.

*N*ec roseum fucus vultum tuum inquinauit istum,

Fusca aut nigredo nubilaui vlla,

Ni vis ut hic sit olor niger, atra avis illa rara : dira

Aut mortis, inquis, denigrasse nubem.

*A*t non crudeles Parcae, potuerunt prorsus istum

Turpare cygnum morte succinentem.

*N*am candet virtus post funus : amictus atque caelo,

Isthic stola^a alba, despicit caduca,

Lacteam & ipsa viam est emensa^b galaxia. At fuisse

Mirum nec istud, candidum colorem

Nigrasse : assuetum hoc fucantibus ; at reducere istum

Rursus nigrorem in pristinum nitorem,

Hic labor, hoc opus est, hoc mirum, & inusitatum : at alter

En frater istud praestitit superstes.

Frustra igitur probris hoc conspuit albicans ligustrum,

Cuius nitorem nebula sorores

Fatifera nulla potuere operire, nec colorem

Posthac nigredo Caecum inquinabit.

^a Apoc. 2. 7. v. 9.

13, 14. & c. 3. v.

4, 5. & c. 6. v. 11.

^b Non immerito

candidissimus Do-

ctor appellatur

galaxia : qui la-

cteum illum scrip-

sit librum qui in-

scribitur, Lactea

ad veram Ecclesi-

am Via, &c.



ΕΙΣ ΤΟΝ ΑΥΤΟΝ

ΜΕΛΑΝΟΧΡΩΤΑ, ΤΗΝ

λευκότητά μελαίνοντα.

Ζηχάρῃ ἀφραδὺν τίς αἰώνυμῃ, ὅν ποδὶ λυώης
Δαίμονῃ ἢ ἐξέρχεται ἡμέτερος οἶκῃ ἐλαύνει.

Ἄφροντα λωβητὴν χέρον ἐπὶ ἀδελφεῷ,

Πάλλιδον παρὰ μελαίνῃν ἔρση, κύνει μωβῇ.

Θυρεῖτ' ἀπειτήωδ' αἰγὸς παρ' ἰδὼν ἀγρότης,

Ἴχθυο, μέδ' ἐπὶ ὑψαύχονα κόμην ἀπυλῇ

Ταμῶνιν ὀρχήν φειδύλιν τόνδ' ῥυπαίνων,

Οὐ βίους κρημνῷ, καὶ ἦδος ἑλαμψὴ δέχων,

Ἀγλαίῃ τ' ἀρετῇ, σπηλίκῃ δόσκα μέμνῃ

Ἀλὼν στυλίουκτῷ, ἀγχιῶν, μέδ' ἐλαμψὼν

Ἐδνοῖν ὠδῖναι πότμῳ, φῶν ἑλαμψὼν ἴδω

Ἐν ζῷ σ', ἐν φθιμῶσι λάμπει νῦν Ἐπὶ αἶδων.

*Franciscus White, Authoris filius, Art. magist. & Col.
Trinit. in Academia Cantabrig. Socius.*

CHAP.



CHAP. I. Paragraph. 2.

Wherein T. W. P. chargeth D. White with corrupting the Rhemists concerning the merit of workes.

T. W. P.



Now I will come to M. Whites depravations, &c. And to begin with one, which as it containeth in it selfe many foule and strange corruptions, so the iniurie thereby offered, is not to one, but to many; and those, for their learning and vertue, men of worthiest memorie, to wit, the

English Doctors of Rhemes.

D. Wh. Way to the Church, Digest. 35. n. 6. 15

Answer. The Authors of the Rheinisch translation and notes of the New Testament, were Gregory Martin, Bristow, and Cardinall Allen^b: who are therefore extolled for vertue and learning by you, because they were *corrumpenda veritatis artifices*^c, artificers of your owne mysterie, &c.

^b Postuin. select. biblioth. l. 2. c. 13. ^c Cyprian. de unit. Eccles.

T. W. If we belecue M. White, the Rhemists affirme, that our workes of their very nature deserue eternall life, the reward whereof, is a thing equally and iustly answering to the time and weight of the worke, rather than a free gift; so that God should be vniust if he gaue it not. But this brazen faced Minister, in alleaging their words, hath committed a double corruption: First, in omitting the word Grace, the true words being, Works proceeding of grace, merit heauen. Secondly, by inserting in stead of the word grace, the word nature, the which was not so much as dreamed of by the Rhemists, or by any Catholike Author. Yea to defend, that workes of their owne nature doe merit, were to renew the Pelagian heresie.

Answer 1. D. White at the place objected^d, nameth not the Rhemists within his Text: neither produceth he any one literall sentence of his Authors, placed in the margent: but collecteth into a summe the doctrine of Andradinus^e, (whom he citeth as well as the Rhemists) and of other Pontificians: as appeareth by the words prefixed to his quotation, *You heare what is commonly said*.

^d Pag. 238.

^e Andrad. orth. expl. lib. 6. Rhem. annot. 1. Cor. 3. v. 18. & Heb. 6. v. 10.

2. He imposeth vpon no Papists, that they maintaine, good workes of nature, or proceeding from nature, doe merit; but that, good workes of grace, doe of their very nature, merit, &c.

It is the heresie of Pelagius (as you say) that morall actions of naturall and viregnerate persons doe merit [in condignitie,] yet many of your Doctors

C

say

f Al. Hal. 3. q. 61. m. 3. ar. 3. & m. 5. ar. 3. Scot. 2. d. 28. q. vnic. Durand. 2. d. 28. q. 6. Adian. Quo. lib. 7. q. 4. Biel. 3. d. 27. q. vnic. ar. 2. concl. 4. Genebr. com. Phil. 67. v. 13. Caietan. opusc. to. 3. tr. 11. ca. 9. nisi ex quadam congruitate, qua congruit homini recte vtenti libero arbitrio in illis quæ Dei sunt. Deum largiri, &c. Vega pro concil. 1. 5. c. 15. Caietan. to. 3. opusc. tr. 11. c. 9. Vis Spiritus Sancti habitantis in homine, non est impar ad acquirendam vitam eternam, & ad efficiendum quod operibus eius in nobis debeat vita eterna. g Rhem. annot. Rom. 8. vers. 18. h Vazq. 1. 3. part. 3. disp. 314. ca. 4. Opera iustorum ex sola ingenita dignitate, meritoria sunt. Ib. ca. 6. n. 39. Ex natura sua, hoc ipso quod facta sunt, ab homine iusto ex auxilio gratie Dei, esse condigna vita eterna. i Ib. disp. 323. ca. 3. k Suar. 3. Thom. p. 1. d. 41. q. 5. 3. Ruard. Topper. artic. 8. Potest nostra iustitia sustinere diuinum iudicium: & verisimile est, quod etiam non iniquis Christo, aut eius iustitia, nisi forte vt capiat. l Th. Aqu. 1. 2. q. 114. ar. 3. Caietan. ib. Conrad. ib. Fra. Romeus de lib. & necess. oper. verit. 22. Richard. 2. d. 27. ar. 3. ad 9. Driedo de red. gen. hum. tr. 2. ca. 3. p. 3. ar. 3. prop. 6. Lindan. panopl. Euang. l. 3. c. 20. Clitrou. impr. ar. Luth. ca. 3. Iodoc. Tiletan. apol. concil. Trid. tit. de bon. oper. sup. ca. 11. diff. 6. q. 4.

say, they merit in congruities. But that good works of regenerate persons, of their very nature, and as they be such, are meritorious, is maintained by Andradus, by the Rhemists, and many other Pontificians.

The Rhemists say: *The value of our workes ariseth from the grace of adoption, which maketh that those actions, which of their nature be not meritorious in themselves, are worthy of heauen.*

Vasquez the Iesuite saith, *Workes of their inbred dignitie deserue, &c. and ex natura operis sic facti, by the nature of the workes thus wrought.* (Where you haue the very forme of speech vsed by my brother.) And Suarez: *They haue an intrinsecall proportion with the reward.* Vasquez affirmeth, that it is the tenet of the best learned in the Popish schoole, that workes of grace are meritorious of their very nature and intrinsecall existence, without any new imputation of Christs merit, or addition and supply of Gods promise, besides their first production. And for confirmation hereof, hee produceth Thomas, Caietan, and sundry other Authors.

Forasmuch therefore, as D. White imposeth vpon you no other tenet, concerning the merit of workes, but that which is embraced by your greatest Doctors; it was rude and vnciuill for T. W. to reproach him with the foule termes of brazen faced Minister, &c.

T. W. *M. White chargeth the Rhemists with holding that the reward of workes is a thing equally and iustly answering the time and weight of his trauels and workes, rather than a free gift. I finde most of these words, but many of them in severall lines, and vttered vpon severall occasions, all which so ioine and chaine together in one continued line or sentence, and thereby to make the Author speake contrary to himselfe, is a thing easie to performe, but the performance is wicked, shamelesse, execrable, &c.*

Answer. Is it wicked and shamelesse, from two premises verbally found in the Rhemists, to collect a right conclusion, and to deliuer the same as their doctrine?

The Rhemists haue two propositions, from whence the assertion and conclusion wherewith my brother chargeth them, is interred. As I thus declare.

The Rhemists affirme, *The reward of good workes is such a reward, as vnder in Greeke, and merces in Latine import.*

But *vnder in Greeke, and merces in Latine* (as the same Rhemists say) *is a very stipend, hire, and wages, such as Paul speaketh of. 1 Tim. 5. 18. saying, The labourer is worthy of his hire: a thing equally and iustly answering the time and weight of his workes, rather than a free gift.*

Therefore the Rhemists hold, as D. White chargeth them, that the reward of good workes is a thing equally and iustly answering the time and weight of the worke, rather than a free gift.

T. W. *But giue this liberty, of omitting, and inserting, and conpling, to the Atheist, which your selfe M. White haue assumed, and you shall finde strange positions maintained by him. For example, the Psalmist speaking of your selfe, and other such like, saith: The foole hath said in his heart, there is no God. Now kindly allow him to blot out the word foole, as you more than foolishly did the word grace, and so insert the word wise man,*

l Rhem. annot. 2. Cor. 3. n. 3. k Math. 5. n. 3. m Rhem. 1. Cor. 3. 8. & Heb. 6. 10. & Math. 5. 2. & Reuel. 22. 4. & 3 Tim. 4. 4.

as you according to the wisdom of the world, did the word nature, and then observe how easily he will prone from the Scriptures, that there is no God. But thus knowingly and deliberately to corrupt, to the dishonour of your owne, and Catholike religion, is to me an argument most conuincing, that you are one of those fooles, who said in his heart, there is no God.

Answer. A Philosopher obserueth, that euery thing which is weake, vseth to be clamorous^k. And thus it fareth with you. Otherwise, what hath your aduersarie done, to cause such a gust of follie to come from you? The abuse committed, is onely your owne, who subtilly haue peruered that which D. White rightly conceived. And therefore as the Eccho^l returnes backe to the place from whence it came: so these bolts (Psal. 11. 2.) which you haue shot, to wit, the foole hath said, &c. must returne againe to your owne quiuer, or rest in your bosome, vntill you can finde a more iust occasion to vent them.

^k Seneca l. i. de ira. Inualidum omne natura est querulum.

^l Basil. ser. in iracund. Conuiuium simile est eccho in solitudine, quod reuertitur ad conuiuiatorem.

Paragraph. 3. Whether Cardinall Bellarmine be corrupted concerning Iustification.

T.W. In the very first page of his Preface to the Reader (so loth, it seemed, he was to lose any time) he sheweth vs one trick, somewhat like vnto the former. Where, by the way, I must aduertise him, that I hold him a man herein impoliticke and incautelous, that would not suffer the very face or front of his Treatise to passe vnblemished: since first he rather should haue coueted to winne the eare of credulitie, with pleasing insinuations of truth; and then (the iudgement of the Reader being once possessed) after to haue vented forth his more impure dregs. For we are taught, Iohn 2. Euery man at the first setteth forth good wine, and afterwards that which is worse.

Answer. S. Hierom hath a saying, *Caueas in alterum dicere, quod in te statim detorqueri potest*: Be warie to utter that against another, which will presently be retorted vpon your selfe. Could you so well obserue what was expedient for another, and be so obliuious in performing for your selfe? But it is commonly scene, that they which are prone to aduise others, are blinde in guiding themselves, according to the sentence of Euripides:

Hieron. cont. Ruffin. l. 3.

Ἀπαντες ἔσμεν εἰς τὸ ὀφθεῖν ὁφθαλμοί,

Αὐτοὶ δ' ὅταν σφάλλωμεν ἢ γινώσκωμεν.

Surely there was neuer any lame and anhelous iade, which hath more stumbled in his first setting out, than your selfe haue done in the entrance of your booke: which as I haue discovered in the last section, so I will further manifest in euery paragraph of your first Chapter.

T.W. M. White to intimate to his reader, how much the Catholikes doe disalue the passion of Christ, thus writeth: The Church of Rome teacheth, that Iustification is wrought by the habit of our owne inherent righteousness, and not by Christs. Thus he peremptorily, without any reservation, affirms, that we reiect the righteousness of Christ, to concurre to our iustification. To the prouing hereof, he produceth a testimonie of Bellarmine: Our owne inherent iustice is the formall cause of absolute iustification, and not the iustice of Christ imputed vnto vs. In the producing this testimonie, M. White hath committed a double fraud: first, he concealeth the

D. Wh. Way to the Church, Preface, p. 1.

Bellar. de iustif. l. 2. c. 2.

latter part of the sentence, which sheweth how we ascribe our iustification to Christ: secondly, whereas Bellarmine excludeth Christs merits from being the formall cause, M. White alleageth it to prove, that it is no cause thereof at all.

^a Hilar. de Trin.
l. 9. Intelligentia
dictorum, ex præ-
cedentibus & cō-
sequentibus expe-
ditur.

^d Scot. 4. d. 13. q.
1. ar. 3. Passio
Christi non delet
culpam nostram,
nisi ut causa meri-
toria, & per conse-
quens ut causa se-
cunda, quæ non
est de essentia rei.
Al. Hal. 4. q. 17. m.
4. ar. 1. Bonau. 4. d.
37. ar. 1. q. 1. Th.
Aqu. 4. d. 17. q. 1.

Ans. Had you in this and sundry other of your exceptions, vsed S. Hilare his rule, which is, *The understanding of sayings must be received from things pre- cedent and subsequent in the discourse*, you would haue troubled your selfe lesse in quarrelling without any cause. The point affirmed by D. White, is, *There is a reall difference betweene the Church of Rome and us, in the question of iustifi- cation, and the maine difference is concerning the formall cause. The Church of Rome maintaineth, that the iustification of a sinner is done by the habit of our owne inherent righteousness (to wit, formally) and not by Christs.* And for confirma- tion hereof, he produceth Bellarmine saying, *Our owne inherent righteousness is the formall cause of absolute iustification, and not Christs iustice imputed.*

My brother intended to charge Bellarmine no further, but onely with ex- cluding Christs merits from being an essentiall and formall cause of iustifica- tion; and with making it onely an efficient and externall cause thereof, accord- ing to Scotus: ^d *The passion of Christ doth not wipe out our fault, but onely as a meritorious cause, and by consequent as a second cause, which is not of the being of the thing.*

T.W. If Christs passion did concurre to iustification, as a formall cause, then it should really inhere in us, even according to Philosophie, which it doth not.

^e Zabarel. Forma
accipitur impro-
prie pro qualibet
causa quæ defini-
tionem rei consti-
tuit. Timpler. me-
taph. l. 3. c. 2. q. 8.
^f Vega pro C6. l. 7.
c. 23. Redemptio
cum sit quid ex-
trinsecū, convenit
Christo formali-
ter, sicut pretium
speciei dicitur illi-
us redemptio.
^g Stapl. de iustif.
l. 6. c. 8.
^h Vasq. l. 1. p. 3. d.
304. c. 1. & c. 5. Quæ
citatur multos.
ⁱ Hof. confess. Petr.
c. 71. D. Soto de
nat. & gra. l. 2. c. 30.
Becan. de iustif.
Calu. c. 2. pa. 304.
Ruard. Tapper. art.
8. de iustif.
^k Vasq. Deus verè
est & dicitur Crea-
tor, non tamen à
forma intrinseca,
sed extrinseca. Ca-
lutan. opuscul. 20. 3. tr.
21. c. 9. Infantibus
baptizatis debetur
eterna vita merito
duntaxat Christi.

Ans. The formall cause, is either taken properly for an inward cause, in forming the subiect, which it doth constitute and denominate, and every such formall cause is inherent: or else it signifies logically the next and immediate actuall cause or reason of things, giuing them their distinction and kinde: ^e whether the same be inherent, assistant, or any way by relation applied or vni- ted to the subiect. And thus the immediate cause of the eclipse of the Sunne, to wit, the interposition of the bodie of the Moone betweene our sight and the Sunne beames, is called the formall cause of the eclipse. In like manner, the formall cause of libertie and bondage, is not any thing inherent in the bond or free, but an externall relation, &c.

Our aduersaries themselves affirme, that the formall cause of redemption is extrinsecall ^f, to wit, the oblation of Christ vpon the crosse, Heb. 10. 10. Ephes. 1. 7. And D. Stapleton ^g, with sundry other Pontificians ^h, make the free fauour of God for the merit of Christ, the formall cause of remission of sins.

And in the same manner, may the satisfaction of Christ imputed or applied, be the formall cause of iustification, without any opposition to Philosophie. For if iustification were an entitie compounded of matter and forme, or of sub- iect and accident, like things naturall or artificiall; then, as our aduersaries ob- iect ⁱ, it must haue a forme inherent: but being onely a relatiue action of God toward his creature, it admitteth no formall cause inexisting, or properly so called, more than creation ^k, redemption, reconciliation, &c.

Paragr. 4. *Wherein D. White is accused of corrupting Bellarmine, about me- rit of works.*

1791 in (D. Di-
griff. 15. n. 13. p. 23).

T.W. M. White having affirmed, that many Catholikes condemne all me- rit of works, alleageth certaine words of Bellarmine to that purpose, saying:

By

By reason of the vncertaintie of mans owne righteousnesse, and for feare of vaine-glory, it is our safest way to repose our whole confidence in the sole mercy and goodnesse of God. But if all Bellarmines contexture had bene produced, and the subiect of his whole disputation considered, it would haue appeared, that he maintaines positively the merit of works, and deposeth the contrary to that whereunto he is produced. Which being so, D. White dealeth herein perfect Minister-like, &c.

Ans. D. Whites assertion, whereunto he produceth sundry testimonies of Papists, is this: *Howsoeuer our aduersaries contend for their merits, yet the learnedest and most iudicious among them, disanow them, teaching people at the way-gate to renounce them.*

This position hath two branches: First, the most learned and iudicious Papists disanow the merit of works, he meaneth according to the tenet thereof, by diuers Pontificians, since the late Trident Councell^a.

Secondly, the most learned and iudicious among them, teach people, at the time of their departure out of this life, to renounce them, in respect of repoling the hope of saluation in them.

My brother produced Bellarmine, to proue this second branch; and therefore the P. P. to manifest his Popish sinceritie, and to make way to a slander, wilfully omitted and concealed the words [*teaching people at their way-gate to renounce them*] whereunto the saying of Bellarmine was referred: and foisteth in a cogging sentence of his owne, which is, *In proose that the Catholike Doctors condemne all merit of works, he alledgeth the foresaid Cardinall, &c.* But this shuffling will not serue your turne: *Dolis apud ignorantes locus est, scientibus vero, dolum intendere non est aliud quam risum mouere*^b: *There is place for guile with the ignorant, but to seeke to put tricks of deceit upon the understanding, is to moue laughter.*

^a *Read the end of this Chap. Obserua. concerning merit.*

^b *Ruffin. hist. Eccles. l. i. c. 11.*

T. W. *What impudencie is it in M. White to produce Bellarmine, as denying the doctrine of merit of works, when the subiect of this very booke (from whence these words are taken, and also of diuers other books in that Tome) is onely to proue that works doe merit?*

Ans. It is one thing to disanow merits in regard of placing hope of saluation in them, in our way-gate or time of temptation and triall; and another, to disallow them altogether. D. White chargeth Bellarmine with disanowing merits in the former sort; and the P. P. accuseth him of saying, that the said author disalloweth and condemneth merits generally.

But yet further, because you minister so iust occasion of inquiring into Bellarmines opinion concerning merit of works, I will be bold to require a solution of you in these two or three doubts.

First, whether is it not possible for Bellarmine to defend merit of works in termes, and yet in substance of matter to denie the same? Vasquez your Iesuite^c obserueth, that this hath hapned to sundry Catholikes.

Secondly, when Bellarmine affirmeth, *This is it we meane in saying, good workes are meritorious; that God is not onely delighted with good workes, but conciliated or induced thereby to benefit them which worke well*^d. What difference is there betweene this assertion and ours^e? Also saying in another place^f, *Seeing our workes of themselves, considered onely according to their nature, be temporarie, vile, and in no sort equall to a supernaturall and eternall reward, surely there must of necessitie be added vnto them a dignitie beyond their owne, that the reward of eternall life may be rendred vnto them.* Whether is not this assertion the very same which Vasquez affirmeth to agree in substance with ours, and in deed, to ouerthrow the merit of condignitie^g?

^a Vasq. 1. 2. p. 2. d. 214. c. 1. n. 1. Contingere potest vt si veram causam & rationem meriti non assignemus, verbis solum ab haereticis dissidentes, re ipsa cum iis conveniamus: quod sane aliquibus Catholicis in hac controuersia accidisse inferius patebit, &c.

^d Bellar. de iustif. l. 5. c. 2.

^e *Read the end of this Chap. Obserua. 1. of Merit.*

^f Bellar. de iustif. l. 5. c. 14. Cum opera nostra bona, si per se considerentur, sint temporalia, & vilia, & nullo modo aequalia precio supernaturali, &c.

^g Vasq. 1. 2. d. 214. s. 1. & deinceps, c. 5.

^a Bellar. de iustif. l. 5. c. 14. & c. 17. Ita ut in opere bono, &c. sit quidam proportio & equalitas ad premium vite æternæ, &c. Vasq. l. 2. d. 214. c. 5. n. 29. ⁱ Vasq. ib. c. 5. n. 24. 26. &c. & c. 6. Immo a omnino actione nostra secundum omnes circumstantias, &c. non potest effici magis bona ex solo verbo Dei promittentis, &c. qui promitteret equum pro obsequio cuiusvis, &c. ^k Bellar. de iustif. l. 1. c. 21. ^l Ibid. l. 5. c. 19. in fine.

^m Vasq. ib. d. 215. c. 4. n. 27. Sixt. Senf. biblioth. l. 5. ann. 199. Durand. 2. dist. 27. q. 2. Quod dicitur de gratia, quod equatur glorie, in virtute, quia est eius seminarium, patet quod metaphorice dicitur, &c. ⁿ Tansen. concord. Ruag. c. 39. Si quis proponat patrem, numerare aliquo promisso, filium ad servens literarum studium prouocantem, &c. Vega. opusc. q. 5. & q. 6. Erit tantum dispositio quadam ad habendum illud munus, pa. 809. ^o Bellar. de iustif. l. 5. c. 7. Tutissimum est fiduciam totam in sola Dei misericordia & benignitate reponere, &c. Vega opusc. quest. 4. Stapl. de iustif. l. 10. c. 14. ^p Vasq. l. 2. p. 2. d. 213. c. 7. n. 37. &c.

For thus I reason out of Bellarmine and Vasquez: Every merit of iustice and condignitie, requires an equalitie betweene the worke and the reward ^h. But Bellarmine affirmeth, that good workes of themselves without Gods promise, are temporall, vile, and not equall to the reward. And Vasquez saith, that Gods promise being extrinsecall, increaseth not the dignitie of the worke, neither addeth any further equalitie with the reward than it had before, but only obligeth God in fidelitie to keepe his promise ⁱ. Neither doth it salue this matter that Bellarmine saith, there is certaine equalitie and proportion ^k betweene the worke and reward: for himselfe ^l elsewhere, and other of his fellowes ^m acknowledge, that every proportion causeth not equalitie. And a figuratiue equalitie (such indeed as Bellarmine is) can produce no more but an improper kinde of merit. To wit, like as when a father promisseth a reward to his childe, vpon condition of doing that dutie whereunto he is already bound ⁿ, and the childe in much imperfection, yet with a willing minde performeth so much of this his dutie as he is able, he deserueth no reward in iustice, neither performeth any thing in iustice equall to the reward promised; but obtaineth the reward by the liberalitie and fidelitie of his father.

Thirdly, it seemeth that Bellarmine limpeth and halseth betweene his owne partie and vs, when he affirmeth, *that it is most safe to repose all our confidence in the sole bountie and mercy of God* ^o. For otherwise, why doth his fellow Vasquez lash and censure his doctrine, but for that he perceiueth some concord thereof with vs ^p?

Paragr. 5. Touching the testimonie of Thom. Aquinas, Rom. 3. l. 4. & Gal. 3. l. 4.

T.W. Thomas Aquinas in the places alledged, speaketh onely of workes ceremoniall or morall, wrought by the power of nature: M. White pradueth him as though hee taught, that workes proceeding of grace, could not iustifie.

Th. Aq. com. Gal. 3. l. 4. Opera non sunt causa, quod aliquis sit iustus apud Deum, sed potius sunt executiones & manifestationes iustitie. Ib. Iacob. 2. dicitur, Nonne Abraham ex operibus iustificatus est?

Ans. Although Thomas in the beginning of his Commentarie mentioneth such workes as be performed by the power of nature, yet afterwards he enlargeth his discourse, and speaketh also of workes wrought by the power of grace. For he treateth of such workes as are the manifestation and execution of iustice; and of such as Saint Iames mentioneth chap. 2. saying, *Was not Abraham iustified by workes?* But these were workes of grace. And therefore Thomas in the places alledged by D. White, excludeth from iustification, workes done in the state of grace.

Paragr. 6. Wherein D. White is accused of corrupting S. Aug. de Cinit. Dei, l. 19. c. 27.

T.W. S. Augustines testimonie truly alledged, is, This our iustice, though it be true, by reason of the end of the true good, whereunto it is referred, yet it is such in this life, as that it rather consisteth of the remission of our finnes, than of the perfection of vertues. Here first our Minister addeth she

the word all, for greater swelling and fulnesse of speech, which is not in S. Augustine.

Ans. Your selfe haue changed this Fathers words: for he saith, *Ipsa nostra iustitia, our very iustice it selfe*: that is, our purest iustice, our whole iustice, and euery part thereof, which is fully equipollent to all our iustice, and rather more empharicall: as if one should say, Our very life is miserable; he intendeth, that all our life, and euery passage and degree thereof is such: and you say, *Ista nostra iustitia, this our iustice, &c.*

T. W. Secondly, he leaueth out a parcell of the same sentence, (to wit, although our iustice be true, by reason of the end of the true good, whereunto it is referred) in which S. Augustine acknowledgeth the very Catholike doctrine of iustification, to wit, that our iustice is true iustice; against which, this very place is urged.

Ans. D. White produceth this testimonie to proue that sinne cleaueth to the workes of the godly, and blemisheth them in part: and therefore, that they may be fully iust, they haue need of remission of sin adherent.

And if you be not transported with affection, you cannot accuse my brother for alleaging it to this end: because D. Stapleton, and other of your owne partie, haue produced it to the like purpose: and the place of it selfe doth effectually proue so much. Now presupposing the perpetuall concomitance of remission of sins with our iustice, we acknowledge, according to the holy Scripture, Eph. 4. 24. Esa. 58. 8. Gal. 5. 22. Phil. 4. 18. 1 Ioh. 2. 5. and with Augustine, that the righteousness of regeneration is true iustice, not onely in comparison of wickednesse, but according to the rule of vertue.

But this euinceth not, that the same is able to iustifie man, according to S. Paul his acceptation of iustification, Rom. 4. First, because it is lesse in quantitie than the morall law of God requires. Secondly, because it is, by adherence of sinfulness, so far contaminate in qualitie, that it hath alwaies need of pardon, and new imputation of Christs merits, both to supply the defect, and to remit the adherent impunitie. Thirdly, because Christ hath not bestowed or appointed it to that end, Gal. 3. 21.

T. W. He falsly translateth for his owne aduantage, perfectione virtutum, by perfection of iustice.

Ans. 1. Your selfe haue translated, tanta, so great, a word noting the quantitie and perfection of our iustice, by talis, such, a word signifying the qualitie: and so whereas S. Augustine meaneth, that mans righteousness is so small in quantitie, that therefore it consisteth rather in remission of sins, than perfection of iustice; you will haue it to be onely such, as hath remission of veniall finnes going with it.

2. Your owne Schoolemen, make these words synonymies: Peter Lombard, *Iustitia magna virtus animi est &c.* (habitually) iustice is a great vertue of the minde. And Alex. Hales, *Secundum substantiam &c.* In substance of matter, grace and vertue are one thing: (now grace and habituall iustice are the same.) And Vorillo: Grace (inherent iustice) is an habit and a vertue. It is reported of Domitian the Emperour, that he vsed to sit in his chamber, and catch flies. This Priest might well haue bene his companion, who wanting better employment, occupies himselfe in these petite cauils.

And now for a conclusion of this section, I desire the Reader to obserue, that whereas this clamorous P. P. in the first chapter of his booke hath made siue assaults against D. White, and inserted into each of them, many refuse and abusive reproaches: That in regard of the matter, he is fully answered, and his first encounter

Aug. de ciu. Dei, l. 19. c. 27. Ipsa nostra iustitia, quamuis vera sit propter veri boni finem ad quem refertur, tanta tamen est in hac vita, ut potius remissione peccatorum constet quam perfectione virtutum.

c Aug. cont. Iulian. l. 2. in Hilario, d. Stapl. de iustif. l. 6. c. 8. e Castl. confute. art. 6. 10. Lo. Viues schol. in Aug. de ciu. Dei, l. 19. c. 27. Vega pro concil. l. 15. c. 20. mentio- mesh some Papists who haue vsed this place of Aug. as before.

f Aug. cont. 2. ep. Pelag. l. 3. c. 7. & c. 10. Iustitia secundum quam iustus ex fide viu- est vera iustitia, regula virtutum. Calu. inst. l. 3. c. 15. §. 7. g Reade afterward Obseru. 2. §. 1. concerning iustif. the end of the chapter, where you shall find this afterward confirmed.

b 2. sent. d. 27. ex Aug. sup. P. 118. c. p. 3. q. 61. m. 2. ar. 4.

d 1. d. 27. ar. 2.

e Sueton. in Domitian. c. 3. Tenebras & secreta captauit, & menses habebat.

encounter is wholly defeated. And concerning his railing, I will say no more, but that as dogs vs̄e to pisse in the fairest places of the house; so it is no newes to heare Popish Priests to reuile them which are of worthy desert in Gods Church.

Observation 1. *Touching remission of sinnes in iustification; Wherein is shewed, that some of our adversaries overthrow the true definition thereof deliuered in the Scripture, and primitive Fathers.*

Proposition 1. The holy Scripture, and primitive Fathers, describing remission of sins, teach that the same is a free condonation of the crime and guilt of sinne, for the merit of Christ.

Heb. 8. 12. Jerem. 31. 34. it is expressed by a *ἰλασμός* *ilasmós*, *I will be mercifull*; and the^b Hebrew word vsed for remission of sins, commeth of a root, signifying, to pardon, forgieue, to be fauourable, and propitious. Moses praiech to God for the pardon of the peoples sinne, in this manner, Numb. 14. 18, 19. *The Lord is long-suffering and of great mercy, forgiving iniquitie and transgression, &c. Pardon, I beseech thee, the iniquitie of this people, from Egypt vnto this day.* Reade Dan. 9. 9. Esa. 40. 2. and Psal. 51. 9. Dauid praiech, *Hide thy face from my sins.* Esa. 43. 25. *I will not remember thy sin.* Iob 7. 21. *Why dost thou not pardon my transgression?* &c. Esa. 38. 17. *Thou hast cast all my sins behinde thy backe.* And Act. 13. 38. *Through this man is preached vnto you forgiveness of sins; and by him, all that beleene, are iustificd* (that is, absolved) &c. And remission of sins is resembled to the free forgiuing of a debt, Matth. 18. 27. to the making of bondmen and debtors free in the yeere of Iubilie, Esa. 61. 2. Luk. 4. 18, 19, and the act of it is called, *not imputation*, Psal. 32. 2.

The Fathers also teach, that remission of sin is a free condonation. Augu-
stine: *What is it for God to become propitious to iniquitie? it is to be pardoning*
and granting forgiveness ^f. Bernard: *It is sufficient for me, to all iniquitie, onely to*
haue him propitious, whom I haue offended: all the sinne which he hath decreed not
to impute vnto me, is as though it were not ^g. Augustine: *Sinne is vnloosed by*
indulgence ^h.

Proposition 2. Together with the action of God remitting sinne, concurreth another action of diuine grace, enabling man to forsake and mortifie every greater sinne which God pardoneth, 1 Cor. 6. 11. Hebr. 9. 14. Reuel. 1. 5, 6. 1 Pet. 2. 9. Ezech. 36. 26. Esa. 53. 5. Psal. 103. 3. Augustine saith, *Remission of sinnes maketh men good trees*. Bernard: *Sinnes are not onely pardoned, but the gift of sanctitie is conferred*. And Chrysostome: *Deliuering from sinne, he ingrafteth righteousness, yea he extinguisheth sinne, and suffereth it not to be*. And like as when Naaman was healed, 2 King. 5. his leprosie was removed, and his flesh restored to his naturall health and beauty; so when God remitteth sin, he remoueth the guilt by free pardon, and conferreth grace, to the destroying of sinne, and healing the soule^m, Psal. 103. 3. Mich. 7. 19. ^a

We are free from the absurd opinion wherewith our aduersaries charge vs, to wit, that we hold, when sinnes are pardoned, God doth not change the minde of the sinner, neither destroy the blot of sinne, but the same remaining in the soule in the like manner it did before condonation, is onely taken away by a not imputation of the guilt: for we beleeue, as I haue deliuered before, vsing a twofold explication.

orig. l. 3. c. 3. Remiss. pec. facit, vt sanctitas in nobis inchoetur. Chem. exam, conc. Trid. p. 1. de iustif. = 1271/1717 שׁוּבָה signif. opprimere & delicere, &c. Ribera com. in Mich. = Vsq. 1. 3. d. 10. c. 4. n. 22. Iuxta sensum harreticorum, &c. peccata nostra radi & non eradicari, tegi & non tolli: nihil aliud esse quam peccata nostra in nobis reuera manere, atque eodem modo post iustif. sicut antea nos manere in istos peccatores. Bellar. Becan. & alii, &c. Bell. com. Pfal. 3. v. 2. Dicunt heretici, hanc remissionem peccatorum, non esse remissionem peccatorum veram, sed imputationem, &c. Sander. de vitiis monach. l. 1. c. 4.

First,

First, the destruction and abolition of the sinne remitted, is a worke of sanctification, and not of iustification, strictly taken, according to S. Paul, Rom. 4.

Secondly, according to the nature of the sinne, so is the extirpation or destruction thereof.

Whensoeuer foule, enormous, and mortall sinnes, 1 Cor. 6. 9. Ephes. 5. 6. 1 Ioh. 3. 8. which Tertullian calleth *graviora & exitiosa*, more grievous and exitious, are pardoned by Gods mercy, the same are abolished and cease to be: yea ordinarily before the Lord forgiveth them, a sinner beginneth to detest and forsake them, Prou. 28. 13. Esa. 1. 16. 2. Ioh. 1. 6, 7. & 3. 6

But habituall concupiscence, & *delicta quotidiana incurfionis*, many smaller offences, and delinquencies of daily incurfion, which by reason of our frailtie, we can neuer be free from in this life, 1. Ioh. 1. 8. remaine in iust persons, and the Lord forgives them vpon these conditions.

First, that his children be humbled because of them, Rom. 7. 24.

Secondly, that they so far repress and mortifie them, as that they lead them not to foule and wilfull offences.

Thirdly, that by confession, praier, almes-deeds, exhibiung mercy and forgiveness to others, and other deeds of piety and charitie, they craue at Gods hand the forgiveness of them. Prou. 16. 6. Matth. 6. 14. & 7. 7. Act. 10. 2. 4. 1 Ioh. 1. 9. Iam. 5. 17. Matth. 6. 17. 1 Pet. 4. 8.

If men forsake not damnable crimes, 1 Cor. 6. 9, 10. 1 Ioh. 3. 8. they shall neuer be forgiven, Ezech. 18. 13. 21. 1 Ioh. 1. 6. And no sins may be esteemed so small, as that we neglect the meanes of procuring pardon for them.

Proposition 3. Many of our learned aduersaries destroy that which is principall and most essentiall in remission of sins, to wit, condonation.

Vasquez the Iesuite saith, *Euen as the true reason of inherent iustice can by no meanes be explicated, vlesse we say, that that which is in vs wanteth no fauour and new acceptation of God, to make vs iust and holy before him: so also the same cannot be defended, vlesse we affirme, that thereby, as by a contrary forme, the whole blot and offence of sin is taken away without any fauour or condonation of God.*

The said Author confirmeth his opinion by these two Arguments especially.

Arg. 1. The Trident Councell makes inherent iustice the forme of iustification; and hereupon, forasmuch as whensoeuer the forme of any thing is vnited to the subiect, presently the thing hath the constitution and being: if after the infusion of diuine grace, a condonation were required on Gods part, (as Bellarmine, Suarez, and other affirme ¹) then inherent iustice were not a sufficient and perfect forme.

Arg. 2. If a condonation be admitted for the merit of Christ, then the merit of Christ imputed, is the formall cause of that condonation ²: and granting this, the iustification of a sinner must haue two formes: one of remission of sins, the other of inward cleansing and sanctification. But this is contrary to the Trident Councell, affirming, that *iustification hath but one forme* ³. And it differs very little from the doctrine of the Protestants ⁴. For in the principall, it is one with it, to wit, in that it holdeth that a iustified person doth next and immediately receiue the remission of sins for the merit of Christ ⁵ imputed. And the smaller difference betweene the sides, to wit, whether inherent iustice may be admitted a part of iustification, might be qualified by some such modification as Vega ⁶ propoundeth to Caluin, saying, *If at all times, when one is iustified, he is also sanctified, what offence is it to allow one common word (namely Iustification ^b) to expresse and containe both these parts?*

I am not ignorant that many other Papists admit condonation; but Vasquez chargeth that opinion with hauing affinity with ours, and affirmeth and pro- ueth, that it is repugnant to the Trident Councell.

¹ Tertul. de idol. c. 1. Aug. Enchir. c. 64. & sup. Iob. tr. 71.

² Tertul. de pud. c. 19.

³ Aug. tr. 5. sup. epist. Ioh. & cont. Crescon. l. 2. c. 12. & de perf. iust. ad rat. 16.

⁴ Reade becafter Obser. 1. of the merits of workes.

⁵ Valq. 1. 2. p. 3. d.

⁶ 304. c. 3. Vera ratio iustitiae inherens, nullaratione explicari potest, & c. nisi asseramus ea sola tanquam contraria forma sine fauore et condonatione dei remitti & deleri totam rationem maculae et offensionis. He allegat per istam opinionem, Thom. Aqu. Caietan. Sotus. Ru. ard. Tapner. Trid. Counc. &c.

¹ Bellar. de pec. l. 5. c. 19. & de iustif. l. 1. c. 16. & de purg. l. 1. c. 10. Suar. to 4. d. 8. & 3. n. 11. Andrad. orch. expl. l. 6. Stapl. de iustif. l. 5. c. 1. & l. 6. c. 8.

² Stapl. de iustif. l. 5. c. 1. Misericordia Dei, siue fauor Dei, propter Christum.

³ Bellar. de iustif. l. 1. c. 3. Conc. Trid. sess. 6. c. 7. Apertissimè verbi dixit, vnica esse formale causam iustif.

⁴ Valq. 1. 2. d. 202. c. 1. Hæc opinio à sententia Chemnitii parum differt.

⁵ Stapl. Antid. B. uang. Math. 20. v. 28. Homo impius Deo reconciliatur & iustificatur. seu ex impio fit iustus, per gratiam pec. remiss. precio sanguinis Christi sibi concessam.

⁶ Vega pro Conc. Trid. l. 1. c. 5.

^b Beza annot. Tit. 3. v. 7. Iustif. nomen largè accipio, vt complectatur quicquid à Christo consequi-

mur, tam per imputationem, tam per Spiritus in nobis sanctificationem. Sic accipitur iustif. verbum, Rom. 8. 30. Beza in quest. In- verbum nomine iustificationis intelligitur etiam sanctificatio, quia hæc duo prorsus coherent.

Obser. 2.

Observation 2. Concerning Iustification.

The Popish faith of iustification, is supported with three positions, whereof neither is true.

Section 1. Wherein the first pillar of Romane iustification is examined.

Our aduersaries maintaine, that inherent iustice in all regenerate persons, is in this life absolute and perfect ^a; and the most famous in their schoole, teach, that it is so, without any further mercy and fauour of God, besides the first production thereof ^b. And this is a necessarie principle, whereupon the frame of their iustification dependeth. For seeing no effect exceedeth the cause, from whence it proceedeth, if inherent iustice be defectiue and imperfect, then the formall effects thereof ^c, to wit, the expulsion of sin, to make a man iust, acceptable to God, and heire of heauen, must be imperfect ^d: and such vertues as proceed from the habit of that imperfect iustice, can neither merit, nor satisfie in condignitie.

But that inherent iustice is imperfect, appeareth by sayings of holy Scripture, testimonie of primitiue Fathers, and confession of many learned Papists.

1. The Scripture teacheth, that a iust mans righteousness is defectiue, imperfect, and mixed with uncleanness. Rom. 7. 18. Iob 9. 20. Esa. 64. 6.

And howsoever the Iesuites ^e shake off these testimonies, yet the same in former times were understood by learned Papists and other Doctors, as wee expound them.

Gerison alleageth the place of Esa. 64. 6. saying, *Who can glory that he hath a cleane heart? who can say, I am innocent and pure? Whereas E say himselfe with the rest becomming vile in his owne eies, pronounceth in a lowly confession, All our righteousnesses are as the rags of a menstruous woman, and as the cloathes of lepers, defiled with mattery filth*. Bernard: *What can all our iustice be before the Lord? shall it not, according to the Prophet, be accounted as a menstruous garment? and if it be strictly indged, all our iustice will be found iniust, and hauing lesse than it ought. What shall we say then of our sins, when our righteousness is not able to answer for it selfe?* And in another place, *Our meane iustice, if it be any, is peradventure upright, but not pure, vlesse we value our selues aboue our fathers, who no lesse truly than humbly haue confessed, All our righteousnesses are as the cloth of a menstruous woman: and how can that be pure iustice, wherein sin is not as yet wanting?* And in the same manner, Bonauenture, Caietan ^f, and the Enchiridion of Celen ^g, expound that place of Esay.

The place of Iob, chap. 9. 20. is expounded by Gregorie, of the imperfection and uncleanness of our workes, saying, *All our iustice is manifestly promed to be iniustice, if it be narrowly indged*. And how much soener we trauell in good workes, we neuer attaine true cleanness, but onely imitate it ^h.

Secondly, whereas inherent iustice consisteth principally of faith, hope, and charitie ⁱ; if these vertues be imperfect, then all our righteousnesses wanteth perfection. But that the same are imperfect, appears first by the Scripture, exhorting iust persons to increase in these vertues, Luk. 17. 5. Ephes. 4. 15. Iam. 1. 4. 2 Pet. 3. 18. and reprobuing such as hauing the same in veritie, wanted degrees of perfection, Matth. 14. 31. Reu. 2. 19, 20. Iob 38. 1. with Iob 40. 5. Secondly,

^a Bellar. de iustif. l. c. 3.

^b Valsq. 1. 3. p. 3. d. 204. n. 11. Ostendit tale esse iustitiam nostram inherentem, vt suapte natura, absque vilo fauore, nos iustos reddat. Ibid. c. 3. n. 31. Concilium Trid. ostendit nostram iustitiam inherentem, esse veram & perfectam iustitiam, quae virtute sua purgat a peccato. lb. d. 208. n. 35. Suapte natura ita pellit maculam ipsam, vt nulla indigeat condonatione Dei. Soto de nat. & grat. l. 2. c. 20. Vega pro Concil. Trid. lib. 15. ca. 12. Ruard. Tapper. art. 8. de iustif. Hec iustitia, &c. ferre potest Dei seueri iudicium, eiq; oppositioni, &c. opera iustorum nulla ratione reprehendi possunt seuerissime discussa.

^c Bellar. de iustif. l. 1. c. 16.

^d Andrad. orth. expl. l. 6. scilicet vniu. imperfecta, &c.

^e Bellar. de iustif. l. 4. c. 20.

^f Gerison. p. 3. de consil. theol. l. 4. profa. 1. & p. 4. tr. de sig. Sunt foeditates quasi pannus menstruatus, aut ficut panniculi leprosum, qui per continuam sanietem defluentem sordidantur.

^g Bern. fest. om. Sanct. ser. 1. Adrian 4. de sac. Eucharq. 1. resp. pag. 65. col. 2.

^h Greg. moral. l. 9. c. 14.

ⁱ Greg. moral. l. 9. c. 14. 1b. cap. 28. Quousque poena corruptionis astringimur, quamlibet rectis operibus infundemus, veram mundiciam nequaquam apprehendimus, sed imitamur. Quauto ad illum (Deum) verius per bona opera surgimus, tanto subtilius vitæ nostræ sordes agnoscimus, quibus ab eius iustitia discordamus.

^a De verb. Esa. ser. 5. Adrian. in 4. de sac. Euchar. l. 1. c. 1. Enchir. Colon. de sac. Euchar. Defecerant sacrificia laudis post lapsum, & vt Esaias ait, Facti sumus vt immundi omnes, &c. ^b Caietan. com. 1. Cor. 5. Iusticia Christi est meritorium Christi, &c. quod dicitur Dei, quia est apud diuinum tribunal vera iustitia ad differentiam iustitiarum nostrarum, quæ apud diuinum tribunal, sunt velut pannus menstruatus. ^c Greg. moral. l. 9. c. 14. ^d 1b. cap. 28. Quousque poena corruptionis astringimur, quamlibet rectis operibus infundemus, veram mundiciam nequaquam apprehendimus, sed imitamur. Quauto ad illum (Deum) verius per bona opera surgimus, tanto subtilius vitæ nostræ sordes agnoscimus, quibus ab eius iustitia discordamus. ^e Bellar. de iustif. l. 1. c. 7.

inherent iustice proceedeth from an efficient cause, hauing imperfection and vncleannesse, to wit, from the will and powers of man. For although diuine grace be one efficient thereof, yet (as our aduersaries teach ^m) it is but a cause in part, and the free will of man is another cause, actiuelly producing the same. But the will and all the powers of iust persons are regenerate onely in part, and haue much of the old Adam remaining in them, Ephe. 4. 22. Rom. 7. 18. Gal. 5. 17. and thereupon they must needs infuse some vncleannesse into the effects produced by them. And S. Augustine affirmeth thus, saying, *That the children of God are so led by the Spirit of God, as that they haue also motions of their owne spirit, whereby they faile ⁿ.* And euen as one hauing a lame legge, although he walke the right way to his iourneys end, and shun all by-paths as farre as his knowledge can direct him, yet halteth as he goeth, Gen. 32. 31. so the remainder of weaknesse and sinfulness of the old man, hath an influence into the spirituall motion of the iust, which although it preuaile not so much as to peruert the substance of their iust action, yet it maketh them feeble and imperfect in their holy waies.

Arg. 2. From the testimonies of the Fathers.

Augustine saith, *° Poore am I and miserable, and being as yet congealed in the vncleannesse of the earthly Image, doe in earthly affections and terrene actions, more resemble the first Adam than the second.* And againe, *° Being renewed by faith and hope, how many old things doe we? for we are so clothed with Christ, as that wee carrie some of the rags of the old Adam about vs.*

S. Augustine and all his schollers affirme, that the good workes of iust persons are imperfect in this life, and haue not the puritie which the law of God requireth.

Augustine: *° No man loneth God so much, as the vncchangeable rule of veritie requires, and that which is lesse is sinne. And the righteousness of this life is inchoate ^r, according to the measure of our infirmitie a certaine smaller iustice ^r. The same is called true, because it is vnfained ^r. Yet not altogether faire, but by comparison ⁿ. Called perfect, because by the vprightnesse of a direct course, it moneth towards perfection, wanting damnable crimes ^r. Vnfained, but not pure ^r. Such as needeth Gods eye to looke vpon it, affectu pietatis, non iudicio veritatis, by the compassion of fatherly pietie, and not by the iudgement of veritie ^r. And the cauill which moderne Papiſts vse, *° saying, The righteousness of iust persons is called imperfect and impure, in respect of the puritie of the diuine nature, or of the glorious state of the beaueuly Saints,* is censured by S. Hierom, saying: *No flesh shall bee iustified in thy sight; he speaketh not in comparison, as old and new hereticks teach ^a.**

Also the Fathers generally affirme, that the good deeds of iust men, after they be wrought, haue need of mercie ^b, and must be presented to God with prayer ^c, and be excused by his mercy ^d, and they cannot goe with safetie to Gods tribunall without mercie ^e: and they must borrow weight from the bowels of the Lord ^f, and receiue supply of that which is lesse, from him ^g. And Isidore saith, *° At the barre of the Iudge, the righteousness of a iust person is not secure: and the very iustice of the righteous must be iustified by God, otherwise before him it is sinne.* And Chrysostome, *° The repentance of man alone, could not wipe away sin, but that it is mixed with the mercy of God.* And Hugo Victorinus: *God by his grace bestoweth vpon man faith, which faith againe by grace he reputeth for perfection, euen as if it were perfect ^k.*

Arg. 3. From the testimonie of learned Papiſts.

D. Stapleton teacheth, that the iustice of regenerate persons, *° needeth the*

^a Aug. de perf. iust. ad. 16. ^b Bern. de verb. Bla. ser. 2. ^c Bernar. in. dedic. eccles. ser. 5. ^d Andrad. orth. expl. l. 6. pag. 533. ^e Hieron. l. 3. in Ierem. c. 13. ^f Aug. confess. l. 9. c. 13. de Trin. l. 13. c. 20. ^g Greg. Moral. l. 9. c. 14. ^h Ib. l. 5. c. 7. ⁱ Hieron. in Ierem. l. 6. c. 36. ^j Bernard. in Cant. ser. 61. ^k Bern. in Epiph. ser. 1. ^l Isidor. l. 1. sent. c. 27. Ipsa iusticia quæ quique iustus est, Deo iustificante iustificatur, alioqui apud Deum, ipsa peccatum est. ^m Chrys. ad pop. Antioch. no 80. ⁿ Hug. de sanct. victor. elucid. in Rom. 4. q. 101. ^o Stapl. de iustif. l. 4. c. 8. Iustitia bonorum operum in fide, est vera coram Deo iustitia, vtunque mixta peccatis & imperfecta, tum quoad vniuersa peccata, tum quoad modum implendi, &c. Quicquid ad plenam & perfectam adimplerem mandata prætermittendo, & frequenter venialiter peccando, siue propter imperfectionem in modo implendi, id totum Christi misericordia & gratia indulget, facitque indulgendo, vt perinde sit coram Deo iusti, vt si vniuersa ad amissum mandata, eademque perfectissime fecissemus.

mercy

^m Becan. de prædest. Cath. c. 7. Bel-lar. de iustif. l. 5. c. 5. Stapl. Antid. B-uang. Ioh. 15. pa. 356. Greg. Val. ro. 2. d. 8. q. 3. p. 4. Chumel. var. disp. p. 2. disc. 5. §. 1. Vafqu. l. 2. d. 211. c. 4. n. 25. & c. 7. n. 50. Lindan. pa-nopl. l. 3. c. 17. Voluntas humana Christi auxilio ce-lesti adiuta, vere est boni operis non sine gratia facti causa.

ⁿ Aug. enchir. c. 64. l. 3. cont. a. e-pist. Pelag. cap. 7. Hæc est nostra in ipsa perigrinatio-ne iusticia, vt ad illam perfectio-nem plenitudin-que iusticia; &c. nunc ipsius cursus rectitudine & per-fectione tendamus.

^o Rude Aug. de nupt. & concup. l. 1. c. 7. Basil. cited by Iac. Graph. decis. aur. p. 1. l. 2. c. 52.

^p Aug. ep. 106.

^q Aug. sup. Plal.

^r Chrys. in Gal.

^s Sicut aurum vi-

^t detur quidem splē-

^u didum, priusquam

^v mittatur in fornacem, verum vbi

^w traditum fuerit igni, tum reo certo

^x dignoscitur, co-

^y quod adulterium

^z est, ab eo quod

^{aa} est sincerum sepa-

^{ab} rato: sic & no-

^{ac} stra opera, vbi di-

^{ad} ligenter examina-

^{ae} ueris, tum eviden-

^{af} ter reteguntur, vi-

^{ag} debimurque: nos-

^{ah} ipsos multis cri-

^{ai} minibus obnoxios.

^{aj} Aug. de pec. mer.

^{ak} & remit. l. 2. c. 15.

^{al} & de perf. iust.

^{am} resp. ad 15. & ep.

^{an} 29. & con. 2. ep.

^{ao} Pelag. l. 3. c. 7.

^{ap} De pecc. mer.

^{aq} l. 2. c. 7.

^{ar} Cont. 2. epist.

^{as} Pelag. l. 3. c. 7. & de

^{at} spir. & lit. c. 36. &

^{au} cont. Faust. Ma-

^{av} nich. l. 22. c. 7.

^{aw} De pecc. mer. l.

^{ax} 2. c. 13.

^{ay} Bernard. Cant.

^{az} ser. 38.

mercy and indulgence of God to forgive the imperfection and defect in the measure of fulfilling the law. And Cardinal Hosius saith: Were it not for the intercession of the mercy of Christ, who gave himselfe for vs an oblation and sacrifice for sinne, and but that he appeareth before the face of God for vs, a wee would bee due to our most commendable life, if without his mercie it were to be discussed in iudgement. And Pighius: We were all cast away, were it not, that Gods mercie succoureth vs, forgiving daily that which is lesse, defeltime, exorbitant, and going astray on our part.

^m Hoc. confess. c. 73.

^a Pigh. Ratisb. disp. de iustif. c. 2.

Section 2. Concerning habitual concupiscence.

^a Radicalis concupiscencia. Al. Hal. q. 38. m. 2.
^b Trid. Concil. sess. 5. de pecc. orig. Bellar. de pecc. l. 3. c. 7. Non est peccatum non solum quia non imputatur, sed quia imputari non potest. Non est veri nominis pecc. ipsa facilitatio & incitatio cum delectatione coniuncta, nisi consensus mentis obtemperat. Stapl. de iustif. l. 3. c. 2. Beccan. de iust. bon. op. c. 1. Gr. Val. Ro. 2. d. 6. q. 12. p. 1. B. Medin. 1. 2. q. 72. ar. 1.

^c Bellar. de amiss. grat. & pecc. l. 1. ca. 3. Venialia ex natura & ratione peccati.

^d Aug. de verb. apost. i. serm. 5. Si concupiscitis quidem, quod lex vetat, cum dicit, Non concupiscite. Veram & realem.

^e Aug. ep. 108. Quid interest ad naufragium, vtrum vno graui fluctu, nauis obruatur, &c.

^f Aug. sup. Ioh. tr. 13. Minuta sunt gutta, quae flumina implent: minuta sunt grana arenae, sed si multa arena imponatur, premit, atque opprimat.

^g Adam. Sab. com. Rom. 7. Non videtur posse pertinere ad personam hominis nondum renouati, quod dicitur, Iam non ego operor illud, &c. Condelector legi Dei, &c. Denique quod ex doctrina coepa in hoc 7. cap. intulit in 8. c. nihil ergo damnationis est ipsi, &c.

^h Gloss. ordin. Rom. 6. Peccatum, id est, fomes pecc. nihil aliud est quam concupiscencia. Adam. Sab. Peccatum, id est, fomes sine habitualis concupiscencia, quae inest nobis ex peccato Adae.

Another pillar of Popish iustification, is, that radical concupiscence, together with the first suggestions, agitation and rebellion of the same, is not sinne. For if the same be sinne, then it followeth, first, that iust persons are alwaies sinners, hauing continually need of remission and not imputation of sinne. Secondly, if concupiscence be sinne, forasmuch as the same worketh in all the actions of man, it will distill into the same, sinfulness, and thereby distaine, impair, and attenuate them, so farre, as that they cannot attaine to that height and straine of perfection, whereby they shall be able to iustifie before God, and to satisfie and merit.

Obiection. Concupiscence may be onely veniall, and then it cannot hinder or impair the perfection of Iustice.

Ans. Granting the same to be a sinne, it cannot be veniall by nature, because it is a transgression of the last commandment, in the proper object of the same. Rom. 7. 7. And that sinne cannot be veniall by nature, which caused the Apostle to cry out, *Oh wretched man that I am, &c.* Rom. 7. 24.

And if it be onely veniall by indulgence, and not imputation, this cannot hinder the *Physicall* or *reall* influence thereof into mans habits and actions, more than the not imputation of original sinne stoppeth the propagation of the uncleanness thereof into the posteritie. Also, admitting the same in iust persons to be veniall; yet it hath so frequent and perpetuall motions, that such a multitude of irregular cogitations and desires which the same produceth, will equall some mortall sinnes: euen as many lesser crannies in a ship, equall one big one; and many small graines of sand, make a heauie burden. And the perpetuall coniunction and concomitance, yea mixture of these sinnes with the purest motions and holiest actions of iust persons, cause the same alwaies to haue need of remission, by reason whereof they cannot iustifie, merit, satisfie, &c.

Obiect. But the holy Scripture and primitive Fathers manifestly teach, that habitual concupiscence and the motions thereof are not sinne.

Ans. First, the Scripture doth as expressly make it sinne, as the same doth theft, adulterie, false witness, prohibiting and condemning it by a speciall commandment, Exod. 20. 17. Rom. 7. 7. And that the Apostle, Rom. 7. speaketh of habitual concupiscence, appeareth by the actions which he ascribeth vnto it, teaching, that in himselfe it lusted against the spirit, and rebelled against the law of the minde, and yet in regard of his consent, was inuoluntarie, and resisted him, v. 20. and also it was such, from which he could neuer be freed so long as he continued in this life. And the same Apostle calleth it by the name of *sinne* five times, Rom. 6. ^h and six times, Rom. 7. and thrice, Rom. 8. it hath the definition of sinne, for it is repugnant to the diuine law, Rom. 7. 7. 23. 1 Ioh. 3. 4. It hath the qualitie of sinne, and is hatefull to God and good men, Rom. 7. 15. It is the very root of the euill tree, and grand stem, which bringeth forth euill

fruits,

fruits, Matth. 7. 18. the mother of all sinne; and whatsoever ignorance, vncleane, iniustice, and wickednesse is committed by man, proceed from it, Matth. 15. 19. Gal. 5. 19. Iam. 2. 14, 15.²

Secondly, S. Augustine, whose judgement in this matter is a breuiarie of the faith of the primitive Church, expressly teacheth, that it is sinne; and this not onely in appellation, but in veritie, saying: ^a *Euen as the cecitie of the heart, which God remoueth by illumination, is both a sinne, and the punishment of sinne, and the cause of sinne: so the concupiscence of the flesh, against which the good Spirit strineth, is a sinne, by reason there is in it disobedience against the dominion of the minde; and a punishment of sinne, because it is rendred to him which was disobedient; and a cause of sinne.* And in another place, ^b *This vnreasonable and brutish anger would not arise, vlesse there were sinne in the members.*

The same Father calleth it, ^a *culpable qualitie*, ^c *a brutish motion*, ^d *an euill and naughtie sinne*, ^e *no small iniquitie*. He saith, it is prohibited by the morall law, and is *vnlawfull, lascinious, and filthy*. ^f *Before baptisme, it is mortall sinne, euen originall sinne it selfe*. And after baptisme, it is taken away in regard of guiltinesse, ^g *and remaineth in act*. And after baptisme, it must bee purged by remission.^m

And whereas this Father saith in one place, ⁿ *Concupiscence in persons regenerate, is no sinne*: the answer is, that he simply denieth it not to be sinne, but onely that it is not imputed as mortall sinne to such as resist it, and because it reigneth not, nor maketh them iniust persons who resist it, and is no crime, and intrudeth it selfe vpon iust persons, as an importunate guest, against their wils: and lastly, because it is daily wasting, and tending to destruction, and not being.

And verily, vncill of late time, the best learned and godliest in the Church, taught that it was sinne. Isidore ^f saith, *It is a filthy motion of the soule, in the affection of vncleane lust.* And Hugo: ^g *It is manifest that the law prohibiteth the first motions of concupiscence.* And Strabus the Author of the ordinarie Gloss, affirmeth the same: and Ferus, ^h and Caietan ⁱ say it is sinne: Yea Thomas, 3. q. 41. ar. 1. ad. 3.

Thirdly, let the absurdities be considered, whereinto our aduersaries fall by denying Concupiscence to be sinne.

First, they grant that it is prohibited by diuine law, and repugnant to the same.

Secondly, they acknowledge, it is hatefull to God, an iniquitie, and vicious qualitie, a thing not good nor indifferent.

Thirdly, they place it among naturall defects.

But if it be an vnfinfull defect of nature, then it is not prohibited by the morall law, more than blindness and death. And if it be hatefull to God and good men, and prohibited by diuine law, then it must needs be sinne, 1. Ioh. 3. 4. For whereas Bellarmine maketh answer, that ^a *Euen as the Dewill is no sinne, although he resist the law of God: so concupiscence may resist diuine law, and bee no sinne*: I answer, that we reason in this manner: Euery vicious qualitie and action thereof resisting the law of God, is a sinne. Habitual concupiscence is a vicious qualitie, and the first motions thereof are vicious actions resisting the law of God. Therefore it is sinne.

^a Aug. de verb. ap. ser. 6. Quicquid est pecc. in dictis, in factis, in cogitationibus, non oriuntur nisi ex mala cupiditate.

^b Aug. contra Iulian. l. 5. c. 3.

^c Aug. in Ioh. tr. 41.

^d De perf. iust. ad. 12.

^e De pecc. mer. & rem. l. 6. c. 16.

^f Contra Iulian. l. 6. c. 5.

^g Ibid. c. 8.

^h De Spir. & lit. c. 4. & c. 36. de perf. iust. ad. 11. de verb. apost. ser. 4. & 5. epist. 200. l. 1. de nupt. & concup. c. 29.

ⁱ L. 5. hom. h. 42.

^j De nupt. & concup. per totum. & cont. 2. epist. Pelag. & cont. Iul. l. 3. & de pecc. mer. l. 2. Soto de nat. & grat. l. 1. c. 8. Bonauen. 2. d. 30. ar. 2. q. 1. Hugo Elucid. Rom. q. 104.

^k Aug. de predest. c. 13. & de nupt. & concup. l. 1. c. 25. & 28. & l. 2. c. 34.

^l De nupt. & concup. l. 1. c. 32. contr. Iulian. l. 2. in principio.

^m Cont. 3. ep. Pelag. l. 1. c. 14.

ⁿ De nupt. & concup. l. 1. c. 25.

^o Ib. l. 2. c. 34.

^p De cor. & gra. c. 12.

^q De nupt. & concup. l. 2. c. 24.

^r In Ioh. tr. 41. & enchir. c. 65.

^s Isidore. de diff. spir. l. 2. c. 27.

^t Hugo Elucid. Rom. q. 171.

^u Gloss. ordin. Rom. 7. cited by Al. Halp. 3. q. 38. m. 2.

^v Ferus com. Ioh. 13. taxed by Dom. Sotho.

^w Caietan. cont. Rom. 7. appellatur pecc. casualiter, tum formaliter.

⁷ Bellar. de pecc. l. 5. c. 10. & 11. Stapl. de iustif. l. 3. c. 2. ^a Stapl. ib. esse quandam iniquitatem & obliquitatem, non solum contra dominatum mentis, sed contra legem Dei: ideoque eam Deo displicere, nec tamen in renatis esse vere ac proprie pecc. Ib. Nec esse rem bonam nec indifferentem. Ruard. Tap. expl. artic. 2. ad. Patemur hanc carnis & voluntatis, ad malum pronitatem, esse obliquitatem, & deviationem a lege & regula, secundum quam natura instituta est ad Dei imaginem, &c. ^b Bellar. de pecc. orig. l. 5. c. 10. Ruard. Tappet. explic. artic. 2. ar. pag. 67.

Section 3. *Wherein the third pillar of Popish iustification, to wit, the distinction of veniall and mortall sinne, is examined.*

Our aduersaries also peece out their iustification, by the distinction of veniall and mortall finnes. The summe whereof is:

First, that veniall sin is not simply sin, but imperfectly and analogically^a. No transgression, but pretergression of diuine law, besides it, but not against it^b. Some of them maintaine, that God is not offended with veniall sinne^c. And they generally call such sins, light, saying, that God in iustice cannot punish them with more than a temporall punishment^d; and they are pardoned without repentance^e, euen by the outward sprinkling of holy water, when one thinks not of them^f. And a man may merit the remission of these sins, by the praier of faith, and other pious deeds^g.

Secondly, with great presumption they place many foule sins in the ranke of veniall, as the examples following declare:

If one in his rage and furie blasphemeth God, not hauing had a precedent deliberate intent, he sinneth onely venially^h. Parents cursing their children, without deliberationⁱ. Children disobeying their parents, when the same proceedeth not of contempt, but of negligence or sensualitye, is veniall^j. Scurrilous and filthy speaking, in iest onely^k. Mens wearing of womens apparell in vanitie of minde; painting of the face, &c. are veniall^l. And drunkennesse is ranked among venials, by Bonauenture^m.

To fast, pray, giue almes, goe to the Church, for vaine-glory, are veniallⁿ. And Azorius the Iesuite affirmeth, that *the finnes which one committeth against his owne good, are for the more part all of them veniall. As when one offendeth by vaine and idle thoughts, by cholericke answers, and excessive prating, spending the time in idleness, gouerning his estate badly, consuming his goods wastfully, or possessing the same conuetsly, eating and drinking intemperately, exceeding in apparel, confessing his sins negligently, and rehearsing his matters slothfully; preferring his owne wit, strength, and beautie before all others: these and the like are veniall*^o.

By this reckoning of their owne making, the Papists wipe out of the debet-booke of sins, the greatest part thereof, and are more iniust than the vnrighteous steward, bidding the man wipe out fiftie measures, who ought an hundred, Luk. 16.6. But how can one be sure^p that the Lord will approue this reckoning? And where are infallible grounds, whereupon mens soules must rest in matter of so great moment? And are not the bold assertions of Popish Casuists and Schoolemen herein as vncertaine as the determinations of blinde Pharisees concerning the like matters? Matth. 23.16.

The holy Scripture reporteth many examples of grieuous iudgements inflicted by God vpon smaller offences than these, which our aduersaries pronounce to be veniall^q, Gen. 19.26. Leuit. 10.2. 2 Sam. 6.7. 1 King. 13.24. And our Sauour teacheth, that *of euery idle word, men shall giue account at the day of iudgement*, Matth. 12.36. And the primitiue Fathers earnestly exhort to beware of accounting any sins light or small^r. Yea sundry learned Papists condemne this distinction, (as the same is now vsed by the^s moderne) to wit, Gerson, Rossensis, Almaine, &c.

^a Thom. Aquin. Quodl. 4. ar. 22. Non habet rationem perfecti peccati. Bellar. de iustif. l. 4. c. 14. Peccata venialia, non esse peccata simpliciter, sed imperfecte, & secundum quid. De amitt. gratia, l. 1. c. 11. Azor. instit. mor. p. 1. l. 4. c. 8. Iac. de Graph. decis. sur p. 1. l. 1. c. 6. Suar. to. 2. d. 4. §. 9. Non est proprie offensa & iniuria, sed valde analogice. Hæc lesus offensa, non sunt magni valoris aut momenti. ^b Bellar. supra. ^c Victorin. tr. de pecc. mortal. Alciusdor. sum. l. 2. tr. 27. c. 2. q. 3. Alex. Hal. p. 24. 18. m. 6. Bonau. 2. d. 43. ar. 2. q. 1. Caietan. sum. v. pecc. veniale. ^d Bonau. ib. q. 2. ad ult. ^e Azor. p. 1. instit. mor. l. 4. c. 8. Bellar. de iustif. l. 5. c. 5. ^f Bonau. 4. d. 16. ar. 3. q. 3. ^g Iac. Graph. decis. sur. p. 1. l. 1. c. 6. n. 10. Si nullatenus excitetur ad feruorem, nec memoriam habeat venialium, tamen obtemperabit per illam asperitatem veniam. ^h Stapl. d. iustif. l. 3. ca. 16. p. 299. Colniek. d. sacra. p. 2. disp. 2. dub. 24. & d. 10. d. 2. n. 23. ⁱ Nauar. manual. c. 13. n. 84. Iac. Graph. decis. p. 1. l. 1. c. 6. n. 17. ^j Nauar. ib. c. 23. n. 117. ^k Iac. Graph. ib. l. 2. c. 56. n. 15. Siluest. sum. v. filius, q. 22. Nauar. c. 14. n. 17. ^l Lessus de iust. & iure. l. 4. c. 4. dubitat. 13. n. 97. ^m Less. ib. dub. 14. n. 109. 110. 114. Nauar. c. 23. n. 20. ⁿ Bonau. 4. d. 16. ar. 3. q. 1. ^o Tho. Aqu. 3. 2. q. 110. Tul. instr. sac. de pecc. mortal. c. 7. Siluest. verb. Vana gloria. Nauar. &c. ^p Azor. instit. mor. p. 1. l. 4. c. 9. n. 8. p. 238. Iac. Graph. decis. l. 2. c. 53. n. 13. ^q Greg. Val. to. 2. d. 6. q. 18. p. 3. Ex Scripturis diuinis, quamuis de multis pecc. constet, quod sunt mortalia, tamen vix de viliis expresse satis videtur constare, quod sunt tantum venialia. ^r Aug. Enchir. c. 79. Leuissima putarentur, nisi in Scripturis demonstrarentur opinione grauiora. Quis enim dicentem fratri suo facie, reum gehennæ putaret, nisi veritas diceret? Matth. 5. Chrys. in Matth. hom. 42. ^s Basil. quest. paru. q. 4. Aug. ep. 108. & l. 50. hom. 42. & in Ioh. tr. 13. Chrys. sup. Gal. c. 1. ^t Gers. no. 3. de vit. spir. lect. 1. Coral. 1. Rossens. rind by Vega, pro conc. l. 14. c. 15. Almai. mor. tit. 3. c. 20.

Observation 3. Touching Popish iustification.

The Trident doctrine concerning iustification, is not Catholike in the Church of Rome it selfe.

1. Peter Lombard ^a the master of the Popish schoole, teacheth, that *we may be said to be iustified by the death of Christ, in the same manner that the Israelites were healed in the wilderness by beholding the brazen serpent*, Ioh. 3. 14, 15. and this is plainly our beleefe.

In the yeere 1195. it appeareth by a decretall of Pope Innocent the third ^b, that many Doctors of those times beleueed, that *sins were remitted in baptisme without the infusion of habituall grace*; and according to this opinion, iustification is onely remission of sins.

And afterward, about the yeere 1305. Pope Clement the first affirmeth, ^c that many Doctors did in those daies hold the former opinion: and he decreed the contrary, touching the infusion of habituall grace in baptisme, not as an article of faith, but as the more probable opinion.

2. Andreas Vega reporteth ^d, that in former ages there was much contention about the formall cause of iustification; and he saith, *It seemed unto diuers, that a sinner was not made iust by any created iustice, as one is made white by the qualitie of whitenesse: but that one is in like manner made iust and beloued of God, as he is beloued of another, by the loue he beareth him, and not by infusion*.

3. Sundry famous Papists of later times haue maintained the faith of the Protestants, touching the formall cause of iustification, namely, ^e Clingius, Pighius, Ferus, the Doctors of Colen, Cassander, Contarenus, &c.

4. Howsoever the Iesuites in schoole propugne against vs this speculation of Trent iustification, yet is not the same radical in their hearts: for in practise and temptation, when men seriously looke about them for their soules health, and are approaching Gods iudgement seat, they cast away this proud conceit of perfection of iustice, and wholly repaire to the mercy of God, and merits of Christ.

Anselme saith: ^f *My life being narrowly sifted, terrifies me. It appeareth all of it unto me, to be either sin or barrenesse; and if there seeme to be any fruit, it is either sained, imperfect, or corrupted, &c.* And then he flies to Iesus and his merits, comforting his soule in them, saying: *What is Iesus, but onely a Saviour? Be thou, O Iesus, by thy selfe, a Saviour unto me.* And the same Anselme: ^g *Oh God, I set my Lord Iesus betweene thee and my sins; I offer thee his merit in stead of mine owne which I should haue, but yet doe want it.*

And Bernard: ^h *Where can weaklings finde safe and firme securitie, but in the wounds of our Saviour? &c. I haue sinned, my conscience is vnquiet, I will remember the wounds of my Lord, and what is wanting in my selfe, I will borrow it from the mercies of my Saviour.* And in another place: *Hominis iustitia indulgentia Dei: Adams iustice is Gods free indulgence or remission of his sin.*^{*}

Yea Pope Hildebrand himselfe, the great key-bearer of heauen, (who relating his Papall priuileges, saith, *If the Romane Pontifex haue any personall defects, yet vndoubtedly he is sanctified by the merits of blessed Peter*) notwithstanding in his aduersitie he repositeth himselfe vpon Christ Iesus onely, saying, *I finde my selfe so far surcharged with the ponderous weight of mine owne acti-ans, that there remaines no hope of saluation for me, but in the sole mercy of Iesus Christ.*^k

^a Magist. 3. d. 19.
 ^{be} linc. ann. 1147.

^b Decret. tit. 43.
 ^c maio. de bapt.
 Ruard. Tapper. de
 iustif. art. 8. in cap.
 maior. Innocen-
 tius 3. quasi pro-
 blema vtriusque di-
 sputable proponit.
 &c. Adrian. 4. sent.
 de sac. bapt. q. 3.
 ad oppos.

^d Clem. 1. r. de
 sum. Trin. Concil.
 Viennens. Tanquā
 probabiliorē.
 See Gaid. Carmel.
 sum. de hazel. ge-
 nerat. c. 8.
 ^e Vega pro concil.
 1. 7. c. 24.

^f Clingius loc.
 eom. l. 5. ca. 42.
 Deus iustos nos
 reputat propter so-
 lam fidem in Chri-
 stum. Pigh. cont.
 Ratib. l. 2. Ferus
 eom. Ioh. 13. taxed
 by Dominicus So-
 tho. Cassand. con-
 sult. artic. 4. de iu-
 stitia, id est, meri-
 to & satisfacione
 Christi nobis im-
 putata, hoc est, no-
 bis, ac si propria
 esset, attributa,
 Scripturae satis a-
 perte loquuntur,
 &c. Card. Contra-
 ren. l. de iustif. Ego
 proptis existimo
 pie & Christiane
 dici, quod debeat
 mus nri, tanquam
 re stabili quā su-
 stentat nos, iustitia
 Christi nobis do-
 nata, non autem
 sanctitate & gratia
 nobis inherente.
 Hac sola, certa,
 stabili nobis nitend-
 um est: & ob
 eam solā credere
 nos iustificari co-
 ram Deo, id est, iu-
 stos haberi.

^g Anselm. medi-
 tat.

^h Cited by Hosius
 confeli. c. 73.

^k Greg. 7. Ap.

^b Bern. in Cant. serm. 61.
 ^{Reads} Stella Luc. 7.
 ^a In Cantic. serm. 23.
 ⁱ Baron. ann. 1076. n. 33.
 Baron. so. 11. ann. 1075. n. 7.

Certaine obseruations concerning good Workes and Merit.

Obseruation 1. Touching Workes: wherein is contained the Protestants faith concerning the reward and effects of the same.

^a Apologia Ecclesie Anglicane testatur, bona opera necessaria esse Christiano ad salutem. Rainold. a. pol. thes. pa. 263. Whitak. de Eccles. fol. 301. Pet. Mart. com. Rom. 2. Beza quæst. part. 1. Pisc. anal. Matth. 25. ^b Aug. de spir. & lit. c. 14. Hier. ad Celan. ep. 14. Ambros. com. Tit. 2. Gaud. Brixian. ad Gen. de viliniqu. Leo de Epiphany. ser. 2. Clem. Alex. Strom. li. 5. Greg. Naz. orat. 40. Theod. Exod. quæst. 63. Cypr. ep. 14. ^c Beza annot. Matth. 5. v. 30. & quæst. par. 1. opus. pa. 669. & cont. Il. l. i. c. demonstr. Ex. istimandum est, preparari, disponi, & appetri corda nostra, &c. Chem. exam. p. 1. pa. 171, 173. ^d Chrys. hom. 18. in Rom. Aug. 30. hom. ho. 2. ^e Chrys. in Matt. hom. 16. ^f Cypr. de op. & elemos. Deprecationes solæ parum apud Deum valent, nisi factorum & operum accessione fariantur. Aug. cont. 2. ep. Pelag. 1. 4. c. 7. Eleemosynis & orationibus impetrantibus. Fulg. ep. 2. de stat. vid. ut agnoscamus bona opera, LOCVM ORATIONIS HABERE apud Deum. Chrys. in Gen. hom. 5. Hilar. in Matt. can. 4. Charitas, &c. Errorum nostrorum ambrosia ad Deum, patrona est. ^g Pined. com. Job 1. 5. Aug. Enchir. c. 70.

1. We beleue and maintaine, that good workes are necessarie to saluation^a. 1 Ioh. 1. 6, 7. Rom. 8. 13. Matth. 5. 20. & Matth. 6. 21. Euen as walking in the way is a necessarie action and meanes to bring a traueller to the end of his iourney, Ephes. 5. 10. And this is the constant doctrine of holy Scripture, and of^b all the Catholike Church.

2. Good workes haue many excellent effects and vses in sundry passages of our saluation; whereof these are principall:

First, they are part of the matter, actions and fruits of repentance, Ezech. 18. 21. 1 Cor. 5. 7. Ephes. 4. 22, 24. and they dispose^c and qualifie our persons, that we may receiue and enioy the benefit of remission of sins, 1 Ioh. 1. 7.

Secondly, they are the matter of our obedience, Rom. 6. 13. and thankfulness, Psal. 118. 19. and of our loue towards God, Ioh. 14. 21. the meanes whereby we glorifie God and edifie others, and prouoke them to vertue, 1 Pet. 2. 12. Heb. 10. 24.^d

Thirdly, they are signes of our election, iustification, and redemption, 2 Pet. 1. 10. 1 Ioh. 3. 24. Ioh. 8. 39. supporters of our faith and confidence in Christ, 1 Iohn 3. 19. ^e helps and furtherances to our prayers, Acts 10. 4. Esa. 58. 9. yea certaine inferior^f advocates^g, and intercessors to God for mercie and forgiveness; and for the release or mitigation of temporall punishment, and for many spirituall and worldly benefits, 1 Iohn 3. 22. Pro. 16. 6. Dan. 4. 24. Ecclesiast. 29. 12. Gen. 30. 33. vi. Hieron. com. Esa. 58. And euen as foule and enormous sins crieto God for vengeance, Gen. 18. 20. so vertues supplicate for mercy and deliuerance, Esay 65. 24. Eccles. 35. 3. In the old law, besides propitiatorie sacrifices, there were peace offerings, Leuit. 3. which had this effect, to wit, to procure and beg of God, his benefits and graces: *sacrificia impetratoria* 8. Iob 42. 8. Ezer. 6. 10. in the roome whereof succeed spirituall sacrifices of Christians, consisting of pious and charitable deeds, Phil. 4. 18. Heb. 13. 6. Reuel. 1. 6. Rom. 12. 1. 1 Pet. 2. 9. and these haue the effect and vse of impetration, Iohn 9. 31. 1 Ioh. 3. 22. Acts 10. 4.

Fourthly, iust persons endued with vertue, are the obiekt of Gods loue and friendship, Ioh. 14. 21. 2 Chron. 20. 7. and he dwelleth with such, 2 Cor. 6. 16. 1 Cor. 3. 17. blessing and protecting them, Gen. 22. 16, 17. and as Isaac smelling the sweet sauour of Iacobs raiment, began to pronounce a blessing vpon him, Gen. 27. 27. so the Lord is rich in mercy and blessings towards those, in whom is found the sauour of grace and vertue, Psal. 84. 11.

Fifthly, although we ascribe the whole vertue of purging sinne, in the article of iustification, to the blood of Christ onely, 1 Iohn 1. 7. Apoc. 1. 5. yet in the doctrine of sanctification, we ascribe power of cleansing and purging sinne to vertue and good workes, according to the manner following: S. Iames saith, *Cleanse your hands you sinners*, ch. 4. 8. and S. Iohn, *Every one that hath this hope, purifieth himselfe*, 1 Ioh. 3. 3. and Esay, *Wash you, make you cleane*, Esay 1. 16. and Solomon, *There is a generation that are pure in their owne eyes, and yet are not washed from their filthinesse*, Prou. 30. 12.

And the manner hereof is, that whereas there be foure sorts and meanes of purging sinne: First, by the way of redemption and remission, this is done by Christ

Christ onely. Secondly, by immediate application of Christ in our iustification; and this is peculiar to faith alone^b, Ioh. 3. 4. 15. Thirdly, *by infusing the grace of regeneration* and habit of sanctification; this is the worke of the holy Ghost as the principall cause, and of the word and sacraments as the instrumentall, Ioh. 15. 3. Eph. 5. 26. Ioh. 3. 3. Fourthly, there is a purging and cleansing of sin necessary to saluation, which standeth in the mortifying and repressing of concupiscence, and subiecting of the powers to the regiment of grace; and also in renouncing and expelling of sinne by the contrary actions of vertue, Col. 3. 5. 12. Workes of light expell the deeds of darknesse, and the lively actions of vertue purifie the soule, according to the Apostle, 1 Pet. 1. 22. *You haue purified your soules in obeying the truth*, Pro. 16. 6. c.

Sixthly, we teach, that the Lord of his bountie and goodnesse rewardeth all the workes and good deeds of iust persons, with rewards spirituall and temporall, 1 Tim. 4. 8. and that in rewarding, he obserueth a proportion, according to the number and measure of good workes^d, 2 Cor. 9. 6. Matth. 19. 28, 29. Dan. 12. 3. Matth. 7. 21. But this reward is not an hire and stipend properly so called, Rom. 6. 23. but a reward of bounty or liberalitie, such as a father after his promise bestoweth vpon his sonne, for performing that duty which he is otherwise bound vnto, and is onely beneficiall to himselfe^f.

And such reward is free: First, because the Lord hath freely, without any desert of man, prepared it. Secondly, because himselfe by grace, as the principall efficient, produceth in men the vertues which he rewardeth^g. Thirdly, the worke being produced, he addeth further worth and value to it, by a new imputation of Christ his merits, Heb. 13. 15. 1 Pet. 2. 5. Reu. 8. 3. Rom. 8. 34. Heb. 9. 24. Fourthly, he detaineth not the reward promised, because of the imperfection and blemish of our good deeds, but freely forgiveth our wants, and beholdeth onely the goodnesse of the vertue, without the defect. Fifthly, in the act of rewarding, God conferreth more than we are able to expect or desire: and when the reward is actually conferred, it exceedeth the outward promise, 1 Cor. 2. 9. and the hope and expectation of the receiuer, Eph. 3. 20^h. Lastly, the iustice of God in rewarding, is rather called *iustice*, by an improper forme of speaking, that by this name the hope of the iust may be confirmed, than because it partakes the definition and forme of distributiue and commutatiue iustice, according to the rules of morall Philosophie, or according to any other proper kinde of ciuill or humane iusticeⁱ.

^b Tol. com. Rom. 3. ann. 17. Fides immediatus & distinctus, in eum fertur cuius virtute iustificamur, sicut aspectus aucti serpentis. Vega de iustit. l. 8. c. 1.

Adam Sasboth. com. Esa. 1.

^c Altiſſiodor. sum.

l. 4. tr. 6. ca. 4. He-

sich. in Ient. li. 4.

c. 14. Hec opera

necessaria habet,

que virtutibus &

actionis studio va-

leant delere pecca-

tum. Cornela La-

pid. com. Rom. 11.

vers. 1. n. 85. Est

mortificat. viua

quidam mors: fa-

cit enim mori con-

cupiscencias car-

nis, dum eas trun-

cat per viuos con-

tinencia, abstinen-

tia, & penitentie

actus.

^d Fulg. de fid. ad

Petr. c. 3.

Hieron. in Esa. c.

24. l. 8.

Terul. Scorp. c. 6.

Chrys. hom. de

præm. sanctior. Ber-

nard. ser. 9. qui ha-

bitat. Beza quæst.

p. 1.

^e Disput. Ratisb. c. 2.

Vclut si liber illis

benignusque he-

rus, &c. Proposi-

tis premiis libera-

libus inuitet, &c.

vnum illud respi-

ciens vt bonos fa-

ciat, &c. Basil in

Phil. 1. 14. & 2^a epist.

ad Rom. 1. 17. & 2^a epist.

ad Gal. 3. 12. & 2^a epist.

ad Col. 3. 10. & 2^a epist.

ad 1. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 2. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 3. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 4. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 5. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 6. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 7. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 8. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 9. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 10. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 11. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 12. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 13. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 14. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 15. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 16. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 17. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 18. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 19. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 20. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 21. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 22. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 23. 1. & 2^a epist.

ad 24. 1. & 2^a epist.

²⁷ *Deus non mercede datur.* 1. Caietan. opusc. to. 3. tr. 11. c. 6. Omnis bona operatio voluntaria hominis debetur Deo, & quanto potioribus & pluribus bonis operibus pollet homo tanto plus Deo debet, quia ipse Deus operatur in nobis velle & perficere. 2. Caietan. opusc. to. 3. tr. 11. ca. 7. 3. Aug. de temp. serm. 40. Chrysost. 2 Cor. hom. 23. Deus, hoc in mercedem imputat, non quod iuste nobis debeat, sed quod misericors est & pius. 4. Anselm. prolog. c. 10. Iustus es, O Deus, non quia nobis reddis debitum, sed quia facis quod decet te summe bonum. 5. Cling. loc. com. l. 1. ca. 14. Quia finito ad finitum nulla est proportio, sed omnia opera nostra finita sunt, gratia autem, iustificatio & vita eterna quid infinitum: ergo nihil debet Deus operibus nostris, semper gratis dat, &c.

Obseru. 2. Concerning merit of workes: wherein is shewed, that many learned Papists haue impugned the doctrine of Merit.

1. Many learned Papists in former daies haue condemned the present doctrine of merit, maintained by Papists. Dionysius Cisterciensis saith, *a Good workes of precept, because they be commanded, are not meritorious of life eternall.* Ferus saith, *b Reward is due to workes, of grace, but not of debt: and the sufferings of this life are not worthy of the future glory: and whosoener desireth to enjoy the fauour of God, must not mention merit.* And Pighius affirmeth, that *c there is no reall difference betweene him and vs in this question.*

operantis, & non potius sint fœdicates, quasi pannus menstruatus, aut sicut panniculi leproforum qui per continuam fœtorem defluantem sordidantur. 6. Cont. Razib. l. 2.

^a Dionys. Cister.

3. sent. q. 3. ar. 3. c.

6. cited by Valq.

^b Ferus com. Mar.

l. 3. c. 20. Gerf.

tom. 4. tr. de sig.

Signum malum

est, offerre Deo o-

pera sua, quasi dig-

num aliquid habe-

ant ex persona

^d Greg. Arim. l. d. 17. q. 1. ar. 1. Durand. l. d. 17. & 3. d. 17. Marfilus Th. Walden. Burg. Eekius. See Vega opusc. q. 5.

^e Bellar. de iustif. l. 1. c. 23. B. Medina. l. 2. q. 114. art. 10. Caetan. l. 3. q. 114. art. 10. Becan. de iustif. Cath. c. 3. Gabr. l. d. 17. q. vnic. art. 1. not. 3. Adrian. in 4. de sacram. euchar. Sunt merita nostra, valut baculus arundineus, &c. & quasi pannus menstruatus, sunt omnes iusticie nostre, &c. Gr. Arim. l. d. 17. q. 1. Volens per hoc, Aug. innuere, quod cum vita eterna datur iustis, non tam redditur quam donatur. Cling. loc. com. l. 1. c. 23. Docemus opera esse meritoria iustis, ex gratia, id est, immunita misericordia, scilicet favore solum Dei, non merito & dignitate operum.

^f Vasqu. l. 3. p. 1. d. 214. c. 1. Contingere potest ut si

veram rationem meriti non assignemus, verbis solum ab hæreticis dissidentes, recipiamus cum iis conveniamus, quod aliquibus Catholicis in hac controuersia accidisse patet. Scotus. G. Arim. Gabriel Occham. Alphonsus Castro. Guil. Paris. Brulifer. Antididag. Colon. Concil. Colon. Concil. Senonens. Holcot. Vega, Hosius, victoria, Camus, Ioh. Bunderius, &c. ^g Holcot. in 5. p. 3. lect. 35. Cling. loc. com. lib. 1. cap. 19. Condignum meritum non est ex parte operum, sed gratia Dei quæ promittit meritum hoc operibus: ita ut condignitas illa meriti respicit gratiam, non opus operum, &c. ^h Brulifer. l. 1. sent. d. 17. cited by Hosius confess. c. 73. Agid. Cornick. Iesuit. de sacram. tom. 1. disp. 10. dub. 2. n. 12. Quod nostra opera tam immensum præmium merentur, magis provenire ex munificencia Dei, quam dignitate operum. ⁱ Alph. Castro. c. har. verb. meritum. ^k Vega opusc. q. 5. ^l Hof. con. Brent. l. 5. Nullum à Sanctis exire potest opus, quod si in se censetur, confusionem iustam non mereatur: docemus igitur mercedem regni cælestis datam iri operibus nostris, verum non propter eorum, quatenus à nobis proficiuntur dignitatem, sed propter Christum, cuius maxime opera sunt. ^m Chumel. q. var. p. 3. pa. 339. ⁿ Bella. de lib. concor. mend. 8. Meritum impetrationis, quod scholastici meritis de congruo nominare solent.

2. Many Schoolemen and Papiſts reiect the merit of condignitie, holding that good workes doe merit onely in congruitie ^d. But the merit of congruitie is indeed no merit, but onely in name: to wit, when a reward or benefit is bestowed, neither for the dignity of the worke, or worthinesse of the doer, or for any equality betwene the worke and reward, but onely upon the liberality of the donor. And this opinion is the same with ours.

3. Although many Papiſts in word maintaine the merit of condignitie, yet (according to Iesuite Vasques) they doe in deed destroy the same merit: and these also in substance agree with vs ^f.

Holcot saith, that *one assisted by grace, may condignely merit life eternall, is understood two waies: one, so, as that there is as much worth in the substance of the merit, as may deserue life eternall. The other, that it is worth so much, onely by the position of some law; as when a small peece of copper, by the ordinance of the Prince, is made worth a loafe of bread. Good workes are not condignely worthy of life eternall, by the substance of the worke, but by grace onely (according to the latter kinde of worthinesse.)*

Brulifer: ^h *An action wrought by charity, is onely worthy of life eternall, by the passive acceptation of God, and not by the nature of the worke it selfe.*

Alphonſus Castro: ⁱ *Workes of grace, of themselves are unworthy of glorie, and we by them could haue had no right to eternall glorie.*

Andreas Vega: ^k *We place no greater right in the workes of iust men, in respect of blessednesse, when we say they be condignely meritorious of the same, but that it pleaseth God of his liberality to conſerre beatitudo upon vs and our deeds.*

With these agree Cardinall Hosius ^l; and the learned Chumel seemes to teach the same, where he saith, *Merit is the meanes of blessednesse, by the way of impetration* ^m. And Merit of impetration, is no more but merit of congruitie ⁿ.

Obſeru. 3. Touching other Schoolemens opinion concerning Merit.

But the doctrine of merit, as the same is maintained by many great Schoolemen and Papiſts, is very absurd and wicked.

Vas. l. 3. p. 3. d. 214. c. 4. 7. Fra. Romeus, Caietan, Scotus, Conrad. Driedo, Capreolus, Clitoveus, Lindan, Tiletan.

1. Vasques the Iesuite, and before him, all the Papiſts quoted in the margent, affirme, that good workes wrought by diuine grace, are of themselves condignely worthy of life eternall, without any further promise, compact, or fauour of God: and looke how the deeds of mortall sinne are of themselves, without Gods threatening, worthy of eternall punishment; so good workes of their owne nature, without any promise, are worthy of eternall life.

2. There accrue no increase of dignity to the workes of iust persons by the merits or person of Christ, which otherwise they might not haue had from the same grace bestowed liberally by God without Christ ^a.

3. Gods promise being added to the workes of iust persons, doth in no sort belong to the reason of merit, but without the same they are of themselves both worthy and meritorious ^b.

^a Vasq. l. 3. p. 3. d. 214. c. 5. n. 31. & c. 7. per totum.

^b Vasq. ib. c. 8.

4. Good

4. Good workes doe as truly and equally merit glory, as mortall sins damnation^c: and Altiſtodore ſaith, they doe it much more powerfully^d.

5. Good workes haue this force in them, that they make vs formally worthy of life eternall, which Chriſts merits doe not: and Chriſt is worthy for them to impetrate whatſoever he requieſteth^e.

6. They teach, that God ſhould be vniuſt, if he rendred not heauen in recompence of good workes^f.

7. After a man is reconciled to God, his ſaluation is a worke of Gods iuſtice^g. For grace to merit, is beſtowed by Chriſt, but afterwards we neuer craue of God that he would beſtow eternall life vpon our meritorious deeds for Chriſts ſake, but onely that he will giue vs grace whereby we may be enabled to merit^h. According to this opinion, God vſeth no fauour in ſetting the crowne of glory vpon the head of his children, but onely an act of iuſtice, Pſal. 103. 4.

8. God rewardeth in manner aforeſaid, not onely good workes commanded, but workes of counſell and voluntarie deuotion, and the fulfilling the Popes will, by taking armes againſt Emperours and Kingsⁱ, ſpoiling and deſtroying the enemies of the Popiſh Church, and ſuch like.

^a Valſ. ib. c. 5. n. 31.
^b Coſſer. enchir. c. 7.
^c Malden. com. Ezech. 18. v. 20.
^d Altiſt. ſum. li. 3. tr. 16. quæſt. 2. Bona opera magis ſunt bona quam mala opera, & multo fortius merentur vitam æternam ex condigno.
^e Valſ. ib. d. 223. c. 3. n. 32. Merita in nobis hanc vim habent, vt reddant nos formaliter dignos vitam æternam: merita autem Chriſti, non reddunt nos dignos formaliter, ſed CHRIS TVS DIGNVS EST QVI PROPTER ILLA IMPB-

YEST, QVICQVID ipſe pro nobis petir. ^f Rhem. annotat. Heb. 6. n. 4. Ruard. Tap. art. 8. de iuſtif. ^g Tol. com. Rom. 5. v. 10. Amicos & reconciliatos, ſaluare per Chriſtum, iam non morientem ſed viuentem, opus eſt ad iuſticiam pertinens, &c. Rhem. 2 Tim. 4. n. 4.
^h Valſ. ib. Nunquam petimus à Deo per merita Chriſti, vt noſtris dignis operibus & meritorijs reddatur merces: æternæ vitæ, ſed vt per Chriſtum deus nobis gratia qua poſſimus digne mercede hanc promereri. ⁱ Sigon. de reg. Ital. l. 18. Præmia ſalutis æternæ omnibus pollicebatur, qui crucem aduerſus Fredericum acrem Eccleſiæ hoſtem ſumpſerunt, ac multos ad eam ſumendam accendit.

Obſeru. 4. The ancient Fathers vſing the word Merit, what they mean.

The Fathers vſing the word *meritum* and *mereri*, did not ſpeake properly: therefore our aduerſaries cannot maintaine their merit of condignitie, being merit in a proper ſignification, by their authoritie.

1. Saint Auguſtine vſeth the word *merit*, in the matter of iuſtification and remiſſion of finnes, wherein the Papiſts confeſſe^a, that *merit* properly taken, can haue no place. His words are, *Remiſſion of finnes is not without ſome merit, becauſe faith doth impetrate the ſame*^b. And Origen, *To confeſſe ſinne, meriteth remiſſion of ſinne*^c. And Hierom, *They which humbly confeſſe their finnes, by their humilitie doe merit the clemency of our Saviour*.

^a Bellar. de iuſtif. l. 5. c. 12.
^b Aug. tom. 3. ep. 105.
^c Origen. Ieuit. hom. 3.
^d Hier. l. 3. comp. Pelag.

2. The word *merit* in the Fathers, doth commonly ſignifie to obtaine, procure, impetrate, &c. Auguſtine, *The magi or wiſemen, Matth. 2. merited to ſee the ſtarre*^e. And, *Nemo de ſui peccati dimiſſione deſperet, quando illi veniam meruerunt, qui occiderunt Chriſtum*, Aug. in Ioh. tr. 31. And Gregory, *Saint Paul when he was travelling to extinguish Chriſt his name vpon earth, merited to heare his words from heauen*^f. And theſeſe, Luke 23. *Crucientis manibus audire meruit, &c. & tract. 24. Meruimus nos prophetari ipſum verbum Dei*. And Ambroſe, *The Church merited the coming of Chriſt*^g.

^e Aug. de temp. ſer. 35.

^f Greg. m. moral. l. 9. c. 17.

^g Ambr. de pæn. l. 1. c. 15.

3. Our aduerſaries themſelues confeſſe the abuſiue acceptation of the word *merit* in the Fathers. Vega: *I am not ignorant that the name of merit is vſed by the Fathers where there is indeed no merit either of congruitie or condignitie*^h.

^h Vega. pro concil. l. 8. c. 6.



CHAP. II. Paragraph. I.

Whether S. Hierom be corrupted concerning reading
the Scripture.

Section I.

T.W. *I*T being a certaine truth, that from Scriptures euill vnderstood, proceed most heresies: M. White, (a faithfull friend thereof) well knowing by daily experience, that no one thing in truth is more auailable, either for the first beginning or propagation of heresie, than generall libertie granted to the vulgar people of reading and expounding the Scripture; doth hereupon much labour, in prooffe of his supposed necessitie thereof, &c.

^a Tertul. cont. Marc. l. 5. c. 19. Omnes hereses ex subiloquentia viribus & Philosophicis regulis constant. De præscrip. c. 7. Euseb. hist. l. 5. c. 25. Chrys. prolog. in 1. Cor. Hieron. in Esa. l. 9. c. 28. & in Jerem. l. 1. c. 2. & contra Pelag. ad Ctesiphon.
^b Aug. de Gen. ad lit. l. 7. c. 9.
^c Hieron. in Hof. c. 7.
^d Hieron. L. 7. Esa. c. 19.

Ans. In this assertion are contained foure particulars: First, most heresies proceed from Scriptures euill vnderstood. This position is questionable: for many heresies proceed from other causes, as well as from Scriptures euill vnderstood, to wit, from Philosophie^a, Col. 2. 8. and from traditions of men, Mark. 7. 8. and from ignorance of holy Scripture, Matth. 22. 29. Saint Augustine saith, that all Heretikes doe not reade the Scriptures^b. And S. Hierome: The questions of Heretikes and Gentiles are the same, because they follow not the authoritie of the Scriptures, but the sense of humane reason^c. And the same Father produceth heretikes maintaining errors in the dialect of our Papiſts: *We are the sonnes of those wise men who from the beginning haue deliuered vnto vs the Apostolike doctrine: the children of the ancient, &c.*^d

2. T.W. No one thing is more auailable for the first beginning or propagation of heresie, than generall libertie granted to the vulgar of reading the Scriptures, &c.

Ans. Leauing out the word expounding, which is your addition, and no part of D. White his assertion; this position is false. For Philosophie, Tradition, and neglecting the Scriptures, ^a are more auailable to cause heresies, than the generall libertie of reading the Scriptures, which is onely an occasion by accident, 2 Pet. 3. 16. and no cause of heresie. Chrysostome saith: From hence arise innumerable euils, that the Scriptures are not knowne: *Hinc erumpit multa illa heresum perniciēs: hōnce breaketh out that manifold mischief of heresies, from hence ensueth dissolute life^c, &c.* And Gregorie and Bernard say, *In this deepe of holy reading, both the Lambe maywade and the Elephant swim^f.* And S. Augustine: *Holy Scripture, like a familiar friend, without any colourable deceit, speaketh to the heart both of the learned and unlearned^g.*

^a Espenc. com. Tit. ca. 1. digt. 2. p. 105. Quasi vero hereses ex Scripturarum studio, ac non potius ex neglectu & ignorantia nascantur?
^b Chrys. Carg. ep. ad Rom.
^c Bern. ferm. paru. f. 64. Greg. in ep. ad Leand. præfix. moral. Chrys. 1. Cor. hom. 6. Qui salutem consequi volunt, Scripturis vacent.
^d Aug. ad Voluf. ep. 3. Greg. Rom. ep. præfix. moral. sup. Job. ad Leand. c. 4. Diuinus sermo, sicut mysteriis prudentes exercet, sic plerumque superficie simplices reſouet. Habet in publico vnde paruulos nutriet, seruat in secreto, vnde mentes sublimium in admirationem suspendat. Quasi quidam quippe est flumini, planus & altus, in quo & agnus ambulet & elephas natus.

3. T.W.

3. T. W. *Because heresies arise from the Scriptures euill vnderstood, therefore the generall reading of them must not be permitted.*

Ans. 1. If for euils which happen by occasion and accident, that which is good shall be remoued and taken away^h; man who is prone to abuse all things, must haue the vse of nothing in this world. *Igne quid utilius? &c.* There is nothing more profitable than fire, yet it is possible for negligent or malicious persons to consume the house by it.

^h Aug. cont. Faust. Manich. lib. 22. c. 97. Neque medicina vitium est, si vel infans seipsum, vel maligni alios, fermentis medicinalibus perimunt.

2. I would gladly vnderstand, why the reading of the Scripture by Lay-men, doth rather occasion heresie, than the reading thereof by Bishops and Priests; or why the reading thereof in a knowne language should rather doe this, than reading the Latine translation, or the originall text? The most pernicious heresies, which hitherto haue imbroiled the Church, receiued their originall from Priests; as appeareth in Ariusⁱ, Nestorius, &c. *No man*, saith Hierom, *can frame an heresie, but he that is of excellent gifts^k, &c.* And Gerson and Æneas Siluius produce the same Father saying, *There neuer hapneth any notorious euill in the Church, but Priests are the cause thereof^l.*

ⁱ Tripar. hist. l. 1. c. 12. Arius in ordine presbyterorum erat, &c.

^k Hieron. sup. Hof. c. 10.

^l Gers. de defect. viror. eccl. n. 48. Æn. Silu. hist. Austr. § 52.

3. Stupid ignorance and grosse infidelitie, Ephes. 4. 18, 19. 1 Cor. 14. 20. Heb. 5. 13, 14. predominant among the vulgar sort of Papists, and following vpon the taking away of the Scriptures from the people, euen as darknesse succeedeth the remouing of light, are to be preuented and auoided as carefully as heresie.

T. W. D. *White a friend of heresie, maintaines generall libertie of reading and expounding the Scripture.*

Ans. 1. There is not any word in all my brothers discourse, of libertie to be granted to the vulgar, of expounding the Scripture. In plaine places the Scriptures expound themselues: and as Augustine saith, *rather require an hearer or reader, than an expositor^m.* And for that which is more difficult, the common people haue the ministerie of the Church, and daily recourse to their Pastors, and tracts and expositions of Scripture, collected by the learned: and they are permitted by our doctrine to relie in nothing vpon their owne priuate spirit, as this Popish Priest obiectioneth.

^m Aug. in Ioh. tr. 50.

2. If D. White be a friend to heresie, because he maintaineth the translation and reading of holy Scriptures in a knowne tongue, then Moses, and Christ, and the Apostle Paul, and all the primitiue Fathers were fautors of heresie, because these in generall exhorted the people to reade the Scripture, Deut. 6. 7. &c. Iosh. 1. 8. Ioh. 5. 39. 2 Tim. 3. 15. Reuel. 1. 3. *That man*, saith Augustine, *which feareth God, doth diligently inquire his will in the holy Scriptureⁿ.* Theophylact deliuereth this compendium of the doctrine of the Fathers: *Say not, that it belongeth onely to religious men to reade the Scriptures, for it is the dutie of enery Christian, and most of all of such as deale in worldly affaires, because they being as it were shaken with a tempest, haue greater need of spirituall succour^o.*

ⁿ Aug. de doct. Christ. l. 2. c. 1. ^o Theophylact. com. Eph. 6. Aug. de Temp. serm. 55. Non solum vobis sufficit, quod in Ecclesia lectiones diuinas auditis, sed etiam in domibus vestris, aut ipsi legite, aut alios legentes requirite, & libenter audite.

T. W. M. *White grossly abuseth S. Hierom in these words: Hierom writeth of Paula a gentlewoman, how she set her maids to learne the Scripture; and many of his writings are directed to women, commending their labour in the Scripture, and encouraged them thereunto, &c. But what is this to vs, who allow not onely religious women, such as these were, whom M. White fraudulently calleth Paulas maids; but euen the Laitie to reade the Scripture, supposing they be humble, discreet, and vertuous: and hauing such a master by them as S. Hierom was, to teach them? &c.*

Would not any man thinke this Minister distracted, thus producing that against vs, which confoundeth himselfe? Doe not these religious women in reading

ding the Scripture, require S. Hierom a Priest to be their master? And doth not he professe to teach them, not what he had learned himselfe from any imaginarie spirit, but from the famous Doctors of the Church? Yea, doth he not plainly and humbly acknowledge his doubting and ignorance in his explication thereof: None of which I am sure is Orthodoxall with Protestants.

Ans. I will passe by your declamation, of distracted Minister, &c. and fulfill the common by-word: Giue losers leaue to talke. The truth is, you are taken in a croupe, and cannot tell which way to turne your selfe. For^a S. Hierom and all the Fathers, doe so expressly maintaine our doctrine concerning the generall reading of holy Scripture, that you are vnable to put by the matter, so much as with a specious glosse. And therefore you bawle against the Moone: and then fetch in by head and shoulders an extrauagant discourse about S. Hierom, indeed to diuert the Reader from the point in question, and to leade him a wooll-gathering after your fables.

But as touching the present matter of Paula, her reading the Scripture: 1. It is certaine, that shee being a lay-woman, did ordinarily reade the Scripture by S. Hieroms perswasion: who saith in the same Epistle; that by her continuall reading, shee had the Scriptures without booke^b, and by the sentences thereof shee fenced her breast, as with the armour of God, against all manner of vices, &c.

2. This woman imposed a daily taske of reading the Scriptures vpon the Sisters, and women conuersing with her, whereof diuers were her maids, as appeareth by S. Hieroms words, in the end of the Epitaph placed in the margin^c.

3. This Father, in other parts of his writings most plainly requireth, and commendeth the reading of holy Scripture by all sorts of lay people, euen by little children.

In an Epistle to Leta^d, (a married wife, and no Nun) he instructeth this Matron, concerning the education of a childe her little daughter, and saith as followeth: Let the childe be deafe in hearing instruments and minstrelsie: but cause her to render euery day a taske of the flowers of holy Scripture. Let her not be sought for in the presse of secular people, but in the closes of the Scripture, asking counsell of the Prophets and Apostles, concerning spirituall nuptials. Let her first learne the Psalter, and with those heauenly songs awake her selfe from light sonnets. Then let her be taught to gouerne her life out of Salomons Prouerbs: and repaire to Iob for examples of vertue and patience. Let her then come to the Euangelists, and neuer lay their bookes forth of her hands. Shee must with these drinke in the Acts of the Apostles, and hauing enriched the cellar of her breast with this substance, then let her comme the Prophets without booke, and commit to memorie the fine bookes of Moses, the Kings, Chronicles, and volumes of Esdras. And then at the last, without any perill, shee may learne the Canticles. But let her be cautelous in Apocryphall bookes, and if shee reade them, vnderstand that they are not those Authors whose names they carry, and that many things faulty are mixed in them; and it is no small wisdom to finde gold among drosse.

The like exhortations to reade the Scriptures, are found in his Epistles, to Saluina^e, to Furia^f, to Dematriadis^g, to Celantia^h, to Theodoraⁱ. And instructing Gaudencius about the education of Pacatula an infant^k, he saith: When the rude and toothlesse girle shall come to seuen yeeres age, let her learne the Psalter without booke, and make Salomons bookes, the Gospels, the Apostles, and Prophets, the treasure of her heart. And lastly, this Father commandeth lay persons to haue the word of Christ, not onely sufficiently, but in abundance, so as they may be able to teach and admonish one another.

T. W. S. Hierom allowed Paula to reade the Scripture, being a religious Nun, discreet, humble, &c. and hauing S. Hierom her master, who expounded

^a Espenc. com. in Tit. 2. p. 257. Hieronymus tantus alioqui mulierum ad Scripturæ studium & lectionem hortator, &c. Hieron. in Plā. 86. Dominus narrabit, & quomodo narrabit? non verbo, sed Scriptura. In cuius Scriptura? in populorum, &c. Dominus narrabit, in Scripturis populorum, in Scripturis sanctis. Quæ Scriptura populis omnibus legatur, hoc est, ut omnes intelligant, non ut pauci intelligerent, sed omnes. Hieron. ep. 27.

^b Ibid. Scripturas sanctas memoriter tenebat.

^c Ipsa assidere lectulo, &c. omnium ancillarum prænuntia officia.

^d Epist. 7.

Inbibat.

^e Epist. 9.

^f Epist. 10.

^g Epist. 8.

^h Ep. 14.

ⁱ Ep. 29.

^k Ep. 12. Ep. 30.

Hieron. com. 3. cap. op. ad Coloss.

ded not the Scripture by a private spirit, &c. Roman Catholikes giue the same libertie to lay persons equally qualified.

Ans. 1. This Father doth not onely permit and tolerate, but inioyne the reading of the Scriptures not onely to Nuns, but to children of seuen yeares old, and to all kinds of lay persons^a, as I haue proued before.

2. The Protestants require the same helps of expounding Scripture, and the same humilitie and reuerence in the reading thereof, which Saint Hierom mentions.

3. Whereas this T. W. and before him Bellarmine,^b Gressar, and other Controuersars giue out, that their Church granteth libertie of reading the Scriptures in vulgar translations, to such lay persons as are able to doe the same with profit: the truth is, that they condemne all reading of Scriptures translated, by the people; and this appeares by their doctrine and practise. Their doctrine is deliuered by Stapleton and others in this manner. 1. *The generall permission of reading the Scripture, is impious, and pernicious*. 2. *God requireth no lay person to read the Scripture, neither is the same necessary or profitable to spirituall edification, but a thing meerely indifferent, and of delight onely*. 3. *The Scripture translated into a vulgar tongue, is not authentickall, or a rule of faith*. 4. *They which translate Scripture, are the seminary and causes of heresie*.

And touching their practise, let these particulars be obserued.

1. *In Countries wholly papisticall, no vulgar translations are permitted: neither any parcels, Epitomes, or Summaries of the Bible, or of the Stories thereof: nor any Prayer bookes in the vulgar tongue, hauing in them any Psalmes, or Canticles taken out of the Bible.* See the decree of Pope Clement 8. and the Spanish expurgatorie Index, in the margin^f.

2. *Whereas in former times, it was permitted in the Index of Bookes prohibited, set forth by the authoritie of the Trent Councel, Regula 4. To Bishops and Inquisitors, by the aduice of the Confessor and Parish Priest, of such lay persons as desired it, to grant licence of reading Popish vulgar translations: Now the said libertie of permission is quite taken away by a later Index of Pope Clement the 8. and Inquisitors may grant no such licences as before*.

Thus our aduersaries may tell their friends a tale of a permission, to discreet & humble persons, to read the Scripture translated: But their mother Church of Rome both disgraceth the vulgar translations composed by her own Disciples^h, & will tolerate vulgar translations no further than thus: to wit, where the same cannot be hindred, the people by conuience or toleration, are rather permitted to read their owne vulgar translations, than to vse oursⁱ: And their Gouernors, like Cato and the Emperour Adrian^k, (who pronounced it expedient to set certaine Countries at libertie, because they were vnable to hold them in subiection:) giue their people leaue to doe that which they cannot hinder^l.

Scripturæ partes, tam noui quam veteris Testamenti. Et insuper summaria & etiam compendia historica Bibliorum, & librorum sacræ Scripturæ, quocunque vulgari idiomate conscripta, & quidem inuolante præcipitur obseruandum. Index Clement 8. circa reg. 4. Trid. animaduertendum est, circa supra scriptam quartam regulam Indicis, felicitis Reſtoris Pij Papæ 4. nullam per hanc impressionem & editionem de nouo, tribui facultatem Episcopis vel inquisitoribus, aut regularium superioribus concedendi licentiam, emendi, legendi, aut recitandi Biblia vulgari lingua edita, cum hactenus mandato aut vſu sanctæ Rom. Eccles. & vniuersalis inquisitionis, sublati ijs fuerit facultas concedendi huiusmodi licentias. h. Posseuin. appar. sac. to. 1. verbo Biblia. Versio Italica, Versio Gallica: ex Caluiniſana versione, plura extemporarie in multis locis desumpta fuerunt, &c. i. Index Hispan. reg. 6. Prohibentur Biblia, vulgari lingua, cum omnibus suis partibus (ac si dicar Biblia & eorum partes. Aſer. l. 8. c. 36.) k. Spartian. vita Adrian. l. Stapl. rel. c. 5. q. 3. ar. 4. pag. 535. propter corruptas hæreticorum translationes, &c.

^a Arbor. Theof. to. 1. l. 8. c. 11. Sacrae literæ olim versæ erant in vulgarem linguam, &c. Hieronymus in Dalmaticam linguam vertit.

^b Bellar. de verb. Dei, l. 2. c. 15. Videmus concedi licentiam eiusmodi librorum ijs, qui cum fructu possunt, id est, ijs qui facultatem ab ordinario obtinuerint. Gressar. def.

^c Stapl. rel. c. 5. q. 3. ar. 4. Peres. Aſala. de trad. p. 1. Bellar. Ledsin. P. Soto. Hosius.

^d Stapl. ib. ar. 4. explic. articuli.

^e Arbor. Theof. tom. 1. l. 8. c. 11. Qui sacras literas in vulgare linguâ transferunt, sunt ipsi hæresium fontes & seminaria.

^f Stapl. ib. pag. 531.

^g Aſer. instit. mor. p. prim. l. 8. c. 36. Quædam permittuntur conscripi vulgari lingua, precationum horariorum libelli, in quibus continentur Psalmi & Cantica ex Biblijs excerpta & Recip. In Indice Hispaniensis regula 6. & 7. omnes huiusmodi libri conscripi lingua vernacula prohibentur. Ex in Indice nouissime edito, iussu sanctissimi Domini nostri Clement. 8. obseru. circa regulam 4. prohibentur sacræ

& librorum sacræ Scripturæ, quocunque vulgari idiomate conscripta, & quidem inuolante præcipitur obseruandum. Index Clement 8. circa reg. 4. Trid. animaduertendum est, circa supra scriptam quartam regulam Indicis, felicitis Reſtoris Pij Papæ 4. nullam per hanc impressionem & editionem de nouo, tribui facultatem Episcopis vel inquisitoribus, aut regularium superioribus concedendi licentiam, emendi, legendi, aut recitandi Biblia vulgari lingua edita, cum hactenus mandato aut vſu sanctæ Rom. Eccles. & vniuersalis inquisitionis, sublati ijs fuerit facultas concedendi huiusmodi licentias. h. Posseuin. appar. sac. to. 1. verbo Biblia. Versio Italica, Versio Gallica: ex Caluiniſana versione, plura extemporarie in multis locis desumpta fuerunt, &c. i. Index Hispan. reg. 6. Prohibentur Biblia, vulgari lingua, cum omnibus suis partibus (ac si dicar Biblia & eorum partes. Aſer. l. 8. c. 36.) k. Spartian. vita Adrian. l. Stapl. rel. c. 5. q. 3. ar. 4. pag. 535. propter corruptas hæreticorum translationes, &c.

the racke, to inforce so much as the bare letter will sound; but must receive their sense from the truth of the thing, and not from the sentence of words.

When God speaketh by the Prophet, *Heare O yee mountaines*, Mich. 6.2. and David, Psal. 114. *What ayleth thee, O sea, that thou fleddest, &c.* And when Eusebius saith, *Thee Oh Pietie and Humanitie doe I adore*^c; Will any man be so unreasonable, as of a Rhetoricall Apostrophe, or Prosopopeia, to inferre a literal sense?

Our Aduersaries haue sundry hymnes and prayers directed to the Image of the Crosse^d, whereof this is one^e.

*All haile Oh Crosse, our onely hope; in this time of the Passion:
Increase Iustice in the godly, and give pardon to the guiltie.*

Now when wee charge them with praying to Images, by this and other such like examples; they tell vs^f, that such prayers are to be expounded by a Prosopopeia; but in all construction it is farre more probable, that S. Hieroms speech should bee an Apostrophe. But I answer further: 1. S. Hierom at no time by way of doctrine, maintained Inuocation of Saints: and hee doubted whether Saints departed could heare our prayers^g. And pregnant occasion being offered by Vigilantius^h, and he being challenged to declare his minde, neuer confests his Aduersarie concerning Inuocation of Saints, but onely maintaines their intercession for vs, which Protestants admit in generallⁱ.

2. Being granted that Hierom requested the prayers of Paula defunct, either in generall, or so farre as she vnderstood his wants, this will not euince Popish Inuocation. For it is one thing to request and aske a benefit, durie, or fauour, which one may doe of his equall or inferior, Iob 19. 16, 17. and another to inuocate and request by praier.

Inuocation is a religious action, and proper seruice of God, Rom. 10. 14. 2 sacrifice, Heb. 13. 15. distinguished by a^k Greeke and Hebrew name, neuer applied in Scripture to any creature^l: the life and force of it, is, the inward cry, and secret request of the heart, Rom. 8. 26. 1 Sam. 1. 13. Psal. 25. 1. and 19. 14. and 10. 17. which no creature immediately discerneth, but God alone. Mat. 6. 4. 2 King. 8. 39^m. And that the Saints by reuelation vnderstand and know our prayers, is either false, or at least vncertaine: And the requesting another to pray for vs, as S. Paul did the Romans, Chap. 15. 30. the Ephelians, Chap. 6. 18. the Philippians and other Churches, Col. 4. 3. 12. 1 Theff. 5. 25. Philem. v. 22. is not religious inuocation, such as our aduersaries performe to the Virgin Marie, and other Saints in their deuotion: For they vse formall prayers, and doe as deuoutly and religiously inuocate Saints as the Lord himselfeⁿ. They pretend a difference betwene their apprehension of God in their prayers, and of the Saints: but the matter, gesture, and deuotion of praier is all one. And in their Saint inuocation they kneele downe, eleuating their eyes to heauen, vncouering their heads, and prostrating their bodies and soules, with sighes and groanes they say: *Oh blessed Apostle Paul, I beseech thee to deliver me from the Angell of Satan, and from the wrath to come, and condukt me to heauen.* And to Stephen; *Oh the first Martyr and Leuite of Christ, Oh holy Stephen, I flie to thee, I inuocate thee, I humbly and deuoutly beseech thee, &c.* And S. Bernard^o praies to the Virgin Marie in this forme: *Let thy abundant charitie conuer the multitude of our sinnes, and thy glorious fruitfulnessse conferre to vs facunditie of meritis: our Ladie,*

^e Euseb. vit. Const. l. 5.

^f Fest. inuent. cruc. O crux splendor cunctis astris, mundo celestibus, hominibus multum amabilis, sanctior vniuersis, salua presentem ceteram in tuis laudibus congregam. Offic. diu. ad visum Rom. O crucis victoria & admirabile signis: in celesti curia fac nos captare triumphum. lib. 2. Noctur. antiph.

^g Offic. Rom. in fest. exalt. Crucis, & in Dom. passionis.

^h Suar. to. 1. 3. Thom. d. 52. S. 4. Per tropum & prosopopeian explicanda est. Bellar. de imag. c. 24.

ⁱ Hieron. ep. 3. Quicquid dixerit quia ille non audit, mutum videtur, cum quo loqui non possumus, de eo loqui non desinamus, &c. Hieron. l. con. Vigil.

^k Bellar. de beat. sanct. l. c. 20. Dicunt Protestantes, sanctos pro nobis orare in genere. Rainol. de idol. Eccles. Rom. l. c. 3. Oecolampad. ad serm. Chrys. de inuent. & Maxim. Martyr. Melancth. loc. com. Manlij. fol. 151. Brent. ad ca. 16. Luc. Aug. sup. Psal. 85. ad finem.

^l Hieron.

^m Aug. l. de cura pro mort. c. 13. & 14. & 15.

ⁿ Cling. loc. com. li. 4. c. 42. Est Deus speculum, in quo vident sancti in celo nostras orationes. Est Christus verbum Dei, quod hoc reuelat sanctis.

^o Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 6. Ecclesiam intravit genua flectens, corde sanctum Petrum rogans ut seculum suum ignoscere. S. 5. reatum suum confitens Deo, & beato Petro. Math. Paris. in Rich. 1. Nunc saluatorem mundi, nunc matrem eius virginem gloriosam, nunc simul omnes electos Dei inuocabam, licet specialiter per intercessionem pijsimi, sanctissimique Nicholai, s. rati consequi petitionis effectum. pag. 177. Vorillo. serm. gratiar. actionis in fine. lib. sup. fenter. Franciscus pater inelyte, &c. mentis equans viribus inspirasti non occurrat: sui erga te saepe ingratus, sed parce filio tuo, ad te modo confugiens, quem exoro attentius, me ut semper velis habere commissum, &c. Cailand. consult. ar. 21. Non desuerunt viri celebres, (Gabr. Biel.) qui afferrent id quod Hester Affluero promissit, se petenti dimidium regni daturum: in Maria completum esse, in quam Deus regni sui quod iudicio & misericordia constat, dimidium, hoc est, misericordiam transtulerit, altera sibi regni parte retenta. Bernard. serm. 2. Aduersa. Vide Beati. serm. 4. sup. Missus est. Gabr. Biel. Can. Miss. loc. 3. 2. A. Aduocatum habere vis, ad ipsum, & Mariam recurre.

our Mediatrice, our Advocate, reconcile vs to thy sonne. Bonaventure saith;
Oh Virgin, be thou to me a strength against my sinner, that I goe not to hell, increase
daily in me the flame of charitie: warme my soule with thy love, plucke me forth
of the kennell of vice; take away the filth of my sinne, thou which art whiter than
snow, and together with thy Sonne grant my request, making mee a Citizen of
heaven.

Also in their prayers, they offer vp the merits of Saints to God, with the same forme of words they doe the merits of Christ, saying to Thomas Becket: *Oh God who hast granted vs to celebrate the translation of blessed Thomas, we humbly beseech thee, that by his merits and prayers we may be translated from vice to vertue, and from prison to thy kingdome P.*

Let our Aduerſaries now produce examples out of S. Hierom, prouing ſuch a forme of Saint-inuocation, and exhibition of merits to God, and we will acknowledge they ſpeake to the matter.

But they onely corraide a few broken and vncertaine speeches, whereof some are figuratiue: other, wishes and requests, limited by ifs and ands; as, heare On Constantines soule, *εἰ τις ἐμνήσῃ*, if thou haue sense, or notion of these things; or priuate deuotions and conceits of some particular persons; or bastard sentences foysted into the writings of Fathers by Hucksters of their owne fellowship: and from hence inferre a Catholike doctrine and Article of Faith^r, according to their moderne fashion, concerning inuocation of Saints.

But if antiquitie fauour them, and this their deuotion bee Catholike, why doe they not produce some publike definition of the Primitiue Church? or proue their praetise out of the doctrinall Treatises of the ancient Fathers touching inuocation and praier? or out of authentickall Records, wherein the ancient forme of Christian seruice, and religious exercises of the prime Christians are expressly related? Iustin Martyr and Tertullian haue reported the same: and Eusebius in his Storie, setteth downe verbatim a long praier vsed by Polycarpe Bishop of Smyrna, at the time of his martyrdome: wherein, if inuocation of Saints had bene reputed any part of Christian deuotion in those daies, hee would vndoubtedly in so great perill and at his death, haue recommended himselfe to God by the praier and merits of Saints: But his forme of praier is Protestantlike, tendered to God himselfe onely by the mediation of Christ^u.

And the elder Fathers deliuer certaine Maximes touching praiſer, which ouerthrow Saint-inuocation. Tertullian ſaith *, *Such prayers are to be vpbraid* with vanitie, which are made without any authoritie of the Lords or Apoſtles Commandement, and muſt rather be accounted ſuperſtition than religion. And Cyprian †, *To pray in other manner than Chriſt hath taught vs, is not onely ignorance, but ſinne: for it is written ⁊ Tu reiekt the commandement of God, that you may eſtabliſh your Traditions.* And he teacheth, *that the ſumme and generall matter of all lawfull praiſer is contained in the Lords praiſer, and enery praiſer is unlawfull which is not leuelled by that forme.* But Popiſh Saint-inuocation, hath neither document or example from the Lord or his Apoſtles, is not regulate by the Lords praiſer, was altogether vnknowne in the old Teſtament ‡, is not commanded in the Goſpell *, nor vſed in the Apoſtles daies †, according to the confeſſion of diuers learned Papiſts.

στὴν ἐξέγερσιν ἡλίου μερῶν, ὁ δὲ ἀνέβλεπεν ἐν δυνάμει, καὶ παύσας τὰς ἀφύπνους, ἔλεγε· οὕτως ἐξήκουσε με τὸς ἡμέτερος, καὶ ἔμελλεν ναυαγῆναι, &c. pag. 37.
 2. Tertul. de orat. c. 13. 7 Cyprian. de orat. Dom. = Pigh. cont. Ratib. l. 13. Horan. loc. Cath. l. 3. c. 21. Suar. i. in 3. Tho. q. 52.
 4. 41. 5. Salmeron. 5. Tim. c. 2. d. 8. = Horan. loc. Cath. l. 3. c. 21. = Peref. Aial. de trad. p. 3. de sancta Sanctior.

Article 2. *Of S. Hieroms Poperie* ; ^b Every one hath an Angell Guardian or keeper.

That every faithfull and iust person hath a particular Angell guardian, is no Article of Catholike faith, but only of probable opinion among Papists themselves.

• Bonavent. Pfalter. minus. Reads the whole. Offic Rom. ab Oclau Pent. vsque ad adu. salve Regina mater misericordiz, vita, dulcedo, & spes nostra, ad te clamamus exules filij Adam: ad te suspiramus gementes, &c. cia aduocata nostra, &c.

P. Missal. Sarisb.
fest. Tho. Becker.
Anton. fun. hift.
p. 3. tit. 23. c. 4. 3.
7. de virtute & mi-
ritis sancti i omni-
nis. confidens, &c.
lb. c. 7. §. 13. An-
th Thomæ meritis
se recommendan-
tes apte sunt aures
eorum. Riel.
can. Miss. lect. 30.
l. n. Obsecro te pio-
issime Domine Ie-
su Christe, ut per
merita beatissimæ
virginis, &c. & omni-
um Sanctorum,
&c. doceas me,
&c. offic. paruum
B. Mar. ad Matut.
Precibus & meritis
B. Mariæ perducat
nos Dominus ad
regnum celorum,
&c. Leo. Hadrian.

&c. Leo Hoftienf.
1. 2. c. 27 Benedi-
di meritis & ope,
&c. Legend. aurea,
in sanct. Egidio.
9 Greg. Naz. cont.
Julian, or. 1. Gr.
Naz. or. funebr.
Gorgon.
8 Trid. Concil.
fess. 25.

f Tertul. lib. de
orat. Cyprian. in
Dom. orat.

† Iustin. Martyr.
apol. 2. Tertul. a-
pol. c. 19.

* Euseb. hist. lib.
4. cap. 15.
ὁ τῷ ἀρχιεπισκοπῇ, &c. &c.

λογισμὸν παροῦς σε
 Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ πα-
 τὴρ. ὅτι ἡ πύξ σου

in 3. Tho. q. 52.

b Hieron. ep. 37.
 Ipsumque propriū
 Angelum, qui cu-
 stos fuit & comes
 admirabilis sumi-
 ne.

felides: Gaictanfaith, that many Angels attend one iust person^b. And Molina the Iesuite saith; That men are guarded by Gods Angels, is a matter of Faith, but that every one hath his peculiar Angell to guard him, is not of Faith, but the common opinion of Saints and Doctors^c. And some learned Protestants affirme; That every elect person hath a speciall Angell to be his keeper^d: and therefore this is no point of difference in our religions. But the Papiſts reach diuers things about the custodie of good Angels, which our Aduerſarie will not easily maintaine out of S. Hierom: To wit, that when a iust person is in Purgatorie, his good Angell repaires thither, and doth viſit and comfort him; reporting unto him the Masses and prayers which are offered for him in the world, and willing him thereupon to rest secure in the hope of his delinuerance^e. And Becanus the Iesuite^f, together with many Schoolemen before him, maintaine, that Antichrist shall haue a good Angell to be his Guardian.

Al. Hal. p. 2. q. 41. m. 4. ar. 4. Tho. Aqu. 2. d. 11. q. 3. ad. 5. & par. 1. q. 113. ar. 4. ad. 3. Dionys. Carthus.

Article 3. Pilgrimage to holy places.

Sundry persons in the Primitive Church travelled to Hierusalem and the Holy Land: Some to visit their friends, and to behold the places and sacred monuments mentioned in the Bible; other to gaine better vnderstanding of the Storie^a, or to delight their mindes with such things as they had heard and read, or to confirme their beleefe: Some also desired to worship in that place where Christs feet had walked^b: and some in those daies were superstitious, attributing more sanctitie to that place than to other, Ioh.4.21, against whom Gregorie Nilense indired his Oration^c.

But what is this for the palliating of the superstition and countenance of Popish pilgrimages to the Holy Land, but especially to Rome at the yeere of Iubilee^d, and to the shrines and Idols of the Virgin Marie^e, and other Saints for satisfaction and merit; deuised and maintained to enrich the Popes coffers, and cozening and pilling of the Christian world, and feeding the Romane Harpics?

Paulus Iouius a Popish Bishop, calleth Popes pardons (annexed to these pilgrimages,) *The instruments of the Pope to gather in money*. And Cranzius saith, *They were the Popes gold mines*. And sundry Popish Anchors complaine of the horrible wickednesse and villanies occasioned by these pilgrimages and pardons^h.

Lastly, although S. Hierom was a fauor of traouelling to the holy Land, for some of the reasons formerly related; yet his doctrine is found concerning the matter in substance: for writing to Paulinus, he saith; *The kingdome of heauen is alike open to them which are in Britaine, and those which are at Hierusalem: neither thinke thou that any thing is wanting to thy faith, because thou hast not visited Hierusalem.*

bert. Scaffelt, Ger

4. deficientibus, ipse delatis per urbem, supplicando, Apollolorum capitibus, populum ad commiserationem in ipsum
 Massino, de episc. vrb. lib. 3. §. in Beneficio 8. Iohannes Villacencius refert, toto illo anno, 200000 milita præter
 ca, tollere facit, auri & diuitiarum, quas Pontifici illo anno concessit. &c. lib. 6. in Beneficio 9. A quinquagesimo
 annis, Vrbani sextus Tubulum reduxit, et sine rogatus in gratiam Romanorum, fuit ipse quæsitus. Et in Alexandro 4.
 ubi iubet, ingenuis hominum numerus, pietatis causa Romam confluxit, AMPLIASSVS OPVS attulit. f. Iouillu.
 4. Indulgencies vetera Pontificum ad parandum pecuniam instrumenta. Vide Theod. Niemi. de Ichism. Pap. lib. 3. sept.
 auri fodine. ⁴ Polydor. Virgil. de Inuent. l. 8. c. 3. Placina in Beneficio 9. Auentin. annal. l. 7. Maximam fene-
 stram patefecit: per que auri hinc accepta inimicos suos tollebant. Vincent. Hispan. Homines & mulieres peregrinam
 & effluente periores: a qui aliquando vadunt cultum, & redeunt meretricem. Verger. de idol. Lauret. pag. 64. Lam-
 man. Peregrinationem Hieroglomycaam aggressus fuit, zelo Dei, vtinam secundum scientiam. ⁴ Hieron. epist. 13.

Article 4.

Article 4. Touching the Adoration of the Crosse.

S. Hierom reporteth not (as our Aduersarie saith^a) that Paula adored the Crosse^b, but that prostrating her selfe before the Crosse, she beheld Christ with the eyes of her faith, as he was crucified by the Iewes, and adored him. And it is acknowledged by Bellarmine, that Paula adored not the Crosse^c. And it appears by the primitive Fathers, that there was no Popish adoration of the Crosse vsed in their daies: for S. Ambrose speaketh thus; *Helen* (the mother of great Constantine) *adored the heavenly King, and not the wooden Crosse, for this were an heathenish error, and vanitie of impious people*^d.

crucis vexillum adorare, &c. adoratione latriz. * Ambros. orat. funeb. de obitu Theodosii. Cyril. contra Iulian. l. 6. Minutius Felix. in Octau. l. 8. Ambrosii.

^a T. W. pag. 24. Adoration of the Crosse.
^b Hieron. ep. 27. Prostrata ante crucem, &c. Cernere se oculis fidei, &c.
^c Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 24.
^d Iamas sum. eccles. 3. part. ca. 3. Tenemur viuifice

Article 5. Signing the bodie with the signe of the Crosse.

The signing of the bodie with the signe of the Crosse, as it was anciently vsed by the prime Christians to these ends, 1. To profess that they were not ashamed of Christ crucified, nor of the persecutions and crosses which befell them for his sake; 2. That they hoped for saluation and redemption by Christ Iesus crucified, whom the Iewes and Gentiles despised, our Diuines acknowledge to be lawfull^e. But the Papists not contenting themselves with the lawfull vse thereof, haue sundry waies abused the same. 1. They make it an instrument of miracles, after that the gift of miracles was ceased in the Church^f. 2. They ascribe vnto it a vertue to sanctifie mens persons, and the creatures of God; to expell and repell deuils, to deliuer from dangers and euils^g, and to performe some of these effects by force of the very outward deed, or *ex opere operato*^h.

In regard of these abuses our Church obserueth not so common an vse of the signe of the Crosse as was in former ages: Neuerthelesse, we condemne not the same signe in regard of it selfe, but vse it in the Sacrament of Baptisme, and abstaine from the more frequent vse of it, because you haue so foully abused it to superstition: and we follow herein the rule of Canon Law, warranted by the Scripture and Primitive Churchⁱ.

* Canon. ecclesi. of the Church of England, an. 1603. can. 30. Hospinian. de orig. templ. l. 2. c. 20. In primordio Ecclesie pius & sanctus, &c. D. Fulk. de success. eccl. cont. stapl. pag. 413.

^f Legend. aur. in S. Francis: Allatam sibi aquam signo crucis edito benedixit, & mox in optimum vini conuersa est.

^g Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 30. Duran. de rit. eccles. cath. l. 2. c. 45. Bos. de sign. eccles. l. 2. c. 8.

^h Bellar. ib. existimo, &c. ex opere operato valere signum crucis confirmari.

ⁱ Tra diabolum. Wil. Nubrigenf. hist. Angl. l. 2. c. 22. de quodam Kaello, &c. P. Cluniacensis ep. 1. c. 1. Quod dicunt crucem Domini non adorandam. Durand. Rational. l. 5. c. 2. Dionys. Cartus. de fest. exalt. crucis. Tantam in cruce confidentiam habent fideles, ut eius signatione, se ab aduersitatibus tueri, & bonis firmari, & a demonibus protegi credant & sperant. Gratian. d. 63. c. quia. & de consecr. d. 4. c. si quis. 2 Kin. 18. 4. Aug. de ciuit. Dei, l. 10. c. 8. Concil. Elbert. c. 35. Concil. Carthag. 3. c. 30. Concil. Antiochod. c. 3.

Article 6. Kissing and reuerencing of Reliques.

Paula kisseth the sepulcher and stone of Christ his Resurrection, in token of her reioycing for the benefit of her Redemption, whereof she was put in minde by those Monuments. But why doe you charge the Protestants with condemning this? we onely reprove, 1. Such adoration of Reliques, as Saint Hierom him selfe and Augustine condemned². 2. The attributing of supernaturall effects to Monuments and Reliques, which they haue not by any ordinance of God. 3. To place confidence and merit in these things without any diuine authoritie; and to cause people to gad and wander to this or that place, that they may receiue benefit by them. 4. We most of all condemne the impostures and couerousnesse of the Romanists, who in stead of true Reliques brought in counterfeits^h, and then for filthy lucre bartered and made portsale of these Reliques, abusing herein the ignorance and superstition of fond people.

² Hieron. ep. 53. ad Ripar. Aug. de mor. eccles. cath. l. 1. c. 39.

^h Vide Wolph. memorab. to. 2. an. 1525. p. 233. & p. 285. Espence. com. Tit. 1. p. 129. Baron. ann. 1008. n. 1. Glab. l. 3. c. 6. Dicitur virgo Moysis inuenisse partem, ad cuius rei famam conueniunt quique fideles, ex Galia, Italia, & transmarinis regionibus, &c. Baron.

an. 1100. n. 10. The Lance is found wherewith Christs side was pierced. Sigo. de reg. Ital. l. 7. A brazen Serpent made of the same brass which Moses by serpent was, as Millan in Saint Ambrose his Church. Bergom. supplem. chron. lib. 10. anno 592. Tunica inconsutilis Domini nostri, &c. ea tempestate inuenta fuit, &c.

Article 7. Tormenting of Devils at the Sepulcher of Saints.

¹ Hieron. cont. Vigilant. Aug. de Civ. Dei. l. 8. c. 16. & l. 22. c. 8. Chryl. ad pop. Antioch. hom. 66. & 2 Cor. hom. 26. in fine. ² Iuel. Reply. art. 2. pag. 39. Cherm. nit. exam. Trid. Conc. p. 4. de reliq. sanctor. Hospin. de orig. templ. l. 2. c. 7. Wolph. cō. 2. Reg. 13. in fine.

When it pleaseth the Lord to shew his power, and to worke miracles¹ in any place, or by any meanes, as seemeth good vnto himselfe, we admire his power, and praise his goodnesse: and we are not ignorant how God hath vsed dead bones as an instrument of life, 2 King. 13. 21. And concerning these things, a most reuerend Bishop of our Church hath written in this manner²: *Almighty God, for the testimonie of his doctrine and truth, hath oftentimes wrought great miracles, euen by the dead carcases of his Saints, in witnesse that they had bene his messengers, and the instruments of his will: but as they were godly inducements at the first to leade people vnto the truth, so afterwards they became snares, to leade the same people into errors.*

Article 8. Building of monasteries, and prof. ssing monasticall life.

Here the P. P. like a Spider, would weaue the long thred, and loofe Cobwebs of his Abbies, Priories, and Nunneries, and the infinite swarmes of his religious Orders from the example of Paula and S. Hierom. But his Monkes and Friers are not of the kindred with the ancient; and setting aside the name onely and some few generalities, they agree in the same manner together as the Pharises did with Abraham, whose of-spring they boasted themselves to be, Ioh. 8. 39.

¹ Hieron. ad Paulin. ep. 13. Si cupis esse quod dicitis Monachus, quid facis in vrb. &c. Azor. inst. mor. p. 2. l. 13. c. 19. ² Hieron. vita Hilari. Aug. l. de oper. Monac. c. 18. ³ Hieron. ad Heliodor. ep. 3. ⁴ Id. ad Eustoch. ep. 23. ⁵ Polydor. de inuent. l. 7. c. 1. Nullum votorum vinculum. ⁶ Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 1. §. 1. Dominico & ordini suo B. Virgo Maria, habitum gestandum ostendit & colorem. ⁷ Ib. c. 1. §. 1. Dominicus ex magna charitate, tres sibi disciplinas, cum cathena ferrea quotidie sibi dabat vique ad sanguinis effusionem: vnam pro peccatoribus in seculo degentibus, &c. secundam pro hiis qui in purgatorio, &c. tertiam pro suis peccatis, quæ tam modica & leuis erant, vt pro eis satisfaceret, &c. ⁸ Ambros. l. 10. ep. 83. ⁹ Aug. epist. 76. Hieron. ad Rust. ep. 4. & ep. 23. & ep. 27. & ep. 13. Polydor. de Inuent. l. 7. c. 1. ¹⁰ Epiphani. l. 2. hær. 41 in fine. Hieron. ep. 8. & ep. 47. Cyprian. ep. 62. ¹¹ Athanas. ep. ad Draconem. *μνηστέον τῶν τοῦτον γυναικῶν* p. 739. ¹² Aug. de hær. l. hær. 41. ¹³ Greg. lib. 1. ep. 40. ¹⁴ Gerl. de desol. vir. eccl. n. 61. Abbates & Monachi, sunt plus officiales fisci quàm Christi, tois nistibus milantes mundo, &c. ¹⁵ Bern. apol. ad Will. Abbas. ¹⁶ Bern. ep. 42. in fine ad Henric. Senens. Archiepiscopus.

S. Hieroms Monkes liued in solitarie places¹, and got their liuing with the labour of their hands². They were lay people, and no Priests³, neither possessed they lands, either in priuate or common⁴. Some of our Aduersaries more ingenious than their fellowes, say; *They were intangled with no voves⁵*, they vsed no disguised apparell⁶, neither did these vnder take the satisfaction and expiation of other mens sins⁷, but onely embraced a retired life: many of them to the end that being sequestred from worldly affaires, they might haue liberty to serue God more freely: others that they might be trained vp in godlinesse and good learning, and fitted to the publike seruice of the Church⁸. Nuns and Laicks continually read the holy Scripture⁹, neither were they so absolutely tied to that state of life, but that if they could not containe and liue chastly, they might goe abroad into the world and marrie, (although they were then censured and reprobued of inconstancie¹⁰): and it seemeth by the words of Athanasius¹¹ and Augustine¹², that some of those Monkes liued in wedlocke, and there were married Monkes in Gregorie his time¹³.

But come we now to Popish Monkes; they leade their liues in Cities and frequented habitations, enioying riches and possessions in abundance¹⁴. They are absolute Lords of Mannors, Castles, Parks, and of all manner of worldly goods. They are cloathed in rich array, and fare deliciously euery day, and their whole life is a vacancie from labour and care. *Let me be iudged a liar* (saith Bernard¹⁵) *if I haue not seene an Abbot ride with sixtie horse.* And the same Bernard¹⁶; *Labour, lining secret, and voluntarie pouertie, are the ensignes of true Monkes: but your eies behold enery thing which is lustie; your feet run to each common meeting; your tongues are heard in enery counsell, and your hands despoile and ransish enery patrimonie.*

There was neuer such an hypocrisie harboured in the world as this of Popish

monasticall life^q, for they vow povertie, and yet in wealth and prosperitie exceed Kings: vowing obedience, they neither giue vnto God the things which are Gods, nor to Cesar those duties which are Cesars. They vow chastitie, and yet the greater part of them rot away in filchinesse^r.

eccles. num. 65. Claustra monialium facta sunt quasi prostibula meretricum. Iouian. Pontan. de bel. Neopol. &c. Vestalium monasteria ita amatoribus patent, vt instar lupanariorum sint. Honor. Aug. Dial. de prædest. & lib. arb. in immunditici forde computrescunt.

^q Lamb. Scafnab. Germ. Frater eius Henricus, &c. in finitū dæmonis monasticam vitam professus est. ^r Gerl. de def. vir. Vestalium monaste-

Article 9. Voluntarie povertie.

Feigned sanctitie is a double iniquitie^f: and this voluntarie povertie so much extolled in Poperie, is the foulest hypocrisie that euer the Sunne shone vpon. All the wealth vpon earth sufficeth not the Popish faction, and you may sooner satisfie hell than the Romish Clergie; and yet they finde seduced fautors, who yeeld a credulous care to their probleme of voluntarie povertie.

Matthew Paris^t treating of the begging Friers, who by vow vndertooke the strictest forme of povertie, saith; *In England they builded Mansions, whose towers were equall to Kings Palaces. These are the men which hoard vp inualuable treasure in sumptuous edifices, and lofty walled buildings, &c. They hang vpon rich men whom they know to abound in wealth, &c.*

Aeneas Syluius saith^u; *The foure Orders of Mendicants inhabit there, free from all beggerie.*

Papirius Masson^x, *Povertie which religious Orders seeme to professe, is more hateful to them than to any other Order of men.*

The wealth and couetousnesse of Popes hath exceeded all measure. It is reported of Pope Iohn the 22. that at his death he left behinde him *twenty five millions or tens of gold*^y. Clement the fift died, seised of an infinite masse of treasure, which he bequeathed to his kinred^z. And Sixtus Quintus of late yeeres, left behinde him in ready coine fiftie hundred thousand pounds^a.

Neuerthelesse, our Romish Emisaries doe in the meane time speake largely in commendation of povertie; affirming, that to giue away all one hath to charitable vses, to wit, to *Abbeys and Massemongers*^b, is a worke of supererogation^c.

But although it be a dutie pleasing God to depart with all one hath, when the Lord himselfe, either by expresse commandement, Matth. 19. 21. or by his calling and providence, offering a iust occasion, Heb. 10. 34. inioyneth man to doe it: yet the presumptuous doing hereof without any such calling is vnlawfull, and many times little differeth from theeuerie in the giuer and receiuer. The same is contrary to the rule of the Scripture, 2 Cor. 8. 13, 14. It depriues people of abilitie to performe those duties, for which they shall eternally be rewarded; Matth. 25. 35. and of the blessing spoken of, Acts 20. 35. and it agrees with the hypocrisie condemned, Matth. 23. 5. And in the Primitiue Church it was censured by diuers of the Fathers, as a practise of Heretickes^d.

And whereas this P. P. endeoureth to confirme his superstition from the example of Paula, (as other of his faith haue done before him^e) I finde in S. Hierom, 1. that Paula made prouision for her children before she entered into this liberall course of giuing away her goods^f. 2. Hierom taxeth her for being ouerprofuse in bestowing^g, and aduiseh her not to be too lauish, lest exhausting the stocke of her liberality, she disabled her selfe from doing the good which she most desired.

Hal. par. 4. q. 30. & 4. 31. Azor. instit. mor. par. 1. l. 13. ca. 1. ^d Epiphan. heres. 61. Aug. de heres. hær. 40. Baron. to. 5. an. 440. n. 9. Ambros. offic. 1. l. c. 30. ^e Al. Hal. p. 4. q. 31. m. 2. ar. 1. Resp. ^f Hieron. ep. 27. Nulla sic amavit filios, quibus antequam proficisceretur cuncta largita est. ^g Ib. Cum in largiendo esset profusior, arguebam, &c.

^f Aug. sup. Psal. 63.

^t Matth. Paris. in Henric. 3. p. 591.

^u Epist. 165. de scriptio Viennæ. ^x Papir. Masson. de episc. vrb. l. 6. in Clem. 5. Religiosi quam proficiunt videntur paupertatē, per cunctis mortalibus exosam habent.

^y Paraleipom. Viperger. ann. 1328. Pap. Masson. in Ioh. 22. Iohannes Pontif. concessit in numerato decies septies centenis florenorum aureorum millibus, &c. Vide Platin. in Ioh. 23. Henric. Token. Canonic. Magdeburg. Silua loc. com.

^z Papir. Masson. de episc. vrb. l. 6. in Clem. 5.

^a Cicarel. vita Sixti 5.

^b Bellarm. de Monach. l. 2. c. 46. Possessiones donatae ecclesiis & monasteriis, quid aliud sunt, quam elemosynæ?

Matth. Paris. in Richard. 1. Hugo Cestrensis episcopus, omnia quæ possidebat in auro, & argento, & gemmis, & vasis pretiosis, domibus religiosis & pauperibus erogauit. ^c Tho. Aq. opusc. q. 19. c. 6. Alex.

Article 10. *Wearing of haire-cloth, and lying upon the ground in stead of a bed.*

The wearing of haire-cloth, and lying vpon the ground, are things indifferent^b, frequent in the Old Testament, 2 Sam. 3. 31. 2 Kings 19. 1. Iob 16. 15. Dan. 9. 3. but haue not any example in the New.

Epiphanius condemneth the open wearing of haire-cloth as vndecent, and disagreeing with the manner of the Catholike Churchⁱ, and there is no necessity of the doing hereof. Howsoever these things being in their kinde indifferent, (when they are lawfully vsed) are not condemned by vs: onely the vile hypocrisie^k and miserable superstition, which after the daies of the ancient Fathers oppressed the Church, hath caused the Protestants lesse to esteeme these exercises, rather maintaining the substantiall actions of mortification, Rom. 8. 13. Iob 2. 13. 1 Pet. 2. 11. Tit. 2. 12. Luke 9. 23. Ierem. 4. 4. than these bodily exercises, 1 Tim. 4. 8. And surely after that, the Church forgetting the admonitions of holy Scripture, Matth. 6. 16. Col. 2. 23. began to describe mortification rather by corporall exercises than spirituall actions, there oppressed the same an vmbraious heape of superstition: and in stead of true godlinesse, people doted after prodigious vestures and habits, reposed confidence in Friers stinking Coules^l. And the brutish Friers, Dominick and Francis, contemning haire-cloth as meane, began to weare shirts of Male next their skinn, chaines of Iron, and halters^m; and they whipped and displed themselves like Baals Priestsⁿ, and lay naked in the snow^o, and wallowed in the dunghill with swine^p, and the shamefull superstition of these beasts, was (indeed) preferred before Christ Iesus and his Apostles doctrine^q.

^a Pareus com. Gen. 37. 34. Hic gestus adiphorus quidem per se, nec improbat, &c.
ⁱ Epiphani. l. 3. heret. 80.
^k Augustinus de serm. in monte moris.
^l Gerf. p. 1. serm. de vita Cler. Saepe mentiuntur hae vestes, dum aliud monstrant extra, aliud tegunt intra: exterius sanctitatem, interius vilitatem, &c.
^m Breviar. Rom. de consec. cucul. Monach. orat. Deum vt vestem illam ita benedicat & sanctificet, vt sit arma fortis ad regendum pecc. & tutum munimen contra spiritum acri, & ignita tela inimici, &c. Antonin. sum. hist. par. 3. tit. 23. c. 2. §. 1. Matth. Paris. in Hen. 3. de Richard. episc. Cestrensi. pag. 840. Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 24. c. 2. §. 6. Crebro pius pater (Franciscus) quasi seminudus, a populo relictus est: eo quod tunicas eius per particulas cum cultellis inciderent, casque deuote contra diuersa pericula, pro salutis remedio reportarent. Id. ib. tit. 23. c. 2. §. 1. Vincent. spec. hist. l. 30. c. 117. Surius tom. 5. Octobr. pa. 850. in S. Dominick. loricato. Antonin. ib. c. 2. §. 1. Sur. to. 5. in vita Francisc. c. 5. pa. 589. Matth. Paris. in Henric. 3. pa. 328. Antonin. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 1. §. 1. Per hunc (Paulum) itur ad Christum, facilius per hunc. Nec miretis, &c. quia doctrina Pauli, sicut & ceterorum Apostolorum, erat doctrina inducens ad fidem & obseruantiam preceptorum: doctrina Dominici ad obseruantiam consiliorum, & ideo facilius per ipsum itur ad Christum, &c. vid.

Article 11. *Abstinence from flesh, wine, and daintie meat upon deuotion.*

The whole substance of Popish fasting^a, consisteth of abstinence from certaine kindes of meat, prohibited by the Roman Church, and in forbearing a second standing meale.

In Popish fasting it is lawfull to eat one large meale, and if the same bee excessiue, it ouerthroweth not the merit of fasting^b. Also, a beuer and drinking at euening is permitted^c, wherein one may receiue food of any kinde belonging to the day, if he exceed not in measure^d: and betweene dinner and drinking one may take food in a small quantitie^e. Wine and strong drinke are permitted in Popish fasts, both at meale, and at any time of the day as oft as one will^f. And there be diuers occasions whereupon people may be excused from fasting: and among the rest, a great Casuist of Spaine^g deliuereth these which

^a Lessius de iustit. & iure. l. 4. ca. 2. dub. 2. Substantia ieiunij solum in duobus sita est: in abstinentia ciborum vectorum & abstinentia secundae refectiois. Caietan. sum. verb. ieiunium. Tota vis ieiunij consistit in prorogatione: inedia vsque ad horam tardiores. Llamas sum. eccl. par. 3. c. 5. §. 19. Ieiunium quod a Christianis observatur, cum modo ieiunandi & assignatione dierum, est mere iuris canon. Less. de iust. & iur. l. 4. c. 2. du. 3. excessus cibi non tollit ieiunium quoad meritum. Tolet. instr. sacer. l. 6. ca. 2. Quamuis quis multum excedat, non ob id soluit ieiunium. Azor. par. 1. instit. mor. l. 7. c. 8. Tolet. instr. sacer. l. 6. c. 2. Nauar. manual. c. 21. n. 27. Caietan. in sum. Llamas sum. Caietan. sum. verb. ieiunium. Ad hoc videtur serotinum ientaculum reduci, vt non referat quid quisque sumat, si modum non excedat. Caietan. ibid. Videntur omnes his pluries comedere & non frangere ieiunium. Azor. p. 1. instit. mor. l. 7. c. 8. Omnes communi consensu testantur, id quod in pocum sumitur, vinum, &c. non solvere ieiunium. Llamas sum. par. 3. c. 5. §. 24. Potus nunquam frangit ieiunium, neque mane neque vespere, etiam si sit vini. Llamas ib. §. 21. pa. 389. Caietan. sum. verb. ieiun. Si vir ieiunando non potest debitum vxori reddere, non tenetur ieiunare: & similiter si vxor non potest se gratam viro seruare, & macilenta, pallida, &c.

follow:

follow: If a man have made himselfe wearie in digging or breaking into a house, that he might rob it, or in killing his neighbour, or in multiplying unchaste actions, or travelling a long way to visit his Concubine, and by these and the like meanes findeth himselfe vnable to fast, he is not bound vnto the same.

And in sundry cases one may procure another to fast for him: neither is it needfull in Popish fasting to conioyne with abstinence from meat, prayers, almes-deeds, or any exercise of religion; and they which fast, may goe to meale at ten, eleuen, or twelue a clocke in the fore-noone^k.

Bernard describing the manner of fasting, exercised in Monasteries in his daies, saith^l (at meale) *One dish is served in after another, and in place of flesh goodly fishes are served double upon the board. When one is satiate with one sort, then succeedeth another service, and every messe is so daintily cooked, that after a man hath fed upon foure or five dishes, the stomacke is provoked by varietie to further appetite.* In an Oration vttered at the Synod of Treurs, the Author saith^m: *They preach Christ fasting in the wilderness, and themselves live sumptuously after the rule of the Epicure, dining in his garden, &c.*

Lindan a grosse Papist, among many other things saith; *The fasts of Catholikes are (meere gluttonie and) Epicure-likeⁿ. A shadow of true fasting is onely found in the Catholike Church. Our fastings swimme with wine, and overflow with abundance: and by varietie of fish exceed the daintinesse of flesh, and seeme to be a very mockery with God.*

Betweene these fasts and such as are commended in holy Scripture, and were practised by Saint Hierom, by Paula, and other of the ancient, I wonder what concord our Aduersary can espie.

Saint Hierom and Paula commended by him, fasted freely of their owne election, (in regard of time and manner) compelled by no lawes of Roman Church^o: Their abstinence was from fish, wine, and all dainties, as well as from flesh^p; and with bodily abstinence they conioyned praier, repentance, deeds of charitie, reading holy Scripture, inward mortification^q, &c. But our Aduersaries teach, *That drinking of Wine, taking of Electuaries, Co-serues^r, and other delicacies, euen after a sensuall manner, breake not their fasting.*

Now for the conclusion of this Section, I aduise T.W.P. once againe to reuiew S. Hierom, before he presume to make the fasting commended by him, a sampler of his Romish hypocrisie.

melle, & reliquis quæ gustui suauia sunt. &c. ^q Hieron. cont. Iovinian. l. 2. & sup. Joel. c. 1. ^r Siluest. sum. verb. ieiun. n. 20. Pa-

^h Toler. infr. sacer. l. 3. c. 11. Azor. p. 1. mor. l. 7. c. 21. Gratian. dist. 28. c. presb. & de penit. dist. 3. ca. de penit.

ⁱ Azor. p. 1. infr. mor. l. 7. c. 20. Sicut. Benen. bibl. l. 6. annot. 106.

^k Nauar. enchir. ca. 21. lac. de Graph. decif. aur. par. 1. l. 2. c. 37.

^l Bern. ep. ad Gail. Abbat. Alciator. sum. l. 3. tr. 7. c. 5. q. 5. Cum multi pices sint æque delicati, vel magis quam carne: cur permittit ecclesia tum piscium, & prohibet esum carniū? Resp. pro peccato Adæ, non fuit aqua maledicta, & ideo non prohibetur esus piscium, quia viuunt in aqua: sed terra fuit maledicta, &c.

^m Tom. 4. Concil. Sur. Synod. Treur. an. 1548. oratio D. P. l. 1. g.

ⁿ Lindan. panno. l. 3. ca. 10 & 11. vi. pag. 121.

^o Caietan. com. Act. 13. Habes in primitiua ecclesia spontanea ieiunia. ^p Hieron. ep. 29. Vino, & liquamine, & piscibus, & ieiun. n. 20. Pa-

Article 12. Keeping set houres of Praier; as in the morning, at the third, the sixth, the ninth, euen song, and midnight.

Our Aduersary would hence extract his Popish Canonick houres: but neither the number, (for Popish houres are seuen^a) nor the time, neither yet the forme and matter of the seruice agree.

Midnight is none of the Roman houres; and the matter of Paula her seruice, were praiers, thanksgiuings, and Psalmes, taken out of the holy Scripture, vsed in a knowne tongue, and ioyned with vnderstanding and inward deuotion. But our Romists Canonick houres consist (chiefly) of inuocation of Saints and Angels, of superstitious blessing of Creatures; Hymnes and chauntings in the honour of the Virgin Marie; and the parcels of Scripture vsed in their seruice, are miserably and ineptly peruerterd to superstition. Also this seruice is performed in an vknowne tongue, which many times the Priests themselues vnderstand not^c: and according to their doctrine it is not materiall, whether any person present vnderstand a word of

^a Azor. p. 1. mor. instit. l. 10. c. 1. Euphan. her. 80. in fine, habet duas uel tres horas, and Hier. 6.

^b Hier. ib. Psalm. rium cantabunt. &c.

^c Catharin. annot. con. Caiet. read by Sixtus Senari. l. 6. bibl. an. 163.

^d Lac. Graph. de-
cif. ant. p. 1. l. 3. c.
32. n. 15.
^e Ib. c. 53. n. 16.
qui caret deuotio-
ne non peccat.
^f Bellar. de bon.
oper. l. 1. c. 18.
Tolst. instr. fac. l.
2. c. 13. Less. de
iust. & iur. l. 2. c.
37. d. 2.
^g Azor. p. 1. instr.
mor. lib. 10. c. 10.
Nana. Man. c. 25.
Siluest. sum. v. ho-
ra. n. 14. Lac.
Graph. ib. c. 52.
n. 4. & 8.
Vide Bellarm. To-
let. Lessius. Na-
nar. &c.
^h Azor. ib. c. 11.
Lac. Graph. ib. n.
8. & 18.
Durand. 4. d. 15.
q. 12. n. 6.
Paluda. 4. d. 15.
Antonio. 3. tit. 13.
c. 4. §. 8.
Angel. v. hora.
Tabien. v. hora.
Siluest. v. hora.
Ioh. Medina. de
erat. q. 15. and many
Law Casuists, Caietan. opusc. to. 3. tr. 4. Clericus obligatus ad horas, si prater intentionem euagatur, excusatur ab
intentione. Dum canitur Kyrie (in Missa) potest licite sacerdos, dicere horas canonicas. ⁱ Azor. ib. c. 9. Tolst. ib. l. 2. c. 13. Nana.
Siluest. &c. ^k Tolst. ib. l. 2. c. 13. Gerson. p. 2. Reg. moral. ^l Lac. Graph. decif. p. 1. l. 2. c. 53. n. 19.

of it or not^d. Neither is inward deuotion necessary to the substance of this seruice, but onely for greater perfection^e: nor yet any particular attendance to the words^f, or actuall attention to the matter in hand, or to the end in generall: but onely an attention virtuall, which is, that one going to Mattins or Euen-song, purpose to fulfill the Commandement of the Church^g; and admit that in rehearsing these Orisons one pronounce the words softly, that others can scarce heare, or in false orthographie, or wherrie them ouer as one troales an empty cart; and if the minde wander and be distracted, yea, if one whisper with another, and salute commers in, or subscribe his name; yet entertaining no wilfull cogitation repugnant to the generall end of seruing God^h: This eternall worke of babble and lip-labour, is diuine worship; and doth impetrate, satisfie and merit for themselues and others.

Also the Papiests concerning the time of canonick houres, turne night into day, and one houre into another: midnight Euen-song is said at sunne settingⁱ; the Mattins of the next day may be rehearsed ouer night^k. And if a Priest post ouer all the canonick houres by nine of the clocke in the forenoone, because he would goe to pastime, and sport himselfe the rest of the day, he committeth no mortall sinne^l.

Thus the superstition of Popish canonick houres agrees with the practise of Hierom and Paula, like the croaking of Froggs in a marriish with Dauids harp.

Article 13. The difference of little and great sinnes.

We acknowledge the same difference of greater and lesser sinnes which this Father did, and subscribe to his doctrine concerning the same, deliuered in his Epistle to Celantia^m, where he saith, *It was the error of the Stoickes to deny the difference of sinnes, and to equall a scape or small thing done amisse to a hainous crime. We beleene there is great diuersitie of sinnes, because we reade the same; and yet wee iudge, that it is very safe to beware of small sinnes as if they were great, &c. Neither doe I know whether we may call any sinne small, seeing it is committed with a certaine contempt of God. And he is most prudent who respecteth not so much the quantitie of the thing commanded, as the dignity of the commander.*

All the Protestants in substance of matter, acknowledge a difference of veniall and mortall sinne in persons regenerate, and many of them admit the termes and forme of speechⁿ. But in the sense and exposition of this distinction, we differ from the Papiests, 1. by denying that any sinnes are veniall by nature, or by the morall law^o, and that in persons iniust or not regenerate, though there be a difference of offences, yet there is not such a difference, as for any of their sinnes to be by nature veniall.

2. In persons regenerate diuers sinnes are veniall by indulgence, and such as God in his mercy (reuealed in the couenant of grace) imputeth not to iust persons, so farre as therefore to esteeme them worthy of his eternall wrath, and vnworthy of his grace, Prou. 20. 9. Iam. 3. 2. Rom. 7. 17. 23, 24.

Foule and grieuous sins in such persons are mortall, 1 Cor. 6. 9. 16. Ezech.

^m Hieron. ep. 14.
Cyprian. ep. 52.
n. 10. Alia est Philo-
sophorum &
Theosorum ratio,
quia dicunt om-
nia peccata paria
esse.
Aug. cont. men-
dac. ad Consent.
cap. 15.
Orig. in Ezech.
hom. 9.
Hieron. l. 2. con.
Iouinian.
Chrys. hom. de
gram. sanct. &
guberna maloru.
Ambros. com.
Rom. 4.
ⁿ The Lutherans,
Pec. Mart. com.
Rom. 6.
D. Field of the
Church, l. 3. c. 32.
*We deny not the di-
stinction of veniall
and mortall sinne.*
^o Chemnit. loc.
com. p. 2. de in-
stif. Sola doctrina
fidei monstrat discrimen pec. mortalis & venialis, &c. fons erroris apud scholasticos, quod sine respectu fidei ex sola lege discrimen inter
mortale & veniale pec. constituerunt. Aug. enchir. c. 79. de quotidianis, leuibus, breuib; peccatis, &c. De Symbolo ad Catechum.
l. 1. c. 6. to. 9. Non dico vobis, quia sine peccato hic viuistis, sed sunt venialia, sine quibus vita ista non est. De Temp. serm. 56. Sicut
sine maius pec. nullus vnquam aut fuit, aut esse poterit, ita sine capitalibus criminibus, deante & auxiliante Deo, omnimodis, esse pos-
simus & debemus.

18. 21. and continue so vntill they be forsaken, Ezech. 18. 21. and are obliterated by repentance.

But offences of ignorance, forgetfulness, inconsideration, and whereunto there is not an aduised consent; and such as in regard of their matter, are not repugnant to the maine offices prescribed by the commandements of God: and notwithstanding which, the heart principally adhereth vnto God, and which stop or quench not the gracefull operation of Faith, Hope and Charitie, towards their maine object: these are veniall by indulgence, and comparable with grace, as hath formerly beene said.

Gen. 9. 21. & 18.
12. 15. & 19. 3. &
27. 19. Exod. 4. 10.
14. & 32. 19.
2 Chron. 19. 2. &
35. 22. Iob 40. 5.
Math. 16. 22.

Article 14. *The vnlearned reading the Scriptures, hauing a learned man for their Master.*

The Protestants require the same humilitie and sobrietie in reading the holy Scriptures, which Saint Hierom and other of the Fathers did^a. And our people haue learned Pastors and other helps, to instruct them in the vse of this profitable and godly dutie^b. But the Papiests vnder pretext of sobrietie, starue the people, Amos 8. 11. and depriue them of reading the Scripture, vnlesse in such places where they cannot effect their purpose, as I haue formerly proued from their owne words.

^a Calu. com. in
Act. 8. v. 31.
^b Aug. de temp.
ser. 56. lb. ser. 55.
Si Scripturas diui-
nas aut ipsi non le-
gimus, aut legentes
alios non libenter
audimus, ipsa no-
bis medicamenta
conuertuntur in
vulnera, &c.

Article 15. *The learned confessing their doubting and ignorance, in the explanation of the Scripture.*

As a theefe when he would rob the house, putteth out the light; so our Adversaries endeouour to depriue the household of faith of the light of holy Scripture, Psal. 119. 104. And to this end they amplifie the difficultie thereof^c, and deny the same being translated into any vulgar language to be the rule of faith^d, and in stead thereof, they bring in Traditions, and old wiues fables^e. But we rather belecue the Lord himselfe, and the Primitiue Fathers teaching vs, that the holy Scriptures are a light, 2 Pet. 1. 19. giuing vnderstanding to the simple, Prou. 1. 4. and making the foolish wise to saluation, 2 Tim. 3. 15. And that euery thing concerning faith and good life, is found in plaine sentences of the Scripture^f. And such things are so manifest, that they rather require an hearer than an Expositor^g: and all necessarie things are manifest in the Scripture^h: And al though the profoundnesse of Gods word exerciseth our studie, yet it denieth vs not vnderstandingⁱ.

^c Bellar. de verb.
Dei. l. 3. c. 1. Greg.
Val. eos 3. d. 1. q. 1.
p. 7. Mulhusinus de
fide.
^d Stapl. Rel. c. 5.
q. 3. ar. 4. pag. 531.
^e Gerf. de sign.
Ruine ecclesie. fig. 8
Fabula & non sa-
nz doctrina sunt,
&c. quae non in re-
uelatione Spiritus
sancti, sed secun-
dum traditionem
hominum con-
sistunt.
^f Aug. de doct.
Christi l. 2. c. 9.
^g Aug. in Ioh. tr. 6.
^h Chrys. hom. 3.
in 2. Thess.
ⁱ Aug. de verb. A-
post. ser. 13.

And for the better inabling of the faithfull, to be conuersant in reading holy Scripture to their edification, God hath ordained a publike schoole and visible ministerie in his Church, Ephe. 4. 12. which when it performeth his dutie aright, is duly to bee heard, and people must receiue the sense of holy Scripture from the same, and not from any priuate spirit, Mal. 2. 7. 2 Cor. 5. 20. Hebr. 13. 17.

Article 16. *Bishops and Priests singing, and carrying Candles in the day time at the buriall of the dead.*

In the prime age of the Church, the Fathers taxed Gentiles for setting vp lights

k Tertul. apol. c. 35. & c. 36. Nec incensum diem infringimus, &c. lucernas meridie vana proferre.
 l Concil. Eliber. can. 34. 35.
 m Plin. hist. nat. l. 16. c. 37. Virgil. 11. Aeneid. in funere Pallantis. C. Tacit. hist. l. 3. in funere Germanici. Sueton. in Calig. c. 13.
 n Hieron. cont. Vigil. & Erasmus in schol. apparet hanc consuetudinem, eo seculo, magis toleratam fuisse quam cum probatam.
 o Greg. Nissen. vita Greg. Thaumaturg. Theod. Euang. ver. l. 8. de Martyr. Prosp. Aq. de premiff. 3. pro 38. Buseb. de prepar. Euang. l. 43. c. 7. Phil. Berold. in aur. Asin. l. 11.
 p Greg. m. Registr. l. 9. ep. 71. Duris mentibus omnia abscindere, impossibile esse non dubium est, &c. Theodorit. con. Græcos. c. 8. in fine. q Chem. exam. Trid. Concil. de reliq. Sanct. pa. 9. r Aug. ad Januar. ep. 119. c. 19. Gerson. part. 3. de vit. spir. lect. 2.

lights in the day time^k: and about the 300 year, a Synod prohibited Christians to burne Tapers in the Cemiterie in the day time^l. And Vigilantius, a Priest of Barcilo in Spaine, accuseth the vse thereof as an Heathenish custome.

Neither can it be denied, but the ceremony of vling Tapers and Lampes at burials, was practised by the Heathen^m. No: withstanding, some of the Fathers after the 300 year, that they might more easily draw the Gentiles to Christianitie, did tolerateⁿ and admit^o (with an alteration of the end and manner) this, and some other ceremonies of the Gentiles^p in Christian Religion: Wherein no doubt, their intention was godly, to wit, to vse their Christian libertie in matters adiaphorous, and not morally euill, according to the Apostles rule, Tit. 1. 16. Rom. 14. 14. and to amoue a present offence and occasion, which hindred Gentiles from receiuing the Christian faith, to wit, the difference of outward ceremonies and customes^q.

But in succeeding ages, when the Gentiles were conuerted, and the Church needed not further to accommodate it selfe to the weaknesse of the Heathen, and that things at first admitted by way of toleration, should rather haue now bene remoued and worne out: superstitious persons contrary to this, make daily addition and increase, borrowing more and more from the superstition of Iewes and Gentiles, vntill at length they ouerwhelmed Christianitie with an intolerable burden of ceremonies, making the easie yoke of Christs Gospel heavier than the state of Iewes and Gentiles^r: and by this meanes they obscured Gods truth, and onely made people ceremonious, whereas they should haue bene pious.

Article 17. Church Service sung and vsed in Hebrew, Greeke, Latine, and Syrian.

That Service should be vsed in the Syrian language, seemeth repugnant to the Popish Tene^r; which is, that there be onely three lioly languages, wherein God delighteth to heare the publike praiers and deuotions of his Church^a. But the Apostolicall rule and precept, was to pray with vnderstanding, and in a knowne language, 1 Cor. 14. And the Primitive Fathers say; *Let euery one in their owne natine speech pray to God, and extoll him with praise^b. And blessed is the people which vnderstandeth his melodie^c. And let vs vnderstand our singings, and not poure out praises without vnderstanding^d. And when you pray to God with Psalmes and Hymnes, let that bee cogitated in your hearts, which is pronounced with your voice^e. Tongues (saith Chrysostome) are vnprofitable, so long as they be not vnderstood^f. And Ambrose, What benefit can he reape who is ignorant of the thing he speaketh?* A certaine lay man liuing in the darknesse of Papistrice, propounded this question to a learned Priest, whether the praiers which he vnderstood not were profitable in the same measure, as those which were said by Priests: and he receiued answer; *That euen as a precious stone is of equall value in the hand of one who knoweth not the price thereof, as in a skilfull Lapidarie his hand; so Praiers are of equall vertue, being said with no vnderstanding, as with knowledge^h*. By which similitude it appeareth, that Papists esteeme praiers to be acceptable to God for the very externall worke, and that the Lord respecteth people for their vaine repetitions, and much babble, Matth. 6. 7.

And thus much for S. Hieron, about whom our Aduersarie made an excursion, thinking to aduantage his Popish cause: but setting aside his verball and windy declamations, vpon which some of his followers will perhaps hungerly feed, he hath gained nothing, but is repelled like the Eccho.

Et in aera succus

Corporis omnis abit, vox tantum atque ossa supersunt.

Paragr.

a Bellar. de verb. Dei, l. 2. c. 15.

b Origen. cont. Cels. l. 3.

c Aug. sup. Psal.

d Ibid.

e Aug. ep. 109.

f Chrys. hom. 35.

in 1 Cor.

g Ambros. com.

in 1 Cor. 14.

h Anton. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 9. §. 5. Stapl. promp. ar. Cath. part. 1. Dominic. Palmarum.

Paragr. 1. Cyril of Alexandria, concerning Lay peoples reading of holy Scripture.

T. W. Cyril affirmeth, that Christ and his Apostles propounded the heavenly preaching unto all, calling unto their doctrine men and women of the baser sort: but he mentioneth not the Scripture, or women meddling therewith. Our blacke White hath onely inuented it to proue himselfe a true Apostata.

Ans^w. By the name of heavenly preaching, Cyril vnderstandeth the doctrine of the Gospellⁱ, which being first preached by liuely voice, was afterwards by the will of Christ committed to writing^k. And this holy Father maintaineth the generall reading of this heavenly doctrine, contained in the Scripture by all sorts of people, saying:

ⁱ Cyril. AL. cont. Iulian. l. 6.
^k Iren. cont. hæ. ref. l. 3. c. 1.

The Scripture was therefore indited in a plaine and familiar stile, that it may be vnderstood of small and great, exceeding the capacitie of none^l. And speaking of Children, he saith; Boyes or young Lads trained up in holy Scriptures, are made most religious^m: And whosoever is conuersant in reading holy Scripture, is made better by it, and becomes profitable to othersⁿ. And in another place^o, Diuine reading, daily praier, and the word of doctrine, are the nutriment of the soule: And, nothing is difficult to them who are conuersant in the Scripture as they ought^p. The Scripture is able to make such as are trained up in it, wise, approued, and of sufficient vnderstanding^q. The beantie of veritie and the exact knowledge of truth, and all manner of good instruction, whereby one is made compleat, conspicuous and glorious in vertue and good workes, are contained in holy Scripture^r.

^l Cyril. cont. Iul. l. 7. pa. 160.

^m Ibid. pa. 162.

ⁿ Ibid.

^o L. 9. in Leuit.

^p L. 9. cons. Iulian.

^q L. 7. cont. Iulian. pag. 150.

^r Ibid. pag. 160.

And from these illustrious sentences of Cyril, with whom consent other Fathers, it appeareth, that the Protestants faith concerning generall reading of holy Scripture, and the perfection and perspicuitie thereof in matters necessarie to saluation, is the doctrine of the Catholike Primitiue Church, from which the Papists are departed: and so the reproach of Apostata vnworthily imputed to D. White, meritoriously seisseth vpon this P. P. and his Compeers, from whom no borith or Fullers sope can cleanse the foule staine of wilfull Apostacie, 2 Thess. 2. 3.



CHAP. III. Paragraph. 1.

Whether the Church may erre? A place of Vincentius Lirinensis examined.

T. W. P.

WE will take into our consideration his corrupt proceeding, concerning the supposed generall erring of the whole Church: not remembering that in regard of Christs sollicitude, care, and affection to his Spouse, it is said, Cant. 1. My beloued is a cluster of Cyprus vnto me in the vineyards of Engaddi, &c.

E

Ans^w. I.

Ans. 1. Vnderstanding the name of the Catholike Church properly, Hebr. 12. 23. Gal. 4. 26. 1 Cor. 12. 12. Ephe. 1. 22. and according to the Article of the Creed, as it is expounded by Saint Augustine, and other of the Fathers; Dr. White neuer supposed any generall erring of the whole Church, Ioh. 14. 16. and 16. 13.

2. The whole multitude of beleeuers of any one particular age of the Church, since the Apostles, neuer erred generally in the maine object of faith, or primitive Articles of Religion^b, Matth. 16. 18. and 28. 20. Ephe. 4. 11. Esa. 59. 21.

3. The Church representatiue^c lawfully assembled in a generall Councell, or a particular nationall Church cannot fall into pernicious error about any weightie matter of faith, so long as making the sacred tables of Gods written word, their guide and rule of faith, they piously obserue the lawfall and needfull meanes of searching out the truth, Matth. 18. 20. 1 Tim. 3. 15. Ioh. 7. 17.

But our Aduersaries take the Church Catholike in a notion of their owne coyning; to wit, for the Pope and Prelats of the Romane Church^d: and also they extend the possibilitie of not erring to all matters of Religion whatsoeuer, primarie or inferior^e; affirming that their present Pope and Church haue infallibilitie of right iudgement, free from error in all their publike doctrine and sentences, concerning faith and good manners.

And thus the state of the question betwene the Papists and vs, is not, whether the Catholike Church may erre; but first, whether the Pope or Romane Prelats usurping^f over the visible Church, may erre? Secondly, whether the ordinarie Pastors of the Christian Church, in the ages succeeding the Apostles, may at any time generally erre in their publike doctrine, about matters belonging to the secundarie object of faith.

We maintaine the affirmatiue in both these questions, grounding our selues vpon the arguments following.

1. The Iewish Church was called and planted by God himselfe, and was his Spouse, Hof. 2. 19. his household and flocke, Psal. 95. 7. and endowed with great priuileges, Rom. 9. 4. Isa. 59. 21. yet the high Priests and other Pastors of the Church grievously erred, 2 King. 16. 11. 2 Chron. 36. 14, 16. Esa. 56. 10. Ier. 5. 1. Matth. 26. 59.

2. There be diuers predictions in the New Testament, concerning the Apostasie and falling away of Pastors of the Church from the truth, 2 Thess. 2. 3. 1 Tim. 4. 1.

3. The Romane Church is forewarned in particular, to beware of Apostasie and Infidelitie, which admonition proueth the possibilitie of her fall and error, Rom. 11. 20.

4. Sundrie Churches planted by the Apostles, and being at the first glorious lights, did afterwards degenerate and turne into darknesse; to wit, the Church of Antioch, planted and watered by the Apostle Peter; Ephesus by S. Iohn, Corinth by S. Paul, &c.

5. Experience hath made it manifest, that the Romane Church and Popes may erre; to wit, the example of the Councell of Constance, which decreed expressly against the holy Scripture in the matter of the Eucharist, to be administered to the people in one kinde^g: And the example of Liberius^h, Honorius, Anastasiusⁱ, &c. which apparantly professed hereticall doctrine. Also some learned Papists confesse, that errors and abuses haue crept into the Church of Rome^j.

^a Aug. enchirid. c. 56. & c. 61. & sup. Psal. 56. & sup. Psal. 90. Prosp. ad Psal. 106. Ecclesia Catholica in ecclesiis suis, præcognitis a Deo, filijs promissionis, membris corporis Christi, &c. Ad Psal. 126. De tota Ecclesia intelligendū est, quæ est Hierusalem in omniū compage Sanctorum, &c.

^b Aqu. 2. 2. q. 2. ar. 5. Fidei obiectum per se, &c. per accidens & secundario, &c. Aug. contra Iulian. l. 1. c. 2. & enclir. c. 20. Altercat. synag. & eccles. ca. 3. Vinea sanctæ ecclesiæ, &c. nunquam tantis spinis inharuit, quin etiam flores, licet raros haberet, &c.

^c Bellar. de Eccles. l. 3. c. 14. Ad Episcopos qui sunt Ecclesia representatiue, &c. Eckius enchirid. loc. de ecclesia. Prælati ecclesiæ dicuntur Ecclesia, quia representant eam, &c.

^d Catech. Trid. sup. artic. Credo Ecclesiam Cath. Bellar. de eccles. l. 3. c. 2. Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. punct. 7. §. 22.

^e Bellar. de ecclesia, l. 3. c. 14. Iannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. Suar. def. fid. Cath. con. sect. Angl. l. 1. c. 4. Dicendum non posse ecclesiam incidere in hæresim, verum etiam nec posse errare, siue per ignorantiam, siue quocunque alio modo, in aliquo dogmate, in quo tanquam in veritate a Deo reuelata, vniuersa ecclesia, conspirat, docet, & proponit.

^f Cassand. de offic. boni viri. Nam & in euangelio seruus infidelis, super familiam Dei constitutus legitur: & Christus de Hierosolymitanis queritur, Luc. 13. quod occiderint prophetas, & lapidauerint eos, qui ad se missi fuerant. † Stapl. Antid. apoc. l. Rom. 11. ver. 22. Bellar. de iustif. l. 3. c. 22. f. Sess. 19. Concil. Constant. Licet Christus, post Cœnam instituit, & suis discipulis administrauerit, sub vtraque specie, &c. tamen hoc non obstat, &c. § Athana. ep. ad Sol. vit. agentes. Hieron. catal. in Fortunat. Platin. in Liberio. Concil. Basil. rep. Synod. to. 4. Surij, pag. 145. Fuerunt habitus vt ethnici & publicani, vt legitur de Anastasio & Liberio. Somom. hist. l. 4. c. 14. Alph. Casto cont. hæret. l. 1. c. 4. Antonin. sum. hist. per. 2. tit. 9. c. 2. † Can. loc. theol. l. 6. c. 8. Honorius. Non est negandum, quin summus Pontifex hæreticus esse possit. † Cassand. conf. art. 26. pag. 304.

6. By reason the illumination of all Gods children (except the first builders of the faith, Ephe. 2. 20.) is in this life inchoate and imperfect, 1 Cor. 13. 9, 12. Hebr. 5. 2. Rom. 7. Gal. 5. Act. 14. 15, &c. And many things in Religion and the holy Scriptures are difficult^k, 2 Pet. 3. 16. It is possible for the Church since the Apostles, being not guided by Reuelation, but onely finding out the truth by ordinary meanes, to erre or be deceiued in matters of faith, not primary and fundamentall.

^k Hieron. to. 3. ep. ad Aug. In Scripturarum expositione, quæ vel ob scurissimæ sunt.

7. In some ages the guides and Pastors of the Church are more negligent and vnskilfull^{*}: and by reason of externall calamities, arising from heresie, schisme, and persecution of Tyrants, which in those ages disturbe and oppresse the Christian state; the helps of knowledge and learning, and meanes of searching out the truth, may then be smaller and lesse sufficient. And as the Sunne, although at no time it lose the whole light, yet at certaine seasons it shineth lesse gloriously: so the fulnesse of truth is not alwaies equally found in the Church, but some obscuritie of error may take place in it.

^{*} Sabellic. Ænead. 9. l. 1. in Ioh. 9. Mirum est quanta bonarum artium obliuio, per id tempus, mortaliū animis obrepserit, vt ne in Pontificibus quidem ceterisque Principibus quicquam elucesceret quod vitam iuuare posset, &c.

8. The Arguments vsed by our Aduersaries, to proue the freedome of the Romane Church from error, euist not.

Obiect. 1. The Church is the ground and pillar of truth, 1 Tim. 3. 15. But the ground and pillar of truth cannot erre^{*}.

Ans. 1. If the Apostles words bee vnderstood of the Church particular; Ephesine, Romane, Corinthian, &c. then they proue no more, but that the Church by office is appointed by God to be the ground and pillar of truth: and so long as it adhereth to sacred Scripture and the meanes of truth, and performeth the office imposed, it actually teacheth sauing truth. But otherwise, as it followeth not; A ludge in the Common-wealth is a pillar of iustice, *ergo*, he cannot be iniust: so it is not a good illation, The Church is the pillar of truth, *ergo*, it cannot erre.

^{*} Bellar. de ecclef. l. 3. c. 14. Apostolus vocans Ecclesiam, Columnam veritatis, vult significare veritatem fidei, quoad nos, niti ecclesie auctoritate, & verum esse quicquid ecclesia probat, falsum quicquid illa improbat.

2. But if the Apostles words be referred to the Vniuersall Catholike Church, containing the Apostles and sacred Writers; then the Church in regard of those Columnes, is an absolute ground and pillar of all reuealed truth; but those great Columnes, Gal. 2. 9. being taken away, the future Church is a ground and pillar of truth, respectiue onely, and so farre as it propoundeth their doctrine.

3. If we vnderstand this saying of Saint Paul, concerning the Church generall in any one age since the Apostles, then the same is respectiue the ground and pillar of truth, to wit, of sauing truth; and the pillar of truth according to the imperfection of this life, which admitteth error in secundarie articles, or about the object of faith by accident; *Et ratione firmissimum suorum*¹, the ground and pillar of truth, in respect of the firme members thereof, and such of the faithfull as adhere to the firmament of the Scriptures.

¹ Aug. ep. 48. Aug. sup. Psal. 93. Sicut stellas in celo non extinguit nox: sic mentes fidelium, in herentes firmamento Scripture Dei, non vincit iniquitas, &c. Basil. in ep. 67. Cecidit vir columna & firmamentum ecclesie.

4. The Romane Church by vertue of this Scripture, can haue no greater immunitie from error than other particular Churches.

Obiect. 2. Ioh. 14. 16. and Ioh. 16. 13. Our Sauour promisseth to abide with his Church for euer, and to leade the same into all truth.

Ans. 1. Our Sauour principally, and according to the perfect fulfilling of this promise, speaketh of the Apostles, and first diuine Witnesses, for they alone were by inspiration lead into all truth.

2. But secondarily, and by a proportionall accommodation, this promise belongeth to the elect, and firme members of the Church of euery age^m, Iohn 17. 20. Matth. 28. 20. and is fulfilled in them according to such a measure of truth and manner of leading them thereunto, as is necessarie to saluation; and not according to the highest measure or amplitude of the grace of truth: for then they should neither erre, nor yet bee ignorant, either singly or ioyntly, of any truth reuealed whatsoeuer; the contrary whereunto our Aduersaries acknowledge.

^m Æneas Sylu. de gest. concil. Basil. Semper in ecclesia sunt viri aliqui boni, qui licet humanæ fragilitati subditi sunt, virtutis tamen perfecti, perfectio funguntur munere, &c.

3. This promise in respect of particular Churches, to wit, the Ephesine, Romane, &c. is conditionall, Rom. 11. 21. Ioh. 14. 23. and 15. 7. 1 Ioh. 2. 22. 24. and 3. 24. And the wickednesse of men may hinder the fulfilling thereof towards them, Ier. 18. 9, 10. Rom. 9. 6. euen as the wickednesse of the Israelites, and of Iudas, depriued them of the benefit of the promises made, Exod. 3. 17. Luke 22. 30.

T. W. *The Church cannot erre in regard of Christs sollicitude, care, and affection, Cant. 1. 14.*

Ans. 1. Christs sollicitude and care ouer the Church, being according to the necessitie thereof in this life, and his owne free disposition, deliuereth not the same from all error; as appeareth by the Primitiue Fathers, whom our Aduersaries confesse^m to erre in many things, notwithstanding the care which Christ had of them.

The care and sollicitude of Christ, deliuers his true Church and firme members thereof, from all damnable error, but not from all error; and it frees them so farre, as is needfull to their saluation, but not simply.

2. Although Christ preserue his true Church, yet the Pope may goe to hellⁿ; and the promises of Christ concerning the preservation of the Church, are not entailed vpon Popes, but vpon that Church which heareth his voice, and seeketh to doe his will, Iohn 7. 17.

T. W. *That the vniuersall Church may erre, M. White laboureth to proue from the testimonie of Vincentius Lyrinensis^o, saying; Not onely some portion of the Church, but the whole Church it selfe is blotted with some new contagion.*

Here our Doctor abuseth his Reader two waies; one in concealing the word conetur: Vincentius saith, What if heresie endeouour to commaculate any part of the Church? And secondly, in leauing out quid si, what if; and so deliuering the Fathers words in an absolute and categoricall enuntiation, which are spoken onely of a supposall and hypothetically; like as if a man did say; Diners folke of Suffolke report, that Master White is extremely giuen to his belly, and to Epicurisme, vpon this supposall if Master White be extremely giuen, &c.

Ans. That which is deliuered by Vincentius hypothetically in the fourth Chapter, is presently after in the sixth Chapter affirmed categorically P: *The poison of the Arrians had now defiled, not a portion, but in a manner the whole world: so farre, as that well-nigh all the Latine Bishops being decciued, partly by violence, and partly by fraud, had a certaine blindness cast before their eyes.* And it is to be noted, that the Romane Pope Liberius, was included in the number of these Latine Bishops¹; and so there was not onely an endeouour to corrupt the Church, but an actual corruption thereof in the principall Pastors, of which the Roman Pontifex was one.

T. W. *If a man doe say, What if diners folke of Suffolke report, that M. White is extremely giuen to his belly and to Epicurisme? &c.*

Ans. Although (as Plinie speaketh) there be no lie so shamelesse but may haue an author; yet I am perswaded that this Architect, Act. 13. 10. hath forged this calumny out of his owne spirit, and that he may say with the Spider, *Ego nulli debeo*, I am beholding to no bodie for it: and resolute it into *teste meipso*, like vnto him, Ioh. 8. 44. *Who when he speaketh a lie, he speaketh it of his owne.* Or perhaps this P.P. mistakes himselfe, thinking Doctor White, by reason he dwelt

neere

^a Barnes in 1. p. Th. q. 1. ar. 8. Can. loc. 17. c. 3. Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. §. 45. Scap. Rel. c. 6. q. 4. pa. 628. Nich. Carbo introd. 1. 4. c. 19. Villaninc. de rat. stud. theol. 1. 4. c. 6. obf. 1. ^b Grae. d. 40. c. 5. Papa.

^c Vincen. Lyrin. com. proph. nouit. c. 4. ^d Quando Arrianorum venenum, non iam portunculam quandam, sed pene totum orbem contaminauerat: adeo ut prope cunctis Latini sermonis Episcopis, partim vi, partim fraude corruptis, caligo quaedam mentibus offunderetur. Hieron. sup. Psal. 133. ante 20. annos omnes ecclesias has haereticis possidebant. ^e Platin. in Librio. Imperatoris beneficio mortuus cum haereticis, in rebus omnibus (ut quidam volunt) seutens. Pontifex tamen cum Arrianis seuebat. Martin. Polon. chron. an. 353. Imperator, conuocato concilio cum haereticis. Arrianis, &c. Felican de papatu, quia erat Catholicus eiecit: & Liberium reuocauit, quia sibi & Arrianis conferat. Marian. Scotus, anno 355. chron. 1. 2. stat. 6. Anast. Biblioth. in Librio. Luithprand. in Librio. Bergon. supplem. chron. anno 352.

neere the place, to haue bene allied to a certaine Romish Priest, to wit, the Prior of Thetford; of whom Matthew Paris in his Chronicle reporteth as followeth: *The Prior of Thetford entertained his brother Bernard, a Souldier, and Guiscard a gun-bellied Priest into his Priorie, and with them twaine night and day he continued eating and drinking: And when the Souldier was laid up or departed, Guiscard, whose belly was like a great tankard, and his carcase a waine load, abode still with him, and swallowed up all the victuals of the Monkes into the gulfe and charybdis of his maw. Hereupon there growing a quarrell betweene the Prior and his Monkes, and they falling to words, a certaine Monke in his furie drew forth his knife, and sheathed the same in the Priors belly, slaying him in the very Church.*

Surely this Prior who suffered martyrdom for his belly, is the Gull and Epicure which the Suffolke people spake of to this P. P. and he receiuing the report with his haruest eares, hath applied the Storie to another man. Reade also in the margent the Storie related by Æneas Syluius of the Germane Priest, who vsed daily to be drunke in the morning, and going to sleepe, when he awaked at Sun-setting, imagined that it was Sun-rising.

But good Sir you are in a wrong box, when you seeke for gluttonie in a frugall and painfull Student, whose meat and drinke was to swallow bookes: you should rather haue gone to the carnall Masse-mongers entiled by Gerson, Presbyteri epulones, but especially to the good fellows your Archdeacon Clemangis describeth, saying; *That Priests liue according to the Epicures law, and not after Christs: they spend their whole time in Taverns and Taphouses, bowling, gulling, dining, feasting, and gaming, and being surfetted and drunke, they fight and shout, and make vprores with impure lips, blaspheming God and the Saints: and at length are brought to rest in the armes of their Harlots, from whence they returne backe to the diuine Altar.*

¹ At Burnham, within 110 miles of Thetford.
² Math. Paris. in Henric. 3. p. 727.
³ Guiscardum clericum monstruosum.
⁴ Cuius cadaver plastrum oneraret.
⁵ In charybdem vter, omnia monachorum victualia immergit.
⁶ Æneas Sylv. 1.2. de dict. & fact. Alphon. 26. Presbyteri autem Montis calui, qui Viennæ imminet, cum ad meridiem visquebibisset, docuere visque ad occasum Solis consueffe: exporree vero ad ecclesiam ire, ornare altaria, sacerdotalia vestimenta sumere, campanaque plebe citare, ut qui Missam celebrare institisset. Interrogatus cur tam sero rem diuinam ageret, verum ad occidentem, quem putabat orientem esse, respondisse fertur. Imo vero

subdubito, an tam mane celebrare liceat, ante exortum solem, &c. 7 Gers. de temper. in cib. & pot. Quanta mala eueniunt ex commensationibus ecclesiasticorum crebris & superfluis, quis enaret? Torre Jacobi, Vinum Theologorum. 2 To. 4. ser. 2. Ad. 2. Nich. Clemang. de cor. stat. eccles. 1. Crapulati & inebriati, pugnant, clamant, tumultuantur, &c. Conrad. Cling. loc. com. 1. 3. c. 52. Vbi iam plus abundat aquales haustus, nisi in domibus Episcoporum & Sacerdotum? Vnde Bfa. 5. *Ve qui consurgitis mane, ad ebrietatem seplaudunt.* Sicque tandem compositi, ex meretricum suarum complexibus, ad diuinum altare veniunt. Synod. Treuir. to. 4. Concil. sur. p. 824. Student rebus a literis & religione alienis, venationibus, aucupis, alex, vanis, denique & Veneri, ut nihil aliud dicam. Papir. Masson. de epis. Vrb. Ls. in Paulo 3. Quas non nisi furim antea voluptates sequebatur, Pontifex designatus, effi fere 65. ætatis annum impleuerat, vltro complexus est: abdicataque maxima rerum cura, hilaritati & genio, conuiuioque & amplis & assiduis, etiam in villa agendis, omni deinceps vita indulgit. Hæc narramus quod sic gesta sunt.

Paragr. 2. *A place of the Rhemists, annot. 2 Thess. 2. about the inuisibilitie of the Church.*

T. W. Master White maintaining a mathematicall, acie, and inuisible Church, strengthmeth his cause with the supposed confession of the Rhemists: *but if their whole speech be set downe, they maintaine that the Church shall be at no time latent and inuisible, no not in the greatest persecutions and times of Antichrist.*

* Rhem. 2. Thess. 2. an. 6.

Ans. Master White maintaineth not that the Church shall at any time be wholly inuisible, neither produceth he the Rhemists to auouch this, but to proue by their confession, that the externall gouernment of the Church may come to decay (for a time) and the outward exercise of Religion be suspended: *and the Church become in part, or respectiue inuisible.*

Engelbert Abb. 1. de oritu & fin. Rō. imp. c. 21. Cum corpus ecclesie factum fuerit: accephalsi, & per consequens membra singula, sine motu & sensu, quantum ad vnitatem & firmitatem fidei, tunc locum & effectum habebit aduenus Antichristi.

And this they affirme, saying; *for the few daies of Antichrists reigne, the externall state of the Romane Church, and publike entercourse of the faithfull with the same, may cease; and the honour, obedience, and communion of Christians therewith, be in heart and secret.*

And the Reader is to obserue, that whereas my Brother deliuereth three positions, concerning the manner of the Churches inuisibilitie maintained by him; and produceth the Rhemists, only to proue one of the three, to wit, the second; the Popish Priest abuseth him, as if he alleaged them for the whole.

Paragr. 3. *Whether S. Augustine be corrupted, touching the Churches inuisibilitie.*

Aug. de bapt. l. 6.
c. 4.

T. W. M. White alleageth Augustine (The Church may be so obscured, that the members thereof shall not know one another) to *proove the inuisibilitie of the Church: whereas this Father doth not at all speake thereof in that place.*

Ans. D. White hauing alleaged diuers plaine testimonies of this Father, to proue that the Church may be vnknowne to the world: this Popish Priestt omitteth all the pregnant places, and fastneth vpon one which is obscurer than the rest: and yet, euen this place, duely considered, proueth that for which it was produced.

b Secundum intima-
mam & superemi-
nentem Spiritus
Sancti gratiam.

c C. 3. quos non
pertinere ad sanctā
ecclesiam Dei,
quamuis in eis esse
videantur.

d Greg. M. mor. in
Iob. l. 1. c. 6. In-
tra mensuras ec-
clesiæ sunt omnes
electi, extra has
mensuras omnes
reprobi, etiam si
intra fidei limites
esse videantur.
Bernard. Cantic.
serm. 68.

e Aug. ep. 48. Ali-
quando obscura
& obnubilatur
multitudine scan-
dalorum: operitur
fustibus.

f Ep. 80. Sed ob-
scurabitur & luna non dabit lucem, &c. Ecclesia non apparebit impiis persecutoribus ultra modum senientibus.

g D. Fulk against
Rhem. Coloss. 1. §. 1. The meetings of Christians were as obscure in summe of persecution before Constantine, as they have bene since the tyrannie
of Antichrist vsurped the Church.

Saint Augustine in the place alleaged^b, speaketh of the societie of good Christians, which are such indeed, according to the inward and most eminent grace of the holy Spirit: and he placeth the Church, truly and properly called, in them; and faith, of wicked persons, that although they seeme to be in the Church, yet they appertaine not to the holy Church^c: And then after other speeches, he addeth; that Saints which are conioyned in charitie, may one of them not know another bodily. Now from hence I infer two assertions:

1. That wicked persons are not any part of the Catholike Church properly taken^d.

2. That seeing godly people which are true members of the Catholike Church, may be vnknowne to their fellowes, who are vnited to them in charitie, euen when they conuerse with them: therefore much more in the time of heresie and persecution, may they lie like wheat vnder chaffe, vnknowne to the world, who haue not the eyes of faith to discern them.

But this Father, in other places^e treating of the Militant Church, as it consisteth of good and bad, affirmeth; that it may be covered, obscured, obnubilated, and overlaid with slonds and clouds, and not appeare because of the rage of persecutors: which is as much as the Protestants maintaine^f touching the inuisibilitie of the Church.

An Obseruation, Concerning the visibilitie and inuisibilitie of the Church,

h Preface. You
are forced to forge
a mathematicall
Church, consist-
ing of certain
imaginarie inuisi-
bilities. Part 1. c. 3.
paragr. 3. & 3.
Part 2. Verses 18.
The Protestants
imaginarie Church
consisting of a
suppositi. Part 3.
paragr. 3.
i Aug. in Psal. 80.

Our Aduersarie in sundry passages of this Treatise^g, hatefully depraueth our doctrine, concerning the visibilitie and inuisibilitie of the Church; but in the setting downe thereof he obiecteth his owne fancie, and not our Tenet.

To whom I answer: First, that which Saint Augustine^h did to some of like qualitie, *Quid impedis officinam decepti cordis fabricare phantasma, quale volueris? What can hinder the forge of a deceived heart, from fashioning so it selfe such a fancie as it lusteth?*

Secondly, the summe of our doctrine touching the inuisibilitie of the Church, is contained in these three positions, whereunto our learned Aduersaries for the greater part assent.

First, taking the Catholike Church according to the full latitude; to wit, as it containeth the whole societie of Saints, both triumphant in heauen, and mili-
tant

tant in earthⁱ: we affirme the same to be inuisible, for neither is Christ Iesus the head thereof visible to vs, Act. 1. 9. nor yet the principall and fundamentall members thereof, the Prophets and Apostles: and the forme and constitution of the whole Church, and the connexion of the Militant part thereof with the triumphant, and the bonds thereof, are spirituall and inuisible.

Secondly, that portion of the Catholike Church of Christ vpon earth^k, which is effectually called and vnited to Christ, and to the Church triumphant, in vertue, as well as in profession, and in which the Spirit of Christ is operative by influence of grace and saluation, Ephes. 5. 23. considered as it is such, is inuisible; because the election of God, the operation of the holy Spirit, and faith, which constitute the same, are spirituall^l, 2 Tim. 2. 19. Ioh. 1. 47.

Thirdly, in the time of some persecutions raised by Tyrants and Heretikes, the true Church is disgraced, and reputed of the wicked (whose number may be great) to be a malignant companie, and none can know it to be the true Church, but such as haue faith, (which may be very rare, Enk. 18.8.) Also the Church by violence of persecution may be enforced to flie and hide it selfe, Apoc. 12. and exercise Religion in secret.

Touching the visibilitie of the Church, we beleue as followeth^m: First, *The Militant Church of any one age since Christ, taken generally as it containeth all Christians, Matth. 13. 47. is visible*, and such as by sense and common reason is knowne and distinguished from Iewes and Heathens. Thus Plinieⁿ an Infidell, in his Epistle to Traian, was able to describe the Christians, and to distinguish them by their seruing of Iesus with certaine religious rites, &c.

2. It is the precept of Christ, and there ought to be alwaies in the world a godly visible Church, professing entirely true faith and religion, according as the same was once deliuered to the Saints. Matth. 5. 6. Rom. 10. 6. 1 Tim. 6. 13, 14. and in many ages of the world there is such a Church performing the same in all capitall points of faith.

Thirdly, in the generall Militant Church, there are alwaies found the substance and essentiall parts of Christian faith and true religion, and there be euermore some Pastors and people more or lesse^o, who outwardly teach the primitive and necessarie Articles of Faith and Religion. And for the more part, there be also some within the compasse of the generall Church, which condemne and reprove the grosse errors that false Prophets and Hypocrites bring in. And all these are in some manner visible: the former by an ordinarie standing in some part of the Church: the latter are many times disgraced, persecuted, and expelled out of that societie, which outwardly carrieth the reputation of true religion: but yet they are in some sort visible, either to their friends or to their enemies. And where they may be suffered, they teach the truth openly; but when they are persecuted, or lie in prison, they professe and manifest their religion at their martyrdome, iudgement, or otherwise as they can, &c.

The difference betweene the Papists and vs in this present question is, 1. concerning the being and existing of the Church, (for the visibilitie dependeth vpon the existing.) 2. concerning the manner of the visibilitie.

1. Touching the being of the Church: they contend that there is in all ages a true Church, whose chiefe Pastors (in respect of outward authoritie) openly teach true faith, without the mixture of any error.

We say, that there be alwaies in the Church generall some Pastors and people, which beleue and professe sauing truth, in the capitall and fundamentall Articles of Religion; but there be not at all times in the same such as teach the truth, without errors in all points. And the same Pastors who teach truth of Religion in substance, may in sundry other points be infected with error, as appeareth by the example of Origen, Tertullian, Cyprian; &c. Also the best Pastors may be reprov'd, disgraced, and persecuted^q; and yet they cease not to be

ⁱ Aug. enshir. c. 36. Quæ tota hic accipienda est, nō solum ex parte, quæ peregrinatur in terris &c. verum ex illa quæ in celis. Aug. in Plal. 56. Nec eadem, quæ nunc est in hominibus, qui presentem agunt vitam, sed eam pertinentibus, qui fuerunt ante nos, Aug. de civ. Dei. 1. 20. c. 9. Aug. in Plal. 90. Corpus huius capitis ecclesiæ est, quæ non hoc loco, &c. nec quæ hoc tempore, sed ab ipso Abel, totus populus sanctorum, &c.

^k Aug. contra Crescon. c. 21. Gloss. ord. 2. Tim. 2. v. 19.

^l Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. Vnio cum Christo & eius ecclesiæ, fit per cognitionem supernaturalium & amoris.

^m Luc. desip. 361. the generall and outward Church of God is visible.

Herbrand. disp. theol. d. 42. n. 34. Aneas Sylu. de gest. Basil. Concil. pa. 9. Cum in ecclesiâ contineantur omnes, qui Christiano continentur nomine, &c.

ⁿ Euseb. l. 3. c. 30. hist. Tert. apol. c. 2. Alterc. Synag. & eccles. cap. 3. Enicuit in hac ætate, quasi scintilla quadam lucis, in sanctis viris paucissimis: quia vinea sanctæ ecclesiæ, &c. ab agricola summo plantata, nunquam tantis spinis innotuit, quin etiam flores celsos raros haberet, &c.

^o Cat. I. test. ver. Act. and Monuments, from Saw 3. to Edward 6.

Centu. Magdeb. Welp. memor. Mon. myst. in q. 9 Athan. trip. hist. l. 4. Chryso. trip. hist. l. 10. c. 13. Euseb. Antiochenus trip. hist. l. 2. c. 24. Bellar. de cult. sanct. l. 3. c. 6.

Templa sepe ab hereticis occupantur, cum Catholici in cryptis & desertis versantur.

^q Cat. I. test. ver. Act. and Monuments, from Edward 6. to Edward 6.

Centu. Magdeb. Welp. memor. Mon. myst. in q. 9 Athan. trip. hist. l. 4. Chryso. trip. hist. l. 10. c. 13. Euseb. Antiochenus trip. hist. l. 2. c. 24. Bellar. de cult. sanct. l. 3. c. 6.

Templa sepe ab hereticis occupantur, cum Catholici in cryptis & desertis versantur.

^r Cat. I. test. ver. Act. and Monuments, from Edward 6. to Edward 6.

Centu. Magdeb. Welp. memor. Mon. myst. in q. 9 Athan. trip. hist. l. 4. Chryso. trip. hist. l. 10. c. 13. Euseb. Antiochenus trip. hist. l. 2. c. 24. Bellar. de cult. sanct. l. 3. c. 6.

Templa sepe ab hereticis occupantur, cum Catholici in cryptis & desertis versantur.

be publike Pastors, and visible by such a manner of visibilitie, as is sufficient for the gathering and preserving the elect.

2. Concerning the perpetuall visibilitie of the Church, we affirme, that the meanes of visibilitie of the true Church, are actions and exercises of Religion, and outward worship of Christ, according to the rule of his word: and whensoever there be any Pastors in the world, which either in an open view of the world in generall, or in the presence of any part thereof, doe exercise these actions: This is sufficient to make the Church visible.

But the Papists place the visibilitie of the Church in a visible Monarch and head the Pope, and in the publike profession of Religion, in a subordination to his regiment. And they make the visibilitie of the Church, a royall, pompous, and glorious visibilitie, such as is the visibilitie of earthly Monarchies and Kingdomes: and they teach, that hereby the Church may be sensibly knowne and differenced, even by naturall men, from other societies.

And thus the state of the question in the Controversie of the Churches visibilitie betweene vs, is, Not whether there be alwaies a visible Christian Church, wherein some Pastors teach saving truth in the capitall Articles of Religion, and by their actions of professing, and teaching the same, are visible to as many as use the meanes, and have a desire to know the truth taught by them; for this we acknowledge: but, whether the true Church of Christ on earth, in whose communion all people must live that come to salvation, be an outward visible Monarchie, consisting of the Romane Pope, and Bishops, and Pastors, and people subiect to them: exercising the worship of Christ by glorious ceremonies, and externall actions of Religion, and such a state as a naturall man by common reason and sense may know, and thereunto adioyne himselfe, being assured that it is the house of the living God, and the ground and pillar of truth.

Section 2. Wherein is examined an Argument used against vs by the Papists, about the perpetuall being and visibilitie of the Church.

^a Philo. Carpath. in Cantic. Luna comparatur ecclesia.

^b D. Carelton. cōsens. de Scrip. ca. 1. p. 13. Vera doctrina, in fundamentalibus, ab ecclesia exordio ad M. Lutheri tempora, integra semper in medijs tenebris lucebat. Vide Zauch. in confess. art. 19. p. 157. Non ab ecclesia Rom. simpliciter, & in omnibus defecimus, sed in illis duntaxat rebus, in quibus ipsa defecit ab Apostolica, atque adeo a seipsa, veteri & pura ecclesia. Neque alio decessimus animo, quam ut si correcti, ad priorem ecclesie formam redeat, nos quoque ad illam revertamur, & communionem in suis catibus cum illa habeamus. * Cassand. de offic. bon. viri. Non inferior Rom. ecclesiam a pristino suo decore & splendore, non parum diversam, multisque morbis & vitiis deformatam, &c. Per multi iique illustres, in ea societate sunt, immo regnum & gubernationem obtinent, qui ad Christi ecclesiam minime pertinent, atque adeo Christi eiusque doctrinæ hostes sunt, & tanquam alieni in ea tyrannidem exercent.

Our Aduersaries object this or the like Argument against vs.

The true Church of Christ continueth alwaies, and being a light of the world standing vpon a Candlestick, it continueth alwaies visible: but the Protestants Church began lately in Germanie and other parts; therefore the same is not the true Church.

Ans^r. First, I declare the Maior. As the Moone^a abideth alwaies, but hath degrees of light: so the Church abideth alwaies in one or other degree and measure of truth, but it abideth not alwaies in the same fulnesse of truth.

Secondly, I answer the Assumption; that the Church began in Germanie no otherwise, than health begins to be in the body, which was oppressed with sickness, and is made whole. In respect of doctrine essentiall to saluation, the Church in the firmest members was the same before Luther^b, and it began to be in Germanie onely according to a greater measure of truth, and according to a freedome from corruptions, which formerly oppressed it: It is the same with all good Christians which liued in the world before it, and succeedeth the sound and firme members of the generall visible Church, in whom was the life of true Religion in the substantiall matters of faith and godlinesse. But hauing shaken off their errors^c, it differs from them in manner and qualitie, as a man who was deceived in sundry things, when he becomes wiser, differs from himselfe as he was ignorant. And as a sicke body when it is healed, and a

Common-

Common-wealth-after it hath reformed disorders, are in substance the same, but differ in qualitie and goodnesse: so the Protestant Churches haue purged sundry corruptions^d, and perfected that which was defectiue, but are the same in kinde with all the good Christians which liued before them; and succeed them of the generall visible Church, in whom was the life of faith and religion.

^d Cassand. de offic. bon. viri. Non distitor postremis huius temporibus, vna cum ignorantia, auaritia, & am-

bitione, superstitiosos nonnullos cultus, & ritus in ecclesiam inrepsisse. Quis membro vitio vertat, si reliquo corpore laborante, & sui curam negligente, ipsum sui curam suscipiat?

Paragr. 4. Concerning a testimonie of Doctor Stapleton, out of his doctrinall principles, about the marks of the Church.

T. W. To proue that we absolutely embrace the marks of the Church deliuered by the Protestants, &c. he produceth D. Stapleton, * writing: The preaching of the Gospell is the proper and very cleare note of the Catholique Church, so it be done by lawfull Ministers. But it is euident by a latter part of that sentence, purposely omitted by Master White, that D. Stapleton doth allow the preaching of the Gospell by lawfull Pastors, so far onely to be a note of the Church, as it is included in the Catholique note of succession, and no otherwise, &c.

* Stapl. princip. doctrinall. l. c. 22.

Ans. This accusation is builded vpon a false report of D. White, his speech and meaning: his words are; * These men (Diuines of Colen, Villa-Vincentius, Hosius, Stapleton, &c.) thinke the teaching of the true Faith, is not possibly all the marks of the Church, but none of them saith as the Iesuite doth, it is no good marke; They say the contrary, it is a marke indeed, a chiefe marke, a proper and very cleare note of the Church, a note ingrauen, and perpetually cleauing to it, &c.

^a Way to the Ch. digress. 18. pag. 105.

Here my Brother chargeth neither D. Stapleton, nor the rest with making the preaching of the Gospell an absolute and sole marke of the Church^b, but acknowledgeth that they conioyne succession and other notes to this, and chargeth them onely with affirming that true doctrine is a note.

^b Stapl. Relict. c. 1. q. 4. ar. 5. Non est scriptura, nota ecclesie simplicitate, &c.

And this is the common opinion of our Aduersaries, as appeareth by Cardinall Hosius, saying^c: There is no Catholique which denies true doctrine and right administration of the Sacraments to be notes of the Church.

^c Hof. cont. Brent. l. 5. Non ergo P. a Soto, vel quicumque Catholicus negat has esse notas ecclesie.

Obiection. Stapleton maketh true doctrine a note of the Church so far as it is included in the Catholike note of succession, &c.

^d Reade my observations following, touching the notes of the Church.

Ans. 1. This opposeth not D. White, who onely affirmeth that Stapleton and others make true doctrine a note of the Church, not questioning the manner how they make it so.

* Bosius de sig. eccles. l. 3. c. 9. Apparet nihil ab ecclesiam nostra creditorum quæ sunt æternæ veritatis, neque pro temporum, locorum, atque hominum varietate variari possunt, quod non sit ex ipsa sacris bibliis haustum, iuxta antiquorum Patrum declarationes.

Secondly, but whereas the P. P. affirmeth that true doctrine is no note of the Church, vnlesse it be ioyned with personall succession: I answer, first, That the Romane Church wanteth this personall succession^d, whereof it glorieth so confidently.

Secondly, this manner of succession, implying the Popes supremacie, and the externall regiment of the Church, according to the present Popish forme, hath no first ordinance and beginning from the Apostles or Primitiue Church; and the true Church in the best ages thereof consisted without it: therefore^e the same can be no condition or meanes to make true doctrine a note of the Church.

Paragr. 5.

Paragr. 5. *Gregorie Valence, touching the marks of the Church.*

f Greg. Val. to. 3.
d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. §. 11.

T.W. In prooffe of the Protestants marks of the Church, to wit, truth of doctrine, and administration of Sacraments, Master White alleageth Valence, saying^e; Among whomsoever the truth of Doctrine and Sacraments are holden, thereby it is knowne the Church is there. For the true displaying of this base iugling Minister, &c. 1. That which Gregorie Valence saith of the persons of which the Church consisteth, Master White applieth to the marks by which it is knowne: secondly, he translateth, Ex iis constare veram ecclesiam, of those persons the Church consisteth, thereby it is knowne the Church is there.

g Way to the Ch.
§. 32. n. 3. p. 137.

Ans. This place is alleaged onely^s to proue, that Gregorie Valence is of opinion, that where the preaching of the Word and Sacraments are found, there the Church is knowne to be, and not (as you ouer-reach) to proue they are the proper notes to discern the Church: for he thus speaketh; I am sure all Papists will grant, that succession, vniuersalitie, &c. are no marks at all, but when they concur with true Faith: whereas they say expressely, that among whomsoever the truth of Doctrine and Sacraments are holden, thereby it is knowne the Church is there.

g Greg. Val. to. 3.
d. 1. q. 1. p. 5. n. 25.
Fatemur, si successio legitima pastorum & doctorum absque veritate doctrina staret, non ex illa facis posse veram ecclesiam demonstrari.

Now Gregorie Valence in termes affirmeth thus much, saying^h; We confesse, that if lawfull succession of Pastors and Teachers should hold without veritie of doctrine, that then the Church could not sufficiently be proued thereby. And in the words produced by my Brother; The true Church cannot be without veritie of doctrine, and with whom these are altogether found, of those persons the Church consisteth.

From whence ariseth this Argument against the Popish marks: For asmuch as that onely is the true Church, with whom veritie of doctrine and right administration of the Sacraments is found, and with whomsoever these are found, of those the Church consisteth: no man can be assured of any societie, that the same is the true Church, vntill he know whether they haue true doctrine, and right administration of Sacraments. And thus, the very touchstone of the Church, and all other notes thereof, is true doctrine, which is the thing the Protestants say.

And as for the translation about which you are so loud, there dependeth nothing vpon it, and therefore it was sufficient to deliuer the sense of the Iesuites speech. And your hatefull language, crying, base iugling Ministers, &c. be-seemeth your conscience and faith, of whom is verified that of our Sauour, Matth. 12. 34. O generation of Vipers, how can you being euill speake good things? &c.

Paragr. 6. *Bellarmino concerning the marks of the Church.*

i Bellar. de eccl.
l. 4. c. 3.

T.W. Master White alleageth Cardinall Bellarmineⁱ, saying: The Catholike notes (Succession, Antiquitie, &c.) make it not evidently true that it is the Church, but evidently probable: But Bellarmines words are, they make it evidently credible. Betweene these two there is this difference: if an hundred graue persons affirme such a thing, this testimonie makes the matter evidently credible; but if two or three of one side should affirme, and as many of the other denie, then it were but evidently probable.

Ans.

Answ. In your instance the latter speech is so far from being evidently probable, that it is very doubtfull and vncertaine: for when the two Harlots, 1 King. 3. 23. affirmed before Salomon; the one that the childe was hers, and the other the contrarie: if these persons had bene more in number, and of each side worthy of credit, would their contradictions contesting each other, haue bene evidently credible of either part? No verily, euery wise man would haue suspected, and bene perplexed in his thoughts about the same.

Also the difference betweene credible and probable, about which you cauilt, is not formall^k and constant: probable is the genus of credible, and evidently credible is no more but a degree of probabilitie.

But to the matter it selfe. This speech of your Cardinall^l being well considered, ouerthrowes your Popish marks: for notes of the Church must be proprieties, and infallible signes of the true Church, such as one beholding, cannot be deceived in the thing whereof they be marks^m. But that which is evidently credible, to wit, so apparent to sense and common reason, as may perswade a prudent person to assent vnto it, is possible to be false. For example: It was evidently credible to Isaac, that Esau must be his heire: to Iobs friends, and to himselfe, that he should die a miserable man: to Ionas and the Mariners, that he should haue perished in the Sea: yet were none of these things true.

Lastly, it is according to the definition of euidentⁿ made by the Papists, evidently credible, that after the words of Consecration, there remains the matter and substance of the Elements; for all the senses (whose apprehension in their proper object failes not^o) discern it to be so: yet if we beleue the Tridentine sentence^{*}, our senses are deceived, and there be onely empty formes without their owne natiue substance in the Sacrament.

^k Molin. dial. 2. l. 2. c. 1. Probabile est duplex, alterum per se, quod ex se meretur fide, &c. ^l Bellar. de Eccl. l. 4. c. 3. ^m See the obser. following of the notes of the Church. ⁿ Gre. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 4. Potest aliquid esse euidentius, quia sensu percipitur, &c. Bellarm. de iustif. l. 3. c. 2. Sixt. Senent. bibl. l. 6. ann. 210. ^o Arist. de gen. animal. c. 10. & 8. phys. 3. & de generat. & corrupt. c. 3. 3. Cic. Acad. 2. Sensum ita clara & certa indicia sunt, &c. ^{*} Trid. Concil. sess. 13. c. 2.

An Obseruation, Concerning the notes of the Church in generall.

As by our earthly Parents we receiue naturall life and being, and after our birth, haue Nurtes and Foster-fathers to educate and bring vs vp: so we are first begotten to a spirituall life, and afterwards increased and continued in the same, by the ministry of the Church, Ephe. 4. 11. 13. Faith commeth by hearing, Rom. 10. 17. Et sicut non nascuntur Christiani, People are not borne Christians, but made such. And God hath placed the meanes of the calling and saluation of all men in the Church, as in a rich depository: The Church is the house of the living God, 1 Tim. 3. 15. And the faithfull are his household, Ephe. 2. 19. And the Church is the mother of Abrahams children, Galat. 4. 26. And God addeth vnto the same such as are saved, Act. 2. 47. To life and saluation (saith Augustine) no man commeth but hee which hath Christ his head; and none haue Christ their head but such as be in his bodie, the Church, Ephe. 5. 23.

But to the end we may be brought or come to the Church, the same must necessarily be knowne; and the notes and markes of the Church are meanes to demonstrate and make it knowne. Whereupon, both we and our Aduersaries^f agree in this, that the knowledge of the markes of the Church, is a most profitable part of Christian science.

^p Tertul. apol. c. 17. Hieron. ad Ietam. ep. 7. ^q Iren. cont. hær. l. 3. c. 4. ^r Aug. de vnit. eccl. c. 16. Iren. l. 3. c. 40. Cyprian. ep. 51. n. 16. ^s Bellar. de eccl. l. 4. c. 1. Controversia de notis ecclesie vtilissima est, &c. nec hæretici negant, & si in hac controversia conueniremus, reliquæ omnes facile componerentur.

Section 1. Concerning the notion and generall description of the Notes of the Church.

By Notes our Aduersaries vnderstand, Certaine outward signes and properties, diuers

* Bellar. de eccl. f.
l. 4. c. 3. Habet plurimas notas, testimoni-
monia, & signa-
que eam diffin-
iunt ab omni falsa
religione, paganor-
um, Iudaeorum,
hæreticorum. Sta-
p. Rel. c. 1. q. 4.
ar. 5. Quem ad-
modum distinguunt
hominem à brutis
parvulis per extrema
lineamenta corpo-
ris, & figuram, &c.
Gre. Val. to. 3. d.
v. in libera homin-
de fid. Cath. con-
de ecclesia, pene-
pare possint hære-
vilo modo contru-

In the marks of the Church they require these conditions : 1. That they be proper, and not common, or such as false Churches may easily pretend to challenge^b. 2. *Evident*, and better knowne than the Church it selfe. And by evident, they vnderstand that which is manifest to sense^c or common reason, by which any Infidell or vnlearned person by his naturall prudence, may infallibly without other meanes know the Church, and such as by which all doubt is taken away about the question which is the Church^d. 3. *Inseparable*, and at all times belonging to the Church^e.

græ, & figuratim, &c. f. ecclesia ab imperiis fidelibus, & ab infidelibus per externam faciem, &c. pag. 113. b. Bellar. de ecclef. l. 4. c. 3. g. Reg. val. to. 3. d. 1. c. 1. p. 7. c. Greg. val. ib. q. 1. p. 4. Euidens conseri folle illud, quod iam fufficiens mouet hominis intellẽdum, vt in libera hominis potestate non fit diffinitio: et que vel per fe morum vt principia: vel quia ex notis percipitur, vel quia fenfus, &c. Suar. def. fid. Cath. cont. fect. Angl. l. 1. c. 8. Quia fenfibus fe exhibet, vt euidenter exalibet, &c. Hof. confef. c. 20. Neque quibus omnis de ecclefia, penes quos fit dubitatio tolli potest: vt hijs notis a quibufuis agnofci poffit ecclefia: ita funt propriæ vt eas nequaquam vfurpare poffint hæretici. Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 4. ar. 5. pa. 114. Notæ debent ita confpicue effe, vt nec ab aduulfarijs facile prætexi queant, nec villo modo controuerfari ad dubiz funt. c. Cofter. enchi. loc. de ecclefia, pag. 75.

Section 2. *Concerning the Notes of the Church, the Protestants teach as followeth.*

† Whitak. de eccl.
 cl. f. 5. c. 1. Bez.
 l. de nois eccl. c.
 3. opufe.
 † Stapl. Rel. c. 1.
 q. 4. ar. 2. nota
 3. & 4. lib. ar. 3.
 Ref. 7. Eccl. ef.
 Chrifti fa fapientia
 bus cognofcitur
 per fanam doctri
 nam.
 † Iunius con.
 Bcl. de eccl. c. 16.
 Quod internum
 rei nota non eff.
 Bannes 2. 2. q. 1.
 ar. 10. Si prædicatione
 internum poffimum
 vbiq; fenfibiliter
 agnofcere, poterim
 us etiam eccl. ef.
 am.
 † Iuftin. apol. 3.
 Eufeb. hift. eccl. l.
 4. c. 8.
 † Chryf. imperf.
 Mach. hom. 49.

First, the Notes of the Church are of two sorts: some *Essentiall*^t, which constitute and give being to the Church, and proue and demonstrate the same, as the cause or proper accident shewes the effect and subiect to which it appertaines. And by these markes beleeuers onely, and men skilfull know the Church *.

Secondly, besides the former notes, the Church hath externall and sensible actions and accidents^b, such as vnbeleeuers may behold, and take knowledge of, 1 Cor. 14. 24. And by the view thereof, as the first meanes, be brought to a confused knowledge of the Church, and from thence by further enquire and labour, come to the distinct vnderstanding of the same.

Thirdly, in many ages and states thereof, the true Church hath visible notes, which for that time being, are signes thereof : yet the same are separable, and at other times not found therein. Of this kinde was the working of miracles, and sundry other gifts of the holy Ghost, 1 Cor. 12. &c. Also the admirable sanctitie, patience, fortitude, and vertues of holy Martyrs and other Saints, which made manifest euen to the Heathens, that the religion of those Christians was diuine. Iustine Martyrⁱ a Philosopher, was hereby conuerted to Christ. And Chrysostome^k speaking hereof, saith ; *In former times good Christians were made knowne sundry waies : it was manifested by miraculous signes, who were good Christians and bad, by the manners of people, &c.*

In likemanner, vniuersalitie, succcession of Pastors, the name of Catholike, communion with some Churches, as the Romane, Ephesian, &c. were in the daies of the Fathers notes of truth¹. Eusebius speaking of the state of the Church, about the year 170, faith ^m, *In euery one of the successions of the Churches, the faith held euen as the Law and the Prophets, and the Lord preached.*

But as a Purple robe, though in ancient time it was proper to the Emperour, and the Ensigne of his Imperiall dignitie, yet in our daies it ceaseth to be so: euen so it happened to many accidentall notes of the Church. So that we doe not a little maruell, why our Aduersaries gleane so many testimonies of Fathers, and farce their writings with them: Seeing the nature and vse of these things is changed, and that which in the ages of those holy Fathers was a marke of truth, is in our daies the veile of error. The time was, when sheepees cloathing was the note of a true Shepherd, and a scarlet robe of a iust Iudge: and thus we grant,

Iren. l. 3. c. 3. &
l. 4. c. 63. Tertul.
l. de praescriptione.
Optat. cont. Parmen. l. 6. Basil. e-
pist. 72. Aug. cont.
ep. fundam. c. 4.
Pacian. ep. ad
Sempronian.
m Euseb. hist. l. 4.
c. 21.

ω ἰσχυρὸς δὲ διὰ τοῦ
χρ., καὶ αἱ ἐκείνης πύ-
λαι, οὗτοι εἶναι οἱ
οἱ νόμοι καὶ τὰ κριτήρια καὶ
οἱ ἀποδείξεις, καὶ οἱ ἀπο-
δείξεις παρ. 41.

grant, that vniuersalitie, locall succession, and the name of Catholike, were accidentall notes of the Church in the daies of the good Fathers, wherein godlinesse and truth were araid with these vestures: but as it falleth out sometimes, that Theeues and Harlots wear the apparell of true men and honest Matrons, and some of the Souldiers who crucified Christ, ware his vnseamed coat; so the things which haue formerly beene ensignes of veritie, may in future times become the cloake of iniquitie.

Fourthly, the difference betweene our Aduersaries and vs in this question, is; we both admit outward and sensible markes of the Church, and the Protestants acknowledge, that the true church hath sensible notes whereby it may be knowne and distinguished; and also that at some times common and separable accidents are so conioyned with that which is essentiall, as that they serue for tokens, (as hath beene declared.)

But whereas they make externall accidents, to wit, vniuersalitie, personall succession, names and titles, &c. inseparable properties and markes infallible, we refuse this, and in stead thereof place proprieties and actions, flowing from the being of the Church.

Also, they require such notes of the Church, as immediatly make people know the same, and leade naturall men by sense and common reason to the true Church: we such as notifie the Church mediately by the doctrine.

Saint Augustine against the Manichees, saith *; *A man cannot know any thing by signes, vnlesse he vnderstand that whose signes they be.* And indeed if the Church were gold and siluer, or a bodily substance, then as Stapleton saith †; *Like as a man besides his reason and inward forme, hath outward shape and stature, whereby externally he is differenced from other creatures: so the church by externall accidents might alwaies be knowne.* But the same being of another nature, a body mysticall, and not naturall; like vnto a wise man, or a good man, nor like a naturall man: an object of our knowledge † enabled by faith to vnderstand: hence it followeth, that as we cannot know a wise man or good man, vntill we doe in some measure conceiue what goodnesse and wisdom are: or supernaturall veritie, but by the lustre of diuine truth; so by carnall tokens and accidents it is impossible to know the true Church, vntill we vnderstand the thing which maketh the same such, and haue effects and tokens emanent from the very forme thereof †. And the perswasion which is produced by humane motives, is not knowledge of faith, but opinion: And the meanes which cause no other assent or perswasion but this, are farre from being infallible markes and demonstratiue characters, such as our Aduersaries would haue their notes of the Church.

If they object against this which I haue deliuered, that euen as at the first planting of the Christian Church, God appointed certaine outward testimonies of truth; to wit, miracles and other visible gifts, &c. whereby ignorant persons before they came to vnderstand the doctrine might be certain that those Teachers had the truth; euen so in future ages, he hath for the helpe of the vnskillfull appointed visible testimonies, whereby people may bee brought to know the true Church without penetrating into the doctrine: Our answer is, that he hath appointed no such meanes, but hauing once sufficiently confirmed his diuine truth by miracles, and the Apostles teaching †, he doth onely giue vs that truth contained in the Scripture, and the externall preaching and profession thereof by the ministry of some part of the Church, to be the outward meanes of bringing men to faith and saluation.

* Iunius cont.
Bell. l. de eccles. c.
16.

• Aug. de vil.
cred. c. 13.
† Stapl. Rel. c. 1.
q. 4. ar. 5. Res. 7.
† Cyril. Alex. in
Esa. l. 1. c. 2. Sion
intelligibilis, supra
omnem creaturam
aspectabilem euo-
lar, &c. Mons in-
telligibilis, &c.
† Stapl. Antid.
euang. in Math. ca.
5. vers. 14. Sicut
Christus vt pro
vero filio Dei ag-
nosceretur, non ni-
si oculis fidei vi-
deri potuit, sed vt
homo in terrens
conuersatus, eam
ab impijs Iudeis,
quæ a pijs cerne-
batur: sic ecclesia
vt pro vera sponsa
& columna verita-
tis, ac matre fide-
lium agnoscat, non
nisi oculis fi-
dei videtur, sed vt
est hominum col-
lecta congregatio,
per totum orbem
diffusa, Christi no-
men profitentium,
catenus non a cre-
dentibus tantum,
sed & ab incredulis
& impijs cerni-
tur, &c.
† Aug. sup. Psal.
125. Vbi impletum
est quod significa-
batur, miraculum
ablatum est.

A briefe Recapitulation of the former discourse.

First, something is required to the constitution or being of the true Church; to wit, the doctrine of faith, obedience, and the inuocation of Christ Iesus, ac-

G

cording

1 Whitak. de eccl.
cl. q. 5. c. 1. & 3.
Bez. de not. eccl.
Daneus com.
2 Tim. præfat.
3 Hof. conf. c.
20. & cont. Brent.
1. 5. Sunt quidem
hec eccl. signa.
Coster. enchir. l. de
eccl. Note iste
sunt duplices: una
ab origine sumi-
tur, &c.

Aug. in loh. tr. 35.
Lumen & alia de-
monstrat & sup-
sum. Supl. Rel. c. 4.
q. 3. ar. 3. Perf.
Aiaz. de trad. p. 3.
pa. 11. Stapl.
prompt. Cath. p. 3.
sub hebdom. 4.
pass. Omnis lux
tam supsum de-
monstrat quam
alia, &c.

cording to the truth revealed by the Prophets and Apostles, in the primarie parts and Articles thereof, Ephe. 2. 20. And this doctrine which giues being to the Church, is called a note of the Church by some of our Diuines¹; and by diuers Papists², because by the same the true Church is knowne and differenced by all those who are able to penetrate into the doctrine.

Secondly, some thing is required to the manifesting of the Church openly to others, that they may be added thereunto and saued: for how can any one come to that which in no sort he knoweth?

Thirdly, to vnbeleueers and vnskilsfull persons, the true Church at the first is manifested onely by a confused ostension: such as doth not declare the same vnto them as true, but onely as a societie professing a forme of Christian Religion, distinct from others, and offering to demonstrate to such as will heare it, the truth of saluation.

Fourthly, after one is in this sort brought to the Church, then vpon the vse of meanes, by the cooperation of diuine grace, vnderstanding the truth professed by the Church, he beginneth to assent and beleue: and before any one can attaine the distinct notion of the Church as true, he must in some degree or other penetrate into the doctrine and faith thereof.

So the difference betweene the Papists and vs, concerning the generall doctrine of the notes of the Church, is: *They require sensible markes, whereby without any penetration into doctrine, or consideration of the principles of faith, one may know by the view of outward signes, that such a societie is the true Church; euen as in the Apostles age, any vnskilsfull person might by the miracles wrought by our Saniour and the Apostles, know in generall that they taught diuine truth. But the notes which we require, are the outward proposing of the doctrine, and exercising of the Religion it selfe in such a manner, that the people may take knowledge thereof, and come vnto it; and then by euidence of the thing it selfe be conuicted in conscience that the same is diuine; and so beleeuing the same, to know that they which teach and professe it are the true Church.* As a man by a certaine obscure glimmering espieth a light a farre off, and so comming to the place where it is, beholds the light it selfe and those which beare it, and distinguisheth them from others.

Section 3. Concerning the Popish notes of the Church.

Touching the particular notes of the Church maintained by our Aduersaries, I affirme two things. 1. That the generall description of notes made by themselves, and formerly rehearsed by me, agreeth not vnto them. 2. They haue not indeed those notes which they challenge, and so eagerly contend for.

Proposition 1. *The description of notes made by Papists, agreeth not to their notes.*

The Papists describing the notes of the Church in generall, teach that they must be euident, proper, and inseparable: But succession, vnitie, sanctitie, and vniuersalitie, as themselves define them, are not so; ergo, after their owne description they be no notes. I will proue the Assumption by each of the foure notes which I haue named, and which our Aduersaries make their chiefeest notes.

1. *Succession,*

1. Succession, as it is defined by Papists, can be no note of the true Church.

Succession is twofold: First, Personall; secondly, both of Persons and Faith. Personall succession alone is common, and the Greeke Church is able to deriue it selfe from the Apostle Andrew^a; and notwithstanding personall succession, our Aduersaries denie the same to be a true Church. Also the Scripture teacheth, that Wolues and false Prophets may succeed good Pastors, Aēt. 20. 29. And the Fathers say^b, *That as darknesse succeedeth light, sickness health, a tempest calme, and falsehood truth; so false Shepherds may occupie the seats and roomes of good: And Caiphas in our Sauours time sat in the roomes of Aaron.* Whereupon Irenæus and Tertullian, commending the succession when it was good, yet allow the same no further than it hath conioyned with it, *The gracious gift of veritie, and wholesome word of diuine truth*^c. And our Aduersaries are now come home to vs and acknowledge this^d.

Mixt succession, consisting both of faith and doctrine, can be no note of the true Church, because the principall part of it, namely doctrine, wherein consisteth the life of succession, is obscure and doubtfull (according to our Aduersaries Tenet^e) and vulgar persons cannot iudge of it; also Heretikes and false Churches may challenge it^f. And Cardinall Bellarmine perceiuing thus much, confesseth that the Argument taken from succession is vsed by them, not so much to proue the true Church, as by the defect thereof, to shew there is no true Church with them that want it^g.

agitur, nec locorum tantum est, nec personarum, sed etiam veræ æque sanæ doctrinæ. Hof. cont. Brent. l. 5. pag. 233. Greg. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei. l. 4. c. 9. Horant. loc. Cathol. l. 6. c. 7. Non argumentatur à perpetua successione prouinciarum, sed à doctrina quæ habet ea esse, cum in iis regionibus ea legitima successio vigeret, &c. • Bellarm. Stapleton. Greg. Valenc. f. Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 4. ar. 5. Notæ debent ita esse conspicuæ, vt nec ab aduersariis facile prætexi queant, nec vilo modo controuersi aut dubie. • Bellar. de eccles. l. 4. c. 8. Argumentum à successione, &c. adferri præcipue, ad probandum non esse ecclesiam, vbi non est hæc successio: ex quo tamen non colligitur, ibi necessario esse ecclesiam, vbi est successio.

^a Niceph. Patriarch. Constantinopol. chronolog. edit. by Bellar. de eccles. l. 4. c. 8. Stapl. princip. de d. m. l. 13. c. 6. Vide Horant. loc. Cathol. l. 6. c. 7. ^b Greg. Nazian. orat. in laud. Athanasii. et in d. m. l. 13. c. 6. ^c Irenæus. l. 4. c. 43. & 44. Tertul. de præscript. c. 32. & c. 37. ^d Bellar. de eccles. l. 4. c. 8. Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. §. 2. 5. Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 4. ar. 2. successio de qua hic Greg. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei. l. 4. c. 9. Notæ debent ita esse conspicuæ, vt nec ab aduersariis facile prætexi queant, nec vilo modo controuersi aut dubie. • Bellar. de eccles. l. 4. c. 8. Argumentum à successione, &c. adferri præcipue, ad probandum non esse ecclesiam, vbi non est hæc successio: ex quo tamen non colligitur, ibi necessario esse ecclesiam, vbi est successio.

2. Vnitie, according to the Popish description thereof, is no note of the Church.

Popish Vnitie stands principally herein, that people embrace the same faith and manner of worship with the High Priest of Rome^a; and submit their conscience and practise to his cathedrall determination. But this kinde of vnitie is deficient in one of the conditions belonging to the notes of the Church; namely, it is separable: First, it was vnknowne to the Apostolicall Church, Mat. 20. 25. Luk. 22. 24. Gal. 2. 7. 9. Aēt. 8. 14.

Secondly, the Primitiue Church for the space of the first 300. yeeres acknowledged it not, as these examples proue. First, Cyprian, Firmilianus, and all the African Bishops and Churches refuse the determination and the tradition of the Romane Popes, Cornelius and Stephenⁱ, and make them their companions and equals: *They stile the Pope their Colleague, their good Brother, their fellow Priest*^k: They rebuke him with much bitterness^l: They taxe him for obtruding vnwritten verities^m, and for claiming superioritie ouer themⁿ, and making himselfe the successor of Peter^o; and they affirme, that euery Bishop ouer his owne flocke is equall to him^p.

Secondly, all the Bishops of the East refuse the Popes determination in matter of ceremonie, and challenge as much prerogatiue from the Apostle Iohn, as the Roman Bishops did from S. Peter^q. Æneas Syluius^r, a famous Papist,

^a Durand. 4. d. 24. q. 5. Propter hoc stat vnitatis ecclesiæ, quod omnia membra sunt sub vno capite. ⁱ Cyprian. ep. 41. & 52. & 72. & 74. Firmil. ad Cyprian. ep. 75. ^k Scripsimus ad Cornelium collegam nostrum. Te oportet vt bonum fratrem, & vniuersum sacerdotem. ^l Cur tantum Stephanus frater obstinata durities. Bellar. de Pontif. l. 4. c. 7. Vocat eum superbum, imperitum, & prauum mentis. ^m Epist. 74. vnde illa traditio, &c. ⁿ Cyprian. ep. 73. & 74. vnde illa traditio, &c. ^o Lib. de vnit eccles. ^p Quomodo modum facium videmus ante Concilium Nicænum, dum sibi quisque viuebat, & parvus respectus habebatur ad ecclesiam Romanam.

ep. 75. • Stephanus per successionem, cathedram Petri habere se prædicat. Episcopatus sui loco gloriatur & se successorem Petri gloriatur, &c. • Habet in ecclesiæ administratione voluntatis suæ liberum arbitrium vnusquisque præpositus, &c. • Lib. de vnit eccles. ^q Rufin. hist. l. 5. c. 23. Basil. ep. ad Rufin. • Pius 2. epist. ad Martin. Mayer. • Ep. 288. p. 802. Quomodo modum facium videmus ante Concilium Nicænum, dum sibi quisque viuebat, & parvus respectus habebatur ad ecclesiam Romanam.

who was afterwards himselfe a Pope, affirmeth; that *before the Nicene Councell, small regard was had to the Romane Church*. This manner of vnicie therefore and subordination to the Pope, is no note of the Church, because it is separable, and was not found in the Church for the first 300. yeeres.

3. Romish sanctitie no note.

f Bellar. de eccl.
l. 4. c. 11.

e Stapl. Rel. c. 1.
q. 3. ar. 5.
Greg. Val. to. 3.
d. 1. q. 1. p. 7.
a Epiphanius &
Augustin. in Apo-
stolici.

* Tertul. l. cont.
Plych. Chrysim-
perf. Matth. hom.
49. Vincent. Ly-
rin. cont. her. c. 16.
& 23. & 24.
Theod. catalog.
heret. in Notat.
Sextus hist. f. l. 2. of Priscilian. Proferus multa in eo, animi & corporis bona cerneres, vigilare multum, famem & sitim ferre poterat, habendi minime cupidus, utendi parcissimus.

Sanctitie of the Church, according to Bellarmine^f, stands in the holinesse of doctrine, which containeth nothing false and contrary to faith, and nothing vniust and repugnant to good manners. According to Stapleton and Greg. Valence^e, the Church is called holy, because it professeth sanctitie, and embraceth an holy religion, hauing in it some principall members, iust, and free from mortall sinne.

But here want two properties of their notes: 1. Sanctitie described in this manner, is not euident nor easie to be knowne, and before one can know it, he must haue recourse to the doctrine. 2. It is not proper, either in regard of claime or possession, Heretikes and Schismatikes doe challenge the same^a, and in the outward exercise thereof (whereof vnlearned persons are onely able to iudge) they haue sundry times excelled the Orthodox^x.

4. Popish vniuersalitie no note, &c.

y Alchazar. Iesuit.
sup. Apoc. 20. 7.
Andrad. def. fid.
l. 3. p. 185. Arrii vi-
rus sanctorum ser-
pit, vt Hieronymo
auctore, tres tan-
tum aut quatuor
Episcopos, inte-
gram fidem ser-
uasse fama fuerit.
z Bellar. de eccl.
l. 4. c. 7.
* Suar. def. fid.
Cath. cont. sect.
Angl. l. 1. c. 8. In se
sunt obscura quæ
potius credi de-
bent, quam videri,
& ideo inepte ad-
feruntur, vt signa
visibilia ecclesiæ.

Vniuersalitie and multitude are not proper to the true Church, but common to Heretikes: Our Aduersaries confesse, y that the Arrians in number exceeded the faithfull. And Bellarmine saith^z, that the Church is vniuersall, though but one Prouince professe the true faith, if it consent with the former vniuersall Church. And this consent with the former vniuersall Church, is a thing vneui- dent^{*} to common persons. The enquire of it is a matter of skill and learning, and cannot be performed without examining and comparing the doctrine and religion of former and present ages of the Church. And thus our Aduersaries euident and visible notes being looked into, proue vneui- dent and inuisible, and must in the end be resolued into the doctrine it selfe, as the Touchstone of the same.

Proposition 2. *Wherein is declared, that the notes assigned by the Papists, are not found in the Romish Church.*

a Horant. loc.
Cath. l. 6. c. 6. De
ecclesiæ certo fig-
no, & perpetua no-
ta, &c. Stapl. princ.
doct. l. 1. c. 22. San-
der. de visib. eccl. ec-
clesiæ. l. 8. c. 50.

Amongst all their notes, our Aduersaries relie most vpon Succession^z, and if it be made euident that they want that, there is little regard to be had of the rest; and therefore for breuitie, I will deale with them about their note of Suc- cession onely.

§. 1. Succession not found in the Romane Church.

Touching Succession in generall, the Papists hold, that onely legitimate Succession is a note of the Church^b. But the present Romane Church wanteth legitimate Succession.

First, the Romane Church hath not succession of true doctrine, without which no other succession is legitimate: for the succession of true doctrine, according to the Fathers, beginneth in the Apostles, and so continueth by a per-

b Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q.
4. ar. 2. notab. 5.
Non quauis, sed
legitima & vera
successio est nota
ecclesiæ. Ib. notab.
1. Successio de qua
hic agitur, nec lo-
corum tantum est,
nec personarum, sed etiam veræ æque sanæ doctrine. Horant. loc. Cath. l. 6. c. 7. Non de quauis episcoporum successione hic tractatur,
sed de legitima, &c.

petuall

petuall descent and propagation through enery age, vntill the present times. Saint Paul saith, the Church is builded vpon the foundation of the Prophets and Apostles, Ephes. 2. 20. therefore as euery building is reduced to the foundation, so vnlesse our Aduersaries will giue vs a Church builded vpon the Sand, they must in their succession lead vs to the Apostles.

Tertullian, maintaining a currant succession, such as we claime, saith^e; *We haue the Apostles of our Lord the authors.* And againe^d, *We are vndoubtedly to hold that which the Churches receiued from the Apostles; the Apostles from Christ, and Christ from God.* And Augustine^e; *Follow thou the way of the Catholike discipline, which hath descended from Christ himselfe to vs by the Apostles, and from hence must descend to posteritie.* And if our Aduersaries would confirme their faith by such a succession, which laying the foundation in the Apostles, and then hauing testimonie in the first 300. yeeres, did afterwards passe by the currant of future ages, the controuersie of Religion betweene vs were at an end: but they outfacing vs with the empty title of Succession, and misalleaging the testimonies of the worthy Fathers, who in their writings commend no other succession than that which the Protestants will freely assent vnto, doe in very deed deriue most of their doctrine from the puddle of their Schoolemen, and for many of their Articles haue no higher ascent than the Trident Council^f: and for the rest, they cannot ascend aboue the 600. yeere.

§. 2. Our Aduersaries haue not legitimate personall succession.

Legitimate personall succession is, that the Successor come into the roome of his Predecessor by a lawfull vocation; and where the calling is vicious, there the succession is rotten^g. And though God in mercy preferue some remnants of truth and piety vnder a faulty calling; yet succession can challenge no priuilege, *ratione sui*, simply, and in respect of it selfe, Ioh. 10. 1. &c. And the Canons^h of the Church pronounee all ordinations false, which are made by mediation of money, fauour, intreaty, &c.

Now the holy Scriptures and Primitiue Fathers, require three things to a lawfull vocation: First, probatation of the person for doctrine and manners, 1 Tim. 3. 10. Act. 6. 3. Secondly, free election of worthy persons, without respect to fauour, lucre, &c. 1 Tim. 5. 22. Act. 8. 20. Thirdly, Ordination, which standeth in the solemne commending the person elect by praiser to God, and designing him to his function and charge, by imposition of the hands of such as are authorized by God and the Church hereunto. Act. 6. 6. 1 Tim. 5. 22. 2 Tim. 1. 6.

Our Aduersaries neglect the two former, being equally or more needfull than the latterⁱ, and stand altogether vpon their titularie ordination, censuring the Pastors of all other Churches as vlawfull, because they want imposition of hands from them. Yea, those Protestant Bishops which were by imposition of hands ordained by themselues, and haue euer since successiueley ordained Bishops and Priests, (as in the Church of England) cannot obtaine their fauour, to be esteemed lawfull Pastors; and yet in the meane time, they themselues haue transgressed in all the parts of lawfull calling, and haue not feeling of their owne want, Matth. 23. 24.

But now to apply these things to my purpose: There can be no lawfull succession where there is a corrupt calling^k; (as appeareth by that which is said before) but it is affirmed by our Aduersaries, that many Romane Popes and Prelates haue occupied the Papall and Episcopall Seaby a corrupt calling. And this I declare as followeth.

Platina^l in the life of Syluester the third, saith; *The Papacie was in those daies come to that passe, as that he which by bribery and ambition (not sanctitie and learning) was able to doe most, he alone obtained the dignitie; good men being either oppressed or reiected: which custome would to God our times did not still retaine.*

G 3

Baronius

^e Tertul. de præs. script. c. 6.
^d Ibid. c. 21. & c. 37.

^e Aug. de vit. cred. c. 8. Sequera-
viam Catholice
discipline, quæ ab
ipso Christo per
Apostolos, ad nos
vique manauit, &
hinc ad posteros
manatura est.

^f The number and
parts of canonical
Scripture. The old
translation to be
authenticall, &c.

^g Bernard. Qui
male intravit &
non per Christum,
quidni infideliter
agat & contra
Christum?

^h Gratian. conf. 1.
q. 1. c. ordinat. &
c. per principalem.
Quolibet munera
interueniente falsa
dijudicatur ordi-
natio. Ordinationes
quæ interueni-
ente precio, vel
precibus, vel ob-
sequ. &c. c. sunt
nonnulli. c. pueri
ad sacros ordines.
Plat. vit. Nich. 27.
Nicholaus Ponti-
fex legem tulit, vt
quisquis noua ca-
nonica electione
in thronum Petri
ascendit, is non
Apostolicus, sed
Apostaticus habe-
atur.

ⁱ Bellarm. Recog.
Potest Presbyter
dispensatione apo-
stolica ordinare.
p. 39. Gloss. de
consecr. d. 5. c. ma-
nus.

^k Azor. instit. mor.
p. 2. l. 4. c. 5. citat
decretum Iulii 2.
editum ann. 1505.
quo docet, vicio-
sam esse electionem
Pontificis, quæ
fuerit simoniaca.
^l Plat. in Sylu. 3.
Sabellic. Enead. 9.
l. 1. Mos inoleua-
rat Apostolica fa-
dis per vim & do-
lum occupanda.

Baron. to. 11. anno 1037. n. 6. & 8. Heufedes apostolica, orbis olim gloria, nunc (proh dolor) efficeris officina Simonis, terunt in eodem mallei, nūmi sunt tartarei.
 Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 16. c. 1. n. 30. Hæc apostolica fides, &c. quot per Simoniacæ hæresis trapezitas, repetitis malleis, crebrisque confusionibus sobiacuerit, &c.
 Ammian. Marcell. l. 27. §. 2. Rufin. hist. l. 2. c. 10. Sozomen. hist. l. 6. c. 23.
 Plac. in Sylu. 2. Martin. Polonus

chron. an. 1007. Naucel. gen. 34. Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 16. c. 1. §. 18. qui citat Ioh. de columna. Fascic. temp. Factus est Papa auxilio diaboli, cui homagium fecit, &c. Ioh. Stella. Venet. in Syluest. 1. Plat. in Julio 1. E Ienonum & parasitorum numero, quidam in hunc ordinem relati sunt. Placina in Bonif. 8. & alij: Intravit ut vulpes, &c. Sabellic. Anead. 9. l. 7. Pontificatum verius finem est, quam suffragio adeptus. Genebr. chronol. l. 4. an. 901. pag. 553. Theoderic. Niem. de Schismo. pap. l. 2. c. 12. Scurtz & Hilbrons episcopi facti. Sabellic. Anead. 9. l. 2. Mos inoleuerat, apostolicæ sedis per vim, & dolum occupandæ. Picus Mirand. ep. ad Leon. de reform. mor. tr. 4. Plerique olim Pontifices, per summum dedecus ad summum decus perueniunt. Sigon. de reg. Ital. l. 9.

Argum. 2. Papall succession hath oftentimes bene interrupted; and therefore the Romane Church wanteth personall succession.

Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 4. ar. 3. Solent hæretici ab Ecclesia ad Christum & Apostolos, ut superiores promouere per saltum id faciunt. Ib. ar. 3. vera ecclesia habet pastores & episcopos, sibi inuicem succedentes.

Rhem. 1. Tim. 6. an. 1.

7 Bellar. de eccl. l. 4. c. 8. Omnes ecclesiæ Patriarchales habuerunt per longa tempora, episcopos manifestos hæreticos, ac proinde interrupta est successio.

Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 1. ar. 2. Resp. ad 3.

Greg. Val. Bellarm. Axor. Stapl. Tolos. Ban. & alij, Zabarel. de Schif. pag. 555. Cum præsumptum sit inueteratum, per 30. annos & ultra, censetur hæresis.

Onuph. in chron.

Ocho. Frising.

hist. l. 6. c. 32. & 33. Baron. to 11. anno 1044. n. 2.

Herman. con. in chron. Leo Ostiens. hist. Cassin. l. 11. c. 80. & c. 81. Sigbert. chron. anno 1045. Benedictus qui simoniace papatum inuenerat, cum esset rudis literarum, alterum ad vices ecclesiastici officij exequendas se cum Papam Syluestrum, consecrati fecit, quod cum multis non placeret, tertius superinducitur Gregorius, qui solus vices duorum impleret, Naucel. Gen. 35.

Baronius^m produceth one Glaber, complaining in this manner; *Alas, thou Apostolske Sea, which in the daies of old wast the glory of the world, art now (O shame) become the shop and forge of Simon Magus: and hammers continually are beating on thy Stithy to make hellish coine.* And the very same complaint is made by Pope Nicholas the second, in Antonineⁿ, of the times before him.

And all Stories report, one age after another, that Romane Popes about all the Bishops in the world, entred corruptly into their seats. Some of them like Julius Cæsar, obtained their place by the sword and blading, as Pope Damasus the first, at whose election 137. persons were murdered in the very Church. Some came in by forcery and compact with the deuill, as Syluester the second: others by bawdery and pandarisme: Some by subtilty and playing the Fox: and an innumerable company by bribery, ambition, and vnlawfull suit; in so much that Genebrard^t reporteth, how by the space of an hundred and fifty yeeres, fifty Popes together were Apostaticall. And as touching the inferiour Clergy, scarce one of them possessed his place but by corrupt meanes. As Sigonius^t speaking of Germany, saith; *There was scarce one who was not a Simoniacke or Concubinary.*

I proue the consequent in this manner: Succession *per saltum*^a, or leaping ouer mens heads, is not lawfull succession, as our Aduersaries maintaine against vs: For when wee say that wee succeed the Apostles and Primitiue Church, because we haue their faith and gouernment: they answer, that this succession is *per saltum*^x, and therefore insufficient. And if succession interrupted, and beginning againe were legitimate, then heresie could not overthrow succession but onely for the time present; and as soone as any Church formerly infected with heresie, began to bee orthodoxall in faith, it should recouer personall succession againe: but our Aduersaries will not admit this. Lastly, if heresie euert succession, then also Schisme doth the like; for according to our Aduersaries^z, Schisme and heresie are of like nature.

The Antecedent of the former Argument, is proued by the multitude of Schismes, which haue preuailed more in the Romane Church than in any other. Onuphrius^a reckoneth vp thirty famous Schismes, whereof I will only set downe two.

The first of these Schismes happened in the yeere 1044. betweene Benedict the ninth, Syluester the third, and Gregory the sixth: whereof Ocho Frisingensis^b writeth as followeth; *About the same time a shamefull confusion of the Church happened in the city of Rome: Three Vsurpers, whereof one was called Benedict, occupied that seat at one time: and to increase the beape of misery, they diuided the Patriarchall reuenues betweene them, one of them hauing his abode at Saint Peter; the other at Saint Mary the great; the third, which was Benedict, sitting in the Palace of Lateran. They all lead a flagitious and filthy life, &c.*

Our Aduersaries reckon Benedict the ninth the lawfull Pope^d, and yet themselves affirme, that hee came to his seat by faction and bribery; and also that he was a Lad of ten yeeres old, and a lewd and vicious beast. And Baronius saith, *He committed abominable villanies*^e: And that at the length he bartered the Papacy to Gregory the sixth for 1500. pounds^f: And this Gregory comming in as aforesaid, is acknowledged by our Aduersaries the lawfull Pope, and the line of personall succession passeth from him; yet presently after hee was deposed for Simony, and Clement the second is placed in his stead, and then the succession begins againe in this Clement^g: Gregory and Benedict are still aliue, and at the decease of Clement, Benedict occupieth the Papall seat againe, and sits therein eight moneths^h.

The second great Schisme began about the yeere 1378. and it continued according to Onuphrius and Genebrard fifty yeeresⁱ, and as others say forty^k. In the beginning of this Schisme, there were two Popes, the one of Italy, the other French. Urban the sixth was the Italian Pope, and there succeeded him Boniface the ninth, Innocent the seuenth, and Gregory the twelfth. The French Pope was Clement the sixth, who sat at Auennion in France, and he had all France, Spaine, and other great Countreyes following him. After his death succeeded Benedict the thirteenth, but at length certaine Cardinals in a Councell at Pisa, depose both the Italian Pope Gregory the twelfth, and the French Benedict the thirteenth, and create Alexander the fifth Pope. Neuerthelesse, the two other Popes hold their places still, and thus there are at one time three Popes, Gregory the twelfth, Benedict the thirteenth, Alexander the fifth. And when Alexander died, John 23. succeeded him. And all this while our Aduersaries confesse^l, that it was an hard matter (indeed impossible) to know which of all these was the lawfull Pope. But at length in the Councell of Constance all the three Popes are deposed, and Martin the fifth is created anew, being immediate Successor to no precedent Pope.

ter affixit. Bergo. Supplem. chron. l. 14. an. 1378. 1. Bellar. de Pont. l. 4. c. 14. Nec poterat facile dijudicari, quis eorum verus & legitimus Pontifex esset, cum non deessent singulis doctissimi patroni. Anton. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 22. c. 2. Emil. de gest. Franc. l. 9. cum utraque causa haberet quod sequeretur, præclaris ingenia sanctisque viros miraculo insignes, iudicio, inter se dissentientes, alios ab Urbano, alios à Clemente iussisse. Gers. de sign. ruin. eccles. fig. 1. Ad tantam ambiguitatem ecclesia devenit, quod ignorat ad quam partem vera sedes Rom. erat, nisi Deus forsitan alicui reuelasset. Azor. inst. mor. p. 2. l. 5. c. 14. Dubij & incerti Pontifices erant. Gr. Val. to 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. §. 38.

d Baron an. 1033. n. 6. Glaber. l. 4. c. 5
e Baron. to 11. an. 1034 n. 3.
f Plat. vit. Bened. 9.
Benno Card. vit. Greg. 7. Sigon. de reg. Ital. 18. Naucler. Gene. 35. & alij.

g Baron. to 11. an. 1045. & an. 10. 6. & anno 1047.
h Leo Ostiens. chron. Cassia. l. 2. cap. 82.

i Genebr. chron. an. 1378. Onuph. chron. Rom. Pontif.

k Cencil. Later. sess. 6. of Simon. Beg. episc. Modius. per 40. ferme an. P. Emil. de gest. Franc. l. 9. Schism. Pontificum, totum prope terrarum orbem concussit. Antonin. hist. p. 3. tit. 22. ca. 2. Palmer. chron. Platin. & alij. Stapl. princ. doct. l. 13. c. 15.

Theoder. Niem. de schism. pap. l. 3. c. 20. id extirpatione lugubris diuturnique schismatis, quod christianum populum diris & horrendis calamitatibus, tanto tempore lachrymabili-

Paragr. 7. *A place of Thomas, concerning the Popes authority in the Edition or making of a new Creed.*

T. W. Master White is not ashamed to affirme, that we take all authority from the Scripture, and give it to the Church: and finally, the Churches authority to the Pope.

Ans. It can bee no shame for Doctor White to charge you with your owne Tener: but it is cowardise and double dealing in you to dissemble the same.

The three imputations obiected are iustly laid to your charge.

First, you take all authority (*quoad nos*) from the Scripture^m, teaching that it is not the ground or pillar of truthⁿ, nor properly and of it selfe any cause or meanes of beleeve or charity^o, and God doth not immediatly speake by it^p, neither is the holy Ghost ioyned with the writing of the Scripture^q; the Church is not subiect to the Scripture^r: and put case any person liuing out of the com-

m Stapl. promptuar. Cath. par. 3. ser. 5. caput Ieiunij, pag. 10. Prædicatio verbi, non est organum aut instrumentum fidei.
n Cocl. reyl. contr. Bulling c. 2. Can. loc. l. 2. c. 8. Canis. cathec. c. 3. §. 13. Bellarm. de Concil. l. 2. c. 12. Stapl.

doct. princip. l. 9. c. 1. & 2. & Rel. 2. 4. q. 2. pag. 471. Non Scripturam Apostolus sed Ecclesiam vocauit Columnam & firmamentum fidei, &c. o Stapl. ib. q. 1. ar. 1. Non est per se & proprie medium ad credendum. — Non est obiectum fidei formale, aut aliqua pars eius. Id. prompt. cath. p. 3. feria 3. post. caput Ieiunij, pag. 10. Bos. de fig. l. 16. c. 10. Siue fidem spectes, siue charitatem, non ad libros sed ad ecclesiam confugiendum. p Stapl. rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 3. p. 445. & ib. q. 5. ad. 6. q Stapl. dei. l. 1. c. 11. n. 5. r Stapl. rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 1. pag. 431.

munion

munion of the Romane Church, doe reade or studie the same, it is not the word of God to them, or of greater authoritie than Æsops Fables^f.

Secondly, the Papists giue all authoritie to the present Romane Church: they make the same the onely externall ground and pillar of truth^g, the sole Iudge of Controuersies^h, the principle or first ground and foundation, from whence the Scripture in regard of men, receiueth all authoritieⁱ.

Thirdly, they giue the Churches authoritie to the Pope, and no Papist in these daies can or will deny this; for besides the positiue speeches of their greatest Doctors^j, the same assertion followeth vpon the maine principles of their doctrine; which are, That the Pope is the prime subiect of Ecclesiasticall authoritie, and that the whole authoritie of all the bodie and the members thereof, is deriued by, and from him^k; and the promise of the perpetuall assistance of the holy Ghost, infallible iudgement, supreme authoritie, and other priuileges are entailed vpon his tribunall^l.

T. W. *Master Whites words are*; Thomas saith^m, The making of a new Creed belongeth to the Pope, as all other things doe which concerne the whole Church. *But Thomas Aquinas his words are*: Noua editio Symboli, &c. A new edition of a Creed; *He meaneth by way of unfolding, explication, and explicite declaring of the Faith, already reuealed in Scripture or Tradition. This diabolically deprauation, and uncharitable impudence of our Minister, &c.*

Ans. In this obiection two things are to be considered: First, the forme of speech; Thomas saith, *The making of a new Creed*: whereas his words are, *The edition of a new Creed*. Secondly, the matter it selfe, how farre our Aduersaries extend the Popes authoritie, in making or putting forth a new Creed.

Touching the first, the same forme of speech which Doctor White vseth in relating Thomas his doctrine about this present Controuersie, is frequent in learned Papists themselues. Vigueriusⁿ abridging this very place of Thomas, saith; *Potestas condendi Symbolum, &c. The authoritie of making a Creed, belongeth to the high Bishop of Rome. And Gabriel Biel^o; Ex his patet, quod Ecclesia vel Papa, ordinando aut faciendo nouum Symbolum, &c. That the Church or Pope by ordaining or making a new Creed, &c.* And the same is found in Gerson^p, Bannes^q, &c. And therefore our Aduersarie hath small reason to flie vpon the Doctor with his lewd termes of diabolically, &c.

Secondly, as touching the matter it selfe; some learned Papists haue expressly maintained, that the Pope may create a new Article of Faith^r: and although our moderne Papists verbally professe^s, that the Pope hath no further authoritie of making a Creed, but onely by way of explication, yet their practise is contrary.

First, the Pope^k, *de facto*, hath framed a new Creed, containing a number of Articles, whereof none are found in the holy Scripture, or were formerly contained in the ancient Creeds.

Secondly, our Aduersaries yeeld their Pope authoritie to deriue matters of Faith out of Scripture^t and ancient Creeds, without arguments or premises taken from the same, by a like art, as if an Alchymist should pretend to extract gold out of a pibble-stone, wherein is no gold.

^f Hermannus defendit by Hofius, cont. Brent. l. 3. p. 148. Quæ pie dicta esse scis.

^g Bellar. de Sacram. l. 3. c. 35. Omnium dogmatum firmitas pendet ab authoritate sententis ecclesie. Stapl. Rel. c. 5. q. 1. ar. 2. ad 1. & 4. & q. 2. ar. 4. p. 513. Gress. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei, tr. de agnosc. Script. Canon.

^h Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 2. ad 5.

ⁱ Gress. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei l. 3. c. 16.

^j Pigh. contra Razib. l. 3. Aqua vniuersa nobis pendet Scripturam authoritas. Bosius de sig. l. 16. c. 10. Scimus articulos esse veluti principia quædam, quibus præ cunctis fides habenda. ASCRIPTURA NON REFERTUR INTER EYMODI PRINCIPIA, sed per Ecclesiam quasi per principia quoddam probatur.

^k Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 1. p. 30. Ecclesie nomine intelligimus eius caput Rom. Pontificem. Bannes. 2. 3. q. 1. ar. 10. An inaduertendum est eum Caetanum, &c. quod apud D. Thomam pro eodem omnino reputatur authoritas Ecclesie vniuersalis, & authoritas Concilij, & authoritas summi Pontificis. Gress. def. Bellar. de verb. Dei. l. 3. c. 10. pag. 2450. Canus loc. l. 6. c. 8. in principio.

^l Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. Bellar. de eccles. l. 3. c. 5. Est summum caput quoad influxum exteriorum doctrinæ fidei & sacramentorum. Gratian. d. 19. c. Ita Dominus. Azor. instit. mor. p. 2. l. 5. c. 15. DEFINITIO FIDEI RESOLVITUR IN AUTHORITYATEM PAPAE. Bellar. de Pontif. l. 4. c. 3. & Recog. de Pontif. p. 19. Tho. Aqu. 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. Viguer. instit. Theol. diuina. d. l. c. 10. ver. 13. Gabr. 3. d. 25. q. vnic. dub. 3. Gress. de potest. eccles. l. 2. c. 11. Hic solus Symbolum condere. Refert ex alijs. Bannes. 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. p. 44. (pro eodem accepit) edere symbolum & ordinare. Arboreus Theoph. l. 5. c. 10. Ioh. Arbor. Theoph. l. 5. c. 10. Abbas dicit, Papam posse nouum fidei articulum condere. Stapl. Rel. c. 5. q. 1. ar. 2. Caetan. 2. 3. q. 1. ar. 10. Bannes. Pefantius, Gr. Val. & alij. ib. Azor. instit. mor. p. 2. l. 5. c. 4. Pius 4. bul. iuram. de profess. fidei, Inuicem nobis. Azor. instit. mor. p. 2. l. 7. c. 2. Onuphr. vita Pij 4. This Creed is rehearsed in the Preface of Bishop Iuels works. Edition last. Bosius de sig. l. 3. c. 4. Nihil reuera credi ab ecclesia quod non sit implicite saltem in Scripturis sacris: quæ iubent vt traditiones etiam teneamus.

For example, whatsoeuer the Catholike Church, that is, the Pope and Council definitiue affirme, is true; but the Pope and Prelats in the second Synod of Nice¹, and of Constance^m, &c. definitiue decreed, that the worship of Images and the Lords Supper in one kinde, were the faith of the Scripture and the Primitive Church. The Church therefore in decreeing these Articles, and pronouncing Anathema to such as should refuse them, did make no new Articles or Creed, but onely by way of explication and extraction, deriued the same from Scripture and Antiquitie; like as if one should forme darknesse out of light.

Thirdly, our learned Aduersaries teachⁿ, that the holy Ghost reuealeth sundry things more than those which be contained in the written or traditionarie word, to the Pope and Romane Church. I intreat this clamorous Popish Priest to giue a reason, why the Pope may not out of these reuelations frame and compose a new Creed? And as famous Doctors^o among the Papiſts, as euer their Church had any, haue not long since maintained, that the Popes decretall Epistles are of equall authoritie with Canonickall Scripture: and what shall hinder but that a new Creed may be composed of the matter of such Decretals, as well as to be extracted from the Scripture and ancient Creeds?

¹ Concil. Nice. 1. God created man after his own Image &c. as we haue heard, so we haue seen. From these Texts, and other as follows, THE NICENE DADS, by way of explication, deriue the veneration of Images.

^m Conc. Const. sess. 13. can. 4. Although Iesus Christ at his last Supper did ordaine and minister to his Disciples this venerable Sacrament under both kinds, &c. and although in the Primitive Church, yet we decree, that it shall be received by Lay people

in one kinde onely. Sur. to. 3. Concil. Iouen. epit. Concil. Licet in primitiua ecclesia. Arbor. Theosoph. l. 5. c. 11. Per verbum Dei non solum debemus intelligere quod in Euangelio conscriptum est, sed & id omne quod postea suggerente Spiritu sancto, ab Apostolis & Patribus orthodoxis traditum est. Stapl. promptuar. Cath. p. 1. Dom. Pentecost. Christus in spiritu nos hodie docet, sicut olim Apostolos, &c. Lindam. Panopl. l. 3. c. 2. Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 1. ad. 4. Spiritus sanctus suggerit docendo Ecclesiam sensum doctrinae Christi & verborum eius, DOCT AVTEM ET IPSA MVLTIS PLVRA. Nec omnes partes docendi implevit Christus, sed adhuc docet in Ecclesia Spiritus sanctus: nec a solo Dei verbo, sed a voce loquentis Ecclesiae pendet fides. Bot. de sig. l. 16. c. 10. Spiritus in mente Ecclesiae insculpsit quicquid in codicibus est relatum, ac multo plura. Gratian. d. 19. c. in Canonice. Turres. sum. de eccl. p. 2. c. 9. Caietan. de primat. c. 14. Concil. Basil. resp. synodal. de Author. Concil. general. pa. 143. & 145. Surius.

Paragr. 8. Doctor Stapleton about the Popes authoritie.

T. W. Master White chargeth Doctor Stapleton^{*} with saying; That the foundation of our Religion is placed vpon the authoritie of the Popes teaching, &c. But Stapleton hath no such saying, &c. And it is meere-ly forged by our calumnious Minister, thereby to suggest that wee make the Pope the foundation of our faith, which we ascribe to Christ Iesus onely, and that we beare the ignorant in hand, the Pope, to be another God, &c. Doctor Stapleton onely meaneth, that the Pope is a secondarie foundation in regard of doctrine, not essentiall and primitive.

^{*} Stapl. Praef. ad princip. doctrinal.

Ans^w. 1. I finde not in the 68. page, whither you referre vs, this testimonie of Dr. Stapleton alleged by my Brother. But touching the matter in substance, both Stapleton and all other Pontificians doe at this present make the Pope the foundation of the Church, expounding our Sauours words, Matth. 16. Vpon this Rocke, that is, vpon the person of Peter, and his Successor the Pope, I will build my Church^a: and whoſoeuer is the foundation of the Church, is the foundation of Religion. Ecclesiasticall authoritie (the prime subiect whereof is the Pope) is the basis and foundation of all Orthodox Religion, saith Stapleton in his Preface to his doctrinall principles. And Cardinall Bellarmine^b applies the words of Isai, Chap. 28. Behold I lay in Sion for a foundation, &c. to the Pope.

^a Stapl. Rel. c. 3. q. 1. ar. 1. concl. 3. Personam Petri intelligit. Et prompe, Cath. in fest. Petri & Pauli. Iansen. harm. Euang. c. 68. Maldon. com. Mat. 16. Victoria Relect. 2. de potest. eccles. sect. 2. Caietan. Bellar. Suarez, Greg. Val.

Obiect. Master White endeouoreth to make the world beleue, that Dr. Stapleton and his Colleagues make the Pope a Primitive and essentiall foundation.

Bannes, Azor. Gretser, &c. Canus loc. l. 6. c. 8. in principio. ^b Bellar. de Pontif. Rom. in Praef. Stapl. doctrin. princip. epist. dedic. Petri & fundamento ecclesiae. Ibid. epist. dedic. Hac auctoritas qua omnis fides nititur. Sur. cont. sect. Angl. l. 1. c. 10. & 11. & l. 3. c. 10.

Ans^w. 1.

* Stapl. promp.
Cath. par. 1. in f. ft.
apost. Petri &
Pauli. Primarium
& fundamentale
quoddam in suo
genere, quale
Christus est in alio
genere, &c. Ca-
pat & fundam. ec-
clesie ministeriale,
mediante Christo
& per participati-
onem. pag. 137.
Stapl. Rel. c. 3. q. 1.
ar. 1. pa. 304.

* Bellar. de Pon-
tif. Praefat.

* Bellar. de eccle-
sia, l. 3. c. 5. Gra-
tiau. d. 19. c. Ita
Dominus. Stapl.
doctr. princip. l. 6.
cap. 1.

* Bos. de fig. l. 16.
c. 1. Idem ambo-
bus regnum, &c.
faciens iustitiam,
vna cum Christo,
&c.

* Dominici. Iac.
de Concil. pag. 63.
edit. Rom. 1538.
Dicitur corporalis
in orbe Deus.

* Blond. l. 3. in-
staurat. Rem. om-
nes Principes or-
bis terrarum, Pon-
tificem vt Deum
summum hono-
rant & colunt.

* De Donat. Conf.
pa. 141.

* Auerin. annal.
Boior. l. 7.

* Extra. Ioh. 33.

* Cum inter,

* Gerson. post

tract. de vnic. ec-
cles. addit. 4. n. 4.

* Cassand. de offic.
boni viri. Pontifi-
cem Romanum,

quem Papam di-
cimus, tantum

non Deum faci-
mus eiusque autho-

ritatem, non modo super ecclesiam, sed supra ipsam Scripturam diuinam efferunt, &c.

* Paul. Emil. de gest. Franc. l. 7. Fazell. hist. Sicil. l. 8. c. 4. * Fazell. ib. Bartholomaeus, Patensis episcop. Siculorum, &c. * Baron. annal. to. 11. * Aeneas Sylu. de gest. Concil. Basil. l. 1. Panormitanus Archiepisc. Papam ecclesie Dominum asserua-
uit. * Iren. l. 3. c. 12. Similes Aesopi cani, qui panem quidem relinquunt, in vmbram autem eius imperum fecit.

Ans. 1. Stapleton calleth the Pope, *Primarium fundamentum*, a *primarie* or *principall foundation*: And Bellarmine teacheth^d, *That the whole frame of the visible Church doth so leane upon him, that if he be taken away, the same falleth*: and he is *summum caput*, the supreme head of the Militant Church, in regard of influence of the doctrine of Faith and Sacraments.

Bosius saith^f, *He hath the same Kingdome with Christ, and sitteth for ever in the visible Church upon the Throne of Dauid*. And hee is as truly a visible King and Monarch of the Church, as Christ is inuisible.

Secondly, whereas the Papist quarrelleth Doctor White, for charging his sect with making the Pope another God; we obiekt no more than we finde in their owne writings.

Cardinall Iacobasius^g saith, *The Pope is termed a corporall God in the world*. Blondus^h, *All the Princes of the earth honour and worship the Pope as a great God*. Streuchusⁱ, *Great Constantine yielded him diuine honour*. Auentine^k, *Romane Popes affect domination and diuinitie, and to be feared more than God*. The gloss of the Canon law^l, calleth the Pope *our Lord God*: and Gerson^m, *In imitation of Lucifer they will be adored and worshipped as Gods, neither doe they thinke themselves subiect to any, but are as the sonnes of Belial, which haue cast off the yoke, not enduring, whatsoever they doe, that any should aske them why they doe so*.

An Archbishopⁿ preaching on a time to the Pope, said; *All power is giuen you both in heauen and in earth*. The Ambassadors of Panormum^o in Sicilie, kneeling before Pope Martin, cry vnto him three times together, *Thou which takest away the sinnes of the world, haue mercy vpon vs*. And a certaine Bishop of the same Country, supplicates to Pope Nicholas the third, in these termes; *Miserere mei fili Dauid*^p; *Oh sonne of Dauid haue mercie on me*.

And Cardinall Baronius^r reporteth, that Pope Hildebrand being a Carpenters sonne, and playing when he was a childe in the place where his Father wrought, he did by chance frame of the chips and parings of wood which fell from his fathers worke, the characters and letters, by which coupled together, was expressed the saying of Dauid, Psal. 72. *Hee shall beare rule from Sea to Sea, and from the riuer vnto the ends of the earth*.

I see no cause then why this Popish Priest should take it in snuffe, to haue his Doctors charged with making the Pope a demy-God, or primitiue foundation^s, &c. Or why in his conclusion he should vent vnciuill speeches, saying: Thus the further we dog M. White in his Allegations, &c. seeing himselfe like Aesops dogge^q, catcheth onely at shadows, and in his barking makes no difference betweene a true man and a theefe, 2. Sam. 16. 9.

Paragr. 9. Saint Cyprian, concerning Appeales.

* Linda. Panopl.
l. 4. c. 89. Quo Ro-
mani Pontificis
prae alijs ecclesia-
rum episcopis,
principatus eluce-
at, ex ipsa episco-
porum omnium ad
ipsum appellatio-
ne, &c. Bellar. de
Pontif. l. 2. c. 31. Siluest. sum. verb. Apellatio, & alij summi & v. Apellatio. f. Turretrem. sum. de ecclef. l. 3. c. 47. & 48. & 49. Iaco-
bat. de concil. l. 10. ar. 1. * Bishop Iouis challenge, ar. 4. pag. 179.

Pontificians labour to credit the Popes supremacie by Appeales^t, saying; *That he as supreme Ecclesiasticall Iudge ouer the whole world, had authoritie in the Primitive Church, to entertaine and call before him the suites and controneries of all other Churches, and to beare and determine the same in his consistorie as the high-est tribunall, from which there lay no appeale, no not to the generall Conncell*^u.

The Protestants disproue this assertion and claime^v by sundry testimonies;

among

among the which one is taken out of Cyprian, which the Popish Priest quarrelleth in this Section.

T. W. First, Cyprian condemned the Nouatian Heretikes, because of the circumstance and manner of their fact, and not for the thing it selfe, to wit, because they sayled to Rome with merchandize of lies, and endeoured to breake the vnitie of the Church; and because they appealed without iust cause, and after conuiction.

Ans. Cyprian¹ both condemneth the accidents and manner, and also the very act of appeale in it selfe, for thus he writeth; *It is iust that each mans fault be heard and sjudged where the same is committed, and where the accusers and witnesses be present.* This speech condemnes appeales to forreine places, in what fashion soeuer. Then he affirmeth, *That euery Bishop within his owne iurisdiction, hath a certaine portion of the Lords flocke, committed vnto his proper care and iudgement, whereof he must yeeld account to God.* Hence it followeth, that the Romane Bishop hath nothing to doe with other mens flockes, and that he cannot be a Iudge of their causes, for whose well or euill doing hee is to render no account. Reade another testimony of Cyprian, placed in the margin².

But this notwithstanding, the Popish Priest vrgeth two things out of Cyprian, materiall, as he pretendeth, both to confirme the matter of appeales, and also the supremacy of the Pope.

T. W. If those Heretikes censured by the Bishops of Africa appealed to Rome, that so they might euade their present punishment, this argueth, that appeales were then in vse.

Ans. Preposterous dealing of Heretikes is no Argument to proue a right. For in the like manner Nestorius³ at the Ephesine Councell, appealed to the Emperor, and to another Councell, yet there was no right for such appeales.

T. W. Cyprian calleth Rome the Chaire of Peter, and principall Church, from whence priestly vnitie ariseth: And saith, the Romanes were they vnto whom vntuth could haue no access.

Ans. First, The Chaire of Peter⁴ had no greater iurisdiction than the other Apostles, as Cyprian himselfe affirmeth⁵, saying; *The rest of the Apostles were the same with Peter, endued with equall fellowship of honor and power.* Secondly, Rome is called Peters Chaire, because it was in those daies doctrine salutis cathedra, the seat of wholesome faith and doctrine⁶, receiued from Peter and other Apostles. But this prerogatiue was common to other Churches.

Neither doth the name of Principall Church argue Monarchy and Papall Supremacy: for principall is spoken of many things, which are equall and of the same kinde⁷: the heart and head are principall members of the body: Tygris and Euphrates are principall riuers; Iames, Cephas, and Iohn, are chiefe or principall Apostles, 2 Cor. 11. 5. And a Church may be called principall for sundry reasons, whereof Popish Supremacy is none. The Romane was a principall Church, in regard it was planted or watered by Paul and Peter⁸, principall Apostles: in respect of worthy Bishops and Pastors, who liued in the same vntill Cyprians age: in regard of many eminent spirituall graces abounding in it: and lastly, because of the celebrie of the Citie where it was, being the seat of the Empire.

And prietly vnity arose from the Romane Church, neither onely, nor as from a Monarch ouer other Churches; but first by way of example, in that it was a president of vnity to others: secondly, by meanes of doctrine and exhortation, whereby it perswaded neighbour and fellow Churches to vnitie. Lastly, where, as Cyprian affirmeth, that vntuth or perfidionnesse can haue no access to the Ro-

manes:

¹ Cyprian. ep. 55.
 l. r. epist. 3. Vide
 Greg. m. epist. 1.
 11. ep. 56 cum no-
 uel. Iustinian. 123
 Si quis, &c.

² Cyprian. orat. ad
 Concil. Carthag.
 de heret. baptis-
 mo. Neque quisquam
 nostrum episcopum
 esse episcopum
 constituit, aut ty-
 rannico terrore ad
 obsequium neces-
 sitatem, collegas
 suos adigit, quan-
 do habeat omnis
 Episcopus pro li-
 centia libertatis &
 potestatis suae ar-
 bitrium proprium,
 tanquam iudicari
 ab alio non possit,
 quam nec ipse al-
 terum iudicare.
 Sed expectemus
 vniuersi iudicium
 Domini nostri Iesu
 Christi, qui so-
 lus & vnus habet
 potestatem, &
 proponendi nos
 in ecclesiae suae gu-
 bernatione, & de
 actu nostro iudi-
 candi.

³ Concil. Ephesin.
 1. edit. Peltan. to.
 3. ca. 20. & Ap-
 pend. 2. ca. 2. & 4.
 & 11.

⁴ Tertul. de pte-
 script. c. 36. Per-
 cure ecclesias A-
 postolicas, apud
 quas ipse adhuc
 cathedra aposto-
 lorum, suis locis
 praesidentur, &c.

⁵ Cyprian de vnit.
 eccles. Zabarel. de
 schism. pag. 561.

⁶ Petrus non sic
 administravit, vt
 occuparet aliorum
 potestatem: immo
 tanquam vnus ex
 Apostolis accepit
 partem admini-
 strationis.

⁷ Aug. ep. 116.
 Chrys. sup. Ioh.
 tr. 85. Cathedra
 Christi, eius enim
 doctrinam acceper-
 unt Aug. sup. Pla.
 1. Cathedra pesti-
 lentiae, pernicio-
 sa doctrina.

⁸ Luitus lib. 4. de
 bel. Maced. Duae
 legiones, duabus
 principalibus por-
 tis, signa effere
 iussit.

⁹ Iren. l. 1. c. 7.
 Epiphani. haer. 27.

^a Sande. de viſib. mona. l. 7. p. 58. Hoſ. confeſſ. Pet. troc. c. 28. Greg. Martin. pref. diſſer. v. Ioh. Diedo de eccl. dog. l. 4. c. 3. p. 1. pa. 234. ^b Bellar. de Pont. l. 4. c. 7. & l. 4. c. 3. ^c Eneas Silu. in epi. de mor. Germ. Turrecremat. Tor. menſis, & alij.

MANES: (which words ſome Papiſts^a haue produced in prooſe, that the Romane Church cannot erre.

I anſwer, 1. That he ſpeaketh of vntruth in matter of fact, and not of faith: and therefore the place is impertinent, becauſe our Aduerſaries^b confeſſe, the Romane Church may therein erre. Secondly, Cyprians words are not aſſertive and poſitiue, ſimply importing, that vntruth could haue no acceſſe to the Romanes: for then why doth he ſo carefully premoniſh and informe them, that they might not erre? but he vttereth a charitable opinion he had of them, and rehearſeth their praiſes, thereby exciting them to perſorme their dutie, and to ſatiſſie the good conceit which he and others had of them: but the world is changed with the Romans ſince thoſe daies, as it is with many other Churches.

T. W. *When Maſter White ſheweth me in this Epistle of Cyprian, theſe words objected: The vntie of Biſhops is broken, when men runne from their owne Biſhops to the Biſhop of Rome; I will publiſely declaime him, The cunningeſt Optician, or rather Magician, that the whole miniſterie of England affordeth.*

Anſw. It is ſaid of ſome, that they cannot ſee wood for trees; and the holy Ghoſt affirmeth of others, that they haue eies and ſee not, Iſai. 6. 10. Ioh. 9. 39. 2 Theſſ. 2. 10^c. The thing and matter from whence theſe words are infered, is found in Cyprian; and therefore the ſhewing thereof in bare letters^d is not materiall. And touching your liuerie of *Optician, Magician, &c.* ſurely vnleſſe you bee of the *kindred of that Cat*, whereof your Antonine ſpeaketh in his *Storie*^e, I ſee no reaſon why you ſhould not paſſe from one matter to another, without leauing a ſtinke behinde you. But howſoeuer, peruſing your *Stories* of the Roman Clergie, we obſerue ſundry Popes, Priests, and Monkes, to haue beene notorious Magicians^f: but to finde one ſuch in the Engliſh miniſtery, I thinke it will not be eaſie for you, though your education be in a *nurſerſe of tales*^g, and your ſelfe haue Cats or Lamia her eies.

^a Aug. de nat. & grat. c. 12. Prau- ricatorum legis diu. lux deſerit ve- ritatis, qua deſer- tus vniue ſit ex- cus.

^d Aug. de gen. ad lit. l. 4. c. 5. Dum res cognoſcitur, non eſſe de voca- bulis hic gandum.

^e Antonin. ſum. hiſt. tit. 23. c. 3.

^f Videtur m. l. eres catum, qui habebat groſſos oculos & flamman- tes: Non comparuit, ſed poſt ſe relinquit veſtigia. ^g Sylueſt. 2. chron. Mart. Polani. Planas, & alij Hildebrand. ſeu Benno Gard. Antonin. hiſt. p. 2. tit. 16. c. 7. §. 4. Palumbus, &c. erat Nigroman- ticus & in maleficijs potens. Will. Malme. bur. de geſt. Reg. Anglor. Palumbus, ſuburbanus Presbyter, erat in Necromanticis artibus in- ſtruitus, &c. Magici figurat excitare, demones territare, & ad quodlibet officium impellere. ^h Papiſt. Maſſon. de epiſc. Vrb. in Ioh. 21. Nihil cupidius audiebat quam rumores, &c. Tacit. vit. Agrip.

Paragr. 10. *Maſter White challenged for abuſing the Rhemiſts, concerning the authoritie of the Church.*

T. W. *Our fraudulent Doctōr labourerh much to induce his credulous Readers to beleene, that we hold, that the Church can at her pleaſure make that Scripture which is not, and vnmake that which once is Scripture.*

Anſw. You are a traveller, and coming out of the Ile of Candie, Tit. 2. 12. cannot proceed in your intended voyage of defacing your Aduerſarie, vnleſſe falſhood be your foundation.

^a Digneſ. 13.

Doctōr White labourerh neither much nor little, to induce his Reader to be- lieue that you teach, the Church can at her pleaſure make or vnmake Scriptures: but his words are *5*; *The Papiſts haue a principle among them, that the Scriptures receiue all their authoritie from the Church, meaning thereby, they are not knowne to be true, neither are Chriſtians bound to receiue them without the attestation of the Church.*

At this you quarrell, ſaying:

T. W. *He curtailerh their ſentence, concealing ſuch their words as doe limit the Churches authoritie therein. And wherein they doe acknowledge an infallible truth of the Scripture, before any approbation of the Church.*

Anſw.

Ans. The question was onely concerning the externall authoritie of the Scriptures, and not about their intrinsecall veritie, and therefore my Brother was to produce so much as concerned this question, and not the rest, being impertinent vnto the matter in hand.

T. W. *The Rhemists onely say, that the truth of the Scriptures cannot be made knowne vnto vs, without the attestation of the Church, and this is all which Master White can collect from this testimonie, which we willingly grant.*

Ans. You doe not onely teach that the Scriptures must be made knowne vnto vs, by the attestation of the Church, (which being rightly expounded wee freely acknowledge:) but you affirme^b, that people are not bound either at the first^a to receiue them as diuine, or afterwards to reuerence and beleue them as the word of God, but for the attestation of the Church.

The Prophets themselves (saith Stapletonⁱ) being now taken away, we are not to beleue their prophecies left vnto vs in writing to be of God, vnlesse the Church doe confirme it.

Where first of all by the Church, you vnderstand the present Roman church^k.

Secondly, by attestation of the Church, you meane that the same, as an immediate diuine witnesse^l, by it owne testimony, without any prooffe taken from the Scriptures themselves or primitive Church, imparteth and conferreth externall authoritie to the Scripture, and makes the same Canonically in respect of men.

For example: euen as the two Gospels of Marke and Luke, although they were endited by diuine inspiration, and thereupon in themselves were alwaies diuine, in actu primo, 2 Tim. 3. 16. yet they became not Canonically, and of sacred authoritie, in actu secundo, vntill the Apostles had approved and giuen testimonie vnto them^m: The same kinde of authorisingⁿ and attestation concerning all the Scriptures, doe the Papists giue to their present Pope and Roman Church.

And yet further than this, you also hold that the Church, to wit, the Roman Pope, affirming and teaching that God is one in essence, and three in person, and that Christ is God and man, or any other Article of faith, is simply to be beleued, for himselfe, and not because he demonstrates these Articles from the holy Scripture^o.

And euen as the faithfull in the daies of the Apostles, beleued the doctrine they preached and wrote, for their owne authoritie meere, and as they were the witnesses of Christ; euen so God hath made the Pope an authentically witnesse of diuine truth^p, whom all persons must beleue, because of his owne word. And euen as the Romanes and other Churches beleued Paul, teaching them, that Christ maketh intercession at the right hand of God, and whatsoever is not of faith is sinne, &c. although he produced no former Scripture to confirme the same: euen so the faithfull in our daies, must with the same assurance of faith, beleue the Pope and Trent Councell, teaching Purgatorie, Transubstantiation, Adoration of Images, or any other such like doctrine. And thus your Churches attestation in pretext of words, importeth no danger; but in realitie, is like a Snake in a faire meadow, and as insensible poison in a potion, a most pernicious doctrine: the summe whereof is; that with the same assurance of faith, one beleueth the Creation of the world, and Resurrection of the dead, because of the authoritie of the Scriptures; euen with like assurance for the testimonie of the Pope, and second Nicene Councell, he is to beleue the Adoration of Images, or any other matter the Pope shall define, if it be neuer so absurd and wicked.

ecclesie Dei absolute & simpliciter non sub conditione credimus. Stapl. prompt. Cath. p. 2. in die Ascensionis, pag. 60. & p. 1. Domp. 6. post Pascha. p. Tom. 4. Concil. Surij. Papæ authoritas Petro non minor. Horant. loc. Cathol. l. 2. c. 7. Talis est persuasio ecclesiæ quæ rationes non requirit, &c.

^b Bellar. de Sacram. l. 2. c. 25. Tota fides Christiana, & omnium dogmatum firmitas, pendet ab auctoritate præsentis ecclesiæ.

^a Espenc. com.

ⁱ Tim. 3. Gremium maternum prima fuit schola sacrarum literarum.

^l Stapl. def. Eccl. auth. cont. Whittaker. l. 1. c. 14. S. 12.

^k Bellar. de Sacram. l. 2. c. 25.

^l Gret. def. Bellar. de verb. Dei, tract. de agnosc. Script. Can. Testificatio ecclesiæ est immediate à Christo. Stapl. dupl. l. 1. c. 9. S. 13. Deus per ecclesiæ loquens, non aliter loquitur quam si immediate per visiones, aut somnia, aut quous alio supernaturali modo nobis loqueretur.

^m Stapl. prompt.

ⁿ Cath. p. 2. in die Ascens. Princip. doctrin. l. 8. c. 8. & 10.

^o Euseb. hist. l. 2. c. 15. Hieron. catal. script. in Mar. co.

^p Stapl. def. auth. ecclesiæ. contra Whittaker. l. 1. c. 4. Apostolorum successores, eandem testificandi potestatem habere, Scriptura docet. Gret. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei, l. 3. c. 2. Quemadmodum si quis viuente Paulo, &c.

^q Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 1. or. 1. Neque ecclesiæ propter verbum Dei creditur, &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

diur. &c. Ibid. Be-

Paragr. 11. Touching the Cardinall Cusanus.

¶ Cusan. epist. 2.
& 3. & 7.

T. W. Doctor White in his thirteenth Digression, alleageth Cardinall Cusanus, affirming^a, that the sense of the Scripture is changeable, admitting diuers and contrary expositions, according to the Churches iudgement.

But the Cardinall speaketh not this concerning principall and fundamentall points of Religion, but onely of such materials and actions, as according to the different commandement of God and the Church, are at sometimes good and meritorious, (as Abraham to slay his sonne:) and sometimes wicked and demeritorious, (as when the King of Edom did sacrifice his sonne, 2 Kings 3. 27.) and the Popish Priest maketh instance in wedlocke, and generation of children in the prime ages of the world, and chastity and single life in the latter ages thereof: And so his meaning is, that the Church at diuers times, deliuereth contrary expositions of holy Scripture in those places onely, wherein the matter it selfe is variable.

¶ Cusan. epist. 2. ad Bohem. de visu cō. Dices fortasse, ecclesia hodierna non ambulat in ritu communionis, sicut ante, &c. Certe hoc te non moueat, quod diuersis temporibus, alius, & alius ritus sacrificiorum & etiam sacramentorum, stante veritate inuenitur, Scripturasque esse ad tempus adaptatas & varie intellectas, ita ut vno tempore, secundum currentem vniuersalem ritum exponerentur, mutato ritu iterum sententia mutaretur, p. 833. etiam si hodie alia fuerit interpretatio ecclesie, eiusdem precepti Evangelici, quam aliquando; tamen hic sensus nunc in usu currentis, ad regimen ecclesie, inspiratus, uti temporis congruus, ut salutis via debet acceptari, sicut de baptismo forma Apostolorum tempore, ubi in Christi nomine, & alio sequenti, ubi in Trinitatis nomine, &c. ¶ Christum occultam inspirationem, quæ singulis temporibus congruit, &c. suggerit. Dicitis forsitan, precepta Christi quomodo mutabuntur auctoritate ecclesie, ut si tunc obligatoria quando ecclesie placuerit? Dico nulla esse Christi precepta, quam per ecclesiam protalisibus acceptata, &c. Et non est hæc mutatio, tanquam à maiori auctoritate, quam Christi præcipiens dependens, quoniam ecclesia quæ est corpus Christi, & eius Spiritu vegetatur, non aliud agit quam Christus vult. ¶ Scripturam siue præceptum, siue consilium continet. Scripturam in verbis præceptis &c. Ep. 2. pag. 835 Iudicamus per præcepta aliquando data, non aliud præcipere velle, quam quod ecclesia, iuxta temporis conditiones, rationabile iudicauerit verbo vel opere. ¶ Et an si hodie alia fuerit interpretatio ecclesie, eiusdem præcepti Evangelici quam aliquando; tamen hic sensus nunc in usu, ad regimen ecclesie inspiratus, uti temporis congruus, debet acceptari. ¶ Potestas non minor in ecclesia quam in Christo. Epist. 7. Nec mirum si praxis ecclesie vno tempore interpretatur Scripturam vno modo, & alio tempore alio modo: intellectus enim currit cum praxi. Intellectus enim qui cum praxi concurrens, est spiritus viuificans.

Ans. Cusanus his words and meaning are more euident, than that they can be smoothed with this glosse, any more than a pot-sheard covered ouer with silver-drosse, be changed into good plate.

First, the occasion of his speech is, to confute the Bohemians^a, who held that the Eucharist was to bee ministred in both kindes, because Christ our Lord administred in this manner, and commanded, saying; Drink ye allos of this. Cusanus answereth, It is a foolish Argument to reason from the example of Christ and the Primitive Church, for the Scriptures are fitted to the time, and diuersly understood; so that one time according to the current rite (of the Church) they are expounded one way, and when that rite of the Church changeth, then their sense is changed. As if hee should say, It was the sense of the Scripture, that people should communicate in both kindes, so long as the Church vied to doe so: but now that the Church which is directed by the infallible inspiration of God^c, hath changed this manner of communion from both kindes to one, the meaning of the Scripture is changed, and people must follow the practise and commandement of the Church, and thinke the same to be the meaning of the Scripture.

Secondly, the Cardinall giueth instance^d, not in things mutable by circumstance, but hee nameth the precepts and counsels of the Gospell, the rites of Sacrifices and Sacraments, the degrees of Wedlocke, &c.

Thirdly, in these and the like matters hee giues the Church authority, to exchange the manner of Christs doing, and to expound his precepts in other sense than the Primitive Church did^e.

Fourthly, hee rendereth these reasons of his assertions: 1. The Church is diuinely inspired, and Christ concurreth with the same in all her precepts and expositions. 2. There is no lesse power in the Church than in Christ^f. 3. The Church is superior, and ouer the letter of the Scripture. 4. The right vnderstanding of Scripture goeth with the practise^f.

And

And many other great Papists in substance of doctrine affirme the same. The Iesuites of Colen said ^g; *The Scriptures are a nose of wax.* And Pighius ^h, *They are a leaden rule and nose of wax.* And Mulhusinus a Moderne Iesuite ⁱ; *The Scriptures for the more part are hard, obscure, and ambiguous, like a nose of Wax and Lesbian rule, which may by wicked persons be drawne this way or that way.* And how reuerently the Iesuites esteeme of the Scriptures, let Gretfars speech testifie ^k, saying ^l; *Doe you thinke there would haue beene more Heresies and Sects, if there had beene no Scripture at all? Sure I rather thinke there would haue beene fewer.* And when Bellarmine and Gretfars say ^l; *That a man is not to beleene the Scriptures to be diuine, because the Scripture it selfe saith so, more than one is to beleene the Alchoran to be of God, because in sundry places thereof we reade, that it was sent from heauen by God:* Can wee bee perswaded, that these men in their hearts giue any reuerence to the Scripture? Surely Balaam the false Prophet beleued God, when he spake to him by his Asse, Num. 22. 27. 34. And shall not Christians beleue him when hee speaketh by the Scripture ^m? And hath God set impressions of his Maiesty and truth in all his creatures, so that not only the heauens shew forth his handy works, Psal. 19. 1. but the very Ant manifests his diuine power? Pro. 6. 6. ⁿ And is there nothing in the sacred Scripture being the liuely word of God, Hebr. 4. 12. and the immediate worke of the holy Ghost, 2 Tim. 3. 16. wherein a Christian man liuing out of the Romane Bee-hiue, can know or discerne the same to be of God, and by often reading and meditation thereof, espy more verity and diuine force in it, than in the Turkish Alchoran?

The Papist in the conclusion of this Paragraph, speaketh of a ring, &c. but I suppose that the names of all godly persons which will euer beleue this doctrine of Bellarmine and Cusanus, may bee stamped in a lesse compasse than a ring: and the spur-blinde Disciples of the Seminary Doctors, which despising the cleare light of truth, embracethis buzzardly stuffe, deserue more iustly to wander in the circle and labyrinth of their owne folly, 2 Thess. 2. 10. than Ethelbert ^o and eightene persons besides, who (as William Malmesbury the Monke reporteth) danced by the space of a whole yeere, not ceasing night or day, because they had disquieted one Sir Robert a Priest, while he was saying Masse in the honour of Saint Magnes.

Paragr. 12. Concerning the glosse of the Canon law, Dist. 40. Cap. Non Nos: about the Popes deeds.

In the beginning of this Section the Popish Priest taxeth Master White for implacable hatred against the Romane Church and Pope: but the matter which indeed offendeth him, is the discouery of the enormous wickednesse of his holly-seeming Father, made by Master White out of the Records and Stories of Papists.

And concerning this matter, let these things following be considered.

First, the crimes and enormous deeds, objected by Protestants against the Popes and other Romists, are found in the publike Stories and Monuments of our Aduersaries themselves ^{*}: whereas on the contrary they distaine the worthiest and most eminent persons of our State and Church, with horrible blasphemies and loud lies, testified by no credible author or witness, but forged and suggested by themselves ^p.

¹¹⁵ Lecta est in tribunali Londinensi scedula per quendam verbi ministrum, iudici regio, sed per errorem porrecta, &c. in qua quidam mulieri narrabat, quam ardentem in illam, dum concionaretur exarserit, quam libenter oculos ad eius formam adiecerit, quam illa venusta & altera Helena visa fuerit, & id genus amores suos, tali persona, loco, & spiritu dignos, multis verbis predicabat acque ad libidinem provocabat, &c.

^g Iesuit. Colon. con. Monhem.

^h High. contouer. Ransb. loc. 3. & Hierarch. l. 1. c. 2. Canil. op. catech. pag. 44. Censur. Colon. pag. 117.

ⁱ Mulhusin. de fide, disp. 2. pag. 21. Colloq. Vornat. Lindan. Panopl. praef. e. ad Iesior. Que ob facili- m ipsius in varias sententiarum formas flexum, recte nato fuit assimila- ta cerebro.

^k Gretf. def. Bell. de verbo Dei, l. 4. cap. 4.

^l Bellar. de verbo Dei, l. 4. c. 4. Et- am si Scriptura di- cat, libros Pro- phetarum & Apo- stolorum esse diui- nos, tamen non certo credaro, nisi prius credidero, Scripturam quae hoc dicit esse di- uinam. Nam in Alchorano Mahu- meti passim legi- mus, ipsum Alcho- ranum de celo à Deo missum, & ta- men non ei credi- mus. Gretf. ibid. def. l. 4. c. 4.

^m Aug. ep. 3. Ad cor loquitur indo- ctorum atque do- ctorum. 1 Cor. 9. 3. Galat. 4. 30. 1 Tim. 5. 28.

ⁿ Basil. ep. 168.

Ambro. Hexam. l. 6. c. 4. Aug. de

gen. ad lit. l. 3. c. 2.

^o Plin. l. 11. c. 30.

^p Guill. Malmesb. de gest. reg. Angl. l. 1. Ego Ethelber- tus peccator, &c.

^{*} Papir. Masson. de episc. Verb. l. 6. in Paul. 3. Quod si Pontifices nolunt turpia aut nefaria de se narrari, nihil eiusmodi faciant: aut cum secrete, non putent ea ipse iri latere, ut & scri- ri, & posteris nar- rari nequeant.

^p Sander. de schif. Britan. Parloas Philopater. Bosius de sig. eccles. l. 9. c. 3. & l. 12. c. 3. & c. 20. Stapl. promp. Cath. in test. Si- mon. & Iud. pag.

¶ *Lingua abusus
futili, inuitus au-
dit, qui volens di-
xit male. Plut. l. de
cap. ex hist. vit. ex
Sophocle.*

Secondly, the Papists themselves giue occasion why wee publish the vicious abominations of their holy Fathers, whilst partly by intolerable vendication of sanctity, they endeavour to make the ignorant beleue, that their thornes and chistles bring forth figs and grapes; and partly by calumnious reports, and the aggravating of personall actions in some of our Religion, to the iniury and abuse of the whole Church, they extort from vs a true report of their Churches wickednesse: *And speaking what they lust, they doe according to the law of like, heare what they lust not.*

T. W. I charge you Master White with much foule demeanour: first, because you cite that which is taken out of the glosse of Gratian, as if it were the Canon law, the same being of incomparable lesse authority: secondly, because that which is spoken of the Pope when the fact is doubtfull, in which case the glosse requires no more in the behalfe of the Pope, than which enery Christian in charity is to performe to a common person, namely, to abstaine temerarious censure, and to interpret doubtfull actions in the better part; you apply to actions wherein both the fact and the right are manifest.

¶ *Possuin. Appar.
v. Glos. iuris Ca-
non.*

¶ *Iac. Graph. de-
cis. aur. and other
Casuists commonly
resolue their decisi-
ons into the Glosse.
Gabr. 4. d. 16. q. 3.
not. 6.*

¶ *Bellar. Recog.
de Pontif. pa. 23.
saith the Glosse of
the decretals for his
famous distinction
of direct and indi-
rect, in the queston
of the iurys tempo-
ral iurisdiction.*

¶ *Scot. 4. d. 17.
q. 1.*

¶ *D. 40. c. Non
nos. Extr. Ioh. 22.*

¶ *C. in d. Rom. gloss.*

¶ *Baron. annal. to.
11. an. 1076. n. 17.*

¶ *Gerf. p. 1. de potest.
eccles. 10. Abiq;*

¶ *mendacio Papa
nequissimus dici
potest sanctissi-
mus. Theoderic.*

¶ *Niem. de schism.
pop. l. 2. ca. 9. &
ca. 32. Papa non
potest peccare si-
moniac, dicebant
curiales.*

¶ *Quid si de ipso
constet, quod a-
dultarium com-
misit aut homici-
dium? Turrescrem.
sup. decret. par. 1.
d. 40. distio Quis
raritate notat, non
impossibilitatem.*

¶ *Decret. 4. tit. 19.
de diuort. cap. 8.*

¶ *Gaudemus, nec
vili vnquam locu e
in simul plures vxores habere, nec cui diuina reuelatione concessum: per quam sicut Iacob a mendacio, Israelite a fir-
to, & Samson ab homicidio, sic & Patriarche, & alij viri iusti, &c. a Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12. Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

¶ *Gerf. de potest. eccles. l. 12.*

¶ *Adulatio negat Papam simoniam
posse committere. Theoderic. Niem. de schism. Papar. lib. 2. cap. 9. & cap. 32. Papa non potest peccare simoniac, dicebant Curiales.*

Ans. First, it is a veniall offence, to call the glosse which deliueis the sense and meaning of the law, and by your selues is printed with the text, and whereby many weighty cases, both in matter of conscience and of strife are decided, and authorized, by the name of the Canon law. No small part of the Christian world was lately gouerned by the text and glosses of the Canon law, and doe you now cast them to the Moales and to the Bars? Esay 2. 20. A Fox when he is hunted forsakes the wood, but yet comes backe againe thither, and makes it his chiefe harbor, &c.

Secondly, concerning the matter of the testimony it selfe, your new glosse salueth not the old. Gratiens text hath these words: *Wee may not doubt the Pope to bee holy, whom the height of so great dignity doth extoll; in whom if meritorious deeds bee wanting of his owne, yet those are sufficient which are imparted vnto him from the predecessor of his See:* According wherunto Pope Gregory the seuenenth in his Dictates, affirms, that the *Romane Pontifex Canonically elected, is undoubtedly sanctified by the merits of blessed Peter.* Iohn Teutonicus in his glosse, expoundeth this assertion of Gratian, and desiring to maintaine the sanctitie and honour of the purpled Priest; first, requires men to iudge charitably of the Popes deeds, and to presume the same holy so long as the case is doubtfull, (and here indeed is your point) but then he proceedeth and solueth the doubt proposed, (which was, *What if it be manifest concerning the Pope, that hee hath committed adultery or homicide?*) saying, *The Popes deeds are excused euen as the homicide of Samson, the theft of the Hebrewes, and the Adultery of Iacob:* That is, they are excused by a speciall priuilege or dispensation: and that this is his meaning, appeareth by the reference hee maketh to a text in the *Decretals*, where it is affirmed, touching Samson, Iacob, and the Israelites, that they were allowed by diuine reuelation to perpetrate the things they did. And from hence I reason: The glosse affirmeth, that the Popes deeds are so excused, as the adultery of Iacob, the murder of Samson, and the theft of the Israelites were excused.

But according to the *Canon Law*, all these were excused by an indulgence and priuilege, granted by diuine reuelation, and not only by the iudgement of charity, as this Popish Priest pretendeth.

Paragr. 13. Concerning the Popes authority, wherein the Popish Priest pretendeth Bellarmine^a to be corrupted.

^a Bellar. de Pontif. l. 4. c. 7.

The moderne Papists teach, that the Romane Pope cannot erre iudicially in his publike decrees of Faith, and generall precepts of manners^b. But many of the former Papists^c denied this, and placed infallibility of iudgement not in the Pope, but in the generall Councell.

They also which hold the former opinion, differ; for although they say in generall that the Pope cannot erre in his publike decrees, yet some of them doe so explicae their assertion, that in very deed they yeeld the Pope no more than what is common toother Bishops and Pastors; for they say the Pope cannot erre, when hee obserueth the order of the Primitiue Church, and vseth such needfull and holy meanes as God hath appointed for finding out of the truth^d; and they further teach, that God doth not assist Popes as he did Canonically Writers^e, but worketh mediately, or by the lawfull vse of the ordinary meanes.

But the moderne Iesuites^f reiect this opinion, saying; *That the Pope is immediately assisted by diuine grace, and that hee cannot erre, whether hee vse meanes and diligence in searching out the truth or not.*^g. And this is now the common opinion, and must needs take place, because as Bellarmine obserueth, if conditions were required to perfect and make lawfull the Popes definitions, besides his owne externall act of decreeing the same, the faithfull should stand doubtfull, whether he had obserued these conditions or not, and so their faith would bee wauering.

And yet againe being past this shelfe, our Aduersaries are perplexed, and more doubts occurre.

First, they cannot deny but that the Pope may priuately erre^h, and many of them acknowledge, that hee may secretly in his owne iudgement bee an Heretikeⁱ, euen at that time when he publickly sententiates the verity of faith for the whole Church: But it is improbable, that he which is ignorant of the truth, and a secret enemy thereof, will publickly decree the same, and binde himselfe and the whole Church to the professing of that, which himselfe in secret doth not beleue. Here our learned masters seeke refuge from Balaams Asse, and from Caiphas^k; But yet Bellarmine^l confesseth, that this is something violent, and scarce suting with the sweet motion of diuine prouidence.

Secondly, the Pope is often an vnlettered Idiot^m, or a Canonist, and no Diuine: from whence now proceedeth his infallibility of iudgement in matters of Theologie? Either hee borroweth the knowledge of that truth which hee defineth, from other men, and then they rather define than he; or he receiueth by reuelation a present ability, and then the Church is governed by new reuelations, which the great Cardinall Bellarmineⁿ and many other of his side in words, altogether deny.

^b Bellar. ib. l. 4. c. 2. Stapleton. Gref. Greg. Val. Bosius; &c.

^c Gerson. Almain. Adrian. Tho. W. Linden. Turrecremar. Alph. Castro. Conc. Const. Concil. Basil. Ser. Canus loc. theol. l. 6. c. 1. Bellar. de Pontif. l. 4. c. 2. Adrian. 4. de sacr. confirm. ar. 3. ad. 2. pa. § 5. Si per ecclesiam Rom. intelligatur caput eius, puta Pontif. x. certum est quod possit errare, etiam in his quae tangunt fidem, haereticum per suam determinationem, aut decretalem asserendo: plures enim fuerunt Pont. Rom. haeretici. Arbor. Theophil. l. 4. c. 32. Papa in fide errare potest, ut dicit Innocentius nominis huius quantus Pontif. ca. 1. de sum. Trin. & tota mihi aberrare via videtur, qui aliter sentit, &c.

^d Viguer. instit. theol. de fid. c. 10. v. 13. Summus Pontif. x. ut priuata persona errare potest, non tamen ut est summus Pontif. x. &c. Operatur autem ut summus Pontif. x. quando obseruatur, quando obseruatur, in Concilio Apostolorum, & sanctorum Patrum definitionibus obseruari solitum.

^e Canus loc. l. 5. c. 5. Non existimandus est summus Pontif. x. eam habere facultatem quae in Apostolis:

sed adhibere, &c. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. Carb. introd. theol. l. 5. c. 7. f. Azor. p. 2. instit. mor. l. 5. c. 5. Si absque Concilio villo, & diligentia rem fidei, aut morum, definiat, Spiritum sanctum sibi peculiariter assistentem habet. Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 3. ar. 3. concl. 5. & ib. q. 1. ar. 1. pag. 432. Docet ipsam fidem ex vntione diuina. Lorin. com. Act. 15. v. 7. g. Bellar. de Pontif. l. 4. c. 2. Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 1. §. 40. Azor. ib. c. 5. & 7. & 14. Quod si nutu suo statuat, &c. Stapleton. supra. h. Azor. p. 2. l. 5. c. 5. Greg. Val. Gref. Bannes Bos. de fig. l. 18. c. 6. Caietan. de authorit. Pap. & Concil. ca. 9. i. Canus loc. l. 6. c. 8. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. pa. 67. Quemadmodum Caiphas prophetauit, nesciens quid diceret, cum esset Pontif. x. illius anni: ita summus Pontif. x. haereticus, quando fungitur officio Pontificis, poterit definire veritatem, contra propriam sententiam ex instinctu Spiritus sancti: immo summus Pontif. x. haereticus intelligit id quod definit esse contrarium propriae sententiae, & nihilominus definit illud ordinante Spiritu sancto, qui assistit officio summi Pontificatus. Bos. de fig. l. 2. c. 11. & l. 18. c. 6. Stapl. Antid. Euang. sup. Ioh. 11. vers. 51. k. Bannes supra, Bosius de fig. l. 16. c. 9. Loqui potest per hominis adumbrati simulachrum, &c. per Asinam, quod cum Balaam fecit, &c. Stapl. prompt. Cath. p. 3. feria 5. post Dom. pass. pag. 220. l. Bellar. ibid. Violentum erit, & non secundum morem prouidentiae Dei, si uis: disponens omnia. T. W. p. 146. m. Alph. Castro. cont. haer. l. 4. c. 4. Cum constet plures eorum adeo illiteratos esse, ut Grammaticam penitus ignorent. Platina in Iul. 1. Adeo plerique literarum ignari sunt, ut vix sciant nomen suum Latine exprimere. Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 22. c. 6. Iohannes 23. vir fuit, in temporalibus magnus, in spiritualibus nullus, atque omnino ineptus. Siegbert. chron. an. 1045. Benedictus, &c. cum esset rudis literarum. Theodoric. Niem. de schism. pop. l. 2. c. 13. Papir. Mass. de episc. Vrb. l. 6. in Bonif. 6. Scribere, canereque vix scientem, &c. n. Bellar. de verb. Dei, l. 4. c. 9. Can. loc. l. 2. c. 7. Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 2. pag. 467. Pauus 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10.

H 3

Thirdly,

Thirdly, our Adversaries acknowledge, that the premises from whence the Pope concludeth and deriueh his sententiall conclusion of faith, may be doubtfull or onely probable; and that hee may erre in his premises and discourse, and yet the conclusion shall bee true, yea prophetically, the spirit of Christ assisting him only therein, and not in the premises.

Now Master White handling this question of the Popes infallible iudgement, affirmeth; First, in generall: That the Papists themselves refuse the Popes iudgement; and this assertion is true concerning many of them: (as I haue shewed before) and the Popes single iudgement was neuer holden infallible, without a generall Councell concurring with him, vntill our daies.

Secondly, Doctor White affirmeth of Bellarmine that he saith, concerning Cyprians withstanding of Pope Stephen: that after the Popes definition it was free to thinke otherwise. Here the Popish Priest denieth not, but that these words are found in Bellarmine: but he excepteth, saying; that other words are found in the same Author, whereby it appeareth, that by definition he meaneth not sententiall definition, but onely a commandement of the Pope.

Ans. 1. Gretsar the Iesuite affirmeth, that Pope Cornelius made a decree and sententiall definition against Cyprian and the Africans, and confirmeth the same by a testimonie of Eusebius, translated by Rufine.

Secondly, Bellarmine adding vnto his speech (*Ut Augustinus loquitur, as Augustine speaketh*) must be vnderstood and interpreted out of Saint Augustine, who affirmeth, that Cyprian and his Colleagues might as yet lawfully thinke otherwise than Cornelius did, and retaine their owne iudgement in the matter of rebaptizing, vntill the point were determined by a generall Councell. Whereby it plainly appeareth, that Saint Augustine makes a Generall Councell publike Iudge of Controuersies in the Church, and not the Roman Pope.

Thirdly, it is certaine that Cyprian reputed not the Pope to be his Ordinarie, neither regarded his definition, either imperative or sententiall, but because of his intermeddling and saucie behauiour, called him *proud, vnlearned, of a blinde and of a wicked minde*. And therefore whereas you explicate Cyprians iudgement by your owne practise, saying; *Catholikes grant, that it is lawfull to hold or beleue contrary to the practise of what the Pope commandeth, so we doe according to his commandement*: you tell vs a storie of your owne doing, which you may rather warrant by the president of the *harmlesse beast, an Asse*, which without inquisition and reason, is gouerned by the owner, than by the example of Cyprian, who neither beleued nor practised according to your manner.

* Stapl. lib. Eccles. in singulis medijs non habet infallibilem & peculiarem Spiritus Sancti directionem, sed potest in illis probabili interdum, &c. Notab. 4. Doctrina eius in medijs discursiva, in conclusione est diuina & prophetica: est infallibilis in ipsa doctrina, in forma & ratione docendi non ita. Ad 4. Infallibilitas docentis ecclesie ponitur in conclusione tantum, &c. Canus loc. theol. 1.6.c.3. In Pontificis decretis duo distinguenda sunt: vnu est intentio conclusioque decreti: alterum quasi ratio & causa a Pontifice, reddita eius rei quam constituit. Atque in conclusione Pontificis summi errare nequeunt, si fidei questionem ex apostolico tribunali decernant. Sin vero Pontificum rationes, necessarie non sunt, ne dicam apte, probabiles, idonee, in his nihil est immorandum, &c. Non est operpretium, rationes ad viuum referre, &c. Stapl. princip. doctr. l. 8. c. 14. & c. 15. In medijs ipsis & argumentis hallucinari & aberrare poterit. ¶ Grets. def. Bellar. de verb. Dei, l. 3. c. 6. Verbum statuentes, decretum sinodale importat. ¶ Euseb. hist. l. 7. c. 2. ¶ Bellar. de Pontif. l. 4. c. 7. ¶ Aug. de bapt. l. 2. c. 18. In qua tamen, si alii adhuc de ista questione, salua pace sentirent, donec vniuersali Concilio, vnum aliquid eliquatum, &c. ¶ Sic Augustinus ep. 162. ¶ Bellar. de Pont. l. 4. c. 7. ¶ Cusan. exercit. l. 6. Obedientia irrationalis, est consummata obedientia & perfectissima, scilicet quando obeditur, sine inquisitione rationis: sicut INMENTUM obedit Domino suo. Climacus de discr. grad. 26. Fatius Iesuit. de mortif. c. 3. Bonavent. vit. Francisc. c. 6. pa. 593. ap. Sur. Cetera obedientia, vt quis sit sicut corpus exanime, quod requiescit vbi quis reposerit, sine motu.



CHAP. IIII. Paragraph. 1.

T. W.

MAfter White pretendeth, that the Catholikes doe acknowledge all sufficiency of Scripture, both for the interpreting it selfe, without any needfull explication of the Church, as also for it fulnesse, &c.

Ans.

Ans. It is ordinarie with you, to obieſt that which your Aduerſarie holdeth nor. The point maintain'd by Doctor White^a is, *That the Scripture pro- ueth it ſelfe to be the word of God, and receiveth not authoritie (to wit, principally and totally) from the Church.* And concerning the expoſition of the Scriptures by the Church; he is ſo far from denying the ſame to be needfull, that with the learned of our ſide^b he acknowledgeth, *It is the office of the true Church to interpret the Scriptures:* And the difference betweene vs ſtanderh not herein, that we deprive the true Church of this office, and yeeld the ſame to every priuate perſon^c (as you and your friends calumniare^d) but in theſe two points.

Fiſt, whereas you appropriate the office of interpreting the Scriptures to the Romane Church onely, we ſay, it is common to all true Churches.

Secondly, you giue your Church and Pope infallibilitie of iudgement in expounding the Scriptures, either by inſpiration and diuine vñtion, as ſometimes you ſpeake^e; or by a peculiar direction and aſſiſtance of the Holy Ghoſt, in the vſe of the meanes, as otherwhiles you ſay^f.

But concerning this queſtion, we beleue as followeth.

Fiſt, negatiuely, that in a ſetled Church, and ordinarily, the publike expoſition of the holy Scripture, belongeth not to any priuate perſon, becauſe ſuch haue & neither receiued gifts nor authoritie, Eph. 4. 11. 1 Cor. 12. 29. Mil. 2. 6. 2 Tim. 2. 15. and the Lord will not haue blinde men leaders of another, Luk. 6. 39. nor every one of the houſhold to be their owne caruers, and ſnatch their food at their pleaſure; but he hath placed ouer his familie wiſe and faithfull ſtewards, to giue his ſeruants their portion of meat in due ſeaſon, Luk. 12. 42. and he requireth that all things in his Church be performed in good order, 1 Cor. 14. 40.

Secondly, we maintaine, that the authoritie and right of expounding the holy Scripture, belongeth to every true Church of Chriſt as fully as to the Romane. For every true Church of Chriſt, is by office and calling the ground and pillar of truth, 1 Tim. 3. 15. and our Sauour authoriſed all the Apoſtles and their ſucceſſors to preach the Goſpell, and to expound the Scriptures, Math. 28. 20. and he beſtowed the gift of interpretation vpon the Church of the Corinthians and other Churches, as abundantly as vpon the Romanes, 1 Cor. 14. 26, 28, 32. And the Paſtors of other Churches were authoriſed to interpret the Scriptures, 2 Tim. 2. 15. 2 Tim. 4. 2. And Philip interpreteth the Scripture, Act. 8. 29, 35. And in the ſucceeding Churches at Alexandria^h, and other places, Pantenus, Clemens, Origen, &c. were allowed to be publike interpreters, and expoſitors of the Scripture. And all ſubordination to the Romane Church (vnleſſe by way of aſking counſell, or vſing aduice, which is vſuall among equals) touching interpretation of Scripture in the prime ages of the Church, was vnheard of.

Thirdly, concerning the manner of interpretation of the holy Scripture, in it ſelfe wee maintaine; That the expoſition thereof, euer ſince the Apoſtles age, is mediate, and dependeth vpon the right and lawfull vſe of thoſe meanes, which the holy Scripture and the example of the primitive Church preſcribeth.

The Apoſtles and their associates were not tied to outward meanes, but without ſtudie and labour, or comparing one Scripture with another, and without collecting arguments from the text it ſelfe or other places, they conceiued and deliuered the true meaning by the vñtion of the Holy Ghoſt. Thus Philip expounds the Prophet Eſay to the Eunuch, Act. 8. and Peter the words of Ioel and David, Act. 2. 16, 25. and the faithfull were bound to receiue theſe expoſitions of Scripture deliuered by the Apoſtles in this manner, as the vndoubted ſenſe of the Holy Ghoſtⁱ.

^a Digreſſ. 12. It is not the ſcripture which muſt aſſure vs.

^b D. Whitak. de Script. q. 3. c. 2. Quotum Eccleſie officium eſt, Scripturas exponere, & interpretari.

^c D. Caſleton. conſeſ. de Eccleſ. 12. p. 303. Populus non tradit, ſed tantum ſuſcipit fidem.

^d Vigas in Apoc. cap. 3. com. 2. exeget. 2. a. n. 2. Contra quam gatiunt impudenter heretici, qui, &c. Scripturae ſacrae intelligentiam, & de eius ſ. nſu controuerſas, ad quemuis eſt liſſiporū grege rabulam, tanquam ad iudicem & cenſorem, deſer. e. 17. ſumunt contempto vniuerſa eccleſie iudicio, &c. Becan. de iudic. contr. num. 43. Mulierculis permittunt libertatem interpretandi Scripturas, &c.

^e Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 1. ad cauſ. 4. Doctr. ipſam fidem, ex vñctione diuina. Stapl. princ. doct. 1. 8. c. 17. Eccleſia in his magiſtris loquitur nō prout ipſi volunt, non ex ratione, & ſenſu humano, ſed prout Spiritus veritatis, qui manet cum ea in eternū, dat eloqui illi: & hic Spiritus Dei non recedit de ore eccleſie. 2^{te}. 1. 21. Gretſed. Bel. lar. de veris. De 3. l. 3. c. 4. Boſius de fig. l. 16. c. 10. Senſus ille non inheret literis, ſed pſi eccleſie.

^f Becan. de iudic. controuerſ. 8. 157. Stapl. princ. doct. 1. 8. c. 14.

^g Hieron. ep. 103. ad Paulin. Hac a me breuiter perſtricta ſunt, ut intelligeres, te in Scripturis ſanctis, ſine prauis & demonſtrante ſenſu, non poſſe ingredi. B. ſil. quaſt. compend. explic. q. 235. Aug. de vil. cred. c. 17.

^h Euseb. hiſt. l. 5.

ⁱ 9. & 10. & l. 6. c. 19. Iren. l. 4. c. 41. Generoſior fides gentium oſtenditur, ſermonem Dei aſſequuntur ſine inſtructione Scripturarum.

The Apostles sundry times confirmed their doctrine by the testimonies of Scripture, for these or the like reasons: first, to maintaine the honour and authoritie of the written word, and to declare that God had appointed it to be a rule of faith. Secondly, to giue example to succeeding Churches and Pastors, to build their faith and doctrine vpon the same. Thirdly, to shew the vnitie and consent of their doctrine, with the Prophetical Scripture. Fourthly, the better to perswade the Iewes and Profelytes, who beleeuing Moses and the Prophets, must also beleue the Gospell, being confirmed by their testimonie: Neuerthelesse, when the Apostles deliuered any doctrine of their owne without such confirmation, their authoritie was of it selfe authentick and the rule of faith, Galat. 3.8. Heb. 2.3,4.

But when the Apostles had finished their course and added their owne doctrine, and perfected the Canon of the whole Scripture, 2 Tim. 3.16. after their decease, the subsequent Christian Church was in the same manner confined to the whole Scripture of both Testaments, as the Iewish Church before Christ was to the Scriptures of Moses and the Prophets.

Before the decease of the Apostles, the Church had a twofold doctrine; the one written, the other preached by liuely voice, 2 Thess. 2.15. But after their departure, *The bounds of the Church were the holy Scripture^k, and let men teach what they say, by the Scriptures, otherwise they are to feare a woe prepared for them, which addeth to the Scripture^l; and what soeuer is besides the diuine Scripture, because it is not of faith, is sinne^m: and set by that which seemeth truth to this man or that man, and enquire all these things out of Scriptureⁿ. And reade vs this out of the Law, the Prophets, the Psalmes, or out of the Gospels or Apostolick writings, and we will beleue you^o.*

The present Church therefore hath not the same authoritie of teaching of faith, or expounding Scriptures, which the Apostles had: neither doth any man succeed them in the same manner of infallible authoritie: but first the whole matter of faith and supernaturall veritie, is contained in the written word: secondly, the exposition of the Scripture depends vpon the lawfull vse of the meanes, which the Scripture it selfe and the primitiue Church prescribe: in the same manner as our Aduersaries acknowledge about the High Priest in the old Law, and concerning all other but the Pope^p.

And to declare this matter more fully, first we acknowledge, that the Bishops and Pastors of the true Church haue authoritie to expound the Scripture^r, which appeares, in that Christ hath made them stewards of his household, 1 Cor. 4.1. and hath giuen vnto them the keyes of the kingdome of heauen^s, Matth. 16.19. among which, the key of knowledge is one, Luk. 11.52.

Secondly, their authoritie is so far forth authentick, as that when they exercise the same aright^t, 2 Tim. 2.15. it bindes the Church and people of God, ouer whom the Holy Ghost hath placed them, to faith and obedience of their doctrine, Mal. 2.6. 1 Thess. 2.13. Ioh. 13.20. Heb. 13.19.

Thirdly, because all these things in the Church ought to be performed in order^u, 1 Cor. 14.40. and because there is difference of the members of the Church, and among the Pastors themselues all are not equall, either in their gifts or publike gouernment of the Church, 1 Tim. 5.19. And in all ages, both vnder the Law, and vnder the Gospell, and in the primitiue Church, (as is testified by Ignatius^v, Tertullian^w, Cyprian^x, Eusebius^y, and others, who deriue this forme of gouernment from the cradle of the Apostles) there were degrees of gouernment among the Pastors; therefore the exercise of this worke, of interpreting the holy Scriptures in the Church of England, is perfor-

^k Hier. sup. Math. c. 1. Ecclesia non est egressa de finibus suis, id est, de Scripturis sanctis. ^l Tertul. contra Hermog. ^m Basil. reg. contra. def. vit. ⁿ Chrys. 2. Cor. hom. 19. ^o Aug. de vnit. eccles. c. 6.

^p Becan. de iud. contr. 9. 76. Pontifex, post ingressum in terram promissionis, non dirimebat controuersias nisi ex scripta lege. ^q Suar. def. fid. Cath. contra sect. Angl. l. 1. c. 11. Pastores & doctores ecclesie, per specialiora auxilia & dona, docentur à Spiritu Sancto, quantum ad commune ecclesie bonum expedit: & ideo ut plurimum non faciunt id per expressas reuelationes, neque per iudicium infallibile, sed quatenus oportet & quantum cuiusque status & munia postulauerint. Pontifex autem max. & Concilia legitima, quando definiunt, docent per singulare assistentiam. ^r Greg. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei, l. 3. c. 3. ^s Gerson. de vita spir. lect. 6. Tanquam praecones & nuntii. ^t Origen. super Math. tr. 1. Hilar. de Trin. l. 6. Hieron. epist. 3. & cont. Iovin. l. 1. Prosp. de vita contemp. l. 1. c. 2. Ambros. de sacerdot. c. 1. Chrys. de sacerdot. l. 1. Augustin. Beda. Isidor. & alii. ^u 1. 2. Tim. 2.15. ^v Ignat. epist. ad Trallian. & epist. ad Magnes. & epist. ad Philadelph. ^w Tertul. de bapt. c. 17. ^x Cyprian. epist. 55. & epist. 57. ^y Euseb. hist. l. 2. c. 1. & l. 3. c. 4.

med by the Pastors thereof respectiue to their severall degrees of gouernment^b.

Fourthly, we doe not place the truth of exposition in personall authoritie^c, for that depends vpon inward grounds, and the right vse of the lawfull meanes; but first we yeeld vnto our Bishops and Ecclesiasticall gouernors, the right of ordering and directing the meanes for the publike interpretation of the holy Scriptures: secondly, the authoritie of publike propounding the same to our whole Church, when there is iust occasion to doe this. Thirdly, touching the exposition it selfe, it is the dutie of Gouernors, besides their owne industry, to vse the aduice and helpe of the skillfull and worthy persons in the Church, whom God hath endued with gifts to search out and manifest his truth: euen as Moses being chiefe gouernour and ouerseer of the workmanship of the Tabernacle, and Salomon of the Temple, did vse Aoliab, Exod. 31. and Hiram, 2 Chron. 2. 14. and 4. 11. and other skillfull workmen about the said worke. Fifthly, the meanes of expounding holy Scripture are of two sorts, according to the twofold matter of the Scriptures: some are onely diuine, and these are in the Scriptures themselves^d; some humane, and these are taken from all helps of wisdom and learning whatsoever.

For in the Scriptures some things are meere supernaturall, and of diuine reuelation; some things are taken from common reason and humane sciences^e, to explicate and apply the former, Ioh. 3. 8. 12. to wit, there be some things deliuered in the Scriptures concerning the Starres, Iob 38. 31. the Elements, Beasts, Fowles, Fishes, &c. and there be references to the law of nature, to Storie and humane wisdom. Also diuers things being implicite taught in the Scripture, must be collected and deriued from thence by discourse and arguing, according to the rules of Art: we doe not meane that the tractation of euery thing in this kinde must be receiued from the very Scripture; but teaching that Scripture expounds it selfe, we meane that the grounds and principles of the exposition of such parts thereof as deliuer supernaturall truth, must onely be taken from the Scripture it selfe, and all other helps be vsed as ministers and seruants vnto them.

car. Est quidem de communibus sensibus sapere in Dei rebus, sed in testimonium veri. Clem. Alex. Strom. l. 1. Aug. de doct. Christ. l. 3. c. 18. & c. 40. c. 41. Rainol. ag. Hart. c. 6. diuis. 2. Calu. com. 1. Cor. 1. 17. Eiper. com. Colof. 2. p. 106. Sadacl. cont. Turrian. p. 253. Pet. Mart. com. 2. Sam. 6. p. 213. Kimidontius de Scriptur. & alii.

^b White. concl. vt pa. 17 in the end of his worke de ecclesia. Non ar- rogo inhibitionem su- mo exponendi ar- ticuli authoritatē, quam grauissimis & sapientissimis ecclesie praposis- tis, Archiepiscopis & Episcopis relin- quo: sed cognos- scendi duntaxat & iudicandi liberta- tem sequor. Cypr. epist. 27. Inde per- temporum & suc- cessuum vices, Episcoporum or- dinatio, & eccle- siæ ratio decurrit, vt ecclesia super Epi- scopos constituat- tur, & omnis actus ecclesie, per eos- dem praposis- gubernetur. ^c Aneas Sylu. de Selt. Concil. Basil. Non ego cuiusvis Episcopi menda- cium quamvis di- tissimi veritatis pre- ponam pauperis presbyteri: habitat sapius in lordido pallio, quam in p- tis vestibus sa- pientia. ^d Iren. l. 3. c. 12. Ostensiones quæ sunt in Scripturis, non possunt ostendi nisi ex Scriptu- ris. ^e Tertul. de resur.

Bellarmines words, in behalfe of the Scripture, prouing it selfe to be the word of God.

Bellarmino in the place alleaged by Master White^f, affirmeth most truly, There is nothing more knowne, nothing more certaine than the Scriptures, and it were great madnesse not to beleue them. And in another place^g; It is better knowne to be true which is found in the Scriptures, than that which is in the ancient Fathers.

T. W. *The Adversarie about this quotation accuseth M. White; first, for adding these words not found in Bellarmine, other meanes may faile: secondly, for making his speech generall, whereas the same is vttered particularly against the Swenkfeldians.*

Ans. First, the words, *Other meanes may faile*, are Master Whites owne, and should, if the Printer had obserued it, haue beene set downe in another cha- racter, or with a Parenthesis; but such small ouersights cannot generally be auoided in Printing^h. Secondly, although Bellarmine in that chapter dispute against the Swenkfeldians, yet his words are generall; euen as when our Saviour speaking

^f Bellar. de Script. l. 1. c. 2.

^g Bellar. de Script. l. 3. c. 2.

^h Bellar. Recog. pa. 3. Typogr.

speaking in particular to the Pharisees, and saying, *Out of the abundance of the heart the mouth speaketh*, vseth a generall sentence, true in many others as well as in those Pharisees, Matth. 12. 34.

Thirdly, from that which is vttered by Bellarmine, it followeth against you, that the Scriptures proue themselves to be the word of God, and are of greater authoritie than the Church. For that which hath nothing better knowne than it selfe, is made knowne by it selfe: and the Church is not better knowne than it; but according to Bellarmine, there is nothing better knowne than the Scripture: and this also is the ancient Catholike faith.

Clement of Alexandria saith¹; *The word of God is hidden to none, it shineth to all men, and there is no Cimmerian darknesse therein.* And Augustine², *The Scripture speaketh in such a manner, vt affabilitate paruulos nutriat, that by it familiar speaking, it nourisheth little ones. And as a familiar friend without gloeing, it speaketh to the learned and vnlarned³; and Euangelicall words carry their owne exposition with them⁴.* And Chrysostome⁵, *You haue the Scriptures before your eyes, like bright lampes of vnderstanding, and the Scripture expoundeth it selfe, and permitteth not the hearer to erre⁶:* And Theodorite, *ιαυτὸς ἐξηγᾷ, it declareth and interpreteth it selfe⁷.* And if there were no proper light in the Scriptures, besides the Churches preaching, to demonstrate it selfe, why did the Lord command the priuate and publike reading thereof in the Old Testament? Deut. 17. 19. and 31. 11. and also in the New Testament, Ioh. 5. 39. Col. 3. 18. 2 Tim. 3. 15. Apoc. 2. 3. And wherefore doth Saint Paul command that his Epistles should be read in the Church? Col. 4. 16. 1 Thess. 5. 27. And writing to the Ephesians, saith, *whereby when you reade you may vnderstand*, Eph. 3. 4. *To write the same things vnto you, to me is not grieuous, but for you it is safe*, Phil. 3. 1. 2 Cor. 1. 13.

¹ Clem. Alex. orat. ad Gentes.

² Aug. de Gen. ad lit. l. 5. c. 3.

³ Aug. epist. 3. ad Volusian.

⁴ Aug. de verb. Dom. in Matth. hom. 23.

⁵ Chrys. ex vari. in Matth. hom. 23.

⁶ Chrys. in Gen. hom. 13.

⁷ Theodorit. quest. in 2. Gen.

⁸ *αὐτὸς ἑξηγᾷ, ἑαυτὸς αὐτὸν ἑξηγᾷ, ὡς καὶ ὁ Θεὸς ἑαυτὸν ἑξηγᾷ.*

⁹ *αὐτὸς ἑξηγᾷ, ὡς καὶ ὁ Θεὸς ἑαυτὸν ἑξηγᾷ.*

¹⁰ *αὐτὸς ἑξηγᾷ, ὡς καὶ ὁ Θεὸς ἑαυτὸν ἑξηγᾷ.*

¹¹ *αὐτὸς ἑξηγᾷ, ὡς καὶ ὁ Θεὸς ἑαυτὸν ἑξηγᾷ.*

Paragr. 2. Bellarmine produced in prooffe, that the Scriptures are the onely rule of faith.

T.W. *To proue that all points in controuersie must definitiue be determined by the written word alone, without any respect to the Churches authoritie: in the explication whereof he marcheth out, making Bellarmine^a his buckler, &c.*

^a Bellar. de verb. Dei, l. 1. c. 2.

Ans. In this short speech you mis-report in three points.

First, you say my Brother holdeth, that all points of Controuersie must be determined by the written word alone: you should haue said, all points of Controuersie, the matter whereof is only supernatural truth. Controuersie may arise about the Grammaticall signification of words, about Theologicall conclusions; some of the premises whereof are Philosophicall, or of humane reason: Or concerning humane Storie, as the same in expounding many Prophecies, is subordinate to the Scripture; as namely, the Persian Monarchs; the kinned of Herod, &c. about the materials of parables and similitudes vsed in the Scripture. Concerning the indiuiduall matter and circumstances of morall actions, and many things of like nature, Master White maketh not the Scripture the onely rule of these things, but of such as be meere diuine and supernaturall: For of the other, the law of Nature, Reason, Humane Storie, Grammar, Logicke, Philosophie, Prudence, and Discretion; the lawes of Superiours are rules, besides the Scripture.

Secondly, you adde, that Master White affirmeth all Controuersies, &c. must be definitiue determined by the written word alone.

Ans. To preuent hereafter in you and in your fellowes, impertinent discourse

course, who in many points either not vnderstanding or dissembling our meaning, fight against your owne shadowes, and declining the matter in question, stasse your paper with vnnecessarie probation of what we deme not: I will here deliuer what Doctor White and other Protestants teach, concerning the definitiue determination of Controversies in Religion.

An Observation concerning the Judge of Controversies.

We acknowledge that there be two kindes of Iudges, which definitiue determine Controversies.

1. The one supreme and independent, whose sentence is infallible, from whom there lies no appeale, and to whose sentence all other Iudges must giue place. And this Iudge is the Holy Ghost, speaking in the Scripture, Ioh. 16. 8. Act. 15. 28.

This Iudge is inuisible, in respect of his person, and yet he deliuereth an open and visible sentence in writing, which is the holy Scripture^b, Ioh. 12. 48. Rom. 2. 15. And thus Chrysostome^c, and Augustine^d, call the Scripture the hand of God, saying; *I read his hand-writing, the same is an inuincible fortresse vnto me.* And euen as the sentence of a lawfull Iudge, being vpon record, is authentick in the Iudges absence, and after his decease: and it is vsuall in arbitrements and sundry controversies, to deliuer a iudgement or determination in writing: so it hath pleased the Holy Ghost in the written word, to deliuer vnto the Church a definitiue sentence touching the greatest questions of Faith and Religion, and sufficient doctrine to be collected from thence, to determine all questions directly concerning faith.

2. But besides the Holy Ghost, our great and inuisible Iudge, the Lord hath placed in his Church subordinate Iudges^e, visible and outward delegates, whose voice and open sentence the faithfull may sensibly heare, and by whose wisdom and authoritie, controversies of Religion are debated and defined, according to the rules appointed by Christ, Matth. 18. 17. Hebr. 13. 17. Act. 15. 27.

And these Iudges are of two sorts: first, generall for the whole Church; namely, the Fathers lawfully assembled and proceeding in a generall Councell, Act. 15. 2. Particular, the Heads and Fathers of each provincially or nationall Church. And these Iudges of both sorts concerning matters of faith and supernaturall verities, are bounded in their iudgement to the written word of God onely^f. Ephes. 2. 20^g, out of the limits where of they may not range^h.

The definition of controversies, truly deliuered by Ecclesiasticall Iudges, according to this rule, is authentick and infallible; and the same hath a double authoritie; one internall, in respect of the matter which is contained in the Scripture; the other externall, in regard of the outward meanes, whereby the truth is deliuered and published by officers, deputed thereunto by God.

The Lord hath placed in his Church Pastors and Teachers, Ephes. 4. 11. Gouvernours and Rulers, Hebr. 13. 17. 1 Tim. 5. 17. Rom. 12. 8. and hath made them Stewards of his family, Tit. 1. 7. *a Bishop is Gods steward*; and he hath committed the keyes of his Church and spirituall kingdome vnto them, Matth. 16. 19. When these persons therefore by office and commission from God, proceed lawfully in declaring and defining the truth: the truth thus declared and published by an ordinance of Christ, is in two respects of more certaine authority, than other truth made knowne by priuate persons: first, because of a

^b Aug. sup. Psal. 22. Fratre sumus, quare litigamus? no intellectus mortuus est pater, fecit testamentum & mortuus est, &c. tamdiu contenditur de hæreditate mortuorum quamdiu testamentum proferatur in publicum: & cum testamentum prolatum fuerit in publicum, tacent omnes et tabule aperiantur & recitentur. Index intentus audit, advocati silent, præcones benedictum faciunt, universus populus suspirans est, vel legitur verba mortui, non sentientis in monumento. Ille sine sensu iacet in monumento, & valent verba eius: fides Christi in celo, & contradicuntur testamentum eius & aperti, legamus. Frater sumus, quare contendimus? placet animus noster: non sine testamento nos dimisit pater noster.

^c Chrys. tom. 5. hom. de expuls. i. p. 11.

^d Aug. sup. Psal. 114. Bell. r. de verb. Dei, l. 1. c. 2. Per corporales litteras quas censemus, erudie nos voluit Ioh. Drielo de eccles. dogm. l.

^{4. c. 4.} Ipsa Evangelia tanquam instrumenta publica. Tho. Aqu. p. 2. q. 1. ar. 7. Sacra Scriptura per quam d. n. voluntas nobis manifestetur.
^e Aug. conc. Cæsar. l. 2. c. 22. ^f Bæcan. de iud. contr. 8. 86. In concilio Apostolorum, in quo controversia illa proposita & definita est nullum Scripturæ test. monium, &c. allatum fuit, &c. I. en. lib. 5. ca. 20. Conf. ge. e oportet ad ecclesiam & eius finem ed. eri. & Domini Scripturæ enutrit. Pluritas enim ecclesiæ Paradisus in hoc mundo, ab omni ergo ligno paradisi etcas manducabis, ait spiritus Dei, id est, ab omni diuina Scriptura in iudicare, &c. ^g Hieron. in Mich. c. 2. Histor. tripart. l. 2. c. 5. ex Theodorit. hist. l. 1. c. 7.

speciall promise of assistance of grace ; secondly, by reason the meanes of discovering the truth, by the ioynt labour and iudgement of many, and those the principall members of the Church, are more sufficient.

But if it be apparent, that Bishops and Pastors abuse their authoritie, or degenerate from their calling and dutie, becoming wolues in sheeps cloathing, Matth. 7. 15. Act. 20. 29. blinde guides and wicked shepherds, Esa. 56. 10. Ezek. 22. 26. as it hapned in the daies of the Arrians, and at the second Nicene Councell, &c. then the faithfull haue libertie and commandment to relinquish their iudgement, Matth. 16. 11. 1 Ioh. 4. 1. Ioh. 20. 27. and to relie vpon the holy Scriptures and other helps, which God affordeth them, Gal. 1. 8.

This doctrine, Stapleton^h and other Papistsⁱ doe vehemently oppose ; pretending, that Controuersies in religion are hereby made interminable : for vnlesse, say they, the Church haue one visible Iudge, whose authoritie is absolute, and to whose sentence all the faithfull must subiect themselves howsoeuer, without debating and questioning his iudgement^k ; they which are audacious and contentious, seeming wise to themselves, will presume to despise the Churches iudgement, pretending that the same is not according to the Scriptures : and in most Controuersies they may gather matter of obiection for the maintenance of their priuate opinion from the Scripture^l.

Answer. First, it is impossible in this life for any societie religious or humane, to preuent or keepe out all abuse and inconuenience which may happen by the wickednesse of euill disposed persons. And yet this which our Aduersaries vrge against vs, is far lesse than that which ensueth from their appointing of one vniuersall absolute Iudge : for admit that he erre, as possibly he may, then the whole Church relying vpon him falleth into error^m. But of the other side, where iudiciall authoritie is made dependant vpon the holy Scripture, and placed in many ; though one or moe chance to faile, others embrace the truth : and although at some hard times, such as were the daies of the Arrians, contentious persons like a tempest, disturbe the outward tranquillitie of the Church ; yet the firme members thereof, and the godly and peaceably minded, doe still retaine the truth.

Secondly, we doe not lie open to this inconuenience so much as our Aduersaries pretend ; neither are they so free from it as they beare the world in hand.

There is no liberty given by our doctrine, to factious and busie persons, vpon their priuate conceit or probable reasons, to contest or disauow the publike iudgement of the Church : But it is then onely lawfull to dissent, when there is euident testimonie of plaine Scripture, expounded according to the generall Tenet of godly Pastors of the precedent Church, to gaine say the present definition of Ecclesiasticall Iudges. And *ceteris paribus*, when arguments of both sides hang as it were euen in the ballance, we alwaies prefer the publike iudgement of the Church before any priuate person. And although our Churches maintaine the generall reading of the holy Scripture, yet they allow not a presumptuous libertie for priuate spirits, to racke and riffe the Scriptures at their pleasure, and to create new diuinitie, or to alter the constant doctrine of the Primitiue Church : but concerning all weighty matters in Religion, we require plaine places of Scripture, such as cannot be peruerbed but the presumption of the doers will appeare : and our rule of faith is plaine Scripture, either being such in it selfe, or as it hath heretofore bene expounded by the Primitiue Church, and most godly and worthy Pastors of the Church euer since their time ; and godly and peaceable Christians submit themselves hereunto. And although there be in all ages turbulent spirits, and some which cause diuision and offence, Rom. 16. 17. 1 Cor. 11. 19. this can no more discredit our Churches, than the sedition of Rebels and Traitors, deface the good lawes and righteous gouernment of a iust Common-wealth. And if in the Apostles owne age

and

^h Stapl. Triplic. c. 23.
ⁱ Suar. def. fid. Cath. contr. sect. Angl. l. 1. c. 11. rat. 5.
^k Stapl. tripl. pa. 310. Vtrum consentanea Script. loquatur, non est o- uum & subditiuū iudicare. Bellar. de Pont. l. 4. c. 3. Non est ouum iudicare num pastor erret. 1 Pigh. disp. c. 3. Cum nihil pene sit in Scripturis tam expressum, quod non ingeniosi hominis expositione aliquam recipiat : quam ex alio Scripturæ loco etiam colare possit & probabilem facere. Linda. pref. in 5. lib. panopl. euang.
^m Greg. M. l. 4. ep. 32. Vniuersa ecclesia à suo statu corrumpitur, quando is qui vniuersalis appellatur corrumpitur. Bellar. de Pon. l. 4. c. 3. Necessario tota ecclesia errabit, si Pontifex erret. Aeneas Sylu. de gest. Concil. Basil. pag. 19. Quid remedium erit si criminosis Papa perurbet ecclesiam ? si animas perdat, si peruertat exemplo malo populos, si denique contraria fidei prædicet, hæreticusque dogmatibus subditos in- buat ?

and preſence, many Imps of Satan diſquieted the flock of Chriſt: yea, if our Sa-
viour and his Apoſtles foretell that there will be alwaies ſuch, Mar. 18. 7. 1 Cor.
11. 19^a. doth not a wicked ſpirit of partialitie poſſeſſe our Aduerſaries, when
they obiect that to our diſgrace, which by Gods permiſſion proceedeth from
the cuill one, Matth. 13. 25. who infeſteth the Church militant to the worlds
end, 1 Pet. 5. 8. and whole malice in this kinde no creature or meanes can
wholly prevent?

But our Aduerſaries pretend, that their viſible Iudge prevents all diſcord and
diſſention; and (as at the building of Salomons Temple) there was no noiſe or
ſound of hammer, axe, or toole to be heard among them; and they all lie downe
in the Tabernacles of peace, hauing changed their ſwords into Plowſhares, and
their ſpeares into pruning hookes.

But when we chance to reade the ſtorie of Pope Iulius the ſecond, Leo the
ninth, Iohn the tenth, Innocent the ſecond, Gregorie the ſixt; and ſee the ſpi-
rituall Iudge himſelfe, the ſofter-father and prime fountaine of vnitie and con-
cord, with a helmet of braſſe vpon his head, and armed with a coat of male:
When we reade in Platina, Sabellicus, Antonine, Onuphrius, Cicarella, the
pen-men of Popes liues, Legends and Narrations of martiall affaires and blou-
die warres, which had their off-ſpring, and were extracted from the loines of
the peace-making Fathers: And that the Pope *indirecte ad ſpiritualia*, by
crooked ſubordination to ſpirituall affaires, as Bellarmine ſpeaketh, or by a di-
rect regimine authoritie, as Francis Boſius defendeth^r, hath euer ſince the daies
of Hildebrand, embroiled the Chriſtian world, ſuborned treaſon and homi-
cide^f, and made a butchery and ſlaughter-houſe of the Weſterne regions: The
ſmooth declamations of Ieſuites and Seminarie Priests doe not ſo much
perſwade vs to beleue, there is a vertue in making generall peace by their viſi-
ble head the Pope, as his owne fell and direfull deeds, doe make vs feare leſt,
as the old ſaying is, *Dum tituli remedia, pixides venena habeant*: Whiles the ti-
tle and inſcription doth promiſe a remedie, the boxes ſhould containe poiſon.

But I haue miſtaken my ſelfe; for our Aduerſaries place the Popes power of
making vnitie in matters of Religion, the ſame being the more euen and pro-
per obiect of his prieſtly regencie: but neither in this kinde can we perceiue
ſuch a ſoueraigne operation. The Papiſts haue no actuall vnitie in Religion, and
there is diuerſitie of opinion proclaimed by themſelues, in euery queſtion of
Theologie. And whereas they pretend, that at the ſound of the Popes ſen-
tence, like Frogs in a marſh, at the falling in of a great log or ſtone, they are all
huſht, and profeſſe whatſoeuer his Holineſſe impoſeth: ſurely in their owne
Records we reade of many Schiſmatikes and refractarie ſubiects, which haue
riſen vp in the Romiſh Church; and theſe not Idiots and pettiſh waſps, but
men of eminent qualities; Marſilius of Padua, Dantes Altigerius, Occham
the flower of his age, the great Doctours of Paris, &c. And to ſpeake of our
owne daies, and matters of yeſterday, the State of Venice and their Diuines in
an oppoſition, regarded the iudgement of Pope Paul the fiſt, as much as the
Church of England doth the Canons of the Trident Councell.

If they pretend that Pope Paul did not define or pronounce a cathedrall ſen-
tence, they ſhould rather haue ſaid he durſt not, leſt his ſubiects turning vpon
him, he had ſhamed himſelfe, bewraying the weakneſſe of his Maieltie, and be-
come ridiculous to the peeuiſh Heretikes; who ſeeing his owne ſheepe rebel-
ling againſt his paſtorall ſtaffe, and deriding his infallible tribunall, would haue
cried vnto him, ſaying; Holy Father, thou great Phyſician of diſcord, cure

^a Tertul. de prae-
ſer pt hær. c. 1. &
3. & 4.

^b Tertul. lib. c. 31.
Arenarum ſterilis
ſeni adulterium,
ab inimico diabo-
lo, &c.

^c Papir. Maſſon.
de episc. Urb. l. 6.
in Iulio 2. p. 379.
In praesentia qui-
dem, in Italia mire
frigen: studia, fer-
uent bella: Ium-
mus Pontifex Iu-
lius belligeratur,
vincit, triumphat,
planeque Iuliana
agit, &c.

Sabellic. Anead. 9.
l. 4. Bergom. ſup-
pl. m. l. 12. Inno-
centius ſecundus
bellator, &c.

Bergom. ſupplem.
l. 14. anno 1371.
Gregorius vnde-
cimus Pontifex à
precibus ad arma
conuerſus.

Vrbani. 4. bellator.
ibid. lib. 13. anno
1262.

Tom. 4. Concil.
Sur. orat. Egidii
Viterbenſis, ſpea-
king to Iulius 2.
in the Synod of La-
teran, ſaith: Militi-
tiz (quod nemo
ante hac potuit)
eccleſie arma, ma-
gis regibus me-
tuenda faceres.

Orat. Tho. de Vio.
Card. Accingere,
pater ſancte, gla-
dio tuo, binos
enim habes, &c.
pag. 551.

Chryſ. hom. 4. de
verb. Eſai. c. 6.
Eius eſt (ſacerdo-
tis) arguere tan-
tum liberamque
praſtare admoni-
tionem, non arma
mouere, clypeos
vſurpare, &c.

Vide Eſpene. com. 1. Tim. l. 2. digreſſ. cap. 6. ^a Bellarm. de Pontif. Rom. l. 5. c. 1. Habet indirecte poteſtatem quandam eamque ſum-
mam in temporalibus. ^r Fra. Bozzius de temp. eccleſie monarch. l. 1. c. 1. & c. 2. Sextus decretal. tit. 6. c. 17. gloſſ. c. fundamenta.
Roma fundata à prælonibus, adhuc de primordiis retinet. ^f Ocho Friſing. l. 6. c. 36. Quanta mala, quot bella, bellorumque diſcri-
mina inde ſecus ſunt, quot es miſera Roma obſeſſa, capta, vaſtata, &c. denique tot mala, tot ſchiſmata, tot tam animorum quam cor-
porum pericula, huius tempeſtatis turbo inuoluit, vt ſolus ex perſecutionis immanitate, ac temporis diuturnitate, ad humanæ miſerie in-
felicitatem ſufficeret comprobanda: vnde à quodam eccleſiaſtico ſcriptore, denſiſſimis Aegypti tenebris comparatur. ^t Faſel. hiſt.
Sicul. l. 8. c. 3. Pontificis conſilio necatur Conradus, &c. pag. 448.

^a Sotus de nat. & grat. l. 1. c. 8. Concilium nihil censuit quid sit peccatum originale, sed sub lite, inter doctores reliquit. Bannes 2. part. Tho. q. 1. ar. 8. Hoc vnum dixerim, vehementer me defendere ut contentio hæc inter pios theologos summi Pontificis auctoritate decideretur, ac componeretur.

Alioqui si ecclesia prudens & sciente, hæc inter theologos varietas permittitur: perinde est, ac si ecclesia diceret, unusquisque in suo sensu abundet, dummodo fidei veritas, & Catholicæ ecclesiæ auctoritas defendatur. Papir. Masson. de epis. Vrb. l. 6. in Sixto 4. Decretum ab eo est de Virginis conceptione, posse quamlibet adversantium opinionem sine peccato, hæresisque visio credi.

^a D. White Def. of the Way, chap. 7.

pag. 41. Or. 7. Stapl. Antid. ap. 1. in 2 Cor. 10. Vacuas mentes offerre Christo per ecclesiam loquenti oportet, nec sub conditione, ecclesiæ vocem admittere, si verbo est annexa, si Scripturis consentanea nostro iudicio loquatur, sed absolute & simpliciter. Becan. de Iud. contr. 9. 106. Si occurreret aliqua controversia, quæ neque aperte ex Scriptura, neque ex traditione decidi possit, recurrendum esset ad auxilium Spiritus Sancti, qui speciatim doceret nos omnem veritatem.

thy selfe. The truth is, the Popes definitive sentences are rare^a, and it behoueth him to be cauteious in them; and vnlesse it be in those few articles, which his vassals with a common consent maintaine against vs, all the rest may goe which way it will, for any definition that can be extorted from him. Yea, when he defines or sends out Bulls, they be so slipperie and cautionarie, that they rather minister sewell to strife, than proue remedies of discord: and among other things, let the Reader consider the Bulls of Pius the fifth, and Gregorie the thirteenth, about the opinions of Michael Baius, and compare with the same that which Vasquez the Iesuite deliueis, (all which is set downe by my Brother in his last booke^a) and let any man iudge whether his Bulls be fish or flesh, in any other matter but onely against vs.

The third absurditie you seeke to fasten vpon Master White, is, that he holdeth all points of Controuersie must be determined by the Scripture onely, without any respect to the Churches authoritie.

Ans. There can be no determination of doubts in the visible Church, without the application of the rule vnto the matter in question, regulate by the same: which application, when it is solemne and publike for the whole Church, Master White acknowledgeth, must ordinarily be performed by the Bishops and Pastors of the Church.

But it is in vaine for you and your fellowes to barke against vs about the Churches authoritie, which we freely and largely acknowledge, and know that the Church cannot be in safety without it; but set vpon vs and conuince vs in the things we denie, which are, 1. That the Romane Church and Pope is the onely subiect of that authoritie: 2. That the authoritie of the Church is propheticall or voluntarie, and not depending vpon the rule of the written word, and the true meaning thereof, collected by the right vse of ourward means.

An examination of Bellarmines speech, concerning the holy Scripture being the rule.

T. W. The summe of your accusation is, That whereas Bellarmine maketh the Scripture a rule of faith in part, M. White produceth him to persuade, that he maketh the same a totall rule.

^a Bellar. de verb. Dei, l. 4. c. 12. Pigh. controuer. Ratib. l. 3. Quoru fuit hoc in scribendo consilium, non vt scripta illa sua præstare nostra religioni, sed subessent potius.

^b Bellar. ibid. & Greddes p. 1569. Becan. de iudic. contr. 9. 103.

^c Bellar. ib. l. 4. c. 11. & in orat. habita gymnasi. Rom. 1586. before his booke of the Scripture.

^d Bellar. de laicis, l. 3. c. 19.

^e Bellar. de iustif. l. 3. c. 8.

Ans. Sometimes Bellarmine writeth in such manner, that he seemes to denie the Scripture to be any rule of faith^a. The proper and chiefe end of Scripture (saith he) was not to be the rule of faith, but a certaine profitable commonitarie, to preserve the doctrine received by preaching.

2. Presently after he corrects himselfe, and acknowledgeth the same to be a rule in part^b in some matters of faith, and a ioynt rule with tradition.

3. Another time he seemeth to make it an entire and totall rule, concerning all such things as are generally necessarie to saluation^c.

4. Sometimes he writeth in such manner, that one would belecue he made the same the onely rule: There is one rule of faith, indubitate and certaine, namely, the word of God declared by the Church^d: and faith cannot rest vpon any thing but the authoritie of the diuine word^e.

But he meaneth not in these places the written word onely or chiefly, but generally the word written and traditionarie: Now Master White hauing to deale with such a Proteus, who of set purpose inuolues his assertions, and makes

makes them ambiguous, to minister occasion of word-bare, may without much blame sometimes mistake his meaning.

But to answer directly to the matter in question; it followeth from the assertion of Bellarmine, that the Scripture is the onely rule of faith. *The rule of Catholike faith (saith he^f) must be certaine and knowne; and there is nothing better knowne or more certaine than the Scripture.* Hence I reason; that is the onely rule whereunto the chiefeft properties of a rule doe solely belong.

But the properties of true and certaine, doe onely in matters of faith belong to the holy Scriptures. And this appeares:

1. Because traditions are farre more vncertaine, than the written word: and many of them false, and vncertaine, as shall be proued, paragrah. 4. of this Chapter.

2. The written word is a rule of traditions, and therefore it is the onely rule. And this appeareth by the doctrine of our Aduersaries, who acknowledge that no traditions must be admitted, but such as agree with the Scriptures, and are deriued from the Scripture, and the writings of the primitiue Fathers^b: But those traditions which are deriued from the Scriptures, haue the same to be their rule: and there is nothing more common in the primitiue Fathers, than to subiect all their writings to be regulate by the holy Scriptures; therefore such traditions as are found in the workes of the holy Fathers, haue the holy Scripture to be their rule. From whence it followeth, that the Scripture is the onely primitiue rule of faith, as some of our Aduersaries haue acknowledgedⁱ; whereof one saith expressly^k; *The holy Scripture is the sole rule of veritie, and whatsoever differs or contradicth the same, it is error and cockle, with whatsoever shew it come forth.* And another^l saith; *The doctrine of the bookes of the Prophets and Apostles, is alone the foundation of truth, and the rule, &c.*

Deus nobis omnia, quæ vult à nobis fieri. Durand. præf. sup. sentent. Scotus ib. in prolog. ^k Ferus com. Matth. L. 2. in ca. 13. p. 248. col. 2.

^l Villaniucen. de forrand. concion. lib. 2. cap. 2.

^f Bellar. de verb. Dei. l. 1. c. 2.

^g Bellar. ib. l. 4. c. 3.

Nec ullam traditionē admittimus contra Scripturā.

Tanquer. Iesuit. d. sp.

Ratisb. pag. 116.

^h Bellar. de Script.

l. 4. c. 3. Nos tantum recipimus pro

apostolicis, quas

firmit testimonio

antiquorum probare possumus, &c.

Ioh. Driedo de eccl.

dog. l. 2. c. 3.

Traditiones eccle-

sie in his quæ spe-

ctant ad necessita-

tem fidei salutaris,

aut demonstrantur

ex Scripturis manifestis, aut ex

Scripturis Patrum.

ⁱ Gabr. Biel. Can.

miss. lect. 71. g.

Non in solo panu

viuit homo, sed in

omni verbo quod

procedit de ore

Dei; id est, Scriptura sacra:

Quæ secundum B. Gre-

gorium, est tan-

quam os Dei, quia

per eam loquitur

Paragr. 3. Eckius alleaged about Tradition, and the authoritie of the Church.

T. W. Eckius his words are^m; *The Scripture is not authentically without the authoritie of the Church: Master White alleaging this Author, affirmeth; They say the Scripture receiueth all the authoritie it hath from the Church, and from Tradition.*

^m Eckius ench. l. 1. de Script. & Ecclesia.

Ans. 1. Master White prefixing before his speech these words, *they say*, doth not meane Eckius onely, but hath reference to other Papists besides. 2. It followeth from Eckius his words, that the Scripture receiueh all external authoritie from the Church, and from Tradition; for he saith, *The Scripture is made authentically*, that is, of publike authoritie, *by the Church*: But the meanes whereby the Church authoriseth the Scripture, is Traditionⁿ.

Ib. Scriptura non est authentica sine auct. eccl. Ecce potestas ecclesie super Scripturam.

ⁿ Pigh. cont. Ratisb. loc. 3. de eccl.

p. 97. col. 2. Baro.

annal. to. 1. 20. 53.

n. 11. Canus loc. l.

3. c. 2. & c. 3. funda.

da. 4.

An obseruation concerning Traditions.

The question of Traditions is one of the principall Controuerfies betweene the Papists and vs^a. And because this Popish Priest doth sundry times in his Treatise intermeddle therewith, I will declare the doctrine of both our sides concerning this matter.

^a Canus loc. theol. l. 3. c. 6.

Section 1.

The word or name Tradition, is in it selfe generall, signifying any doctrine deliuered from one to another, either by word or writing ^b, Act. 6. 14. 2 Thess. 2. 15. and chap. 3. 6. 1 Cor. 15. 34.

But in this present Controuersie it signifieth *unwritten doctrine* ^c, *giuen by diuine inspiration touching matters of Faith and Religion, which the Apostles by word of mouth deliuered secretly onely to the chiefe Pastors* ^d *of the Christian Church, to be taught in the same: and the which being not committed by them to writing as the Scriptures were, yet are a part of the rule of faith, and of equall or greater authoritie than the written word* ^e.

Secondly, the principall matter of these Traditions, are doctrines and articles of faith, precepts of manners, exposition of Scripture, Rites, Ceremonies, and externall actions, as necessarie to Religion as those which are found in the Scriptures ^f.

Thirdly, these Traditions are equalled by all our Aduersaries with the Canonickall Scripture ^g: and in some things they prefer them before the same, calling them the foundation of the Scripture ^h, the touchstone ⁱ and rule whereby to try the same ^k, and they esteeme them more necessarie in the Church than the Scripture, saying; Tradition is of the being of the Church, but the Scripture onely of the perfection and well-being ^l. And the Scriptures without the same, were in a manner of no vse ^m. They make the Scripture a dead letter written in Tables; and Tradition an Epistle of Christ written in the heart.

Fourthly, they make the Pope and Romane Church the Register and authenticall keeper of these Traditions, saying, they are spiritually written in the heart of the Church and Pope ⁿ, and not in bookes or parchments, at least many of them. And although sometimes they seeme to authorise them by the testimonie of the Primitiue Church ^o; yet they acknowledge, that they are not all of them found in the Records of the Ancient, but may newly in euery age be brought to light by the Romane Church and Pope ^p; and so after a terrible rattling and thundering out of names of ancient Fathers and Councils, in the coole of the businesse, the generation of these non-script verities, for the greater part, descendeth from the loynes of our Aduersaries father, and last friend the Pope.

Section 2.

The Protestants doe not simply denie Tradition; but first we distinguish Traditions, and then according to some acceptations, with a subordination to holy Scripture, we admit thereof.

First, our Aduersaries maintaine, that there be doctrinall Traditions, or Traditions containing articles of faith, and substantiall matters of diuine worship and religion, not found in the holy Scripture; to wit, Purgatorie, Inuocation of Saints, adoration of Images, Papall Monarchie, &c. These and all other such like Traditions, containing new parts and additions of Articles of Religion ^a, the Protestants simply condemne and refuse; and when we dispute against Traditions, we take the word in this notion: and herein is the maine difference betweene them and vs.

Secondly, the name of Tradition in the writings of the Primitiue Doctors, is taken in three other acceptations.

First,

^b Irenzus. Tertullian. Cyprian. Bellar. de verbo Dei, l. 4. ca. 2. Bannes 1. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. p. 167. Peref. de trad. p. 1. post. 2. Lorin. com. Act. 6. 14. Canus loc. l. 3. c. 6. & alii. ^c *ἡ ἀγραφὴ διὰ τοῦ στόματος* P. Galatin. de arcan. Cath. ver. l. 1. c. 1. ^d Bellar. de verbo Dei, l. 4. c. 2. & 11. quædam folis prelati, &c. Can. loc. l. 3. c. 3. Stapl. Rel. c. 5. q. 5. ar. 2. Gr. Valto. 3. d. 1. p. 7. q. 1. §. 43. Azor. inst. mor. p. 1. l. 8. c. 4. Bos. de sig. l. 3. c. 6. Gref. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei, pag. 1597. ^e Stapl. Rel. c. 3. q. 3. p. 352. Articulus fidei esse potest non solum quod in Scripturis reuelatur: sed quod traditione ecclesiastica ad nos deriuatur. ^f *All the former Authors.* ^g Sixtus Senens. biblioth. l. 2. pa. 123. Non minus moretur inter ethnicos abissi, qui ecclesiasticas traditiones recusant, quam qui euangelium recusant. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. de trad. concl. 5. Andrad. def. Cone. Trid. l. 2. Carb. introd. theol. l. 5. c. 5. Suar. def. fid. Cath. conf. Angl. l. 1. c. 9. ^h Baron. to. 1. annal. ann. 53. n. 11. ⁱ Can. loc. lib. 3. ca. 2. Lydius lapsi, &c. ^k Pighius contr. loc. 3. Regula ad quam & Scripturas, &c. ^l Bellarm. de verbo Dei, l. 4. c. 4. Nisi Hebionis hæresis, &c. de bene esse, &c. Cusan. epist. 2. ad Bohem. Sander. de visib. monarch. lib. 1. cap. 5. Hoc genus potest per se subsistere, &c. (traditiones) non sunt ambiguae, &c. de his nulla lis oritur, &c. Plutarchus refert Anacharsin, prudentem sane virum, vehementer operam Solonis irritasse, quando cum intellexit leges Atheniensibus conscriptas dare velle, &c. ^m Bosius de sig. l. 16. c. 10. Inanis fere & nullius fructus, &c. ⁿ Coster. enchir. de Scriptur. Bos. de sig. l. 16. c. 10. Can. loc. l. 3. c. 3. fundam. 4. ^o Bellarm. de verbo Dei, l. 4. c. 9. Driedo de eccles. dog. l. 2. c. 3. Stapl. Rel. c. 5. q. 5. ar. 2. ad. 6. Bosius, Carbo, & alii. ^p Gref. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei, l. 4. c. 9. pag. 1713. & 1715. Azor. inst. mor. p. 1. l. 4. c. 11. Bosius de sig. l. 3. c. 6.

^a Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. de trad. Peref. Aiala. de trad. p. 3. Azor. inst. mor. p. 1. l. 8. c. 4. P. Soto def. conf. cath. Cum non sine in Scriptura, necesse est esse apostolicæ traditionis. Sander. de visib. monarch. l. 1. c. 5. Oratione pro defunctis, inuocationem Sanctorum, &c. traditiones facit.

First, for externall Rites and Ceremonies of decency, order, and outward profession in religion not found in the holy Scripture, but vsed as things adiaphorous, and not of the very substance of worship but accessarie; of which kinde, the Primitiue Fathers mention sundry; to wit, The signing with the Crosse, praying with the face towards the East, thrice dipping in water at Baptisme, tasting of milke and honic^b, &c.

These ceremonies and the like vsed in the primitiue Church, belong not to the substance of religion, but are indifferent things and mutable; and lawfully vsed or omitted, according to order, and commoditie of euery Church, and as they be subseruiant to godlinesse, taught in the Scripture^c.

Secondly, the report and testimonie of the primitiue Church, concerning matter of fact, and concerning the iudgement and practise of the Apostles; such reports as explicate the meaning, or confirme the doctrine of the Scriptures; to wit, the testimonie of the said Church, concerning the number, parts, and integrity of the Canonick Scriptures, and that the Apostles did baptise Infants^d, and admit none to the Lords Supper, but such as were first baptized and of elder years; That they which were baptized, were afterwards confirmed and receiued imposition of hands, &c. These are called of the Fathers, by the name of Tradition, and depend vpon the holy Scriptures, and maintaine the doctrine thereof.

Thirdly, the primitiue Church receiued from the Apostles liuely teaching, the summe and explication of Christian doctrine in many principall parts thereof; and the interpretation of sundry places of holy Scripture, concerning the Articles of the Trinitie, Incarnation, and such like: The which Creed, summe of doctrine, rule of faith, and exposition of the Scripture, being compared, agreeth with the written word: also the signification and translation of the words and phrases of the Bible in the severall languages, is receiued from hand to hand, &c. the Fathers vsually call these things by the name of Tradition^e.

The Protestants admit these three sorts or kindes of Tradition, according to the doctrine and meaning of the primitiue Church.

First, rituall and ceremoniall about things indifferent, to be vsed or changed according to the lawes of euery Church, and as they serue to edification, or otherwise.

Secondly, Historicall, which confirme and establish the doctrine of the Scripture.

Thirdly, Doctrinall, by way of explication or plaine deliuerie of that doctrine which is really contained in the Scripture.

But in the admitting hereof, we require two cautions: 1. That the holy Scripture be the rule of all Traditions whatsoever, thus farre, as that vpon examination they be conformable and subseruiant vnto the same^b. 2. That they haue the testimonie of the primitiue Church in the prime age thereofⁱ, and descend to our daies from the same by the streame of succession, through ages following, and were receiued as Apostolike in other Churches as well as the Romane.

Thus the state of the question betwene the Papists and vs in the Controuersie of Traditions, stands in these three points.

acceperant, posteris tradiderunt. Atque hæc est, quæ apostolica traditio & veritas non scripta, à nonnullis appellatur. ^f Iren. l. 3. c. 4. Tertul. de præscript. ca. 13. Orig. proem. l. 1. de princip. Euseb. contra Marcel. episcopum Ancyran. Epipha. hæ. 69. Cynl. Alex. apol. Concil. tom. 1. & ad Theodos. de recta fide. Proclus epist. ad Armen. Iren. l. 3. c. 2. & c. 3. Basil. hom. 28. contra Sabel. & Arrian. 8. Apolog. eccl. Angl. Harm. confess. sect. 17. Chem. exam. p. 1. de Trad. Caluin. 1 Cor. 11. 2. comm. Beza opusc. to. 3. Resp. ad Claud. Simeon. pa. 18. & in Colloq. Possiacen. com. Gal. p. 3. Pet. Mart. com. Iud. 3. B. Bilson of subiect. p. 4. p. 581. & 586. D. Field of the Church, l. 4. Herbrand. disp. pag. 117. n. 17. Lubbert. cont. Bellar. de script. p. 631. Hofland. cont. Greg. Val. pa. 235. 239. Zanch. de Scriptur. & de oper. redempt. What. cont. de Script. q. 3. c. 5. pag. 223. ^h B. Bilson. Teach what you will by tradition, so it agree with the written word of God, we be not against it. Hofland. Si ex traditiones vigeantur quæ in ecclesia virgine fuerunt: quæque quibusdam modis præcipue, admittimus. ⁱ Basil. hom. 28. contra Sabel. & Arrian. Ne Spiritum sanctum à Patre & Filio separet, absterreat te Dominica traditio. Dominus ita docuit, Apostoli prædicauerunt, Patres obseruauerunt, Martyres confirmauerunt, satis tibi sit, ut dicas quemadmodum edocuit, &c. Tho. Walden doct. hd. l. 3. ar. 2. c. 19. De dubijs fidei debemus inquirere, quid senserunt Apostoli, quid successores apostolorum, & deinceps viri probati vique ad nostra tempora reliquerunt in scriptis, & secundum quod verba ipsorum concordant sic elicere veritatem. Cassan. de offic. boni viri, ex Cath. trad. antiq. perp. & vniuersali, &c.

^b Tertull. de cor. mil. c. 3. & in Apol. c. 16. Orig. in Num. hom. 5. Ignatius epist. ad Philadelph. Iustina. apol. 2. & orth. qu. q. 118. Euseb. hist. l. 3. c. 24. & l. 4. c. 22. & l. 5. c. 22. Basil. de Spir. sanct. c. 27. Epipha. hæ. 80. in fine.

^c Aug. epist. 11. & ep. 86. & ep. 118. & ep. 119.

^d Orig. com. 6. cap. ad Rom. Ecclesiæ ab Apostolis traditionem acceperit, paruum obprobrium dare. Hier. contra Luciferian. An necesse Ecclesiæ hunc esse morem, ut baptizatis postea manus imponantur, & ita inuocetur Spiritus sanctus? Ex- igit ubi scriptum sit, in Actibus Apostolorum. Etiam si scripturæ auctoritas non subelict, totius orbis in hac partem consensus, instar præcepti, obtinet. Nam multa alia quæ per traditionem in Ecclesia videntur, auctoritatem scilicet legis obseruauerunt.

^e Cassian. de offic. boni viri, p. 7. Qui nobis initio veram hanc, & germanam esse Christi & Apostolorum doctrinam, quæ in ijs scriptis continetur, suo testimonio approbarunt, iidem sancti, & mentem ipsam, & intelligentiam eorundem scriptorum, quam ex viuâ ipsa, & amplissima Apostolorum doctrina

First, whether there be Traditions of equall authoritie with the Scripture, teaching diuers parts of doctrine, or other Articles of faith ^k and religion besides the same?

Secondly, whether any Traditions are to be admitted, but such as being examined by the Scripture, as the supreme rule of diuine truth, are proued conformable to the same?

Thirdly, whether Traditions wanting the plaine testimonie of the primitive, and other precedent Churches ^l are to be receiued, vpon the bare credit and asseueration of the Roman Church and Pope?

The Papists in euery of these affirme, and wee deny. And they maintaine many dogmaticall Traditions besides the Scriptures: Also, they will haue Tradition of equall authoritie with the written word, and to be beleued absolutely without subiection to the Scripture. And they giue authoritie to the Pope and Romane Synagogue to obtrude vpon vs Traditions of a later hatch, and such as were vnknowne and vnheard of by the primitive Church, yea many which their owne Doctors, not long since haue condemned.

Two Arguments against the Doctrine of Popish Traditions.

Argu. 1. If Popish Tradition be a part of the rule of faith, and of equall authoritie with the written word, then it must haue the same or equall testimonie and confirmation therewith. But it hath not such testimonie and confirmation.

The written word of the New Testament was confirmed these fve waies: 1. By the liuely testimonie of the Apostles ^m, God bearing witnesse with signes and wonders, and miracles, and gifts of the Holy Ghost. 2. By the Scriptures of the Old Testament. 3. The primitive Church had the very first copies and authentically writings of the Scripture deliuered by the Apostles owne hands ⁿ. And that Church deliuered the Scripture to posteritie, witnessing from whom they receiued it. 4. The written word hath the generall approbation and testimony of the whole Church of Christ in euery age thereof vntill this day, witnessing that the same is diuine. 5. The written word hath many impressions and notes of diuine veritie and grace in it selfe ^o, whereby it perswadeth the faithfull, and assureth them that it is the word of Christ: But Popish Traditions want all these confirmations.

First, in speciall or distinctly they haue no testimonie of holy Scripture: The Apostles or Christ himselfe neuer preached them, for any thing we can certainly vnderstand; they neuer referred people vnto them, but oftentimes both in the Pharises and Gentiles condemne Traditions, which were very like vnto these of Poperie, Matth. 15. Mar. 7. Col. 2. &c.

Secondly, the primitive Church doth not plainly affirme, that she receiued them from the Apostles mouth, as it did the bookes and doctrine of the New Testament. Our Aduersaries alleage some darke and vncertaine speeches of Fathers in prooffe of their Traditions: but they must either giue vs plaine and manifest testimonies, or else acknowledge that the Scripture is more evidently confirmed by the primitive Church than Tradition, which is the thing I affirme.

Thirdly, the Papists want the perpetuall consent, and generall approbation of the whole Church in euery age for their Traditions, which the Iesuites confesse in regard of sundry of them ^p.

Fourthly, our Aduersaries are forced for want of better prooffe, to confirme their Traditions by the testimonies of counterfeited and bastardly writings, bearing the names of ancient Fathers, Abdias, Martialis ^q, Dennis Arcopagite ^r, Decre-

^k Bannes 3. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. de trad. Orationes esse ad sanctos faciendas, venerandas esse eorum imagines, &c. neque etiam impressis & inuolutis Scripturæ doceant.

^l Caluin. contra Pigh. de lib. arbitrio. Non difficulter inter me & Pighium, in hac de traditionibus contentione conuenire posset: si modo Ecclesie traditionem, ex certo & perpetuo, sanctorum & orthodoxorum consensu demonstraret.

^m Iren. l. 3. c. 3. Discipuli veritatis existentes, extra omne mendacium sunt.

ⁿ Tertul. de prescript. c. 36. Apud quas ipse authenticæ literæ eorum recitantur, sonantes vocem & repræsentantes faciem cuiusque, &c. Aug. cont. Faust. Manich. l. 2. c. 2. & l. 33. c. 9.

^o Horat. loc. Cath. l. 3. c. 2. Reuerentiam, sua sibi maiestate vltro conciliat. Greg. Val. to. 1. d. 1. q. 1. p. 5. Ita lictoris mentem commouet vt nulla alia doctrina.

^p Azor. instit. mor. p. 1. l. 4. c. 11. Greg. def. Bellar. de verbo Dei, l. 4. c. 9. Fieri potest, vt antea scis seculis, res non fuerit plane patefacta, &c. Vt aliquid censetur apostolica traditio, non est necesse, vt omni tempore ab vniuersis fidelibus creditum sit.

^q Bellar. Recog. l. 2. de monach. Epistolæ Martialis Apostoli. & liber Abdias, de rebus gestis Apostolorum citatur a nobis, tum hoc loco, tum alibi, quoniam ab aliquibus recipiuntur. ^r Caietan. com. Act. 17. An iste sit ille Dionysius, qui scripsit libros de diuinis nominibus & celesti hierarchia, certum non est.

all Epistles^f, &c. of the credit whereof many among themselves doubt. And for want of primitive Fathers, the Papists^t make their schoole Doctors living within foure hundred yeares, one of their witnesses and meanes to proue Tradition by.

Fifthly, Popish Traditions in themselves, to wit, the Popes royall Supremacie, Adoration of Saints and Images, Church-service in an vnkowne tongue, single life of the Clergie, Communion in one kinde, praying to dead men, &c. are repugnant to the holy Scripture: and many Articles of Tradition lately defined by the Trent Councell, were in former times either opposed or doubted of, by learned Papists and Schoolemen^u.

And from these premises I reason in this manner: That whose credit and authoritie depends onely vpon the Romane Church now being, or vpon the same since the six hundredth yeare, is of inferior credit to the Scripture: whose authoritie dependeth vpon the testimony of the holy Ghost, speaking in the Scripture, vpon the plaine testimonie of the Apostles, and vpon the testimonie of the primitive Church, which receiued them from the Apostles: and lastly, vpon the generall approbation of the whole Catholike Church since the Apostles vntill now, no true Church of Christ euer doubting of them.

The authoritie of Popish Traditions depends onely vpon the Romane Church, &c. and they want all other plaine testimonie, in regard of such a measure of testification, as the holy Scripture hath the same.

Therefore the authoritie of Traditions is inferior to the authoritie of the written word.

Argum. 2. Those things which proceed from the will of God onely, can be made knowne vnto vs no other way, but by the reuelation of the Scripture. All Articles of Faith and precepts of manners, concerning the substance of Religion, proceed from the will of God onely. Therefore they can be made knowne vnto vs by no other meanes but by the Scripture.

The first proposition is deliuered by diuers learned Doctors of Rome: Thomas Aquinas teacheth the same in expresse termes^x, saying; *Ea qua ex sola Dei voluntate proueniunt, &c. nobis innotescere non possunt, nisi quatenus in sacra Scriptura traduntur, per quam diuina voluntas nobis innotescit.* The things which proceed from the will of God onely, cannot be made knowne vnto vs but so farre as they be deliuered in holy Scripture, by which Gods will is manifested.

Gerson the Chancellor of Paris^y, *Men must dare to say nothing in diuine matters, but that which is deliuered in the sacred Scripture. The reason whereof is, because the Scripture is giuen vnto vs a sufficient and infallible rule, for the regimen of the whole Ecclesiasticall body and all the parts thereof, to the end of the world.*

The second proposition is manifest, and also testified, Mat. 16. 17. 1 Cor. 2. 9, 10, 11.

Paragr. 4. Canus concerning Traditions.

T. W. *Canus his words are*^a; To the confutation of Heretikes, there is greater force in Tradition than in Scripture. And againe; Tradition hath greater strength against Heretikes than the Scripture; yea, almost all disputations with them, must bee determined by the Scripture. *Master White setteth downe Canus his meaning in this manner: There is more strength to confute Heretikes in Tradition than in Scripture; yea, all disputations with them, must be determined by Tradition, &c.*

1. M.

^f Azor. instit. mor. p. 1. lib. 10. ca. 8. Quamuis eiusmodi epistolae decretales, non ita constantem & certam auctoritatem apud omnes habeant.

^t Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. n. 45. pa. 377. Carb. introd. l. 4. c. 8. pa. 472.

^u Biel. 4. d. 17. q. 1. allegat diuers Scholasticos, doubting of auricular confession. B. Rhenan. in Tert. praef. ad Lect. Ser. Bonau. 4. d. 11. q. 2. de Transsubstantiatione. Alusiodor. sum. 1. 3. tr. 8. c. 5. quæst. 6. of invocation of Saints. Multi dicunt quod nos nec oramus Sanctos, nec ipsi orant pro nobis, &c.

^x Tho. Aq. 3. q. 1. ar. 3. Aug. de doctr. Christ. l. 2. c. 9. In his libris timeantes Deum querunt voluntatem eius. L. 3. c. 1. Homo timens Deum, voluntatem eius, in Scripturis sanctis inquit. Bellar. de pec. l. 6. c. 3. Non est de rebus quæ pendunt à diuina voluntate, aliquid asserendum, nisi Deus ipse in Script. sanctis, tale aliquid reuelauerit.

^y Gers. exa. doct. p. 2. confid. 1. Gabr. Can. miss. lect. 71. Verbum Dei sacra Scriptura, quæ ab ore Dei procedit, ipsius indicat voluntatem; per quas solas plenam Dei voluntatem intelligere possumus. Gers. p. 1. serm. de Circumcis. Dom. confid. 1. Sacra Scriptura est regula sufficiens pro regimine Ecclesie.

^a Canus soc. l. 3. c. 3. fundam. 4.

1. *M. White leaneth out the Aduerbe Fermè almost, or in a manner.*

Ans. 1. Canus accounteth the Scripture of it selfe, altogether insufficient to confute Heretikes, because the sense thereof, whereupon confutation dependeth, is onely attained by Tradition ^b.

2. Hee maketh Tradition the touch-stone ^c whereby false doctrine is examined and tried; whereupon it followeth, that as M. White speaketh, all disputations must be determined thereby.

Thirdly, he affirmeth, there is greater strength in Tradition to confute Heretikes than in Scripture.

Fourthly, all controuersies must bee decided by the sense of the Scripture; but Tradition containes the sense of the Scripture ^d. Therefore all controuersies, according to Canus, must be determined by Tradition.

Obiect. 2. M. White conceales the reason, which Canus rendreth of his speech.

Ans. 1. Master White did neuer intend to write out all Canus his booke.

2. Canus his reason changeth not the sense of his speech, but confirmeth the same.

Obiect. 3. Canus borroweth his assertion from Tertullian, which M. White concealed.

Ans. First, Canus himselfe affirmeth no such thing, but onely in confirming his opinion, vseth the testimonie of Tertullian, with five other Authors^e; neither is Tertullian, but Vincentius Lirinensis, placed next in order to those words of Canus.

Secondly, Tertullian is not of Canus his iudgement; for although in his booke of Prescriptions, hee say vpon occasion, that Heretikes must bee confuted by Tradition: yet hee neither meaneth all Heretikes, but such as denied the Scripture in whole or in part ^f: neither by Tradition vnderstandeth hee a diuers doctrine from the Scripture, but the preaching and doctrine of the Apostles and primitive Church by word of mouth, containing the very same matter in substance with the written word, and making no addition of other parts or points of faith thereunto.

If this Popish Priest could shew vs his Traditions about the Supremacy, Transubstantiation, Purgatory, Inuocation of Saints, &c. in Tertullian, hee spaketh to the purpose: but now hee equiuocates onely in the word Tradition, and deludeth his followers, perswading them that they haue this old Doctor on their side. But in very deed Tertullian ^h effectually and constantly maintaines the perfection of the Scripture, and confutes the opinion of Canus ⁱ, and other Papists who say; *That the Apostles deliuered not all the mysteries of Religion to the faithfull in publike, but some part thereof in secret to the perfecter sort* ^k.

T. W. saith, they distrust not the Scripture, nor want the same to proue their Catholike doctrine.

Ans. 1. The same is not necessary to proue their Catholike doctrine, all parts whereof can better stand without the Scripture than with the same ^l.

2. They locke vp the Scripture in chaines and muzzle it, and will not suffer the same either to goe one foot, or speake one word more than their Pope allowes it.

3. The Scripture as it speaketh in his owne voyce, or in the voyce of the Primitive Church; or lastly, as it is expounded by many of their owne Doctors, will not proue their Popish Articles: witnesse first the place of Mat. 16. which Stapleton ¹ saith, verbally maintaineth the supremacy, but according to the generall consent of Doctors ^m, and many Popish Writers, containes no such

^b Quis vane ac legitimus Scripturæ sensus, non nisi traditione ecclesiæ certo cognosci possit.

^c Lydius lapis, &c. in manu Ecclesiæ, quo falsa verasque doctrinas exploraret. Lindan. Panopl. l. 1. c. 2. Vnica sacra anchora Catholice Ecclesiæ traditio.

^d Canus ibi Steu. anticom. 1 Cor. 11.

^e Egesippus, Ignatius, Irenæus, Hillarius, Vincentius, Lyr.

^f Legis & Prophetarum, quædam probat, quædam improbat.

^g Regula fidei est vnum omnino Deum esse, &c.

^h Quid est hoc depositum? tam tacitum ut alterius doctrinæ deputetur?

ⁱ Tertul. de car. Christi, c. 2. & c. 7. de resur. car. c. 2. & c. 45. & cont. Hermo. c. 22.

^j Canus loc. l. 3. c. 7.

^k Tertul. de præscript. c. 22. Iren. l. 3. c. 14.

^l Pigh. cont. ca. 3. Quam (Traditionem) si recipimus, omnis facili, etiam sine Scripturis inter nos, componetur controuersia. Græf. def. Bel. d. script. l. 4. c. 12. Putas ne plures hæreses & sectas exorturas fuisset, si nulla de veris scripturæ existeret, quam nunc cum scriptura a mortalibus de celo data est? ego certe propior sum existimanti, pauciores fuisse futuras.

^m Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 1. ar. 1. Est hæc Christi verbalis constitutio, &c.

ⁿ Arboreus. Theosoph. l. 5. c. 5. Lanfranc. d. sacram. c. Berengar. Quæ verba (Matth. 16.) tametsi de pastoribus sanctæ Ecclesiæ dicta esse credantur, & a quibusdam Catholicis exponantur, &c.

thing*. The Text of Saint Iohn, from which onely they deriue auricular confession, Iohn 20. 23. according to Scotusⁿ and Caietan^o, two of their most subuill Doctors, contains no precept of that Sacrament. The place of Paul, 1 Tim. 6. 10. commonly produced by them for Traditions^p, and hotly pressed by Suarez against the Kings Maiesty^q, to proue that the English faith is not Catholike, because the same is not receiued of Romane Prelates who are the Timothees, in whose custody is the heauenly disposition of sacred truth; according to Lira, Thomas, Caietan, Guiliardus^r, &c. hath another sence and meaning. And their onely text for the fire of Purgatory, 1 Corinthians 3. 15. according to Alchafar^s a famous Iesuite, treateth not of this purging fire.

And in very deed, the great frame of Popery, both for the doctrine and exposition of the Scripture, leaneth onely vpon the Lateran Church, holden vp by the shoulders of Friar Dominick^t and Ignatius Loiala, and their generation. And the Papists are destitute of the Tradition, they so eagerly contend for, *Neither are they able to proue one maine or capitall Article of their Trent faith by Tradition, beginning in the Primitiue Church, and descending to our age by the perpetual current of the Doctors of the Church euer since.*

• Caietan. Com. Ioh. 20. Fateor, &c. p. Caietan. Com. 1 Tim. 6. Commissum gregem sub depositi nomine custodiendum mandat. q. Suar. def. fid. Cath. Cont. sect. Angl. l. 1. c. 10. r. See their commentaries vpon 1 Tim. 6. v. 20. s. Alchaf. com. Apoc. 11. v. 2. not. 5. Non aridet eorum expositio, qui ad ignem purgatorij appl. cant, &c. t. Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 4. §. 3. Summus Pontifex vidit in somnis, quod Lateranensis Ecclesia, quasi suis compagibus resoluam, grauem minaretur ruinam: quod cum tremens, ac matrens aspiceret, ex aduerso vir Dei Dominicus occurrebat, & humeris superimpositis, totam illam casuram fabricam sustentabat. Gamsaga de orig. seraph. relig. par. 1. pag. 1. Reuersus ad quandam Crucifixi imaginem seruentius semet orabat, ab eaque vel labentem eius domum, omnino tanquam ruinantem ruinam repararet, prepositus est.

T. W. Thus wee see how our Doctor by his foule collusions, hath laboured severall wayes to oppresse and obscure the worthinesse of Gods Catholike Church.

Ans. The present Romane Church, in respect of those Articles which it maintaineth against the Church of England, is not Catholike.

T. W. Hee falsly ascribeth unto her head an vsurping sovereignty.

Ans. The earth neuer felt or saw so foule an vsurper as the Pope, who exalteth himselfe about the law of Christ, conculcates the highest Maiesty vpon earth^u, inrocheth vpon the right of the Church^x, and had hee power to his will, would be an absolute Monarch, both spirituall and temporall ouer all the world^y.

Secundo, hoc tertio die fecit. Naucle. Gen. 40. Summus Pont. Imperatoris collum pede comprimens, ait, Super aspidem & basilicum, &c. Math. Paris. hist. Angl. Henric. 3. Nonne rex Anglorum, noster est vasallus & mancipium, &c. Gerl. de potest. eccles. lect. 11. z. Zabar. de schif. pag. 106. Ex hoc infiniti sequuti sunt errores, quia Papa occupauit omnia iura inferiorum eccles. y. Papir. Maillon. de epis. Urb. l. 5. in Bonif. 8. Cum Bonifacius non Gallie solum, sed mundi dominum, se esse predica. &c.

T. W. Shee euer sendeth forth most glorious beames of splendor and truth, and perpetuity, according to that of the Psalmist, Hee hath set his Tabernacle in the sunne; which contrary our inuisibilists for these 1600. yeeres, did neuer set vnder the Horizon of an vniuersall Latency: That sun which neuer expatiates beyond the Tropickes of Gods Traditionary or written word; that sunne which with is defining, and infallible authority, in explicating the true sence of Gods word, dissipates and dissolues all clouds of error: finally, that sunne whose concentrons uniformity could yet neuer brooke any inuolution or nouelty.

Ans. Wee both of vs, Protestants and Papists, acknowledge a visibilitie of the Church, and a perpetuity of diuine truth in the same, but we differ about the manner hereof. You will haue it at all times gloriously vntable; alleaging, Psalme 19. 4. and to professe truth entirely, free from all error and corruption, and

* Sc. pl. doct. princip. l. 6. c. 3. quod fillius super hanc Petram, ad Christum ipsum, non ad Petri personam refertur, prorsus nihil est hic Petro retributum. Origen. Cyprian. Hilar. Ambr. Hieron. Chrysostom. August. Leo. Eusebius Irmisen. Isidor. Beda. Haimo. Rabanus, Lira, Hugo Victor. Aeneas Silvius, Cusanus, Gerson, gloss. Gratian. Panormitan. gloss. ordinaria. Willermus, Stella, &c. See Aeneas Silv. hist. Confil. Basil. Scot. 4. d. 17. q. 1. ar. 1.

• Lamber. Scyth. hist. Germ. Henricus imperator, nudis pedibus, ieiunus, a mane vique ad vesperam perstabat, Rom. Pont. sententiam expectando: hoc

* Alph. Castr. con. hzr. l. 1. c. 4. Plat. in Iul. 1.

* Bein. in Pl. qui hab. c. 6. & 7. & in Can. ferm. 33. Serpit hodie putrida tabes, per omne corpus Ecclesie. Abbas Viper. Sapientia prae omnibus iniusta, &c. Gerf. ep. Brugis scrip. to. 4. Ita à planta pedis visque ad verticem, &c. Con. Basil. ep. synod. Cum omnis Christiana, & ecclesiastica disciplina vita extincta sit, &c. Adr. 6. citatur ab Espenceo, Tit. 1. p. 71. Quibus (peccatis) ad desperationem fura laborat.

* Greg. mor. l. 34. cap. 7.

* Iansen. paraphr. Psal. 18. Genebrar. com. ib. v. 6. Bellar. explan. Psal. 18. Ambros. ad virg. exhort. ubi Christus manet nisi ubi iustitiae meridia fulget, idq; sacrae scripturae docetur testimonio, quod dicit, In Sole posuit tabernaculum suum.

* Matth. Westb. an. 1246. Deuotionem in odium, & maledictionem conuertebant, &c.

* Sext. decret. c. 1. Romanus Pontifex, qui omnia iura in serinio peccatoris sui censetur habere, &c.

* Bos. de sig. l. 16. c. 10. Scriptura non refertur inter ciuiliu modi principia.

* D. Palk. contra Rhem. 1 Tim. 6. n.

3. *You are worthy able to proue your tradition from hand to hand, from age to age, from Bishop to Bishop, whereof you falsely boast, &c.*

* Tertul. apo. c. 6.

* Zabarel. de schif. pag. 559. Quidam summi Pontifices, qui magis ad mo-

dum terrenorum principum, quam Apostolorum ecclesiam reuerunt. Sander. de visib. monarch. l. 2. c. 4. Tam sacerdotalis, quam regia potestas, communicata est pastoribus ecclesiae. Bellar. Recog. pag. 21. Ex illis verbis, Ioh. 21. Pasce oues meas, colligi auctoritatem imperandi regio more. Sext. c. periculos. gloss. totius orbis tenet principatum. Bellar. Recog. de sum. Pontif. l. 5. c. 4. Dum hac recognoscere, acriter de hac re. inter scriptores disceptabatur. Fr. Bozius l. 5. de temporalis Monarchia Papae. Bos. de sig. l. 16. c. 1. Papir. Masson. de epis. Vrb. l. 5. in Bonifac. 8. Pontifex maiore odio incensus mittit in Galliam quendam clericum archidiaconum Narbonensem, cum literis quas publicari iubebat. *Ille autem conturbatus dixit in Philippum, nisi in temporalibus aequae spiritualibus subditum se Romano Pontifici profiteretur.* Tertul. de idol. c. 15. Quod attinet ad honores Regum & imperatorum praecceptum habemus, in omni obsequio nos esse oportere, &c. Contra Scap. c. 2. Colimus Imperatorem, &c. ut hominem à Deo secundum, & solo Deo minorem. Polycarp. apud Euseb. hist. lib. 4. cap. 15. Chrysof. ad Rom. hom. 23. & ad pop. Antioch. hom. 2. Greg. Naz. or. 18. ad ciues trap. Cyril. Alex. epist. de elec. ad Theodos. in lib. contra Iulian. Theodoret. hist. l. 4. c. 8. Aug. de verb. Dom. ser. 6.

and that the Popes and Prelates doe thus: But wee reade your owne Authors², complaining of grosse ignorance, hellish wickednesse, and damnable hypocrisie in your Popes and Church³: And the Scripture prophesieth of an Apostasie from sincerity of faith, in the outward face of the visible Church, and premonisheth concerning Antichrists comming, and decciueable errors, 2 Thell. 2.

There shall be in all ages a visible Church in earth, some parts whereof profess diuine truth in the substance of Religion; but that there must be a Church in all ages gloriously visible, and wherein the chiefeft Prelates sincerely maintaine Gods truth without all error, is a matter affirmed by your selues, but controlled by experience and truth. And the princely Psalmist affirmeth no such thing, Psalme 19. 4. speaking literally of the Sunne, Genesis 1. 16. and mystically of Christ⁴, according to the exposition of your owne Authors⁵.

Also, your Romane Church is of latter dayes become indeed a planet or wandering starre, Iude verse 13. but yet hath little similitude with the Sunne, vnlesse in scorching heat, whereby it consumeth the sap and moisture of goodnesse: and many people by reason of the wrong and oppression they receiue from your Pope, doe curse and cry to God for vengeance against him⁶: like as some inhabitants of Africk are reported to curse the Sunne when it riseth, because of the vehement heat, wherewith it annoyeth them.

Neither is the motion of your Church within the Tropickes of written or Traditionary word, as you pretend; but indeed within the compasse of the Popes spirit and will⁷, you conculcate the written word, excluding it from being a principle of Religion⁸, and you regard not the Traditions of the Apostles or Primitiue Church: and vnlesse you may haue liberty to canonize a new Traditionary word, you are vnable to iustifie the Articles which we oppose, and you defend. We expect Primitiue Traditions⁹, and antique Ordinances of the Apostolike Church, and you tender vs nouelties, and Articles of a latter hatch; and you deale with vs as Tertullian speaketh of the Gentiles¹⁰; *Laudatis antiquitatem, & non de die vinitis: You magnifie antiquity, but sabshon your Religion after a new cut.*

And will you but indifferently consider, it will appeare that the very body of your Church is cast into a new mould: and whereas in the Apostles age, and many descents after, it was a spirituall state, now it is become an earthly Monarchy and kingdom of this world¹¹, contending in our dayes¹² more eagerly for the domiaion of the earth, than it did in the prime age for the inheritance of heauen: your graue Diuines at Rome and other places, doe at this houre eagerly propugne the temporall Monarchy of the Church. And the thirst of your Pope after worldly dominion, is so vnquenchable, that Kings and Princes the Lords anointed, whose Maiefty by diuine law is sacred as his owne, Psal. 82. 2. Exod. 22. 28. and which no religion besides popish, did euer violate or assaile, haue their liues and kingdoms in ieopardy, and sometimes there is but a step betwene them and death, by meanes of your religious proiects. And whereas in times past it was Catholike conscience, *To feare God and honour the King¹³*, 1 Pet. 2. 10. and all the world beleeued Christ Iesus, speaking in Salomon, *By me Kings reigne, Prou. 8. 15. and no person had right to remoue the Diademe, and take the crowne from the Kings head, but God himselfe, Ezech. 21. 26. 1 Sam. 15. 28. in our dayes the Tricrowned Priest and Nazarite of Rome, either by a*

spirituall

spirituall or mixed iurisdiction (such as Esay describerh, saying, *Thy wine is mixed with water*) can vnloose and knap in sunder the girdle of Princes, euen as a threed of tow is broken: And imperiall Souereignty, the pillar and foundation of tranquillity and piety in the Commonwealth^k, 1 Tim. 3. 2. Iude 21. 25. must depend vpon the curtesie and ankle bones of a Popish distinction: and Traditionary expolition of Scripture, fetching his pedegree from Pope Hildebrand, to wit, *Surge Petre & macta*, Act. 10. 13^m. that is, Goe kill and confound Kings.

^k Chrys. ad pop. Antioch. hom. 6.
^l Bellar. de Pontif. Rom. l. 5. c. 6.
 Non potest Papa deponere Principes, &c. tanquam ordinarius iudex: tamen potest tanquam summus princeps spirituales. Non directe & immediate, sed in-

directe & in ordine ad spiritualia. Vide Sander. de vifib. monarch. l. 2. ^m Baron. aanal. to. 11. ex Gregorio 7. Sentent. Card. Baro-

nij, super excommunicat. Venet.



CHAP. V. Paragraph. 1.

Whether inward faith bee needfull to make one a member of the Church.

T. W.

M After White suggesteth, that wee require not any true and inward faith, or other vertues, to denominate or make one a perfect member of Gods Church, but onely an inward (bew thereof: and to this end introduceth Bellarmine^a, speaking thus: No inward vertue is required to make one a part of the true Church, but onely the externall profession of faith.

^a Bellar. de eccles. l. 3. c. 2.

Ans. Here againe you play the falsary; for Doctor White produceth Bellarmine to no such end.

Your Compartner A. D. had said; *The note of sanctity belongeth not to the Protestants Church, by reason many of their people are evidently more wicked, than they were in former time.*

Doctor White, besides other answer, denies the consequent of this reason, affirming, that Papists themselues doe not make personall sanctity a note of the Church; and for prooofe hereof^b he produceth Bellarmine, &c. From whose assertion it followeth, that the former illation of A. D. is false. For if no inward vertue be required to make a Christian an absolute member of the true Church, but onely externall profession of Faith, and communion of Sacraments, then personall sanctity, which consisteth principally of inward vertues, is no note of the Church, because the same is separable from many true members thereof.

^b Harding. Staphilus. Baronius.

T. W. Bellarmine acknowledgeth, that all Theologicall vertues are found in Gods Church, and that inward vertues are necessary for a Christian soule: and hee compares such as want the same, to the lesse profitable and excrementall parts of the body: and Master White wrongeth the Cardinall, who saith; *That a man onely of outward profession, is but aliquo modo pars ecclesie, meaning onely in an imperfect or equiuocall manner of being, &c.*

Ans.

* Stella Com. Luc. 18. Nunc adeo creuit viciorū tempestas, &c. Lambert. Scania. hist. Germ. p. 210. O mores, O tempora, &c. Platin. vita Marcel. 1. Vicia nostra eo creuere, ut vix apud Deum milericordiz locum relinquant. Concil. Basil. resp. synod. Omnis ecclesiasticæ & Christianæ vitæ disciplina, vbiq; pene extincta videtur.

† Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 3. ar. 1. not. 5. Solent hæretici dicere, sanctos esse proprie membra ecclesiæ, alios improprie & equiuoce: sed falluntur, &c. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10.

‡ Platin. vita Ioh. 13. Sunt qui scribunt hunc sceleratissimum hominē, seu monstrum potius, &c.

§ Constan. Concil. sess. 11. ar. 5. Fax viciorum, & diabolus incarnatus. Benedic. 9. apud Baron. annal. to. 11. Alexand. 6. apud Guicciardin. & alios. || Bellar. de ima. l. 2. c. 21. Quod non dicitur, nisi improprie, simpliciter negari potest. Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 3. ar. 6. ad. 4. Nisi forte æquiuoce, quod perinde est ac non esse.

Ans. First, this remoueth not my Brothers answer to A. D. for although Theologicall and inward vertues, bee alwaies found in some members of the Church; yet the same may bee wanting in many, and sometimes in the most: and the multitude of those which want them, being according to Bellarmine, absolute members of the visible Church, may bee more wicked than people were in former times.

2. The last part of the answer, which is, *That a man of outward profession only, is a part of the true Church, in an imperfect and equiuocall manner of being only*, is both repugnant to the Tenet of your owne Doctors^d, and subuerteth the Popish Church: for hence it followeth, that the Romane Pope when hee is a wicked monster^e, and Deuill incarnate^f, is not the visible head of the Church: for hee which is a member in an æquiuocall manner of being; to wit, like a wooden leg, or a head of brasse, is no organical part, no head or instrument to cause influx of Faith or Sacraments into the body of the Church, as our Adversaries maintaine their Pope doth. And hence it followeth, that the Romane Church is many times a breathlesse and headlesse lumpe, without any Faith or Sacraments; and as the head is æquiuocall, so the faith and religion is in name only such, and not in definition.

Lastly, if as Bellarmine saith, those persons which want inward vertues, are no otherwise members of the visible Church, than the haire of a mans head, his nailes and euill humors, are members of a naturall body; it is worthy the inquiry, how Popes and Prelates being such, can be the foundation of the militant Church or principall parts whereof the same consisteth; seeing it was neuer yet heard of, that haire, nailes, or euill humors, did principally constitute the frame of the naturall body of man.

Paragr. 2. Bellarmine concerning ignorance, and implicate faith.

^a Bellarm. de iust. l. 1. c. 7.

T. W. Master White alleageth Bellarmine^a, saying; Faith is better defined by ignorance, than by knowledge; so proue, that among vs the lay people are not bound to know what the matters of faith be. But Bellarmine speaketh of such knowledge as proceedeth from the demonstrable evidence of the thing knowne, and is incompatible with faith; and not of Christian understanding, going with faith, and proceeding from diuine reuelation: for same Master white forbears to seduce any longer the ignorant, &c. making them beleue, that Bellarmine doth support a supine and affected ignorance of the articles of faith.

ⁱ Nunc aduersus Caluinum, &c. Bonauen. 1. d. 24. exposit. textus. Stapl. d. iust. l. 8. c. 24. in eo qui corde credit ad iustitiā, requiritur explicata cognitio, ut sciatur quid credat, &c. Col. Cora. Luc. 1. annot. 107. Hugo d. sacram. l. 1. p. 10. cap. 3. duo sunt in quibus fides constat, cognitio, & affectus. Cognitionem hic intelligimus, scientiam rerum, non illam quæ ex præsentia ipsarum comprehenditur, sed illam quæ auditu solum percipitur, & ex verborum significatione manifestatur. Thom. Aquin. 2. 2. q. 174. ar. 6. fides nostra, in duobus principaliter consistit: primo quidem in vera cognitione Dei, &c. Caietan. in 2. 2. q. 171. ar. 3. nulla alia cognitio a fide negatur, nisi euidentiā habens.

Ans. 1. Bellarmine in the Chapter whence these words are taken, disputeth against Caluinⁱ, and excludeth from faith such knowledge as hee affirmed to be necessary thereunto. But the knowledge which Caluin required vnto Faith, was not the knowledge of demonstration, such as the Manichees would haue; but onely the knowledge of reuelation, that is, the conceiuing by vnderstanding, the object beleueed, as the same is propounded in the Scripture, and doctrine of the Church.

2. Bellarmine giues instance in children, women, rurall and vnlettered per-

sons,

sons, who (saith he ^k) are numbred among the faithfull, and belecue the articles of the Trinity and other points of Faith, although they scarce conceiue any thing in their minds besides the sound of the words. Hence it followeth, that Bellarmine excludeth from faith as a thing generally necessary thereunto, all distinct knowledge of the matters beleueed: and then saying in the conclusion of the Chapter, That Faith is better defined by ignorance than by knowledge, hee can meane no otherwise, but that grosse ignorance in diuers persons may stand with faith; and by the word *notitia*, hee vnderstandeth both the science of demonstration which the Manichees^l required in faith, and also the knowledge of reuelation which Caluin requires.

se quod credit ecclesia, & ecclesiam itidem credere, quod ipse crederet. 1 Aug. de vit. cred. c. 1. Greg. Val. to. 3. nichil contendebant, nihil esse amplius credendum, quam quod possit euidentia ratione demonstrari.

^k Bellar. de iustif. l. 1. c. 7. Cum maxima pars fidelium vel propter aetatem puerilem, vel propter sexum muliebrem, &c. Vide Stapl. Rel. c. 5. q. 3. ar. 4. ad. 8. Espenc. com. 2. Tim. 3. Decantata hodie per Catholicos Carbonarij fideles, qui quicquid crederet interrogatus, responderit, credere

Paragr. 3. *Whether Nauar make it heresie, to dispute of matters of faith.*

T.W. *Master White alleageth Nauar. saying; It is heresie for a lay man to dispute of matters of faith. But the said Author maketh it onely mortall sinne, and a lesse offence than heresie.*

Ans. In the *sexus Decretalium*^m, the prohibition, forbidding lay men to dispute of the Catholike faith, vnder paine of excommunication, is placed vnder the Title *De hereticis*: and Nauar in his *Manuall*^a, condemning in lay men all disputation concerning matters of Faith, confirmes his assertion by that Text of the Canon law: and this gaue my Brother occasion to suppose, that Nauar accounted the same heresie. And in those places where Popery is in full strength, if lay men dispute and question matters of Faith, the sacred Inquisitors will be bold to examine whether they smell of heresie or not^o; and it esteemes they doe the same, their law will pronounce them Heretikes indeed.

^m Sext. decr. l. 5. tit. 2. de heret. c. Quicumque.
^a Nauar. enchir. c. 11. n. 26. Silu. sum. v. disp. Linwood. l. 5. de Magist. c. preterea gloss. Laicus nullo modo disputare debet de fide publice vel occulte.
^o Hufen. Moller. hist. Iesuit. c. 3. Si contra disputent, ad domum Inquisitionis remittuntur.



CHAP. VI. Paragraph 1.

Whether Synesius be abused concerning his owne mariage.

T. W.

Master White, page 343. produceth a testimony from Synesius Bishop of Ptolemais, who in an Epistle to his friend Euopius, writeth thus: The sacred hand of Theophilus hath giuen mee a Wife, and hereupon I testifie to all men, that I will neither forsake her, neither priuily as an adulterer keepe her company, but I will pray to God to send mee by her many and good children. Here our Ministers incredible deceit (of which he is to himselfe most conscious) lyeth, in applying the words, spoken by Synesius when he was a lay man, to him as hee was

K

after-

Niceph. hist. eccle. l. 14. c. 55.

afterward a Bishop and Priest, &c. Synesius after hee was created Bishop of Ptolemais, lined for all the time after separated from the company of his wife: and he acknowledgeth in this very Epistle, that mariage with a determination, not to leaue the company of his wife, is a sufficient barre or let to Priesthood.

Now what doe you say Master White? doe you not thinke that this your perfidious dealing being once made knowne, will become odious, &c.

Ans^r. Master White saith, you haue a brasse visage, and are able to out-face euen impudency it selfe.

* Niceph. hist. eccl. l. 4. c. 55. Omnibus predicato, me illam prorsus de securam non esse, & De quibuldam rebus, illi ambigenti, per commodam dispensationem sacerdotij dignitatem suscipere permittit.
* Euagr. hist. l. 1. c. 15. Suidas.
f Baronio. 5. ann. 410. n. 72.
g Langus annot. Niceph. l. 4. c. 55. Index expurg. Belg. in Lango p. 77. hath not expurged it.
h Socrat. hist. l. 5. c. 21. τοιοῦτον αὐτῷ ἐν τῇ ἐκείνῃ τῇ ἐκείνῃ, πρὸς τὴν αὐτῆς τοιαύτης φύσεως ἡ συνεισφορά.
i Nicoph. l. 1. c. 34.

1. It is true, that Synesius whiles hee was a lay man, penned this Epistle to Euopius: and being solicited by Theophilus and others, to become the Bishop of Ptolemais, excuseth himselfe as vnfit for so great a function: and among other impediments alleageth his mariage, professing that hee would by no meanes forsake his wife. But Theophilus and the rest vrge him notwithstanding to vndertake the Episcopall function: And touching his mariage and all other demands proposed by him, they leaue him to his owne choice, to doe as seemed good vnto him. And it appeareth by diuers arguments, that hee forsooke not his wife: 1. hee saith expressly, hee would not forsake her, &c. 2. Nicephorus affirmeth, that it was committed vnto him, κατὰ διοίκησιν, by fauour or dispensation to receiue the Priestly dignity^d: whereby it is manifest, that the Church condescended vnto him, and gaue him liberty to keepe his wife. 3. It is affirmed by no ancient Writer^e, nor by Baronious^f himselfe, relating this Story, that Synesius forsooke his mariage. 4. Langus^g a Papist, in his marginall annotation, vpon this place of Nicephorus, saith, that Synesius would not put away his wife. 5. It was not vniuersally obserued in those dayes for Bishops to liue out of mariage^h, and therefore Synesius being otherwise minded, there was no absolute necessity for him to forsake his wife.

To the abusive conclusion of this Popish Priest, I answer with Seneca, *Uti quisque est contemptissimus, ita est lingue solutissima*, The more vnworthy any one is, the more slippery and riotous is his tongue.

Paragr. 2. Concerning Paphnutius.

T. W. For his further Patronizing of Priests mariage, hee vrgeth that often obtruded place of S. Paul, Heb. 13. Mariage is honourable among all men, and at these words citeth in the margent Sozomen, as writing, that Paphnutius maintained the Protestants construction of that place, so as that Priests might absolutely marry at any time.

i Greg. Martin. ag. transl. Rhem. Heb. 13. an. 3.
k Sozom. hist. l. 1. c. 23. Grace & Latine, c. 22. ἡμεῖς δὲ γάμον ἀποδεχόμενοι, οὐκ ἐγγονοῦμεν.
l Chryst. in Hebr. hom. 33.
m Valsq. paraphr. in Heb. 13. 3. Theophyl. Interpretatur an omnibus hominibus. Lira. Caiet. D. Fulk. ag. Rhem. Heb. 13. cunctis more.

Ans^r. Master White produceth the Story of Paphnutius out of Sozomen, not to proue that Priests might marry at any time, as you belye him; but to shew that Papists in the matter of Priests mariage, are varied from the Primitiue Church.

And as touching the place of Paul, Heb. 13. 4. which you and othersⁱ affirme to be wrongly translated: 1. It is manifest, that Paphnutius vnderstood the place as we do, for otherwise it would not haue serued to proue the lawfulness of Priests mariage, for which hee produceth it^k. 2. Chrysostome and Theophylact vnderstand the same of persons. τῶν καὶ ὁ γάμος παῖσι: Mariage is honourable to all, saith Chrysostome^l. And Valsques confesseth^m, that Theophylact doth interpret it of all men as wee doe: and the latter part of the verse, Whore

Whoremongers and Adulterers God will iudge, being an opposition to the first part, sheweth that it is fittest to expound the same of persons.

T. W. The Councell of Nice did onely tolerate and permit the mariage of Priests, before their entrance into Priesthood, but not after their consecration; which doth absolutely crosse the scope of Master White, who will haue it lawfull for men to marry after they be entred into Orders.

Ans. The learned Papists know, that this Story of Paphnutius, and decree of the first Nicene Councell depending vpon it, makes against them; otherwise why doe so many censure and reiect it?

2. The Story being admitted, proueth that Matrimony and Priesthood are compatible; and that a Priest liuing in wedlocke, may exercise his ministeriall office, without any offence to diuine law, or the primitiue Ecclesiasticall law.

3. There can no solid reason be giuen, why the vse of mariage before Priesthood, and continued afterwards; is rather lawfull than that which is contracted after Orders.

But the truth is, the best of you are in a wood, and opposing your selues despitefully against Gods ordinance, the Lord hath confounded you, partly by his expresse word, 1 Tim. 3. 2, 12. Tit. 1. 6. which as plainly approues the matrimonie of Ministers, as of any other persons: and also by giuing vp your Popes and Clergie to such intolerable filthinesse, as hath made your single life ridiculous to all the world. And the best you are able to performe in this Argument, is to iere and mow, and to befable your sectators with the fat conceit of a woman and a steeple; fitter to bee vttered by the wiseman of a morrice, than a Catholike Priest: of which Bernard saith; *Toyes and idle words are vanitie in secular persons, but in a Priests lips they be blasphemies.*

dotibus non liceat, laicis licere. ¶ Reads the storie of Iob, Croom, Cardinall, the Popes Legat, who hauing the day before, in a Synod at London condemned Priests marriage, was at night taken in bed with a quene, &c. Henric, Hunting. hist. Angl. l. 7. Math. Paril. in Henric. 1. an. 1155. Math. Westmon. Henric. 1. p. 31. Fabian, chronicle pa. 326. ¶ Bernard. de consid. ad Eugen. l. 2.

¶ Bosius de sig. l. 5. c. 9. Figmentum est quod de Paphnutio narratur. Baronio. 3. an. 325. n. 128. Alan. Copus dial. 1. pa. 154. Cajetan. quod. lib. 2. q. 12. ait olim post susceptos ordines sacros, licuisse matrimonio copulari ad incedet glissam d. 31. c. Alter quæ citato loco exponit copulantur, id est, copulato vtuntur. Iud. Tena. com. Heb. c. 5. dist. 1. §. 1. pa. 351.

¶ Tertul. exhort. ad cast. c. 7. Vani erimus, si putauerimus, quod facer-

Paragr. 3. Saint Augustine concerning fasting.

T. W. The Doctor for the great auersion which hee hath of fasting, and forbidden meats for certaine daies, writeth; that ancient Monkes made no distinction of meats, and alledgeth Austin, &c.

Ans. Doctor Whites assertion is; That the ancient Monkes were not the same or like the Popish, but of another kinde, and among sundry other things they differ in their manner of fasting. For whereas the substance of the Romish fast is difference of fish and flesh, according to a positive law of the Romish Church: the ancient Monks knew not this Romane distinction of meats, neither did they formally obserue the same; that is, by a generall necessitie, or by vow, or with reference to the Popes decree; or by esteeming any one kinde of meat holier than another. But their fasting was a generall abstinence from all dainties, either flesh or fish, or wine, or of any other kinde. And they did this freely without compulsion, law, or vow: Also vpon iust occasion they vsed any food indifferently, as Saint Augustine testifieth in the place alleaged, saying; *The same persons which refraine when they are in health, if sicknesse constraineth them, receiue any food without difference; yea, they which be in health, doe*

¶ Aug. de mor. eccles. l. 2. c. 33.

¶ Digress. 45.

Aug. ib. ¶ Continent se qui possunt, &c. multi neque vescuntur carnibus, &c.

¶ Abstinere vel propter fratrum imbecilitatem, vel propter suam libertatem.

¶ Pietatem sedulo exercent, corporis vero exercitatio-

nem ad exiguum tempus pertinere nouerunt, 1 Tim. 4. 8. ¶ Non solum à carnibus & vino abstinent, sed etiam ab ijs quæ venter & gutturis prouocant appetitum. ¶ Propter suam libertatem. ¶ De mor. eccl. Cath. c. 13. Aug. de Ciuit. Dei l. 16. c. 37. Non sibi genere, sed auiditate immodesta quenquam culpandum. Aug. cont. Faust. Manich. l. 30. c. 5. Christiani non heretici sed Catholici, edomandi corporis causa, &c. non solum à carnibus verum à quibusdam etiam terræ fructibus abstinent, vel semper sicut pauci, vel certis diebus atque temporibus, sicut per quadrigesimam fere omnes, QUANTO MAGIS QVISQVE SEV VOLVERIT SEV POTVERIT.

^b T. V. doth shew himselfe so resolute an Advocate of venerie, so much of Epicurisme.

^c Tertul. cont.

Marcion. l. 5. c. 15.

^d Paul. Iouan. vita

Leo. 10 l. 4. Platin.

vita Ioh. 13.

Onuphr. in Alex.

and. 6.

^e Petrus Rauenn.

serm. synod. Can.

cited by Coccius p. 2.

Th. Iaur. Cath. l. 8.

ar. 6.

^f Holcot. sup. Sap.

l. p. 183. Dæmones

incubi. Gignunt

communiter pin-

gus, grossos, &

corpulentos, &c.

^g Colum. hunc vi-

lissimum deum,

&c.

courteously minister the same to the weak, and generally to all which cannot other-
wise enjoy their bodily health: and whereas some persons foolishly refuse that which
is thus offered, they brotherly admonish them to beware, lest by vaine superstition
they rather make themselves unhealthfull than holy.

In the conclusion of this Paragraph, Master White is called an Advocate of
venerie^b, by reason he defendeth Ministers matrimonic; and of Epicurisme,
because he denies the Monkish distinction of meats: but it seemes this Popish
Priest neuer read Tertullian^c, saying; *Lust or venerie is not ascribed to matri-*
monie, no not by the very Gentiles, but to inordinate, unnaturall, or prodigious lust,
(such as the Romane Priests, Monks, and Popes^d doe exercise, if their owne
friends haue done them right.) Ob how many wretched Priests in Italy, France,
Spaine and other Regions, (saith Petrus Rauennas^e) doe by incontinencie sse more
swiftly than an arrow to the Region of hell! And Holcot^f; Our moderne Priests
are like Satyres or Incubi through lecherie: and as the Incubi or Night-mares are
reported to haue begotten Giants; so the Priests of Priapus and Beelphegor^g
(Baal-Peor, Namb. 25. 3.) by the vehemencie of lust, beget grosse and corpulent
children. And that Epicurus himselfe hath not equalled the Popish Monks in
gluttonie, is shewed before, Chapter 2. in the answer to S. Hierom, §. 11.

An obseruation concerning the matrimonic of the Clergie.

^g Hieron. super
Daniel. 11. ^e An-
tichristo, facilius
interpretatio est,
quod simulat ca-
stitatem, vesperti-
mos decipiat.

^h yonixg.

Caetan. Mulieres

pro vxores, pro-

culdubio episco-

porum & diaco-

norum. Hugo.

Card. Mulieres

scilicet ordinan-

dorum.

ⁱ Clem. Alex. l. 1.

de mactis. p. 199.

Aug. d. bon. vid.

ca. 12. nec ex meo

corde prater scrip-

turæ authorita-

tem, quasi hec

nuptias audeo cō-

dempare.

Euthym. Panopl.

p. 2. Tit. 12. aper-

tetum Christo rum

Apostolis aduer-

santur, qui nup-

tias maledictis af-

ficiunt, & dete-

stantur.

^h Iguatim cited by

Longw. and Ni-

ceph. l. 4. c. 8.

Dionys. Corinth.

Episc. Niceph. ib.

Mā to Buzi ouer-

the alywae. de i-

pusayac. p. 100.

by tunc aduocis,

de d. d. tunc

aduocis. p. 100.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

de d. d.

Because this Popish Priest, being himselfe a votarie, and disciple of one, who,
according to Saint Hierom^g, *Shall faigne chastitie that hee may deceiue the*
mor, doth very despighfully in sundry passages of his Treatise, condemne, abuse,
and deride the matrimonic of Protestant Ministers; therefore I will propose to
the view of my Reader, some materiall obseruations concerning this matter, to
the end it may appeare, what cause our Aduerlaries haue, either to glory in their
owne pretended chastitie, or to calumniare in others lawfull marriage.

1. The doctrine of the Romists concerning single life of Bishops and Priests,
is contrariety to the expresse word of God, 1 Tim. 3. 2. *A Bishop must bee the*
husband of one wife, &c. one that ruleth well his owne house, having his children
in subiection, and verse 11, speaking of Deacons, Euen so must their wives^h bee
grauē, &c. let the Deacons bee the husbands of one wife, ruling their children and
their houses well, Tit. 1. 6. 1 Cor. 7. 2. And from the foresaid Scripture, Cle-
ment of Alexandriaⁱ saith: The Apostle admitteth the husband of one wife, whe-
ther he bee a Priest or a Deacon, or a lay-man, which useth matrimonic without
reprehension.

And againe, *All the Epistles of the Apostles which teach sobrietie and continen-*
cie, and which deliuer innumerable precepts of matrimonic, procreation of children,
and household government, doe no where prohibit or disannull honest and temperate
matrimonic. And this was the Orthodox faith of the prime Christians, who
said^k; Impose the yoke of single life upon no man, for it is a perillous burthen, and
hard to be kept, euen when it is obtained, if it be obserued of necessitie.

2. In Tertullian^l and Cyprians daies, matrimonic of Bishops and Priests
was reputed honourable and lawfull: Cyprian^m speaking of one Fœlix, saith;
That hee administred the Priesthood vnder Decimus, and lined next vnto him with
Victoria his wife: And in another placeⁿ, Let the Priest Numidicus bee placed
among the Presbyters of Carthage, who cheerefully beheld the Martyrs when they
were burned, and with them his owne wife, Lateri suo adhaerentem, carrying by his
side. And the Papiests confesse, that matrimonic of the Clergie was lawfull in the
prime age of the Church. Hugo the Cardinall saith^o: It was then lawfull for

^l Tertul. exhort. ad cast. c. 7. ^m Cypri. ep. 19. vel l. 3. ep. 15. ⁿ Cypri. ep. 35. vel l. 4. ep. 10. ^o Hugo Card. com. 1 Tim. 3. Tunc licebat sacerdotibus habere uxores.

Priests to haue wines. Alphonsus Castro ^p; *In the prime age of the Church wee reade that Priests were married.* And Pammelius ^q vpon the former place of Cyprian: *In that age, because of the scarcitie of single men, wedded Priests were chosen.* And Æneas Syluius ^r, afterward Pope; *The primitiue Church did not erre, which permitted Priests to enioy wines:* And Gerson ^s; *In the primitiue Church Priests were married, because then there were but few, and by reason they had wines before their conuersion; and they used matrimonie soberly, and the Church was not yet endowed with temporall possessions.*

3. They which first disgraced wedlocke in the primitiue Church, were Heretikes ^t; and in the yeere 320. the Eustachians ^u were condemned for despising married Priests. And the decree of the Councell of Gangra ^x, touching the same matter, is very well knowne.

4. Although some ancient Fathers embracing the conceit of Tertulian ^y and Origen ^z, and admiring single life, because of libertie and outward commoditie, as also because the world fauoured the same, did aduance by their doctrine and example solitarie chastitie, and disgraced matrimonie: and some of their speeches, and namely, of Hierom ^a, scarce differ from Heresie; yet the same Fathers ^b acknowledge, that married persons were elected Priests in those daies. And Augustine ^c saith, *The Church had many such.* And Socrates ^d; *Not a few Bishops of the East, liuing in the Episcopall office, procreate children by their lawfull wines.* And Chrysostome ^e saith, *That wedlocke is so precious, that with it one may ascend to the throne and dignitie of a Bishop ^f.*

5. The learned Papists acknowledge, that matrimonie in the Clergie is not prohibited by diuine law, but onely by Ecclesiasticall or the Popes law ^g. And sundry Papists ^h haue affirmed, that it were profitable for the Church to haue the single life of the Clergie remoued, because of that horrible scandall which Priests and Ecclesiasticks did bring vpon their order by whoredome and filthinesse. And when after the 1000. yeere Pope Hildebrand generally obtruded the law of single life vpon the Clergie, that Act of his is censured by Historians and others, as a noueltie, and a thing pernicious. Antonine ⁱ the Archbishop of Florence, and Sigebert ^k reporting how this Pope remoued married Priests from their office, say: *This was done by him nouo exemplo, after a new fashion, and as many conceiued, of an inconsiderate zeale, and that it caused a grieuous scandall in the Church: and how few Priests after the enacting of this Law, lined continently: but some for lucre and vaine-glorie feigned continencie, and many did accumulate to incontinencie, periurie, manifold adulteries, &c.* The same is affirmed by Auentine ^l, Lambertus Scafnaaburgensis ^m, Matthew Paris ⁿ, and others.

6. There was neuer generally, or in regard of the greater number, any true chastitie in the Popish Clergie; and euer since the law of single life was obtruded, whoredome and bawderie so shamefully distained them, that they became a by-word to the Christian world ^o.

Bernard ^p complaineth in this sort: *If according to Ezekiel his prophesie, wee dig thorow the wall, we shall finde in the house of God an horrible abomination: for after and besides fornication, adulterie, and incest, the very passions of ignominie and works of filthinesse, (Rom. 1. 27.) are not wanting, for which the Cities of Sodome and Gomorrha, the very nurses of filthinesse were preadamed. Some of the Priests of the Church are besprinkled with the loathsome and matterie filth of this*

^p Alph. Castro. cont. har. l. 13. v. sacerdotium.

^q Pammel. an. Cypr. ep. 19.

^r Æneas Silu. ep. 136. c. Thabortasacitatur à Coc-

cio thesau. tom. 2.

^s l. 8. ar. 6.

^t Gerson. p. 4.

^u Dom. oclau. Epi-

phan. ser. de mod.

^v viuend. coniug.

^x collat. 2. Bona-

uent. 4. d. 37. q. 3.

^y Tunc non fuit in-

dicta clericis con-

tinencia. Claud.

^z Eipenc. com. Tit.

^a Multis annorum

^b centenarijs post

^c Apostolos Eccle-

^d sia primitiua de-

^e fectu celibum,

^f habuit sacerdotes

^g maritos. Conrad.

^h Cling. loc. com. l.

ⁱ 3. c. 36. Tempore

^j nascens Eccle-

^k sia, vsque ad Si-

^l ricij & Innocentij

^m tempora coniuga-

ⁿ ti ordinabantur in

^o sacerdotibus. An-

^p tonin. p. 2. Tit. 12.

^q ca. 2. §. 9.

^r Iren. l. 1. c. 22.

^s Clem. Al. Strom. l.

^t 2. in fine, & l. 3. per

^u totum. Epiphan.

^v har. 26. Tertulian.

^w Origen, turning he-

^x retikes. Aug. ep.

^y 74. & de mor.

^z Manich. l. 2. c. 18.

^a Sozom. hist. l. 3.

^b c. 13.

^c Concil. Gangr.

^d can. 4. Gratian. d.

^e 28. ca. si quis.

^f Tertul. exhort.

^g cast. c. 3. & c. 9.

^h Orig. sup. Rom.

ⁱ l. 10.

^j Hieron. in libris

^k cont. Iovin. Lud.

^l Viues schol. Aug.

^m de Ciuit Dei. l. 16.

ⁿ c. 34.

^o Hieron. l. 1. cont.

^p Iovin. El guntur

^q mariti in sacerdo-

^r tium. Plurimi sa-

^s cerdotes habent

^t matrimonia.

^u Aug. hares. 40.

^v Socrat. hist. l. 5.

^w c. 21. Gratian. d.

^x 31. c. aliter. & d.

^y 36. c. Cenoman-

^z nus.

^a Chryl. sup. Tit.

^b hom. 2. 2. 2. 2. 2.

^c &c.

^d Hist. Trip. l. 1.

c. 10. Spiridion habuit uxorem & filios, &c. vir clarus, &c. Antonin. 2 Tit. 11. ca. 2. §. 9. Chastitas ordini annexa est, ex statuto ec-
clesiæ. Aug. Triumph. de pot. eccles. q. 92. ar. 3. Concilij & supererogationis opus. Alphons. Castro. cont. har. l. 13. v. sacer. Al-
uifod. sum. l. 4. tr. 9. q. 4. Thom. Aqu. 2. 2. q. 88. ar. 7. & Caietan. opusc. tom. 1. tract. 27. Soc. 4. d. 38. q. 1. ar. 1. Siluest. sum. v.
marim. Mich. Medin. de continen. c. 1. Azor. p. 1. inst. mor. l. 13. c. 12. Est communis sententia Theologorum veterum & recentiorum,
Æneas Silu. in Platin. vita Pij 2. & de gest. Concil. Basil. Multi saluarentur in sacerdotio coniugati, qui in sterili celibatu damnantur,
Panormitan. cum olim. de cler. Stephanus Auerrius. Durand. Lindan. Erasmus, &c. Antonin. sum. hist. p. 2. tit. 6. c. 1.
§. 21. Sigebert. chron. an. 1074. 18. Auentin. annal. Boior. l. 5. Lambert. Scaf. hist. Germ. pag. 201. Matth. Paris.
Wil. Conquest. an. 1074. Auentin. annal. l. 5. Cauda falax sacrificiorum in proverbum abiit. Bernard. de conuers.
ad cler. c. 29.

uncleannesse, and abstaining from the remedie of wedlocke, they breake out into all flagitious wickednesse.

Auentine⁹ in the storie of Pope Gregorie the seuenth, the Author of this compelled Eunuchisme, speaketh in this manner; And thou, O vigilant Gregorie, what wouldst thou haue done if fortune had reserved thee untill our daies, in which to dally with women, to whore, drinke, to ravish and deflowre Virgins, to adulterate wiues, is become the principall studie of Priests, in so much, that cauda salax sacrificulorum in prouerbium abiit?

The Synode of Treuers^r celebrate in the yeere 1548. relateth as followeth: To this sinne (of drunkennesse) is ioyned another more grievous staine of offence, to wit, the unlawfull societie of Priests and Deacons with women, which bow intolerable enmie and hatred of all the professors of Catholike faith against sacred persons, it hath procured from the first beginning untill now, can hardly bee expressed. And we must ingenuously confesse, that no staine of wickednesse hath more grievously offended the eies of the vulgar, and ministred greater occasion to their rage and cruelty against the Ecclesiasticall state than this. Gerson^r reporteth, that in his daies the lecherie of the Popish Clergie was a generall and a rooted euill: and many iudged it a smaller offence for Priests to lue with Concnubines of their owne, than to commit more grievous crimes with the wiues and daughters of their Parishioners, besides other more horrible abominations. Hugo Cardinalis^r: Priests in our daies are not the husbands of one wife, (according to Paul, 1 Tim. 3.) but fornicators with ten or twentie harlots. And lastly, Sigonius^u; An inquirie being made in Germanie into Ecclesiasticall persons, there was scarce one found, who was not a Simoniacke or a fornicator.

7 Whereas the Papists in specious words reiected wedlocke in their Clergie, yet indeed they did practise and admit it: for although their Bishops and Priests kept no women vnder the title of wiues, yet they generally maintained Lemans and Concnubines which were an inferiour kinde of wiues².

Onuphrius in the life of Pope Alexander the sixth, saith; If this Pope at any time were not oppressed with businesse, he denoted himselfe to all sorts of pleasure without resp. Et, being especially addicted to women, of which hee begat foure sonnes and two daughters. The chiefe of his Lemans was Vannocia, a Roman, which by reason of her beautie and amorous dalliance, and marvellous fruitfulness in his meaner fortunes, he detained in a manner as a lawfull wife².

Pope Hildebrand^a, the Father of the generall decree of single life in the Clergie, was reported to haue lulled night and day without any shame, in the armes and embracings of the great Countesse Maud: and that shee being surprised with the stolne dalliance of this Pope, regarded not second marriage after the decease of her first husband. Reade Antonine^b, reporting the like of Pope Clement the fifth: and Pope Leo^c the tenth was defamed, for Sodomiticall filthinesse, with his Pages and Chamberlaines, saith Iouius, a Romish Bishop.

And as touching the common sort of Priests, Gratians glosse is not vknowne^d; Few of them were found without that fault: And the glosse vpon Legat Otho^e; If a Priest keepe his Concnubine privately within his owne or his friends house, he incurreth not the penaltie of this Constitution.

Peter Rauennas^f, and Michael Lochmaier^g, liuing about the yeare 1490. re-

⁹ Auentin. annal. l. 5. pag. 448.

^r Concil. Treuir. sub Ioh. to. 4. Concil. Surij edit. 2. pag. 119. Polyd. de inuent. l. 5. c. 4. saith the like.

^r Alphons. Castro. d. iust. hæret. punit. l. 3. ca. 5. pa. 615.

^r Tam frequens iam est facinorositas in continentia, ut si quis illorum cha-

^r tus esse sciat, quauis multa alia necessaria illi desint, ob hoc solum sanctus à populo habeatur.

^r Gers. de vita spir. l. 4. cor. 14.

^r Inexpertis forsitan erant hij doctores, quam generale, & quam rationale sit hoc

^r malum: quo deteriora flagitia circa vxores aut filias parochianorum, & horrendæ abominaciones in alijs prouenerent.

^r Hug. Card. com. super 1 Tim. 3.

^r Sigon. de reg. Ital. l. 9.

^r Bonauent. 4. d. 37. q. 3. hic morbus incontinentie maxime viget in Clericis ut patet. Roderic. speculum. vitæ. l. 2. c. 19 fol. 305.

^r Quanto liberioribus sunt Canonici tanto licentius in plurima abacchantur vitia.

^r Nec vna vni sufficiunt muliercula nisi retentam habeant in domo ut vxorem: concubinas verò & adulesculas quarum non est numerus.

^r Lippoman. cat. Gen. 23. Concnubina olim non erant illegitima & fornicaria, sed vxores minime principales.

^r Lefseus de iust. & iur. l. 4. c. 3. d. 7. Aliqui iurisperiti dicunt, concubinatum legitimum coitum Barthol. & alij. Constit. Otho. de concub. cler. gloss. Vxor comedit cum viro in eadem patina, eam honeste induit, &c. sed quando tenet illam ut ancillam, & mittit ad aquam, &c. 7 Omphr. vita Alexand. 6.

^r Iuste vxoris loco pene habuit. a Lamb. Scaf. hist. Germ. b Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 21. c. 3. §. 3.

^r Iouius l. 4. de vita Leo. 10. d. Gloss. d. 81. c. Maximin. e Gloss. Otho. de concub. cler. Si secrete. Si non caste tamen caute. Conrad. Cling. loc. com. l. 3. c. 52.

^r Vbi sunt, qui corrigunt tam aperta lenocinia, quod presbyteri, sub pretextu ancillarum, habeant concubinas, cum quibus tor habent pueros: aliqui legitimas apud se, frivole contra voluntatem maritorum, detinent vxores: aliqui virgines deflorantes, & penes se occulte rementes, &c. aliqui pluribus non contentantur, sed hodie illam, cras alteram constuprant, &c. Math. Paris in Henric. 3. Legatus Otho in Concil. London. licet ad prostigandum à laribus Ecclesiæ, putridum illud turpitudinis libidinosæ contagium, quo decor ecclesiæ grauius maculatur, studuerunt semper, ecclesiastici correctores: ipsum tamen tantæ improbitatis existit, ut semper se ingerat, impudendum. pa. 436.

^r Dionys. Carthus. c. plural. benefic. ar. 13. Quidam eorum, quamvis pro dolor paucissimi, temperate continenterque viuunt. f Rauennas. ferm. in synod. Cam. g Lochmaier. paroch. pag. 134. Sum. predic. de Luxur. sicut patet de viris ecclesiasticis, qui ancillas sub titulo familiaritatis, in domibus suis continuo tenent, in quibus ipsæ dominantur, & peccandi liberas habent habenas.

port, that many Clerkes in their dayes did openly keepe Concubines as their wives, and brought up children. And Clemangis^b; The Priests being at a fee with the Prelates, doe commonly and openly keepe their Concubines.

And Iacobus de Graphijsⁱ, a Monke of Cascina in Italy, liuing in our dayes, complaineth; *Oh grievous (to be reported) Priests, Deacons, and Subdeacons, doe in the open face of the world keepe Concubines as if they were wives, and openly bring up their children.* And Frier Paul^k a Venetian now liuing, reporteth, that the Abbot of Nerusfa, besides other unchaste behauiour, was accused to the State of Venice for daily filthinesse with his naturall sister. And one Scipio Saracino, a Canon of Vincenza, was in like manner accused, for putting in practise his lecherie euen within Churches.

8. If there were the loue of true chastitie in the Pope, and Romane Clergie, why doe they tolerate and support the Stewes in Rome it selfe*, and all other places of their gouernment? Sixtus the Pope in late times, as a Papist^l reports, builded a famous Stewes. And the question being debated by Schoole-men of nicest conscience^m, whether it be lawfull for the Romane Church to tolerate harlots, is resolu'd affirmatiuely. And Iacobus de Graphijsⁿ saith; *That according to some great luriſts, the law doth so farre forth tolerate fornication, that it compelleth harlots to play the queanes with any that will, provided alwayes that they be paid their fee.*

To conclude this obseruation: let our Aduersaries in their malice against honest matrimonie, being Gods ordinance, beware lest that be verified of them which Clement of Alexandria^o speaketh of Plato and other Philosophers: *That they maintaining decrees of chastity with their tongue, serued vile lusts, some vsing Harlots and Lemans, and many abusing young men.* And there is a memorable speech of Augustus the Emperour, in Dio Cassius^p vsed to some of like affection with our Romane Priests: *It is not the loue of single life, and a desire to be without women, which hath perswaded you, for at his pleasure euery one hath his mate by his side; but you seeke liberty for lasciuiousnesse and lust.* The true reason why the Pope doth so eagerly (against the Apostles doctrine) maintaine the single life of the Clergie, is, temporall commoditie, and the worldly glory of the Church^q, as Gerson intimateth in the words formerly alleaged, *Nondum erat Ecclesia dotata.* And Bonauenture expressly deliuereth the same: *Whiles the Church was not endowed with temporall wealth and dominion, it had married Priests.* And it is to be noted that at the same time, and by the same Pope, who vsurped ouer the Magistrate^r, was this law of single life obtruded vpon the Church, and no doubt to the same purpose, to support the liberty, pride, and pompe of the Antichristian state.

Strom. l. 3. μιχαλ λωσις ἀγάπης καὶ δόξης. pag. 181. p Dio hist. Rom. l. 56. q Bonauent. 4. d. 37. ar. 1. q. 3. Tunc non fuit indita Clericis continentia, propter paupertatem, quia non tantum abundabant tunc, quantum nunc. Mald. sum. q. 15. ar. 12. Si visque ad hoc tempus sacerdotes habuissent uxores, introducta fuisset in ecclesiam exitiosissima tyrannis: quis esset Princeps, qui nollet esse sacerdos? r Lambert. Scaf. hist. Germ. Vt Romanus Imperator subditus Romano Pontifici, semper, dictoque obtemperans foret.

b Nic. Clemang. de corrupt. stat. eccl. pag. 36. Geis. defect. viror. eccl. n. 66. Sacerdotes in consuetudinem duxerunt sub pretextu ancillarum habere concubinas. Espenc. com. Tit. 1. pag. 67.

i Iacob. Graph. decis. aur. p. 1. l. 1. c. 76. n. 6. Vide Marium Belg. de schism. & concil. p. 653. & 656.

k Pater Paul. Venet. l. Italico, Of the order of Serui.

* Nauar. enchir. cap. 17. n. 195. In hac vrbe, scientes & patientes Papa, locantur, & semper conſueuerunt locari, domus meretricibus.

l Cornel. Agrippa de vanit. ſcientiar. Nobile Iupanar. Iamas ſum. eccl. p. 708. Franciſc. Sanſouin. de gub. reg. l. 11. c. de iud. Mareſcal. Concil. de leſ. Card. de emendand. eccl. exhib. Paulo 340. 3. edit. Colon. col. 1551. Sleida. com. l. 12. Gloſſ. Othon. de concub. cler. Videtur quod hoc crimen meretricij, ſub diſſimulatione tranſire debeat in eccleſia.

m Geis. de vita ſpir. l. 4. coral. 14. & p. 4. ſer. Aduent. 2. de luxuria.

n Iac. Graph. decis. aur. p. 1. l. 1. c. 75. n. 4.

o Clem. Alexan.

Paragr. 4. Whether Baronius be corrupted concerning miracles.

T. W. Our Miniſter labourerh to prone by the confeſſion of Catholikes, that working of true miracles is common to Heretikes, and therefore no peculiar note of the true Church or faith: and to this end he alleageth Baronius^a touching the miracles of Simon Magus, &c. But Baronius affirmeth not that theſe were true miracles, but impoſtures and ſlights onely.

Anſw. The word miracle is of a common ſignification, and comprehendeth both true and falſe maruells^b, betweene which there is this difference.

1. True

a Baron. annal. to. 1. an. 68. n. 22. b Aug. de Ciuit. Dei. l. 10. c. 16. Illa quippe miracula decorum Gentilium. Tertul. apol. c. 23.

1. True miracles haue three properties : 1. They are effected by diuine power, Exod. 8. 19. Psalme 77. 15. and 136. 4. 2. Their matter and externall Act, is reall, not fantastick, or ad delusion of sense. 3. Their finall cause is the confirmation of verity.

But false miracles, 2 Theff. 2. 9. are the worke of Sathan, or some delusion of sense^e, or strange and rare effects, hauing hidden causes in Nature or Art: and their finall cause by which principally *quoad nos*, in respect of vs, they are distinguished from true, is falshood and wickednesse.

These things being premised, I answer; Dr. White saith not as you charge him, that the working of true miracles (being such, according to all their causes) is common to Heretikes, neither produceth he Baronius to proue this; but vsing the word Miracle largely, as the Scriptures and fathers commonly doe, he saith; The working of miracles, that is, of wonders and maruells^d reputed miracles, and such as cannot be discerned to be other, but onely by their end, are common to Heretikes^e: and this is the plaine doctrine of the Scripture and Fathers, Deut. 13. 1. Matth. 24. 24. 2 Theff. 2. 9. Reuel. 13. 13. Marc. 13. 22.

And Baronius^f affirmeth thus much, producing Anastasius Nicenus, who reporteth of a Macedonian Heretike; *I beheld an Heretike of the sect of Macedonius, at Cyzicum, who by pretext of prayer remoued an Olive tree out of the place wherein it grew, &c. And this same Heretike caused a dead man to speake, &c. Wherefore it is not meet to admit euery one which worketh signes, for a Saint, but we must examine things according to the Apostles rule: Belceue not euery spirit, but try the spirits whether they be of God or not, 1 Iohn 4. 1.*

And whereas our Aduersarie would haue the world belceue his Popish miracles, wrought by Saint Dominicke, Saint Francis, Saint Katherine, &c. 1. The same are in themselves so absurd and ridiculous, that common sense detesteth them, (reade the margent &c.) 2. They are referred to maintaine superstition and false doctrine. 3. Their owne Doctors giue no credit to them^h: but of this matter further is to be spoken hereafter.

^e Aug. ibid. Specie tenus mortaliū sensus imaginaria iudificatione decipiunt. Vid. Greg. dial. li. 2. cap. 9. Aug. lib. 83. qu. 79. Quædam miracula sceleratos homines facere, etiam pseudo-prophetas, pseudo-christos, Math. 24. Mar. 13. & Antichristum, 2 Theff. 2. qualia sancti facere non possunt, &c. Vide Espenc. com. 2. Tim. 3. n. 14. pag. 90. &c. ^d Aug. de Ciu. Dei, l. 20. c. 19. Gratian. conf. 26. q. 5c. Nec mirum, Aug. sup. Exod. q. 21. ^e Suar. def. fid. Cath. l. 1. c. 7. Hæc adulterari possunt, & ita exterius fingi, vt non sint necessaria signa veræ fidei. Antonin. sum. mor. p. 4. tit. 13. §. 3. Antichristus certamen assumet contra fideles per miracula. Math. 24. Dabunt pseudo-prophetæ, id est prædicatores Antichristi signa magna & prodigia, &c. Greg. M. li. 20. ca. 3. Moral. Nonnunquam hæretici signa & miracula faciunt, &c. Dried. d. capt. & Red. gen. hum. p. 1. ca. 2. tr. 2. m. 3. d. 3. pa. 24. Greg. mor. li. 32. ca. 13. Nunc fideles nostri mira faciunt, cum peruersi patiuntur, tunc autem Behemoth huius (diaboli) satellites etiam cum peruersa inferunt mira facit. Pius Martyr corpus tormentis subiicit, & tamen ante eius oculos, tortor miracula facit. Altus erit veneratione prodigij (Antichristus) & durus crudelitate torquenti. ca. 14. vt eos qui aperte iniqui sunt pertrahat, seculari potentiam ostendat, vt vero iustos etiam fallat, signis sanctitatem simulat. & li. 33. ca. 29. & ca. 37. & li. 34. c. 2. A sancta ecclesia virtutum signa, subtrahuntur, &c. & ille hostis per aperta prodigia ostenditur. Aug. tract. 14. in Ioh. Nemo vobis fabula vendat. Pontius fecit miraculum, & contra istos mirabiles cautum me fecit Dominus meus, dicens, in nouissimis temporibus exurgent pseudo-prophetæ facientes signa & portenta, &c. ^f Baron. an. 360. n. 21. ^g Antonin. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 1. §. 3. Dominicke making the signe of the crosse, and travelling in great showers of raine, the same neuer wet him or his clothes. His bookes lying many daies in water, were hurt no more than fishes. With the kisse of his hand, he made lecherous Monks chaste. Ib. He made Heretikes see the dewill. Ib. c. 14. §. 3. Katherine of Siena by vertue of the host, lived many daies without food. §. She was solemnly wedded to Christ. By praies she was enabled to reade. *Christooke out her heart, and gave her a new one.* §. 10. Shee smelled the filthy finnes committed in the Popes Court, out of Auennion in France, to Siena in Italy. §. 13. ^h Canus loc. l. 11. c. 6. Nostri plerique de industria, ita multa confingunt, vt eorum me pudeat & tædeat, &c. Clingius loc. com. lib. 4. cap. 43. Villaincent. de formand. concion. lib. 2. cap. 4. Nonnullæ duorum historiarum circumferuntur prorsus insulsæ, &c. Caietan. opul. to. 2. tr. 1. cap. 5. Non censeo digna de quibus verba fiant.



CHAP. VII. Paragraph. I.

Bellarmine concerning Transubstantiation.

T. W.

MAfter White alleageth Bellarmine^a, saying; It may iustly be doubted whether the text be cleare enough to inforce transubstantiation, seeing men sharpe and learned, such as Scotus was, haue thought the contrary. But here are certaine words omitted, (to wit) it may iustly be doubted, whether the text without the declaration of the Church, be cleare enough to conuince an obstinate man, in the point of Transubstantiation, seeing men sharpe and learned, &c.

^a Bellar. de Euchar. l. 3. c. 23.

Ans. Bellarmine's speech concerning the Churches declaration, carries a faire shew among them which vnderstand not the matter: but in deed it leaues the Scripture in the same obscuritie it found it. For by the Churches declaration, he vnderstandeth not such an explication of the Scripture, as doth open and expound the meaning thereof by conference of places, knowledge of tongues, or by obseruing the expositions of former interpreters, or by arguments and meanes: such an exposition as giueth light, and makes one see that in the Scripture it selfe, which he was ignorant of before: but onely a papall sentence, wherein the Pope and Romane Synagogue without prooffe or demonstration, affirme this or that to be the sense of the Scripture^{*}.

Forexample; There is nothing indeed extant in the text of the Gospell from whence it may appeare, that the sacramentall elements are transubstantiated into the bodie and bloud of Christ^b, and if all the learned and godly men of the world, should all their life long poare into the text, they could espy no grounds to leade them to this exposition^{*}; yea, the doctrine of other Scripture and euident reason, doe teach another manner of Christ his presence in the Sacrament: yet Pope Innocent the third in a Roman Synod^c decreeth transubstantiation, and commandeth all the faithfull to beleue, that the same is contained in the text of the Gospell. But how can the bare authoritie and affirmation of a man, make that the meaning of the Holy Ghost, which is not collected from the Scripture, either in plaine words, or by arguments? Saint Augustine^d taught, *That the words of the Gospell carry their exposition with them.* And, *Ipsē sit expōitor, qui fuit propōitor*;† Let him be the expōitor which was the propounder. And Hilarie^e, *It is unlawfull to impose a meaning, but we must rather receiue a meaning from holy Scripture.* And Irenæus^f, *Offensions which are in Scripture, cannot be made knowne but by the Scripture.* And Gregory^g: *In things*

^{*} Stapl. li. 11. ca. 4. princ. doctr. suae alia scriptura, scripturas sepe interpretatur, ipsumque sensum quem expresse, necessario credendum tradit, solum etiam spiritus Dei, ad illud infallibiliter concludendum instructa. Ecclesia sine preuia scriptura tanquam demonstrationis medio, sed solo instinctu spiritus sancti edocet, &c.

^b Biel. can. miss. l. 4. Quamuis expresse tradatur in Scriptura, quod corpus Christi veraciter sub speciebus panis continetur: tamen quo-

modo ibi sit Christus, an per conuersionem alioquin in ipsum, an sine conuersione incipiat esse corpus Christi cum pane, manentibus substantia & accidentibus, non inuenitur expresse in canone B. blic. Durand. 4. d. 11. q. 1. & 15. Camerac. 4. sent. q. 5. ar. 2. Non potest ratione probari, nec euidenter sequitur ex scriptura, sed quod ita sit creditur ex authoritate ecclesie. ^{*} Caietan. in 1. Tho. Aq. q. 75. ar. 1. *The old Edition.* Vid. Egid. Coenick. d. sacram. q. 75. ar. 1. n. 13. ^c Concil. Lateran. 3. sub Innocentio 3. c. 1. Cuius corpus & sanguis, in sacramento altaris, sub speciebus panis & vini veraciter continentur, transubstantiatis, pane in corpus, & vino in sanguinem potestate diuina. ^d Aug. de verb. Dom. serm. 2. † In Ioh. Tract. 19. ^e Hilar. de Trin. l. 1. ^f Iren. l. 3. c. 12. ^g Origen. in Math. b. 5. ^h Greg. li. 3. ep. 41. Debemus ad testimonium omnium verborum quæ proferuntur in doctrina, proferre sensum scripturæ, quasi confirmantem quem exponimus sensum. Sicut enim omne aurum, quoquoque fuerit extra templum, non est sanctificatum: sic omnis sensus, qui fuerit extra diuinam scripturam, quamuis admirabilis videatur quibusdam non est sanctus, quia non coniunctus à sensu scripturæ quæ solet eum solum sensum sanctificare quem habet in se, sicut templum proprium aurum, &c.

concerning

concerning God, we labour to convince and binde men by reason, rather than by power.

For as much therefore as that which Bellarmine calleth the declaration and exposition of the Church, is indeed no declaration, but a presumptuous imposing of a forreine sence vpon the Scripture; it followeth, that if the Text bee not in it selfe cleere to proue transubstantiation, the Pope or Romane Churches exposition maketh it not so.

Pragr. 2. *The Master of sentences about Confession.*

T.W. *In this next place we will descend to the Sacrament of Penance, prophaned by this our Doctors depravations.*

Ans. Repentance or Penance, as the same is taught in holy Scripture, is a vertue, but no Sacrament. 1. It hath no corporall visible element or outward signe, which, according to Saint Augustine and other Doctors, is essentiall to every Sacrament. 2. Auricular confession, which you make a part thereof, and absolution depending vpon this confession, and which according to your Tenet, is the forme of this Sacrament, haue no institution in the New Testament.

^g Chry. hom. 7. in
3. ca. Cor. 1. Aug.
de doct. Christ. l.
1. c. 1. & l. 1. c. 9. &
con. Maximin.
Arrian. l. 3. c. 22.
Isidor. orig. l. 6.
c. 19. Sacramenta dicuntur quia sub tegumento corporalium rerum, &c. Hugo Victor. de Sacram. l. 1. p. 9. c. 2. Sacramentum est corporale, vel materiale elementum, foris sensibiliter propositum, ex similitudine representans, ex institutione significans, ex sanctificatione continens aliquam inuisibilem & spiritualem gratiam. Hac definitio ita propria & perfecta agnoscitur, vt omni sacramento, solumque conuenire inueniatur. Omne enim quod hac tria habet, sacramentum est; & omne quod hijs tribus caret, sacramentum proprie dici non potest.

T.W. *And first, to beare the Reader in hand, that by the acknowledgement of Catholikes, auricular confession and other parts of this Sacrament, are not necessarie.*

^a Digress. 33.
Vid. Coenick. d.
sacram. p. 6. n. 31.

Ans. Doctor White in this Digression^b, treateth of satisfaction, and not of auricular confession; and the word Confession is onely rehearsed by the way in the sentence, which he produced about satisfaction.

T.W. *He produceth the Master of Sentences, saying; by Contrition onely, without Confession or paiement of outward punishment or liberalitie of the Prelat, or paines of Purgatorie, I may goe straight to heauen: where we finde these words, (or liberalitie of the Prelate, or paines in Purgatorie) to be added by Master White, to make the confession of this Author more full and swelling.*

¹ Panormitan. c.
Deus qui. de pen.
& remiss. gloss. ib.
Dixit se auduisse a
multis theologis,
qui hoc melius
sciunt quam iuri-
stæ, quod potest
esse tanta contritio peccatoris, quod absque alia satisfactione exteriori in hoc seculo, & absque aliqua liberalitate prelatorum, & sine ulla pena purgatorij, habebit vitam æternam propter maximam misericordiam Creatoris. Bonaven. 4. d. 18. ar. 2. q. 2. Tantum potest contriti, vt Deus totum remittat, & statim euolabit (ad celum.)

Ans. My Brother citeth three Authors in his Margent, and propounding their sentence, prefixeth before the same, (others say :) but you pretend, that he allegeth the Master of Sentences onely, and hath corrupted his testimonie by adding certaine words to it. But those words are in Panormitans Glossatorⁱ, being one of the Authors, from which the whole sentence is produced.

T.W. *The Reader ought to conceine, that although all Catholikes teach, that perfect contrition is of force to blot out a mans finnes, yet they hold, that this contrition cannot bee without confession, at least in voto, that is, that the partie hath a desire to confesse his finnes to a Priest when opportunitie shall serue.*

Ans.

Ans. The latter part of this assertion is not generally true: 1. Sundry Papists haue taught, that a contrite person may obaine remission of his sinnes, without reference to the *kies*, or confession made to the Church. And this opinion was indifferent in Gratians^k time. 2. Venerable Bede^l maintaines the necessity of auricular confession in case of heretic onely, and enormous crimes, and not for other mortall sinne. 3. Concerning the purpose of confession, to be included in contrition, Gabriel Biel^m hath these words: *It seemeth that one may haue perfect contrition sufficient to remission of sinnes, sine voto confessionis, without the purpose of confession.* 4. Many Schoolemen hold, that an implicit purpose thereof is sufficientⁿ, from whence Canus^o inferreth; *If by penitency sins are remitted without an explicit purpose of Sacramentall confession, then they are blotted out without any reference to the kies.*

^k Gratian. d. pen. d. 1. c. conuerti-
mini: vnde datur
intelligi quod etiam
ore tacente
veniam consequi
possumus, &c. &
ca. Qui natus, & c.
Omnis qui sic co-
fessio ad ostensio-
nem penitentiae,
non ad impetrati-
onem veniae, & si-
cut circumcisio
data est Abraham

in signum iustitiae, non in causam iustitiae, sic confessio sacerdoti offertur in signum veniae acceptae, non in causam remissionis accipiendae, Anconin. 3. Tit. 14. ca. 19. §. 1. Nota quod Magister sent. in 4. d. 17. & Gratian. d. pen. d. 1. querunt: vtrum absque confessione sacramentali actu vel proposito, per solam contritionem id est dolorem de peccatis cum proposito abstinendi, et si non confitendi, possit haberi Remissio peccatorum. Et multa dicunt, pro & contra, & tandem Gratianus dicit, in fine distinctionis illius, Quia vtraque opinio habet viros sapientes & Religiosos: Quid magis tenendum relinquit iudicio lectoris. *Vasq.* in 3. 10. 4. q. 84. ar. 5. d. vnic. n. q. 90. ar. 1. d. 1. n. 3. Petrus oxoniensis Doctor Salmanticus, docuit confessionem sacramentalem non esse in precepto eis qui iam a peccatis vero contriti, iustificati sunt: vnde consequenter remitti pecc. contritione sine ordine ad clauas. *Vasq.* in 3. 10. 4. q. 84. ar. 5. d. vnic. n. 25. dicit, posse quemque iustificari a peccato mortali, cum contritione, etiam cum proposito expresso non recipiendi sacramentum, pa. 31. Gratian. de pen. d. 1. c. Vtrum sola. Sunt qui dicunt, quemlibet veniam criminis sine confessione ecclesiae, & sacerdotali iudicio posse promereri. Ib. c. Quamuis. Cui harum potius adhaerendum sit, lectoris iudicio referuatur. Scot. 4. d. 14. q. 2. ar. 2. ^l Bedato. 7. hom. 2. s. 1. Dom. 14. in Luc. 17. pag. 98. B. Rhenan. argum. in Tertul. de penit. Biel 4. d. 17. q. 1. ar. 1. notab. 2. ^m Biel lib. Si quis quomodo confessio in voto includitur in confessione, potest dici implicite & virtualiter, &c. ^o Canus Rel. de pen. p. 5. pag. 884. Si per penitentiam peccata remittuntur, sine explicito voto huius sacramenti, reuera delentur sine ordine ad clauas.

T. W. *Such you see, is the proceeding of our Minister thorow his whole booke, euer inuesting his doctrine and assertion with most foule and stained deprauations, well discovering the spotted guiltinesse of his soule; therefore I could wisb Master White (that so his minde might be appavelled answerably to his name) to follow the admonition of the Euangelist, Get thee a white garment, (to wit, of repentance and future integritie) that thou maist be clothed, and thy filthy nakednesse doe not further appeare.*

Ans. It is very reasonable, that you which are quicke sighted in obseruing faults in others before they be committed, and so liberall in exhortation, should make some reflection vpon your owne errors; otherwise the saying in the Gospell, *Physitian heale thy selfe*, and, *Hypocrite pull out the beame, &c.* may iustly be retorted vpon you. And touching Doctor White, whom you first accuse at your pleasure, and then exhort: I answer, That you are loud in words, and lame in proofes, and being your selfe naked, Apoc. 3. 17. giue him counsell to be clothed, 2 Cor. 5. 4. who is in the place and fellowship of those which hauing washed their robes, and made them white in the blood of the Lambe, doe weare white garments, which the vnclane filth of a Popish blacke mouth cannot distaine.

Paragr. 3. Bellarmine concerning Satisfaction.

T. W. *To make the Catholike doctrine of satisfaction more vngratefull, Master White produceth Bellarmine & thus writing: Christs satisfaction it selfe taketh not away the punishment due vnto vs, but it remoueth it so farre forth, as we haue grace from thence to make our owne satisfaction of power.*

^p Bellar. de pur-
gator. l. 1. c. 10.

In this place Bellarmine handling a Schoole point, whether our satisfacti-

on receiving his force from the passion and satisfaction of Christ, may be termed one satisfaction, or two satisfactions, resolveth that it is but one satisfaction, and that formally ours, neither by this is excluded Christ or his satisfaction. Here all men may see, that Bellarmine does in no sort detract from the passion or satisfaction of Christ, for he saith, 1. That Christs satisfaction is not excluded by ours. 2. That by his satisfaction we have grace to satisfy. 3. That our satisfaction applieth Christs to us. 4. That without Christs satisfaction, ours can be of no force.

Ans. In these words two things are affirmed by you. 1. That your doctrine of Satisfaction is Catholike. 2. That Bellarmine doth fully acknowledge the necessitie of Christs satisfaction, both to produce mans satisfaction, and to concur with the same, to make it of price and value. Concerning this latter, you trouble your selfe in vaine in acquitting your Cardinall, who is not accused by Doctor White touching this matter.

But the false doctrine wherewith he and his fellowes are charged, is: That they conioyne the actions and sufferings of iust persons with Christs, making the same with his, a ioynt satisfactorie price, and part of digne compensation for the guilt of venial sinne, and for the temporall punishment of sinne. Suarez saith^a; *A iust person may simply and absolutely in condignitie (or iustice) satisfy for venial sinne, and not obtaine the remission thereof freely.* Gregorie Valence^b; *Christ did not offer his owne satisfaction onely to God the Father to be accepted, but also ours, that by the power of our satisfaction, the debt of temporall punishment might be discharged.* Bellarmine^c; *It pleased Christ to conioyne our satisfaction with his owne.* Vasques^d; *When as temporall punishment is remitted unto us, for satisfaction made in grace, the debt is not forgiven us, but is truly taken away by our compensation, and we are worthy to be free of that temporall punishment.* And againe^e; *The works which we exhibite to God after our iustification by the helpe of grace, doe in such sort by their very nature, without any pact or promise of God, satisfy for the temporall punishment of another life (in Purgatorie) that God can in no sort iustly punish the man who hath thus satisfied.* Victoria^f; *If a man be considered in the state of grace, &c. thus he doth most properly and according to equalitie, satisfy God, if we ioyne our merits to Christs.*

This doctrine of our Aduersaries which my Brother impugned, is neither true nor Catholike.

1. It is repugnant to holy Scripture, which instructeth people to seeke the remission both of great and small sinnes, and the release of punishment due to all their sinnes, by praier of faith, confession, amendment of life, and fruits of repentance, (all which imply impetration & onely, and not compensation or redeeming, by payment of a condigne price.) Math. 6. 12. 1 Iohn 1. 9. Iam. 5. 15. 1 King. 8. 33. 36.

2. Forasmuch as satisfaction (according to our Aduersaries description^h) is a compensation made to God for the iniurie done unto him by sinne, according to some equalitie of Iustice; and the said iniurie is of infinite value, because it depri-

^a Suarez. 3. Tho. to. 1. d. 4. §. 9. Dico simpliciter & absolute posse hominem iustitiam satisfacere, de condigno, pro veniali peccato, atque adeo ex iustitia, & non mere gratis illius remissionem consequi. Henric. sum. mor. de Sacram. l. 4. c. 15. Palud. 4. d. 16. q. 1. 2. Soto 4. d. 15. q. 2. 2. Ledesm. q. 18. ar. 2. Bellar. de pen. l. 4. c. 14. Christi sanguis, &c. penam temporalem totam, nisi propria satisfactione cooperante non expiat. Opera nostra cooperari expiationi, & propitiationi Christi. Ruard. Tap. ar. 6. pag. 179. Egid. Coenic. de sacram. to. 2. d. 10. d. 2. ^b Greg. Val. to. 2. d. 6. q. 17. p. 5. Cogitandum est, Christum non solum suam sed etiam nostram simul satisfactionem aeterno Patri acceptandam obtulisse, ut ex vicem nostrae satisfactionis debitum illud temporalis poenae solueretur licet diuersa ratione. Bellar. de pen. l. 4. c. 15. Christus satisfecit immediate, pro culpa & reatu mortis aeternae, &c. mediate autem pro poena temporali, &c. Mald. d. sp. to. 2. de Satisf. cap. 1. pag. 79. ut cum praepetori, &c. ^c Bellar. de purg. l. 3. c. 10. ^d Vasq. to. 1. d. 15. c. 6. n. 39. Quando pro satisfactione in gratia facta remittitur nobis poena temporalis, non condonatur nobis illud debitum, sed vere compensatione nostra tollitur, & nos sumus digni, qui deinceps eo debito careamus. Ruard. Tapper. artic. 6. Compensando aequalens secundum iustitiam Dei estimationem. Capreol. 4. d. 15. p. 6. hoc est ad quando emendam culpae, potest satisfacere. ^e Vasq. l. 2. p. 2. d. 223. c. 3. n. 38. ^f Fran. Victor. sum. sacram. de satisfact. n. 199. Bellar. de pen. l. 4. c. 12. & de indulg. l. 3. c. 9. Opera penalia per Spiritum Christi facta, ex condigno reatum poenae temporalis expungunt. Viguer. instit. theol. c. 16. vers. 21. Suarez tom. 4. d. 37. §. 1. Sunt propriae solutio pro poena. Ib. assert. 2. Per satisfactionem poenam compensamus, & soluius. Greg. Val. tom. 4. d. 7. q. 14. p. 1. Hec compensatio quae fit in satisfactione, non tantum habet respectum ad poenam, sed ad nonnullam offensam & iram Dei, quae per eiusmodi compensationem auerti debet. Ruard. Tapper. artic. 6. Cum satisfactio opus sit iustitiae, ex genere suo, contra gratiam, distinguitur. Maldon. disp. to. 2. de satisfact. cap. 1. Vno modo gratum vocatur, quod Deus acceptum habere debet, vellet, nolit. Atque hoc modo grata sunt ea, quae proficiuntur ex ipsius gratia, &c. 2. Aug. cont. 3. ep. Pelag. l. 4. c. 7. Eleemosynae & orationibus impetrantibus. ^h Greg. Val. to. 4. d. 7. q. 14. p. 1. Dnodo de red. g. n. hum. tr. 2. c. 2. ar. 2. par. 3. Sati facere Deo, est debitum honorem Deo restituere. Ruard. Tap. ar. 6. Satisfactio est aequi iustitiae & voluntaria redditio aequalentis, secundum iustam rerum estimationem. Ibid. In recompensam iniuriae, &c.

with God of his honor which is infinite: hereupon the actions and sufferings of iust persons, being finite, cannot be a digne price and compensation of that iniurie, according to any forme of iustice. 1. It is confessed, that the honour which is taken from God by the least sinne, is infinite^k. 2. Our best deeds are finite, yea, imperfect^l; for if they be considered according to their next and immediate production, they are the actions of a creature: and if they be considered according to their principall efficient cause, or the mysticall vnion of a iust person with Christ, in this respect, they are still finite, because the motion of the holy Ghost and Christs influence into iust persons, (being proportionable to the receiuing and capacitee of the creature) is in a finite manner^m. If our Aduersaries shall answer, that the compensation which is rendered to God, in recompence of the wrong which man hath done him, is equiualent and of value, not in respect of it selfe, but by the liberall acceptance of God, vouchsafing to admit that for satisfaction, which is not of such value and dignitie in it owne natureⁿ. 1. Some of them, and by name Vasques^o, Ruard Tapper, &c. reiect this assertion of Gods liberall acceptation, and will haue the workes of iust persons by their very nature to satisfie condignely. 2. If the compensation depend onely or principally vpon the liberall acceptance of God, and not vpon the intrinsecall price and value of the thing it selfe, then the same is not satisfaction of condignitie^p, (as our Aduersaries pretend) but onely of congruitie, and by way of impetration, (as the Schoolemen speake:) for example; If a King shall forgieue a punishment to a delinquent, guiltie of sundry capitall offences, vpon this condition, that hee confesse and amend his faults: this confession and amendment is not a condigne satisfaction and compensation for the iniurie done to his person and lawes, but onely a condition and qualification in the subiect, to impetrate and receiue pardon^q. And thus farre the Protestants acknowledge, that the vertuous deeds and patient sufferings of iust persons, are auailable to the procuring of remission of punishment with God.

2. The former doctrine of Iesuites is not Catholike, for neither did the primitive Fathers teach the same, nor yet many learned Papists assent vnto it.

When the primitive Fathers insile the pious and charitable deeds of penitent persons, with the name of satisfactions: they vse the same word improperly^r, and in a figuratiue notion, not intending that the said deeds are a iust compensation for the iniury committed against the diuine Maiesty or his law, but for these reasons.

1. Because God is pleased, Psal. 51. 19. and contented with this obedience and humiliation of penitent persons so farre, as that vpon their performance hereof, he vouchsafeth to remoue or mitigate his punishments and iudgements, as if he were indeed satisfied by them.

2. Because penitent persons by these actions render glorie to God, whom they formerly wronged and dishonoured by their sinnes.

3. Because by contrary actions to their former deeds, whereby they wronged and displeased God, they destroy their sinnes, and remoue future occasions of offending him; which is a kinde of satisfaction.

proxime procedant, non autem à persona, à qua prouenit gratiæ auxilium, quod ad ipsa confertur. Alciusod. sum. l. 3. tr. 16. q. 2. Sicut Deus dedit gratiam, ita & liberum arbitrium; & sicut dedit homini liberum arbitrium ut utatur illo, ita & gratiam ut bene utatur illa, &c. Ergo bonum opus non tantum in quantum est liberi arbitrij, sed etiam in quantum est gratia est hominis. Gabr. 4. d. 36. q. 2. noc. 3. Requirit æquivalentiam, non secundum naturam rei, sed secundum acceptationem diuinam. vid. Ast. 3. d. 19. §. 1. p. 54. Rosell. d. 7. sacram. l. 9. d. 9. cap. 17. Victor. sum. sacram. de pen. n. 199. Potest talis satisfacere ex liberalitate acceptantis. Durand. 4. d. 15. q. 2. Cling. loc. com. lib. 4. cap. 37. Satisfacere dicitur largo modo, &c. Vasq. 1. 2. p. 2. d. 323. c. 3. n. 38. p. Ruard Tap. art. 6. Est alia satisfactio, quæ sit secundum acceptationem gratiosam eius qui laesus est, & quamvis condigna non sit, &c. Durand. 4. dist. 15. q. 1. Aequalitas secundum acceptationem illius cui fit emenda, est æqualitas interpretatiua solum est satisfactio large dicta, &c. De Congruo, secundum gratiam Dei acceptationem. potest homo mereri apud Deum, ac satisfacere de peccato commisso. Bellar. l. 4. de penit. c. 8. Possit hominem penitentem per elemosynas placare Deum ex congruo, atque ab eo gratiam reconciliationis impetrare. Agidius Coenici. Iesuit. de sacram. tom. 2. disp. 10. dub. 3. n. 19. Satisfactio de congruo, non potest absolute dici satisfactio, sed tantum secundum quid. Hoker eccles. pol. li. 5. §. 72. Penitency is a prayer, &c. Chryl. ex var. in Math. hom. 16 accepit penitentiam com tem quæ aduocati locum impleuit, &c. Greg. m. li. 12. ca. 24. mor. quoties post culpam Eleemosynas facimus quæ si pro prauis actionibus precium damus, D. Hall, lib. Na peace with Rome. The word Satisfaction was not displeasing to the ancient Fathers, nor in their sense vi. Anselm. lib. Cur Deus homo. Vid. Aq. suppl. 3 q. 12. ar. 3. Satisfactio est honorem debitum Deo impende. e. 1 Aug. de dog. eccles. c. 54. Satisfactio penitentis est peccatorum causas excludere, nec eorum suggestionibus aditum indulgere. Greg. Nissen. orat. cont. eos qui alios acerbis iudicant. Chryl. orat. de beato Philegon.

i. Sac. 3 p. d. 4. q. 1. ar. 2. 7 p. 56. ex eodem capite, quæ excedit grauitas effectus Dei nonatur proportio satisfactiois exhibitæ à pmo homine, quia semper infinite distat à dignitate personæ, quæ iniuriam patia est: Quæ improprio non potest suppleri per gratiam creatam, quia licet hec sit diuini ordinis, & participatio diuine nature, tan eiora eius dignitas finita est, & simpliciter infinite distans à dignitate personæ offensa. Cling. loc. com. l. 4. c. 37. Offensa est in Deum infinitum summe bonum, opus vero nostrum quid finitum. Agid. Coenici. Iesuit. de sacram. to. 4. de satisf. dist. 10. dub. 2. Omne nostrum meritum, omnisque satisfactio sunt absolute finita.

k. Gabriel. 4. d. 16 q. 2. Omnis offensa Dei est infinite fugibilis, & impatiibilis, eo quod est iniuria boni infiniti.

l. Reade chap. i. of the booke, obferu. concerning iustif. §. 2. Cling. loc. com. l. 4. c. 37. Vt quis existens debitor centum denariorum, nunquam satisfacit perfecte vno denario: sic nullus pro minimo peccato potest æquivalenter satisfacere.

m. Vasq. 1. 2. p. 2. d. 214. c. 7. n. 44. Opera dicuntur dignitatem & valorem accipere à persona à qua ipsa

Reade Ionas 3. 10. Ioel 2. 12, 18, 20. 1 Cor. 11. 31, 32. 1 King. 21. 29. Matth. 5. 16.

Alto the name of Satisfaction^r is vsuall with the Fathers, to expresse exemplarie corrections which were externally imposed by Church discipline: and the satisfaction and restitution performed to men, for wrong and offences done to them.

But that they neuer beleueed or taught the doctrine of condigne satisfactions, by way of a price or compensation to Gods iustice for veniall sinne, or temporall punishment, appeareth: 1. Because they apply the word Satisfaction to the expiating of mortall sinne, and eternall punishment^r; whereby it is certaine, that they vie the said word figuratiuely, and vnderstand no more thereby, but impetration, &c.

2. The description of Satisfaction made by them, importeth no more but impetration, preuention, and excluding the occasions of future sinnes. Cyprian^r saith, *To the appeasing and exorating of the Lord, let vs send our groanes, not onely our voice, but with fasting, teares, and all manner of deprecation. And the same Father^a, They seeke to binder, that Christ may not be intreated by prayers and satisfactions.* Augustine^x, *It is not sufficient to change the manners into better, and to depart from euill deeds, vntlesse also satisfaction be made to God by the sorrow of repentance, by the mourning of humilitie, and by the sacrifice of a contrite spirit, alms-deeds co-working: for it is not onely said, that we must abstaine from sinne, but also deprecate the Lord for that which is past, that we may bee pardoned.* Ithodore^y; *Satisfaction is to exclude the causes and suggestions of sinnes, and not to reuerterate sinne any more.* This description is taken out of Augustine^x, and is also vied by Rabanus^b and Hugo^c. Bernard^d saith; *Condigne satisfaction is to correct euill deeds, and not to reuerterate the same.* Angelus^e in his summe, *Satisfaction is the assuaging and fulfilling of penance inioyned, and due to bee performed.*

Lastly, sundry learned Papists maintaine Satisfaction, onely in a figuratiue acceptance. The Enchiridion of Colon^f, *Satisfaction is compensatorie by a certaine trope.* Pighius^g, *We teach not that those penall workes are a price, &c.* Michael Baius^h, *When by almes and other pious workes we satisfie for temporall punishment, we doe not offer a digne price to God for our sinnes: but we performe something vpon the sight whereof, the satisfaction of Christ is applied and communicated vnto vs.* And Durand, *A man is able onely by congruities, or the gracious acceptance of God, to satisfieⁱ, &c.* And from hence it appeareth, that your doctrine of satisfactions is not Catholike, so much as with your owne Doctors.

In your conclusion, you boast of much aduantage, which your cause hath gained by Doctor White. But at your next Audit, pleaseth it you to reconsider, and perhaps you shall finde that you haue gained backward, and may put your gettings in your eie, &c.

^a Tertul. de pen. c. p. 9. Cyp. ep. 27. & ep. 40. Sorozom. h. st. eccl. l. 7. c. 16. Aug. enchirid. cap. 65. Tertul. de pen. cap. 9. Angelus sum. verb. Sati. factio. Catech. Trid. d. 9. c. 1. facram. in Satisfact. Greg. in li. 12. mor. c. 24. Tunc elemosine precium, nos a cul. is liberat, cum perpetrata plangimus & abd. camus. ^f Orig. sup. Exod. hom. 6. & super Leuit. hom. 2. Tertul. de penit. c. 5, 6, 7, 8. Cyp. epist. 10. & 27. & 40. Hieron. ep. 70. ca. 2. & c. 1. Ioel. Ambrosi. ad virg. l. p. c. 8. Si futuras penas gehennae perpetuas, in hoc paruo vitae spacio compensauerit, leuissimum ab aeterno iudicio liberat. Aug. enchirid. cap. 70. Chrys. hom. 14. in Genes. & hom. in Psal. 95. Mal don. Iesuit. di. p. 10. 2. de Satisf. cap. 2. Non subito quin quibus veteres auctores satisfactionem agnouerint pro culpa. ^g Cyp. ep. 8. vel 1. 4. ep. 4. ^h Cyp. ep. 55. ⁱ Aug. hom. vlt. inter 10. hom. c. 5. Aug. de vera & falsa penit. Penitentia grauius fructus postulat, ut cum dolore & gemitibus mortuus impetret vitam, eiusd. by Biel. 4. d. 16. q. 2. ar. 1. not. 1. ^y Ithodor. orig. l. 6. c. 9 & exhort. ad penit. pag. 313. ^x Aug. de dogm. eccl. c. 54. ^z Roban. de instit. cler. l. 2. c. 30. ^a Hugo Victor. de Sacram. l. 2. p. 14. c. 2. ^d Bern. de Inter. Dom. c. 11. ^e Angel. sum. v. Sati. factio. ^f C. de Satisfact. Tropo quodam compensatiua est. Vega pro Concil. l. 13. c. 36. quales quales satisfactio. ^g Pigh. controu. Ratisb. c. 9. Gabr. 4. d. 16. q. 2. ar. 1. not. 3. Doctores in hac materia videntur aduersi: dicentibus quibusdam, quod homo non possit satisfacere, &c. ^h Mich. Baius de indulgent. Quando per elemosinas atque pia opera, satisfacimus pro peccatis temporalibus, non dignum precium Deo pro peccatis nostris offerimus: sed aliquid facimus cuius intuitu, Christi satisfactio nobis applicatur & communicatur. Reade Possuin. apparat. sacer. v. Mich. Baius, where this opinion is condemned by the Bulls of two Popes, Pius 5. Greg. 13. Rossellus de 7. sacram. lib. 9. dist. 9. cap. 17. Accipitur satisfactio nostra secundum liberalissimam Dei acceptationem, &c. ⁱ Durand. 4. dist. 15. q. 1. Coenick. d. sacram. p. 2. disp. 10. d. 3. n. 19. satisfactio de congruo non potest absolute dici satisfactio, sed tantum secundum quid. Gabr. Biel. 4. d. 16. q. 2. ar. 1. notab. 3. Accipiendo satisfactioem secundum strictum iustitiae rigorem, homo in praesenti, non potest satisfacere pro peccato, neque mortali, quia tali respondet secundum rigorem iustitiae poena aeterna: neque pro veniali, quia & pro illo, iuste posset peccator puniri poena aeterna. Debet ergo equivalencia estimari secundum acceptationem diuinam, qui ex sua misericordia summa liberalitate determinauit tantam poenam, seu tale opus acceptare pro satisfactioe, &c. secundum hunc modum potest homo satisfacere pro peccato, faciendo aut patiendo illud, quod Dominus statuit acceptare pro plena remissione. Virues. Phil. conr. Luther. Satisfactio penitentialis, nihil aliud est quam sensus infectum reddendi quod factum est.

One other Argument against Satisfaction.

If penitentiall deeds of iust persons did satisfie in condignitie, for the guiltinesse of temporall punishment: then the temporall punishment should alwaies cease vpon the fulfilling of the said penitentiall deeds, and God were iniust by inflicting such punishment, after condigne satisfaction exhibited vnto him.

But vpon the performance of the deeds of penance, temporall punishment alwaies ceaseth not; and God is not iniust in punishing with temporall chastisements iust persons after they haue repented ^k, 2 Sam. 12. 10. and 2 Sam. 24. 12.

^k Aegid. Coenici de sacram. ca. 2. disp. 10. dub. 3. num. 30. Sape Deus statuit, aliquas penas pro peccatis infligere, in hac vita, ita vt nullam aliam satisfactionem pro ijs velit acceptare: quod tamen est necessarium ad satisfactionem de condigno, patet ex pœnis quibus Deus punit adulterium Davidis, & numerationē populi, quas David nulla alia satisfactione potuit auertere.

tis infligere, in hac vita, ita vt nullam aliam satisfactionem pro ijs velit acceptare: quod tamen est necessarium ad satisfactionem de condigno, patet ex pœnis quibus Deus punit adulterium Davidis, & numerationē populi, quas David nulla alia satisfactione potuit auertere.

The principall Arguments of Papists for Satisfactions of condignitie, answered.

Obiect. 1. God hath indented and couenanted with iust persons, to accept their vertuous deeds and penall actions and sufferings, as a iust price and compensation for the guilt of veniall sinne, and for the temporall punishment of mortall sinne, Ierem. 17. 8. And this price and compensation performed by man, is satisfaction properly called.

Ans. The antecedent is false; God hath not couenanted with iust persons, to accept any such deeds or passions as a digne price or compensation, &c. but onely as a dutie and matter of obedience, of right belonging to him: and when he accepteth the same, and vpon the performance thereof, releaseth any punishment, he doth it liberally, and meerely of bountie and grace, respecting the said duties onely as a meanes of impetration, and supplication for pardon.

Obiect. 2. To redeeme sinnes, is to make Satisfaction for sinnes: Nabuchadnezzar was commanded by Daniel to redeeme his sinnes by iustice and almes-deeds, Dan. 4. vers. 27. And Salomon saith, Pro. 16. 6. By mercy and truth iniquitie shall be redeemed.

Ans. Admitting the old Translation, which saith, redeeme, &c. Nabuchadnezzar was exhorted to redeeme his sinnes with iustice and mercie, *Non per modum solutionis, sed deprecationis*: not as by a price or satisfaction, but as by the matter of repentance; as by a qualification in himselfe, and reall supplication to God, for pardon both of guilt and punishment of sinne. Also this great King was an iniust person, and therefore according to our aduersaries doctrine, could not satisfie in condignitie. And Daniel speaketh of the fault and eternall punishment of sinne as well as the temporall punishment; and so this testimonie of Daniel can in no sort be fitted to the Popish fancy of condigne satisfaction. Reade Cyprian. li. d. oper. & Eleemos. n. 5. — 6, 7.

Salomon, Prou. 16. 6. speaketh not of expiating temporall punishment, after the guilt and eternall punishment is releaseth, but hee treateth generally both of guilt and punishment. Neither doth he declare the manner of expiation to bee by satisfaction (as our Aduersaries meane) but sheweth rather how mercy and truth expiate iniquitie, as a sacrifice impetratorie, and by way of supplication, qualification of the subiect, fruit of repentance, &c. Neither haue these words any manifest reference, to indebite actions and sufferings, or externall deeds of austeritie, wherein Papists place their Satisfactions.

conuenire vt non possit vllus ante gratiam gratum facientem ademptam, Deo satisfacere. Greg. Val. tom. 4. in Tho. Aqu. d. 7. q. 14. p. 3. Communis & certa sententia, &c. Henric. sum. moral. lib. 5. cap. 18. Qui citat multos, &c. Ianfen. comm. Prou. 16. v. 6. Per misericordiam & veritatem, hoc est, aequitatem vel iustitiam, quæ duo obseruationem omnium mandatorum includunt, expiatur peccatum admissum, magis quam hostijs & sacrificijs, &c. Henric. sum. mor. l. 5. c. 19. §. 4.

L. 2

Obiect. 3.

¹ Gabr. 3. dist. 27 q. vnic. notab. 2. Potest premians aliquid retribuere operanti, intuitu alicuius actus, alias non daturus, non tanquam digno in se, nec ratione operis condigni, sed ex sua liberalitate etiam ei qui inimicus est. Coenick. ibid. Manasse agens penitentiam, impetravit relaxationem à captiuitate alijsque grauissimis pœnis, &c. Coenick. ibid. Daniel suadet Regi, cui imminabat diuina punitio, vt peccata sua elemosynis redimat, quod nihil aliud est, quam Deo pro ijs aliquas pœnas minanti satisfacere. Bellar. de penit. l. 4. c. 3. & c. 8.

² Cyprian. li. d. oper. et Eleemos. n. 5. Daniel, cum Nabuchodonosor aduerso somno territus æstuarer, pro auertendis malis, ad diuinam opem impetrandam remedium dedit, &c. Ambros. li. 1. ep. 1. fides, gratia, misericordia, &c. Redemptio est, animæ. Sic enim scriptum est, &c. (Exod. 30. 12.)

³ Bellar. de penit. l. 4. c. 1. Doctores omnes in eo

Greg. in Evang.
hom. 20. pe. hoc
quod dicitur, facite
dignos fructus
penitentia, vniuersi
cunque contri-
tencia conueniunt,
vt tanto maiora
acquirat bonorum
operum lucra per
penitentia, quan-
to grauiora sibi in-
tulit damna per
culpam.

Obiect. 3. Iohn Baptist exhorteth people to bring forth fruits of repentance, Math. 3. 8. But to bring forth such fruits is to satisfie, &c.

Ans. To bring forth fruits of repentance, is to exercise true repentance, consisting of deeds as well as words, and to remoue sinnes by contrarious actions of vertue, to the end penitent persons may both approue their repentance to be solid and effectual, and also thereby as a necessarie qualification and disposition obtaine remission of sinnes, both for guilt and punishment.

Paragr. 4. Thomas Aquinas, concerning veniall sinne.

¶ Tho. Aqu. 3. q.
87. ar. 3.

T. W. Master White alleageth Thomas, saying: Veniall sinnes may be forgiven by knocking of the breast, going to the Church, receiuing of holy water, or the Bishops blessing, or crossing our selues, though wee doe not actually thinke of them. But Thomas addeth to these, Quatenus cum detestatione, &c. As these actions are done with a detestation of sinne and reuerence to God, so they purge veniall sinnes.

¶ Paludan. 4. d.
36. q. 1. ar. 2. con-
clud. 4. Siluester,
Angilus, Tabiana,
in memis, verb.
Aqua benedict.
Gabr. 4. d. 16. q. 5.
ar. 3. d. 3. Abu-
leni. com. 4. Reg.
c. 2. q. 39. Petr.
Soto. de sacram.
penn. l. 19. Maior.
4. d. 37. q. 92. Hu-
go. de sacram. l. 2. p. 9. ca. 2. Gloss. Gratian. d. 35. ca. vltim. orarium, quia facile. ¶ Dom. Sot. 4. d. 15. q. 2. ar. 3. Can. Rel. de
sacram. p. 1. ad 6. Walden. sacram. to. 3. tit. 4. c. 68. Ledem. 4. p. 1. q. 38. ar. 3. d. 3. Azor. p. 1. instit. mor. l. 4. c. 11. Camif. sup.
Catechif. Turrian. l. 3. pro epist. Pontif. c. 6. Beuxam. to. 2. harmon. Matth. 14. pag. 510. ¶ Azor. instit. mor. l. 1. c. 11. q. 11. ¶ Iac.
Graph. decis. aur. p. 1. l. 1. c. 6. n. 10. Exemplum de eo, qui se aqua lustrali aspergit: nam etsi nullatenus excitetur ad feruorem, nec me-
moriam habeat venialium, tamen obtinebit per illam asperersionem eorum veniam. Henric. sum. mor. de Sacram. l. 4. c. 13. Non ratione impe-
trationis tantum, aut quia excitant motum penitentia, vel charitatis, sed ex opere operato, &c.

Ans. You haue two opinions concerning the manner, how sacramentals purge veniall sinnes. Some Doctors hold, they doe it mediary, *ex opere operantis*, by exciting and eleuating the minde to deuotion. But other teach, that they effect the same immediaty by their very outward act, *ex opere operato*; and when one hath no actuall cogitation of the sinne or motion to repentance. And your learned Iesuite Azorius, and Iacob de Graphijs, say, That whatsoeuer other thinke to the contrarie, yet this is indeed Thomas his opinion. And so if Doctor White were deceiued about Thomas, your owne Authors misled him.

¶ Paludan. 4. d. 36. q. 1. ar. 2. conclud. 4. Siluester, Angilus, Tabiana, in memis, verb. Aqua benedict. Gabr. 4. d. 16. q. 5. ar. 3. d. 3. Abulen. com. 4. Reg. c. 2. q. 39. Petr. Soto. de sacram. penn. l. 19. Maior. 4. d. 37. q. 92. Hugo. de sacram. l. 2. p. 9. ca. 2. Gloss. Gratian. d. 35. ca. vltim. orarium, quia facile. ¶ Dom. Sot. 4. d. 15. q. 2. ar. 3. Can. Rel. de sacram. p. 1. ad 6. Walden. sacram. to. 3. tit. 4. c. 68. Ledem. 4. p. 1. q. 38. ar. 3. d. 3. Azor. p. 1. instit. mor. l. 4. c. 11. Camif. sup. Catechif. Turrian. l. 3. pro epist. Pontif. c. 6. Beuxam. to. 2. harmon. Matth. 14. pag. 510. ¶ Azor. instit. mor. l. 1. c. 11. q. 11. ¶ Iac. Graph. decis. aur. p. 1. l. 1. c. 6. n. 10. Exemplum de eo, qui se aqua lustrali aspergit: nam etsi nullatenus excitetur ad feruorem, nec memoriam habeat venialium, tamen obtinebit per illam asperersionem eorum veniam. Henric. sum. mor. de Sacram. l. 4. c. 13. Non ratione impetracionis tantum, aut quia excitant motum penitentia, vel charitatis, sed ex opere operato, &c.



CHAP. VIII. Paragraph 1.

Whether Bellarmine be corrupted about the question:
If God be the Author of sinne.

T. W.

Dignif. 41. S. 30.
pag. 271.

TO the iustifying, that Catholikes are as farre engaged in defending that blasphemous and horrible doctrine, that God is the Author of sinne, as the Protestants are, he alleageth Bellarmine, &c.

Ans. It is an impudent slander, to charge vs with holding God to be the Author of sinne; and had not these foule beams of malice blinded your eyes, you would

would have obserued Doctor Whites speech in this very place, saying ^a; *We hold that God is not the Author of sinne, but the Devil and mans owne will; the contrarie whereunto we desie as blasphemie.*

^a Ibid. pag. 371. S. 51.

T. W. He alleageth Bellarmine ^b, thus writing; God by a figure, &c. Thus our Minister alleageth Bellarmine, and then triumphantly concludeth: Let our Aduersaries looke well into these speeches, and they shall finde that we say in effect no more. Your Aduersaries, Master White, haue looked well into these speeches, and they doe finde and say in effect, that you are a most faithlesse, dishonest, and corrupt Writer, and indeed, one of those whom the Spanish phrase calleth, Vn hombre de salmado, a fellow without a soule: for if you either feared God, or had a true conceit of any Religion, or thought that the soule were immortall, you would neuer deprave this Author as you doe, making the Catholikes to be patrons of that blasphemie, which in their soules they damne to the pit of hell.

^b Bellar. de amiff. grat. l. 2. c. 13.

Ans. 1. I finde that verified in you, which Cyprian ^c speaketh, saying; *It is the fashion of those, whose breasts and soules the Devil inhabiteth, to testifie their venomous ranconr with a furious voice: otherwise what can bee the incentive of this your sauage abuse of Doctor White in this place?*

^c Cyp. ep. 55. or l. 1. ep. 3.

You pretend two causes: 1. That he produceth Bellarmine to maintaine, that Catholikes are Patrons of blasphemie, and hold God to be the Author of sinne. 2. That to the end he might inforce the Cardinals words to sound to this purpose, he depraueth and curtalleth sundry parcels of his speech. But neither of these assertions are true. 1. Doctor White produced Bellarmine, to shew, that learned Papists in substance of doctrine, consent with the Church of England, concerning the providence of God about sinne. And he doth in no sort tax them for making God the author of sinne; but freeeth both them and the Protestants from this blasphemie.

2. He omitteth no words in Bellarmine, materiall to that purpose, whereunto he alleaged him; to wit, which serued to proue the threefold action of God about sinne, deliuered by him.

Doctor White setteth forth the Doctrine of the Orthodox Protestants, touching Gods providence, about sinne, in three propositions.

1. God, as the vniuersall cause of all things, sustaineth mankinde, and vpholdeth his being, Act. 17. 28. yea, the being and mouing of all his actions, (in regard of their entitie) good and bad.

This position is maintained by Bellarmine ^d, and by all the Papists, God (saith he) concurrereth as an vniuersall cause, to the substance and entitie of the action: The entitie of the hatred of God considered in it selfe, is not euill ^e, &c. As an vniuersall cause he conferres a certaine force and influx indifferent, &c.

^d Bellar. de amiff. grat. l. 2. c. 5.

^e Bellar. ib. c. 12.

2. God with-holdeth his grace, being bound to no man, and leaneth the wicked to themselves: whereupon it followeth, that their hearts harden, and they cannot but sinne. The manner how he hardeneth, is not by creating the sinne, (as he doth grace in the elect) but by denying them the power of his grace which should mollifie them, and by offering them sundry obiects, which they conuert into occasion of sinne and ruine, &c.

Bellarmino ^f and other Papists assent to this doctrine, saying; God doth not onely forsake, and by desertion suffer men to be subdued of their enemies, but also he doth not bestow congruous grace whereby they may obtaine strength, &c. And other branches contained in this second Article, are deliuered by Bellarmine, Chap. 13. l. 2. De amiff. gratia. And Vasquez ^g saith; God is the Author of the cogitation and occasion, from whence he knowes that sinne will proceed. Lira ^h; For the punishment of sinne he taketh away his grace. Caietan ⁱ; The householders going

^f Bellar. ib. c. 18.

^g Vasq. l. d. 99.

^h Lira super Ex.

ⁱ Caietan. com.

Math. 21. v. 33.

into a farre Countrey, *Matth. 21. 33.* is Gods subtraction of his gracious helpe, keeping men from euill.

^k Bellar. de amiff.
grat. c. 16.

^l Ibid. c. 13.

^m Bannes 1. q. 23.
ar. 2.

ⁿ Vafq. 1. q. 22.
ar. 2. obferu. n. 27.

3. The Doctors third propofition is, God ordinateth the finne, which is nothing elfe but the directing of it in fuch manner as he pleafeth, that it proceed no further or otherwife, than his good pleasure willeth. Now Bellarmine^k deliuereth the doctrine contained in this propofition, faying; God by a marvellous power ruleth the hearts of wicked perfons, and kindreth them, that they cannot per- forme, endemour, will, or thinke any other thing, than what he permitteth. And againe, *Prasidet voluntatibus malis^l, &c.* He fits a Generour ouer wicked wils, and ruleth, bendeth, and plieeth them, working inuifibly in them, &c. He inclined the corrupt will of Semei to curfe Dauid, by permitting, &c. Bannes^m; Sinne being confidered, as it is permitted of God, is vnder the prouidence of God, and vnder the will of God. Valquesⁿ; Sinnes are as it were the matter whereabout the prouidence of God is occupied.

And thus Doctor Whites three pofitions, containing a fomme of our doctrine, are a Breviat of that which is taught by Bellarmine and other Papifts, concerning Gods prouidence about finne.

T. W. Now we will fee what a mount of impoftures and deceits our Mi- nifter hath heaped up, in producing this one authoritie. 1. He omitteth alto- gether without the leaft intimation of Bellarmines diflike thereof, the firft kinde or manner how God may be faid to compell man to finne; to wit, pro- perly and immediatly, which Bellarmine calleth impious and blafphemous, and yet Master White endeuoureth thorowout all the paffage here urged, to charge him therewith.

^p Serar. com. Iosh.
c. 6. ex eorum
(Caluinianorum)
placitis iubet eti-
am ille peccata. O
infamiam? Quam
non modo Catho-
lici femper exe-
crati funt: fed &
ex ea ipfa hærefi
iam in Anglia pe-
ne Academici om-
nes.

Anfw. Like a Mountebanke you proclaime a mount of impoftures, and bring forth a Moufe. 1. It is no impofture for Doctor White to omit that which is on all hands by Papifts and Proteftants condemned as a blafphemie. 2. It is a wil- full calumny in you to fay, that Doctor White endeuoureth to charge Bel- larmine with holding, that God properly and immediatly compelleth man to finne: But as your Cardinall is innocent from this blafphemie, fo no Orthodox Proteftant beleueth or maintaineth it, and your felues confeffe, that the Prote- ftants of England affirme no fuch thing*.

T. W. 2. For the more engaging of Bellarmine herein, he immediatly ap- plieth that example of a Hunter letting goe the flip, to Gods commanding and inclining men to finne, which Bellarmine onely by illation applieth thereunto.

Bellar. de amiff.
grat. 1. c. 13. Be-
can. de auth. pecc.
c. 13. p. 162. Cor-
nel. lap. com. Rom.
9. n. 87.

Anfw. When an Hunter letteth goe the flip, hee is willing that the hound fhould follow the game; fo Bellarmine affirms, that God doth permit, and by giuing libertie as it were, excite thofe, which of themfelues are prone and dif- pofed hereunto, to commit the finne they defire, and my Brother chargeth him with faying no more.

T. W. 3. Where Bellarmine faith, that wicked men, by diuine prouidence, are inclined to one euill rather than another, not pofitiuely, but by permiffi- on, The Minifter hath left out thefe latter words, &c.

Anfw. My Brothers purpofe being onely to fhew, that Bellarmine agreeth with the Church of England, in the doctrine of Gods prouidence about finne, produced fo much as ferued to that purpofe, and had no iuft occafion to deliuer other particular fpeeches of his, concerning the fpeciall manner, how wicked perfons are inclined to finne.

T. W. Our Minifter fubtilly taking hold of the word Pofitiue, doth leaue out all the reft, wherein is expreffed how the fame word is to be vnderftood, and ioyneth it immediatly with the words, occafionally and morally.

Anfw.

Ans. In his first solution Bellarmine desires that God *morally* moueth the will to euill, and this might iustly occasion Doctor White in reciting his opinion, to omit the word *morally*: but in the fourth solution, Bellarmine^e thwarreth himselfe, saying; God inclineth the will to euill, *occasionally, and morally*. Now in this case what should Doctor White doe? If he had put in the words, *morally and occasionally*, you might haue opposed him with the former place, *God doth not morally incline to euill*: And now he leaueth it out, you charge him for omission, out of the latter.

^e Bellar. de amiff. grat. l. 2. c. 13. primus modus, &c.
^e Bellar. ib.

Quo teneam vultus mutantem Protea nodo?

T. W. *He purposely forbeareth the example, wherein Bellarmine doth interpret the words, occasionally and morally; to wit, in sending a good thought, and not an euill thought.*

Ans. Doctor White neuer intended to copie out all Bellarmines workes, but to collect the summe of his doctrine touching the three points formerly named: neither hath Bellarmine those words, *and not an euill thought*; and to your selfe are faultie in adding, as you charge the Doctor with omitting.

An obseruation concerning the providence of God about sinne.

1. That God Almighty being onely good, doth notwithstanding *permit and gouerne wicked actions and sinnes*, is taught by the holy Scripture, Acts 2. 23. and 4. 28. and by the primitive Fathersⁿ, and generally by all the Protestants and Papists^r.

2. There be foure actions of diuine providence about sinne: 1. Of *permission*, Act. 14. 16. 1 Cor. 10. 33. 2. Of *inspection* and knowledge, Iob 34. 21, 22. Psal. 94. 7. 3. Of *limitation* or restraint, Gen. 20. 6. 4. Of *direction* and order, whereby sinne being in it selfe euill, is by Gods wisdome and goodnesse ordered to some *passiue* euent, which is good, Rom. 8. 28. Gen. 50. 20.

3. *God is not the author or efficient cause of sin, as it is sin^x, in any manner whatsoever*, Psal. 5. 4. James 1. 13. 1 Ioh. 2. 16. And this is the generall doctrine of the primitive Fathers, and of all Orthodox Churches.

4. *The author and efficient cause of sinne is the will of man^y*, Match. 15. 19. *by deficiency from the Creator to the creature*. The same at the first was created good, Ephes. 4. 24. And being endued with liberty to chuse good or euill, as it should be pleasing vnto it selfe, and hauing in it a possibilitie of deficiency, because it was created mutable, and of nothing^{*}; it did voluntarily by it owne election and motion depart from the obedience of the Creator, to an inordinate desire of the Creature, Gen. 3. Rom. 5. 12. Ioh. 8. 44. 1 Ioh. 3. 8. And by this meanes Concupiscence entered into the soule; and from the sinne of the first man, being propagated to posterity, bringeth forth actuall and personall transgression in all the sonnes of Adam. And thus *the first immediate cause of sinne*,

aliquid & improbae iustus, & permittit omnipotens. Bellarm. de amiff. grat. lib. 2. cap. 16. Deceit permittere, vult permittere, &c.
¹ Aug. de Ciuit. Dei, l. 5. c. 9. Voluntas nostrae tantum valent, quantum eas Deus valere vult atque praescire. Fulgent. ad Monim. lib. 1. pag. 57. Deus licet author non sit malorum cogitationum, ordinator tamen est malorum voluntatum, & de malo opere cuiuslibet mali, non definit in se bonum operari. Gregor. mor. lib. 32 cap. 16. Diaboli gladius a Deo applicatur, &c. l. 34. c. 4. Caietan. tentac. 8. q. 5. Hugo de sacram. lib. 1. v. c. cap. 16. Aug. de Gen. ad lit. l. 11. c. 3. * Id. Resp. ad art. falso impos. resp. 10. detestanda & abominanda opinio, &c. De vt. l. credend. c. 18. Ambros. Hexam. l. 1. ca. 8. Polan. thesp. 2. de pecc. Doctores ecclesiarum reformatarum non statuunt, peccati author em, seu causam efficientem esse Deum. ⁷ Aug. de Ciuit. Dei, l. 5. c. 9. & l. 12. c. 6. 7. & l. 14. c. 13. & l. 15. c. 21. Ezechiel. id. c. 23. cont. Iulian. l. 1. c. 3. De gratia Christi, l. 1. c. 19. De nupt. & concupisc. l. 2. c. 28. Aug. cont. Faust. Manich. lib. 22. cap. 22. A voluntate est initium peccati. Caietan. in 1. Tho. q. 23. ar. 3. Gess. compend. theol. de pecc. actual. Bonauent. breuiloq. p. 3. c. 1. de orig. mali. Caietan. opusc. to. 3. tr. 1. orat. 3. Malum ex naturali boni defectu, ex mutabilitate, mutabilitas ex possibilitate, possibilitas ex finitate, finitas suboritur ex nihilo. Malum a bono nascitur, sed per accidens. Fulgent. l. 1. ad. Monim. Peccati initium si attendatur, vult, quod nihil aliud est, quam inordinatarum rerum, inordinata rationali creaturae dilectio, quae sponte persequendo dilectionis ordinem, perdidit & saluam. * Aug. de Ciuit. Dei, l. 12. c. 6. Inuenit voluntatem naturam, non ex eo esse incipere, quia natura est, sed ex eo quod ex nihilo natura facta est.

¹ Aug. de Genes. ad lit. l. 8. c. 4. Deus bipartito, providentia sua opera, prae se vniuersae creaturae, naturae ut fiant, voluntatibus autem ut sine suo iussu, vel permissu nihil faciant. Et de Ciuit. Dei, l. 11. c. 17. & l. 14. c. 26. & l. 27. c. 1. Ezechiel. c. 11. & c. 100. & 101. De Trin. l. 3. c. 4. & l. 8. c. 24. Clem. Alex. Strom. l. 1. c. 17. Hieron. l. 3. in Ierem. c. 12. Prosper. ad excerp. Gen. d. 8.
⁷ Bannes 1. q. 23. ar. 3. Tho. Aqu. 1. q. 22. ar. 2. Becan. de praedest. Calu. Stapl. de iustif. lib. 11. cap. 7. & c. 15. Valsq. 1. q. 22. ar. 2. obseru. Serrat. in Iosh. l. 1. c. 9. q. 1.
¹ Aug. de diuinat. dnm. c. 2. Deus

was the will of man, by deficiencye from good, and the next efficient cause of all small sinne in vs, is habituall concupiscence.

5. Whereas sinne is a deficiencye and aberration from the rule of iustice, 1 Ioh. 3. 4. it cannot subsist alone, or of it selfe^a: but euen as halting must necessarily be ioyned with some motion of the bodie, and hoarsenesse of speech with the action of speaking: So the euill of sinne is conioyned with some action or motion of the soule or body, which hath a positieue and naturall being, and whereunto there hapneth a going astray from diuine law; euen as it hapneth to a lame mans naturall motion, to haue halting concurring with it.

Of that which is positieue and naturall in sinfull actions, Diuines acknowledge God to be the author, both in that he preserueth mans being, will, and faculties, whereby he is enabled to his operations^a, and also because as the first and principall mouer, he produceth together with the second cause, all positieue motion, Act. 17. 28. ^a For example, in the sinne of lying, there is the action of speaking, and there is an inordinate manner, or declining from veritie in speaking: the one being naturall, and which may be applied to good as well as euill, is the operation of God, and of the naturall power of man: the other is a defect of the second cause, and of man himselfe onely, as he is corrupted with originall sinne.

These two, namely the entitie or substance, and the prauitie of the actions goe inseparably together, and the latter cannot be without the former; and touching the same, the Schoolemen teach as followeth.

Vega^b, God cōworketh with man, those actions which haue an intrinsecall and inseparable nauightnesse. Greg. Arimin.^c and Capreolus^d; God worketh with man the euill act^e. Conradus^f; God produceth more principally the substance of the act of sinne, than the will it selfe. Driedo^g; God as an vniuersall cause effecteth the motion of the will when it willet adulterie. Vasquez^h; God is the author of the cogitation and occasion, of which he knoweth that sinne will proceed. Anselmeⁱ; The act of sinne according to the substance, is of God. Gerson^j; The second free efficient cause, (the will) can doe nothing by sinning, but God concurrereth positieuely to all that which is positieue in the act. Seraphinus Capponus^k; The euill of sinne is in some sort of God. And Thomas Aquinas^l; Euill actions as they be deficient, are not of God, but of their next deficient causes: but all the action and entitie they haue, is of God; euen as halting proceedeth from the power locomotioe, in respect of motion, but in regard of the defect, from the lamenesse of the thigh. Nauar; God himselfe inuitereth, yea helpeth men to doe some things which are sinnes, as they are entities^m.

6. The action of God, whereby he is said to excōcate, 1 Ioh. 1. 2. 40. Esa. 19. 14. to obdure, ^a Rom. 9. 18. to deccine, 1 King. 22. 23. Esa. 63. 17. deliuer into a reprobate minde, Rom. 1. 28. to impell or excite to euill, Psal. 105. 25. 2 Sam. 24. 1. 2 Sam. 16. 10. and to worke by wicked persons, as his instruments, 2 Sam. 12. 11. Esa. 54. 16. is not an action of infusion, or positieue productionⁿ, such as he vseth in the iust, when he causeth vertue and grace, Phil. 2. 13. 1 Cor. 11. 12. and doth illuminate and sanctifie them, Hebr. 8. 10. Ezech. 36. 26. Ephes. 2. 10. but a worke of desertion, permission, and order: whereby 1. he leaueth man to himselfe, Act. 14. 6. and forsaketh him, 1 Sam. 16. 14. that is, affordeth not occasions and meanes, apt and congruous to reforme him; and suspendeth or denieth the

^a Aug. ench. c. 11. & 12. Nec malum vnquam potest esse vltimū, vbi bonum est nullum. Et cap. 24. Mala omnino sine bonis, & nisi in bonis esse non possunt: potest enim homo vel angelus non esse iniustus, iniustus autem non potest esse nisi homo, vel angelus, & bonum quod homo, bonum quod angelus, mali quod iniustus. De Ciuit. Dei, l. 14. c. 11. & l. 19. c. 23. Fulg. de fid. ad Petr. c. 21. Anselm. de casu diab. l. 9. c. 20. 11. Damascen. orth. fid. l. 3. c. 4. Aqu. 1. q. 48. ar. 3. Caietan. ibid. Molina 1. Tho. q. 5. disp. vnica. ^b Aug. de Ciuit. Dei. l. 22. c. 24. Efficacem potentiam suam si rebus subtrahat, nec progredi poterunt. ^c Caietan. 1. Tho. q. 19. ar. 8. Stat causam secundam necessariam moueri a prima, & cum hoc ipso moueri modificari, ex natura causae secundae. Prima causa non attingit effectum secundae causae, in seipsa: sed modificata, cooperatione sua iuxta modum ipsius causae secundae. Bradwardin. 4. caus. Dei. l. 1. c. 14. Male sapit multum, si dicatur Deum velle & facere actum incestus patris cum filia, filii cum matre, &c. parricidii, seditionis, blasphemiae, &c. & tamen tam Sancti quam Philosophi ita dicunt, &c. Quis enim in tali incestu preparat semen & mouet, creat & infundit animam ferui nisi Deus? & quomodocunque sonet, sic loquuntur Sancti Dei, imo Spiritus Dei, Esa. 26. &c. Hugo Viç. de Sacram. l. 1. p. 4. c. 13. Si vero dicitur Deus vult malum, graue est auditu, & non facile recipit pia mens, &c. Non quia quod dicitur non bene dicitur, sed quia quod bene dicitur, non bene intelligitur. ^d Vega pro concil. l. 2. c. 15. ^e Greg. Arim. 2. d. 28. q. 1. ar. 3. ^f Capreol. 2. d. 18. q. 1. ar. 3. ad 12. ^g Conrad. 1. 2. q. 49. ar. 1. ^h Ioh. Driedo de Red. tr. 2. c. 2. ⁱ Valsq. 1. Tho. d. 99. c. 4. n. 21. ^j Ansel. de concord. lib. arb. & predest. c. 2. ^k Ger. p. 4. centilog. de causa finali, 5. & p. 3. de consol. l. 2. prof. 2. ^l Serap. com. Gen. 49. concl. 2. append. ^m 1. Tho. Aqu. contra Gentil. l. 3. c. 71. Alifio. sum. l. 3. tr. 8. c. 3. q. 2. Deus potuit precipere quod vnus homo haberet duas uxores, & multa alia mala. ⁿ Nauar. enchirid. ca. 21. n. 25. Deus ipse inuitat, imo iuuat ad agendum aliqua, quae sunt peccata, quatenus sunt entia, &c. ^o Stapl. Antid. Apost. Rom. 9. v. 19. &c. Obduratio, &c. ex solo Dei beneplacito esse potest. Ipsa permissio peccati potest esse a sola voluntate Dei, &c. ^p Aug. de predest. & grat. c. 4. & sup. Psal. 77. & enchirid. c. 99. & sup. Iosh. q. 18. Cornel. à Lap. com. Rom. permissioe & indirecte obdurat. Orig. ho. 2. ad. 2. c. iudic. Quomodo cum tradit Sathan? dicitur à matre eius & auctore se, & refugit à cogitationibus eius malis, & desiderijs indignis, & relinquit domum cordis eius vacuum.

concourse

concourse of his speciall helpe and grace. 2. He suffereth man to be tempted about his strength, to be ruled by his errors, 2 Thiel. 2. 10, 11. and transported by his owne concupiscence, Rom. 1. 24. Psal. 81. 12. and permitteh Satan to exercise his subletie and malice towards him, * 1 King. 22. 23. 3. He ordereth objects and meanes in such sort, as that they may be incentiues by way of occasion, to prouoke the wicked to exercise that sinfulness, which is in, and of themselves, where, and how God will haue it so breake out for punishment, correction, example, or triall.

Obiect. 1. Calvin and Beza teach sundry other things, concerning the prouidence of God about sinne.

Ans. 1. They and all their followers absolutely denie, that God is the author of sinne, &c. And Calvin saith; *It is an execrable blasphemie to teach thus.* 2. Forasmuch as our greatest Aduersaries affirme, that we of the Church of England are no Calvinists, it is iniust to blame vs for their doctrine if it be faulty. 3. Sundry reuerend and iudicious persons, hauing examined Caluins doctrine, doe free him from those imputations, which his Aduersaries obiect against him.

Obiect. 2. Calvin teacheth, that God decreed the fall of man, and that sinne hapneth by the ordinance and will of God. From whence, according to Bellarmine, Becanus, &c. many blasphemous illations doe follow.

Ans. God may be said to decree the fall of man, and to ordaine sinne three waies. 1. *Decreto causante*, by such a decree and will, as doth naturally * or morally cause and effect it: and thus to say that God decreed sinne, maketh him the author of sinne. But Calvin and Beza maintaine not any such decree of God, but condemne the doctrine thereof as blasphemous: and yet Becanus and the Iesuites declaime and dispute against them, as guilty of this blasphemy.

2. God may be said to decree the fall of man, *decreto permittente*, by a permissiue decree; conditionally, and with reference to mans owne act; to wit, if man himselfe by his owne free election, would fall into sinne, then God decreed to suffer him; and vpon the prescience of mans owne voluntarie fall, he ordained the permission of his sinne. This is the doctrine of Molina, Fonseca, Suarez, Bellarmine, Becanus, Valenza, Vasquez, Stapleton, and many Papists; and is confuted by learned Chumel, and sundry other of their owne part.

3. God may be said to decree the fall of man, *decreto permittente, & ordinante*; by such a decree in God, as did both determine to permit it, and purpose with himselfe, that vpon his permission it should infallibly be. For example: 1. God decreed to create man mutable, and subiect to possibilitie of falling. 2. He decreed to permit Satan to tempt him. 3. He decreed not to con-

qualitas, id est, quale cor habet ad malum, suo fiat vicio, &c. tamen qualitate mala huc vel illuc impellatur, causis sit quibus animus propellitur: quæ causæ ut vel existant vel non existant, non est in hominis potestate, veniunt ex occulta prouidentia. Vide ib. q. 24. & 29. * Bellar. Recog. de ecclef. l. 4. c. 6. p. 49. P. B. Abboc. Antilog. cont. Budæm. pag. 66. & Answ. to D. Bishops preface. B. Morton. Cath. apol. l. 1. c. 25. D. Field of the Church, l. 1. c. 23. D. Hackwell ag. Carriar. c. 2. n. 12. pag. 101. q. Caluin. instit. l. 1. c. 18. & l. 3. c. 23. Beza de prædest. cont. Castal. pag. 391. & 740. Polani. theol. p. 3. de pec. pag. 67. * Bellar. de amiss. grat. l. 2. c. 34. f. Becan. lib. de auct. pec. * Physice. * Beza cont. Castal. de prædest. pro impio & blasphemio habemus. Molina l. 1. q. 23. disp. 4. m. 11. Quos Deus præsciuit per præscientiam conditionalem, futuros pro sui arbitrii libertate, &c. Vide Cornel. de Lap. com. Rom. 8. v. 29. n. 188. Dionys. Carthus. com. Rom. 8. * Fonseca Metaph. 6. q. 6. sect. 8. Molina in 1. Tho. q. 13. ar. 1. disp. 17. Suarez. opusc. l. 1. c. 6. &c. Vasq. in 1. Thom. disp. 67. Bellar. Recog. lib. de grat. & lib. arb. pag. 108. Becan. de prædest. Cath. c. 5. Gregor. Val. to. 1. d. 1. q. 23. p. 3. Stapl. Antid. Apostol. Rom. 11. v. 29. Scientia media. * Chumel. disp. var. ad. 1. 2. d. 4. p. 60. Prædestinatio, dicuntur electi, secundum propositum Dei, Rom. 8. 28. qui operatur omnia, secundum consilium voluntatis suæ, Eph. 1. 11. & non dicit quod operatur omnia ex præuisione operum, sed post consilium voluntatis suæ. Si enim Deus operatur ex scientia media, qua videt quid vnaquæque causa, seu voluntas operatur sit, in omni euentu & occasione, si in ea constituitur, tam quidem non operaretur secundum consilium voluntatis suæ, sed potius ex consilio voluntatis creatoris, iuxta ea quæ prauidet per scientiam mediam, hoc est, quatenus cernit, quid vnaquæque voluntas futura sit & operatur, in omni euentu & occasione, si in ea constituitur, quod est agere ea quæ creatura vult & decernit, ante decretum & consilium voluntatis Dei. * Jun. cont. Bellarm. de ecclef. l. 4. c. 9. * Benius d. offic. gratiæ, ca. 5. p. 68. Ego sane æxistimo futura ista contingentia, respectu Dei esse absoluta, non conditionata: nec respectu Dei posse nisi remeet, formari conditionaliter istiusmodi propositionem: An Deus ab omni æternitate scierit, quid facturus esset Adamus ab uxore tentaretur: quia Deus in puncto æternitatis hoc & quodcumque aliud futurum contingens absolute præsciuit. Et ideo ab omni æternitate scilicet Adam tentandum, peccatum, & similia: cuius ratio est, quia futura contingentia respectu Dei, sunt per decretum saltem permissiui determinata, ac propterea necessaria. Contingentia enim dicuntur, propter liberum concursum, secundæ causæ, non respectu Dei, apud quem sic dicto decreto sunt necessaria. Aug. enchir. c. 107. Vtrumlibet horum elegerit, Dei voluntas fieret, &c. Bellar. de grat. & lib. arb. l. 4. c. 13. Deus intelligit res omnes, quæ quocumque modo esse possunt: deinde voluit decernit ex his, quæ velit reipsa existere; Vasq. to. 1. d. 99. c. 4. n. 21. Tamen Deus sit author cogitationis & occasionis, ex qua nouit futurum esse opus peccati. Hugo Victor. de Sacram. l. 1. p. 1. c. 22. Si non potest prouidentia eius, aut mutari, ut aliud fiat, quam præuisionem est, &c. necesse est apud fieri quod prouisionem est, & nihil fieri quod prouisionem non est.

* Greg. M. moral. l. 2. c. 21. Q. ia Achab rex ex precedentibus peccatis dignus erat, ut tali debuisset deceptione damari, quatenus qui sepe volens, ceciderat in culpam, quandoque nolens capere cur ad poenam. Occulta iustitiæ licentia malignis spiritibus datur, ut quos volentes in peccati laqueo strangulant, in peccati etiam poenam nolentes trahant. & l. 3. c. 5. Aug. in Psal. 104. In seruum venundatus est Ioseph: nempe quando factum est peccatum erat frater, & tamen Deus misit Ioseph in Ægyptum. Intuenda est ergo res magna & pernecessaria, quomodo Deus bene utatur malis operibus hominum, sicut illi contra malè ventur bonis operibus Dei.

* Greg. sup. Ezech. lib. 1. ho. 11. Distincta sunt omnipotentis Dei iudicia, & qui peccatorem diu expectat ut redeat, non reddenit, atque contemnit, ponit adhuc ubi grauius impingit.

Aug. super Exod. q. 18. Vult Deus bene cordibus malis, &c. Quamuis vniuscuiusque cordis in malitia

* Lord Archbishop
of Canterbury in
one of his 6. Le-
ctures. Th. Abot
B. of Salisbury. D.
Bishop B. of Che-
ster. D. Field. D.
Hatchwell, alleged
before.

b. Less. d. gr. ef-
fic. c. 3. pa. 11. Ha-
retici num tempo-
ris nunquam dixe-
runt Deum velle
ipsam multam o-
peri annexam, sed
solum velle ipsa
opera poscua qui-
bus malitia an-
nexa, idque in
bonum finem.
Calu. Instit. l. 1. c.
18. n. 3, 3. 4.
Vasq. l. 1. d. 99. c. 3.
n. 9. Recentes
doctrinam Thom.
& antiquorum,
putant sic esse in-
telligendam, vt
Deus ab eterno
prescribit singu-
las nostras actio-
nes, id quod non
solum in operibus
gratia censent esse
verum, sed in alijs
etiam operibus
peccati, si sermo
sit non de malitia,
sed de substantia
actus. Ib. c. 4. n. 23.
(aliqui sentiunt)
Deum nos appli-
care, agere, imple-
re, &c.

* Bannes l. 1. q. 23.
Ferrar. l. 3. cont.
gent. c. 161. Mar-
fil. l. 1. q. 41. ar. 2.
Greg. Arim. l. 1. d.
41. q. vnic. ar. 2.
Adam. Sasb. com.
Rom. 9. Durand. l.
d. 40. q. 3. Capre-
ol. l. 1. d. 41. q. vii.
Caietan. & Shu-
mel l. 1. q. 23. ar. 5.
Eftius com. Rom.
9. v. 13. pa. 137.
* Bannes l. 1. q. 23.
ar. 5. Reprobatio
includit volunta-
tem, permittendi
aliquem cadere in
culpam, & inse-
rendi damnationis
poenam pro culpa.
Rispolis de prae-
nit. l. 1. q. 1. concl.
3. Permissio pecc.
& obduratio, effectus reprobationis, secundum Thomam, &c. Altiſidor. l. 1. c. 9. q. 3. Reprobatio est praeſcientia Dei, qua ab eterno scit Deus, se non appositurum gratiam isti, &c. d. Bannes ib. ar. 3. pag. 270. Deus habuit hunc actum ab eterno, volo permittere hanc peccata, volo quibusdam non dare auxilia, quae si recipere non peccarent. * Eftius com. in Rom. 10. qui citat. Aug. d. Cor. & gram. ca. 7. & d. pecc. mer. & Remiss. ca. 22. & d. dono perſeu. ca. 19. Greg. ho. 17. in Euangel. citat Hieronymum, Caietan. Socum, Pererium. * Sup. sent. l. 1. d. 40. §. 11. permissio peccati Adz, voluit fuit & merita a Deo. Aug. sup. Psal. 105. Corollarium de sponte malum conuertit ad odium, &c. f. Beniſ de efficacitate gratiae, c. 2. &c. pa. 7. &c. Ofor. ep. l. 9. de iustitia. Anton. Delphinus de iustitia. Eftius com. in Rom. 10. v. 14. * Driedo. d. capt. & Red. tr. 5. ca. 4. pa. 133. Deus secundum ordinem iustitiae vastandas terras, has vel illas, quas gentis suae, impijs tyrannis, iam paratis praedari, atque ambitiose dominari, inspirat cogitationes ad vastandas terras, has vel illas, quas tali poena indicat dignas. Beza, de praedest. contra Castal. Nos affirmamus non tantum inanem illam & commentitiam permissioem, aut defectionem: sed Dei concilium decretum, voluntatem, actionem denique verò interuenire. * Calu. cont. Libertin. c. 14. Beza de praedest. con. Castal. p. 366. Sicut Sol in cadauer radios suos emittens, &c. f. Beza, Excitatur cum Sathana, tum aliorum ministerio, propria improbitate vtens. * Basil. serm. Quod Deus non est auct. malorum. Aug. d. ciuit. d. l. 11. c. 17. Bellar. de amiss. grat. l. 1. c. 13. Medici vtantur vipera veneno. * Greg. mor. li. 3. ca. 26. Diaboli gladius, a Deo applicatur, &c. li. 34. c. 4. scit ad bonorum custodiam, bene vti malae actione Reprobatorum. vid. Greg. sup. l. 1. Reg. 1. l. 5. c. 1. * Aug. de grat. & lib. arb. c. 20. & c. 21. Nunc voluntatem proprio

curre with Adam by effectual grace, and to enable him to resist temptation. 4. He knew that without this concurrence of grace man would fall, and he willingly permitted him so to doe. This seemeth to be the summe of Caluins doctrine, touching the decree of God about the fall of man. Concerning the truth whereof, I presume to say nothing, referring my selfe to the grauer iudgement of other more reuerend persons, who haue purposely handled this matter.

But in defence of my Brothers assertion, who affirmed, that learned Papists say as much in effect, touching Gods prouidence about sinne, as Caluin doth, I thinke his assertion is true, in respect of sundry Papists^b, although it be doubtfull whether Bellarmine holdeth thus or nor.

1. Sundry learned Papists, to wit, Bannes, Rispolis, Ferrariensis, Marſilius, Gregorie Arimin, Adam Sasbot, Shumel, Eftius, &c. maintaine; That Gods decree of reprobation, goeth before all praeuision or foreknowledge of sinne^c. But vpon this assertion it followeth, that God preordained the fall of man, because according to this Tenet, *Reprobation implyeth an absolute will and purpose of God, to suffer man to fall into sinne, and to inferre the punishment of damnation, because of sinne*. And Bannes^d a celebrious Doctor, saith; *God from eternitie had this act in himselfe, I will permit these sinnes, I will not bestow helps and means vpon certaine persons, which if they might haue receiued, they would not haue sinned*. And Eftius writeth, That the permission of Adams sinne was wil-
led^e and intended of God^e.

2. Many learned Papists, and among the rest Beniſ^f, instilled excellentissimus, doe teach, that God bestoweth not vpon many persons sufficient grace, whereby they may auoid infidelitie and mortall sinne. And from hence also it followeth, that his purpose and will is, that some persons shall fall into sinne.

Obiect. 3. Caluin and Beza teach, that God not onely permitteth & diuers persons to sinne, but that hee vseth a secret action, and inclineth their will to exercise the naughtinesse which is in themselves, vpon such objects as hee hath appointed.

Ans. Their meaning is^h, that like as when a man moueth a dead carrion, there ariseth a noisome sauour, not effected by the mouer, but proceeding from the filchinesse of the rotten carkasse: So God by a secret occasional actionⁱ moueth the heart of man, being full of vnclannesse, and causeth the vnſauorie filth of sinne, lurking before in the heart, to breake out, and to annoy the wicked person himselfe or others, who deseruet to bee punished or corrected by this meanes: In this action there is no iniquitie or sauour of wickednesse in the mouer: but whatsoever is corrupt and filthie, proceedeth from man himselfe, who before this motion, was a carrion dead in sinne. And if wee allow Physi- tians to vse venomous herbs^j, and in certaine cafes to extract the poison which is in them, to the compounding of bodily medicines: how much more is the Lord able by his prouidence, without any defilement of himselfe, to apply^k the wickednesse of the creature to a good euent?

2. It was the plaine Doctrine of Saint Augustine^k, that God by a secret motion, worketh in the hearts of wicked men, inclining them to their particular objects. For speaking of Shimei, he saith^k, *The Lord by his iust iudgement in-*

3. Permissio pecc. & obduratio, effectus reprobationis, secundum Thomam, &c. Altiſidor. l. 1. c. 9. q. 3. Reprobatio est praeſcientia Dei, qua ab eterno scit Deus, se non appositurum gratiam isti, &c. d. Bannes ib. ar. 3. pag. 270. Deus habuit hunc actum ab eterno, volo permittere hanc peccata, volo quibusdam non dare auxilia, quae si recipere non peccarent. * Eftius com. in Rom. 10. qui citat. Aug. d. Cor. & gram. ca. 7. & d. pecc. mer. & Remiss. ca. 22. & d. dono perſeu. ca. 19. Greg. ho. 17. in Euangel. citat Hieronymum, Caietan. Socum, Pererium. * Sup. sent. l. 1. d. 40. §. 11. permissio peccati Adz, voluit fuit & merita a Deo. Aug. sup. Psal. 105. Corollarium de sponte malum conuertit ad odium, &c. f. Beniſ de efficacitate gratiae, c. 2. &c. pa. 7. &c. Ofor. ep. l. 9. de iustitia. Anton. Delphinus de iustitia. Eftius com. in Rom. 10. v. 14. * Driedo. d. capt. & Red. tr. 5. ca. 4. pa. 133. Deus secundum ordinem iustitiae vastandas terras, has vel illas, quas gentis suae, impijs tyrannis, iam paratis praedari, atque ambitiose dominari, inspirat cogitationes ad vastandas terras, has vel illas, quas tali poena indicat dignas. Beza, de praedest. contra Castal. Nos affirmamus non tantum inanem illam & commentitiam permissioem, aut defectionem: sed Dei concilium decretum, voluntatem, actionem denique verò interuenire. * Calu. cont. Libertin. c. 14. Beza de praedest. con. Castal. p. 366. Sicut Sol in cadauer radios suos emittens, &c. f. Beza, Excitatur cum Sathana, tum aliorum ministerio, propria improbitate vtens. * Basil. serm. Quod Deus non est auct. malorum. Aug. d. ciuit. d. l. 11. c. 17. Bellar. de amiss. grat. l. 1. c. 13. Medici vtantur vipera veneno. * Greg. mor. li. 3. ca. 26. Diaboli gladius, a Deo applicatur, &c. li. 34. c. 4. scit ad bonorum custodiam, bene vti malae actione Reprobatorum. vid. Greg. sup. l. 1. Reg. 1. l. 5. c. 1. * Aug. de grat. & lib. arb. c. 20. & c. 21. Nunc voluntatem proprio

clined

clined his will, being formerly wicked through his owne fault, into his sinne. And againe¹; God worketh in the hearts of wicked men whatſeuer hee will; inclining their wills whither he pleaseth, either to good for his mercie, or to euill for their owne demerits. And in another place²; God worketh his iudgements not onely in the bodies, but hearts of men, by manerous and ineffable meanes. And the same is affirmed by Hugo de Sancto Victore³, and by the ordinarie Glotie⁴.

Obiect. 4. Calvin and Beza say, That God produceth the same act which a sinner doth, but in a different manner.

Ans. Azorius the Iesuite saith the like⁵, In sinnes which are wickedly committed, God together with the will of man, worketh that which is done. And Andreas Vega⁶, God, according as sundry Divines doe more probably thinke, by his will and concurrence, effecteth our sinnes together with vs. Canus⁷, There is no absurditie, if we referre the same worke as it is a punishment, to God the Author, and as it is a fault, to Satan. These Doctors and Calvin intend no more, but that which other Schoolemen hold; to wit, that God produceth the same act in regard of the entitie or positiue being; but not the same formally⁸, or according to the obliquitie and wickednesse thereof.

Obiect. 5. They teach, that God in his providence vseth sinners, and their wills and deeds, to be his instruments, to the effecting of his owne most iust and holy will.

Ans. According to Psal. 17. 13. Esa. 10. 5. They meane, that they are passive instruments, and effect his will, onely in regard of the event⁹; and as in adulterie, the luxurie of parents is wicked, and yet the children begotten are Gods creatures¹⁰: So in wicked deeds the action is sinfull, and yet the passion or thing produced by it, as it is receiued in another, may be good. Adam Sasbot. com. Esa. 10. 14.

¹ Degrat. & lib. arb. c. 21. super Exod. q. 18. Vnde cuiusque cordis in malitia qualitas est. quale cor habeat ad malum, suo seruitio, quod inoleuit ex arbitrio voluntatis: tamen ut qualitate mala huc vel illic mouetur, causis fit quibus animus propellitur quae causa ut existant vel non existant, non est in hominis potestate, sed veniunt ex occulta providentia.

² Cent. Julian. l. 5. c. 3. De praelat. Sanct. c. 20. d. corrept. & gram. ca. 7. illum (judam) elegit ad effundendum sanguinem suum.

³ Hugo de Sacram. l. 1. p. 5. c. 29. Deum ad iudicia sua iusta complenda, malas voluntates hominum, quibus ipse vult modis & occasionibus, siue intus, siue foris, & exercitare ad volendum.

dum & dirigere ad perficiendum, & ordinare ad subsistendum. * Gloss. ordinar. Rom. 1. tradidit eos Deus. Et citatur a Thom. 1. 2. q. 79. ar. 1. P. Azor. inst. mor. p. 1. l. c. 21. In peccatis quae per operam committuntur, cum voluntate humana Deus etiam operatur id quod fit. 9 Vega pro concil. l. 1. c. 15. pag. 28. 29. Orig. M. li. 14. ca. 35. moral. Vna causa cum Deo etiam per eos agitur. — Hoc agunt exteriori, quod Deus agit disposuit, &c. li. 16. ca. 26. per Reprobos in iustitiam, culpas percutit electorum. Aug. tr. 7. in Ep. Ioh. Ecce Christum tradidit patri, & tradidit Iudas. Nunquid non quasi simile factum videtur? Traditor Iudas, ergo traditor est Deus pater? absit, &c. facta est traditio a patre, facta est traditio a filio, facta est traditio a Iuda. Vna res facta est, &c. Hugo Victor. d. factam. li. 1. part. 4. c. 15. Mali sunt non efficiendo contrarium ipsius voluntati, sed amando contrarium ipsius dilectioni; & sic quidem voluntas Dei semper impletur, & non excusantur mali, propterea quod in ipsis, & per eos voluntas Dei impletur. * Loc. lib. c. 2. f. Beza in Act. col. Mompelg. Deum esse voluntatis, etiam malorum in matricem causam, & non quatenus illi mala est: siue ut in schol. loquuntur, secundum rationem entis, et non secundum illius desectum. De qua re vult Tho. 1. q. 49. ar. 2. ad. 2. Beza: Non vult Absoloni inestum ut inestum. Peccata a voluntate Dei procedere quatenus peccata, si diceremus, Esteremus, eos omnibus supplicijs dignissimos. Molina. concur. grae. & lib. arb. d. 31. Plerique antiquorum, &c. Adio quatenus est a libero arbitrio, est vitiosa: quatenus est a Deo tanquam a prima causa & origine totius esse creati, neque vitiosa est, neque pecc. quoniam a solo Deo habet esse, ac proinde bonitatem transcendenti, defectum vero a regula. * Greg. M. li. 6. mor. ca. 15. Hoc in usum suae voluntatis redigit, per quod sibi voluntas humana cont. ad. cit. ca. 14. Mira modo sit, ut quod sine voluntate Dei agitur, voluntati Dei contrarium non sit. Quia dum in malum usum mala facta vertuntur, eius consilio militat, etiam quae eius consilio repugnant. — Sic opera eius magna sunt, ut per omne quod ab hominibus agitur, eius voluntas exquiratur. Vitari vis, superari consilij nequaquam potest. Aug. enchir. ca. 91. I. eius quasdam voluntates suas bonas, implet per malorum hominum voluntates malas. Beza annot. Act. 4. v. 28. Referendum est verbum *weisauy*, non ad consilia & voluntates Herodis & Pilati, sed ad ipsorum consiliorum euentum. August. tom. 3. de agon. Christi, c. 7. Malus homo & malus Angelus, diuinae providentiae militat: sed nesciunt quid boni de illis operetur Deus: non ergo pro meritis malitiae stipendiantur. * De nupt. de concupisc. l. 2. c. 20. De Ciuit. Dei, l. 12. c. 24. Cont. Faust. Manich. l. 22. c. 83. Ex adulterorum concubitu, formatur & nascitur homo, de hominum opere male, bonum opus Dei.

Paragr. 2. Saint Augustine concerning reprobation.

T. W. Our Minister, to prone his blasphemous doctrine of reprobation or damnation, doth shrowd himselfe under an abused testimonie of Saint Augustine*, whom he thus citeth; It is a manifest truth, that many cannot bee saued, not because themselves will not, but because God will not (which without all obscuritie, is manifested in Infants) These latter words Master White hath fraudulently omitted.

Ans.

* Aug. tom. 2. ep. 107. ad Vital.

Ans. 1. Where you charge Doctor White with blasphemous doctrine, touching reprobation, it seemes you much regard not what you say, Psal. 12. 4. Master White holdeth no other doctrine, touching reprobation, than your owne Thomas, Bonaventure, Caietan, Capreolus, Ferrariensis, Soto, Bannes, Iansenius, and the learned part of Aquinas his Schollers, haue alwaies taught ^a, and which is lately propugned against Molina and Suarez, by Shumel, Rispoli, Martines, and other Papiſts ^b, and which the Church of Rome it selfe neuer condemned as erroneous.

2. Saint Augustines testimonie, Epist. 107. affirmeth verbally, that many people cannot bee saued, not because they will not, but because God will not haue them saued: And he meaneth elder persons as well as Infants; as appeareth by that which he presently deliuereth in the same Epistle, touching perseuerance in grace ^{*}, (which is peculiar to elder persons onely:) 2. In another place ^c, handling the same Argument, he nameth elder persons, saying; *Of two infants, being alike corrupted with originall sinne, why one is chosen and another forsaken, and of two elder persons, why one is effectually called, and the other not, must be referred to the unsearchable iudgement of God.*

Benius a learned Papiſt affirmeth ^d; *That it is the constant Doctrine of Saint Augustine, that sufficient grace is not giuen to all men by God: And the same Author saith; That this was the doctrine of many great Schoolemen, both before and since the Trident Councell^e. Grègorie Ariminense ^f holdeth thus, and Vasques, Bannes, Estius, Driedo, Adam Sasboth, Ruard Tapper, &c. ^g acknowledge the same, touching Saint Augustine: And Saint Augustine himselfe expounderth the place of Paul, 1 Tim. 2. God will haue all men to be saued, &c. of the elect ^h; and expressly teacheth, *That if men in a secret iudgement bee not secured from the masse of perdition, by the grace of predestination, neither words nor deeds, whereby they may bee enabled to beleue, are applied vnto themⁱ.* From whence it followeth, that the doctrine which this Romane Diar calleth blasphemous, is Saint Augustines, and according to this great Father, many men cannot bee saued, not onely because they will not, but also because God will not. And the naming of Infants by Saint Augustine, Epist. 107. is not to reſtraine the speech onely to them; but by the example of infants, to make his assertion more euident: for if infants which are sinners in a lesse degree than elder persons, are yet many times by a secret iudgement of God, excluded from Baptisme the meanes of their saluation; then may God more iuſtly deprive elder persons, being guiltie of greater sinnes, of sufficient grace.*

^a Thom. Aq. 1. q. 23. Bonau. 1. d. 41. 4. 3. Caietan. ib. Bannes ib. Chumel ib. Estius com. Ro. 9. ar. 1. sent. d. 41. Iansen. com. sup. ca. 41. ecclesiast. v. 11. Ferrar. contra gent. 1. 3. c. 161. Rispoli de præd. nit. 1. 1. q. 1. c. 3. ^b Perennis com. Rom. 9. d. 5. ^{*} Aug. Ep. 107. ^c Aug. de bono perſeu. c. 8. & de prædest. sanct. c. 6. Prosp. ad excerpt. genent. d. 3. Greg. in euang. hom. 30. Bellar. de grat. & lib. arb. l. 1. c. 3. Si curuerunt est non omnes saluos fieri, quia in si non voluit sic etiam verum est, non omnes saluos fieri, quia Deus non vult voluntate beneplaciti. ^d Benius de eff. grat. c. 16. Constant. semper censuit, non omnibus offerri gratiam. ^e Id. ca. 4. ^f Greg. Arim. 1. d. 46. ^g Vasq. 1. d. 97. c. 6. Necessè est fieri Augustinum eius fuisse sententia. Et ib. n. 14. Augustinus, Prosper, & Fulgentius, illius fuisse sententia. Driedo d. Red. tract. 4. ea. 2. m. 2. part. 8. pa. 113. col. 2. 117. concl. 2. Adam Sasb. com. 1. Tim. 3. 4. Ruard. artic. 7. ^h Aug. de corrept. & grat. c. 14. Ita dictum sit, omnes homines vult saluos esse, vt intelligantur omnes prædestinati. Benius de eff. grat. c. 16. Enixe semper atque constanter ad solos electos referri voluit. Fulgent. d. incarnat. & gra. ca. 11. pa. 748. ⁱ Aug. d. pecc. mer. & Remiss. li. 2. c. 5. & d. Prædest. sanct. ca. 8. & li. 1. ad Simplician. q. 3. & d. spir. & lit. ca. 34. — Et d. Ciuit. Dei li. 15. ca. 6. Aug. de bono perſeu. c. 14. Isidor. de sum. bon. sue sent. l. 2. c. 15. Nonnulli ita despicuntur à Deo, vt deplorare mala sua non possint. Aug. de fid. ad Petr. c. 35. cited by Ephrem, com. 3 Tim. pag. 59. Non magis iræ vasa quæ Deus non prædest. nauit ad vitam, vlla ratione saluari possunt quam misericordie vasa perire. Stapl. Antid. Apost. Rom. 9. v. 11. &c. Ad hanc adoptionem filiorum Dei, ad hanc primam salutem, quæ in baptismo credentibus confertur, quod attinet, cur hodie & per omnes ætates aliquæ gentes vocantur, & aliquæ non, aut olim tam pauci Iudæi, tam multi Gentiles vocabantur, si quis velit eorum operibus causam discriminis tribuere, propositum Dei secur. dum electionem, id est, gratuitam & fixam Dei electionem subuerteret. Dried. d. Red. gen. hum. c. 2. tr. 4. m. 3. p. 8. paruulis quibusdam, non datur fidei sacramentum, & adultis quibusdam forsitan absque propria culpa negligentiæ, non datur vt audiant salutis euangelium. Bel. d. grat. & li. arb. li. 2. ca. 8. Credimus Deum absoluta voluntate, alios non velle saluare, tum paruulos, tum adultos. Ruard. Tapper. art. 7. pa. 222. Alia tamen opinio, magis consentanea est Augustino, & patrum Concilijs, quod non omnibus Deus concedit tale auxilium: sed sicut mera voluntate prædestinat aliquos ad salutem, quibus ex sola bonitate sua, disponit dare bona gratuita necessaria ad salutem, ita mera voluntate, non propter præuiam aliquam rationem ex parte Reprobatorum, aliquos reprobant à gloria. Non est ergo paratus, quantum ex se est, dare illis gloriam, nec finalem gratiam, & pari ratione, nec auxilium gratuitum, ad tenendam, & recuperandam huiusmodi gratiam. — Sæpe dicit Augustinus, & præcipue in Epistola ad Vitalem, & d. prædest. sanct. c. 8. enchir. 103. quod quibusdam Deus nolit dare gratiam.



CHAP. IX. Paragraph I.

Epiphanius, concerning the Adoration of the Virgin Marie.

T. W.

WHereas according to Catholike doctrine, different degrees of honour are to bee exhibited to God, and his blessed Angels and Saints; as to the first, adoration, and to the other in a farre lower degree: not onely damned spirits, but damnable Heretikes their painefull Schollers, as envious emulators of glorious Saints, doe euer labour by many subtilties, to rob them quite of all deserved veneration, in which kinde Master White willing to act his part, euen against the blessed Virgin, the mother of God, alleageth Epiphanius, saying; The Virgin Marie, was a Virgin, and honourable, but not giuen for vs to worship, but her selfe worshipped him who tooke flesh of her.

Epiphanius. l. 3. heres. 79.

But for the revealing of this illusion, it is to be observed, that Epiphanius writeth against certaine women who adored a chariot, and did offer up bread in the name of Marie: which was unlawfull in two respects; 1. Because it is not permitted to women to sacrifice^b. 2. Because this manner of adoration by sacrifice, is proper onely to God, and there belongeth no more but honour and worship to the blessed Virgin and Saints.

^b Why doe your women baptize? Epiphanius. l. 1. c. 42.

Ans. 1. The declamation of this Popish Priest beginning with damned spirits, and damnable heretikes, is like himselfe: for Master White and all the Protestants acknowledge, that due honour and veneration is to be exhibited to all the Saints of God, both liuing and defunct. We say with Epiphanius^c; Let Marie haue honour, and let the Lord our God be adored. But the Papists, In stead of honour exhibite error (as the same Father speaketh) to the blessed Saints; and their manner of worship according to him, is heresie and doctage.

^c Epiph. her. 79. i. Maria et virgo, et uxor, et mater, et uxor, et mater, pag. 450. *Εἰς τὴν ἁγίαν ἑστῶσαν*

2. Whereas you say, that damned spirits are emulators of this adoration, which you exhibite to glorious Saints: the truth is, that your superstition^d of adoring Saints is the doctrine of Devils, for the principall foundation thereof was feigned miracles, and apparitions^e of Devils, in the likenesse of Saints. Delrius^f the Iesuite saith; The Deuill appeared to one in the likenesse of S. Ursula, &c. and to one Secondello, a Deacon, the Deuill appeared in the shape of our Lord, saying; I am Christ. Antonine^g; The Deuill did usually appeare to a certaine deuout Frier of Paris, in the likenesse of the Virgin Marie, and revealed many things vnto him.

^d Gert. p. 1. fer. de cen. Doim. de vita clericor. Sanctis reuerentes esse videntur, colentes eorum sepulchra, memorias atq; reliquias: tamen nequaquam eos imitantur in sanctitate, immo vixtentibus imitantur & insidiantur, qui sanctorum vitam acque mores quæstionibus imitant. Math. 23. 29.

3. Although Epiphanius reprove in particular the fact of the Colliridians, yer in confuting their error, he vttereth diuers speeches, and vseth arguments,

^e Thyreus Iesuit. de appar. spir. append. 1. ad l. 1. Sumpserunt quidem illæ ex apparitionibus initium. ^f Delrio inquit. mag. l. 4. c. 1. q. 3. §. 5. pag. 146. ^g Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 10. §. 1. in fine. Vide Isidor. etymol. l. 8. c. 9. citatur à Gratian. conf. 26. q. 5. c. Nec mirum. Aug. de cura pro mort. c. 10.

M

whereby

^b Epiphani. heret. 78. in fine, & 79. ^c *ἐν τῇ ἀλυσὶ τοῦ σκου-*
πώτος, ὅτι ἰουδαίος,
ἀλλ' ἐπὶ τῇ ἀλυσὶ,
ἐπὶ τῇ τῇ ἀλυσὶ
σκουπώτου, pag.
448. ^d *ἐν ἀλυσὶ*
σκουπώτου, ὅτι
δοξα, πῶς μὴ
δοξῇ τῇ ἀλυσὶ
τῇ ἰουδαίᾳ, &c.
^e *Τὸ Μαρίδον μὴ*
δοξῇ σκουπώτου,
ὡς ἡμεῖς γινώσκοντες,
ἀλλ' ὅτι αἰσθεῖται. ^f *Εἰ*
ἡ ἀλυσὶς ἡ Μαρία,
ὡς ἀλυσὶς, ὡς τῇ
μῆτρὶ, ἀλλ' ὡς εἰς
τὴν σκουπώτου.
^g Baron. tom. 4.
ann. 373. n. 30.
^h Bellarm. de San.
beat. l. 1. c. 15.
ⁱ Malmesbur. de
gest. Angl. l. 3. c.
10. Dunstan. iurat.
Per Deum & ma-
trem eius ignavus
homo erit.
^k Turf. Laur. hist.

^l 1. c. 2. Ante Deipare effigiem, ara solido è saxo quadrato, &c. Turf. Laur. lib. 1. c. 17. Quotidie adoraturus Deum cum matre eius, &c. Ib. lib. 2. cap. 16. diploma Leon. 10. Nullum promptius miseris aur efficacius peccatoribus refugium inueniatur, merito totius animi mentisque affectibus recolentes, illam in caelis primum adorandam, deinde in terris ubique venerandam, &c. pag. 129. ^m *Αὐτὴ ἡ*
κοιμῆσις ποικίλη, τὴν ἑαυτῆς οὐκ οἶσιν γινώσκει; μὴ τὴν ἐκ τῆς ἁγίας ἁγίας τῆς τῆς ἀλυσὶς τῆς ἀλυσὶς, &c. pag. 447. ⁿ Suar. in 3. Thom.
som. 1. d. 52. c. 3. Adoratio Sanctus exhibita est quodammodo diuina. Turf. Laur. pref. in hist. Lauretan. Ad huius (Mariæ) arbitrium,
&c. terras, maria, cælum, naturamque moderatur: hac annuente & per hanc, diuinos thesauros mortalibus & cælestia dona largitur.
Vt omnes intelligant, quicquid ab æterno illo, augustoque bonorum fonte, in terras profusur, fluere per Mariam.

whereby he condemneth in generall all religious adoration of the Virgin Marie. His words are^b; *Neither Elias, nor Iohn Baptist, nor Teclah, nor any Saint is adored, &c.* And, *If God will not haue Angels adored, how much more not her which was begotten of Anna and Ioiakim?* Again, *Let none adore Marie, either man or woman.* And, *What Scripture hath said any thing of this? and which of the Prophets euer commanded a man to be adored, much lesse a woman?* And, *Although shee is glorious, holy, and honourable, yet is shee not appointed to be adored.*

But here our Aduersarie treading in the steps of Baroniusⁱ and Bellarmine^k, endeouours to elude these testimonies, saying, That Epiphanius condemneth onely the exhibiting of diuine honour to the holy Virgin.

Ans. Some part of that worship which Papiests giue to the Virgin Marie, to wit, Inuocation, Rom. 10. 14. Vowes, Psal. 50. 14. Oaths^l, Deut. 6. 13. are the actions of diuine adoration. And Turf. Laur. commendeth Paul an Hermite, and saith he adored God and his mother.

2. Epiphanius in the place alleaged by Doctor White, saith; *The Lord in the Gospell speaketh to the Virgin his mother, What haue I to doe with thee woman? In which speech, to the end that none should thinke her ouer excellent, he calleth her woman, prophesying as it were aforehand, of the heresies which should arise, and premonishing that none in admiration of her sanctitie, should fall into this doating heresie of adoration^m.*

An obseruation, concerning adoration of Images.

There is nothing so wicked and absurd, but a Romist can defend it: neither is any thing so true, but he can outface it; witnesse, among other things, *the adoration of Images.* The same is an impietie so apparently condemned in the Scripture, that neither blasphemie it selfe, witchcraft, adulterie, or any sinne, is more plainly detected and prohibited.

And the primitive Church consenteth exactly with the holy Scripture; and for many ages did in generall proclaim the same to be Idolatry. Neuertheless, our Aduersaries calling darknesse light, and sowre sweet, Esa. 5. 20. defend it, pretending that they propugne a Catholike veritie. The summe of their Tenet is this which followeth.

1. They maintaine the making, setting vp, and vsing of Images in Religionⁿ. And among the rest, the making of the Images of God himselfe, and the Trinitie^o.

2. They teach a threefold vse of them: 1. Of *ornament*, or beautifying their Temples and Religion. 2. Of *instruction*^p, wherein they affirme, that pictures many times instruct better than Scripture. 3. Of *adoration*, making them instruments of worshipping God and the Saints. And concerning adoration, they maintaine, that Images are to be adored with the same adoration, with the sampler^q, appointing onely a respectiue difference, to wit, that the principall is worshipped simply and for it selfe; but the Image in regard of the

^a Concil. Trid. sess. 25.
^b Tho. Aqu. 3. q. 25. ar. 3. ad. 1.
^c Suar. 3. Tho. to. 1. d. 54. §. 2. Durant. de ritib. eccl. cath. l. 1. c. 5. Thyreus de appar. spir. append. 1. c. 1. Possuin. bibl. l. 18. c. 16.
^d Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 10.
^e Naclant. com. Rom. c. 1. digress. de imag. pag. 42.
^f Non solum latendum est, fideles adorare coram imagine, vt nonnulli ad cautelam forte loquuntur, sed & adorare imaginem sine quo volueris scrupulo: Quin & eo illam venerantur cultu, quo & prototypum eius. Propter quod, si illud habet adorari latia, & illa, latia: si illud dulia & hyperdulia, & illa pariter eiusmodi cultu adoranda est. Illas sum. ecclef. par. 3. c. 3. pag. 265. Tenemur ex hoc præcepto, viuifice crucis vexillum adorare, &c. At non solum crucis vera lignum ipsum, sed & imaginem crucis cuiusque materie, vel picture adorare debemus, &c. Tho. Aqu. 3. q. 25. ar. 3. ad. 2. & 3. sent. d. 9. q. 2. Bonauent. 3. d. 9. ar. 1. q. 2. Richard. 3. d. 9. ar. 2. q. 2. Albert. 3. d. 9. ar. 4. Paludan. 3. d. 9. q. 1. Almain. 3. d. 9. q. 1. concl. 5. Marfil 3. q. 8. ar. 2. d. 2. c. 3. Maior. 3. d. 9. q. 1. Capitol. 3. d. 9. q. 1. ar. 1. c. 2, 3. Caietan. 3. q. 25. ar. 3.

similiuade

similitude and reference to the principall. And thus the Images of God, and Christ, and the Crucifix, are by their doctrine to be adored with diuine worship properly called^r: like as Christ his manhood being personally vnited to the Deity, partakes the same adoration with the Godhead^r. And other Images of the Virgin Marie, and the Saints, are respectiue to be adored with worship suitable to their samplers.

3. They make the adoration of Images, a meritorious worke^r; and condemn the deniers thereof as Heretikes, and hauing power, they cruelly torment and burne them to death^u.

4. The principall Arguments whereby they propugne this adoration, are these which follow.

Argu. 1. The Tradition and custome of the Church, and the authoritie of the second Nicene Councell, &c.

Ans. 1. Perefus Aiala^r, a great learned Papist and Bishop, citing many Doctors and Schoolemen, affirmeth; *That the doctrine of adoration of Images, hath neither Scripture, Tradition of the Church, common consent of the Fathers, nor yet effectual reason to confirme it.* 2. The second Nicene Councell was very latey, about the yeere 787. and it was controlled by another Councell in the West^r: neither did it maintaine adoration of Images, in such manner, as Suarez, Thyreus, Possuin, and the Iesuites doe, but onely *ueneration*, or yielding outward reuerence in passing by them, or standing before them^a, &c.

Arg. 2. The Iewes in the Old Testament, adored the Arke of the Couenant, whereunto were annexed the Images of the Cherubins^b. Psalm. 99. vers. 5. the old translation hath, *Worship the footstool of his feet* (which was the Arke.)

Ans. If the place of the Psalm be rightly translated, it is, *Worship at his footstool, or before his footstool*^c, that is, worship God, looking towards the place where the Arke of the Couenant resteth, and in the Tabernacle or Temple where the Arke is placed, bow downe before it^d. And the Cherubins were not appointed to be adored, as Tertullian^e, and after him Lorinus^f the Iesuite, affirme: and how could they which neuer saw the Cherubins, Heb. 9. 7. worship them in the same manner the Papists doe their Images?

Argu. 3. It was lawfull in the Old Testament to worship the brazen Serpent^g and the Cherubins; therefore it is as lawfull to adore and worship the Images of Christ and the Saints.

Ans. Although ueneration, which is a reuerent vsing of sacred things, be due to such signes as God himselfe hath appointed; yet that measure, and such actions of reuerence as Papists^{*} exhibite to Images, are vnlawfull to be exhibited to the signes instituted by God himselfe, as appeareth by the example of the brazen Serpent^h, 2 King. 18. 4. and the water of Baptismeⁱ.

3. As it doth not follow, that because we are to honour the Kings Lieutenant, hauing receiued authoritie from the King; therefore we must exhibite the like honour to another, whom the subiects haue exalted to that dignitie of their owne head: So although God had appointed the adoration of sacred signes ordained by himselfe; it followeth not, that Images which are erected besides his ordinance, are capable of ueneration^k.

Arg. 4. Because God hath wrought sundry miracles by Images, therefore they ought to be adored^l.

Ans. Both the Antecedent and Consequent are false. 1. The miracles which our Aduersaries affirme, to haue beene wrought by Images, recorded in

Iansen. ib. Ioh. Campen. ib. * Tertul. contra Marcion. l. 2. c. 32. f Lorin. com. Act. 17. v. 25. Constat adorationem ab Hebreis non esse ipsi exhibitam. g Bellarm. de imag. l. 2. c. 12. * Suar. l. d. 54. §. 4. Fieri recte posse ut prototypum in imagine, & imago cum prototypo vno actu adoretur: atque hoc modo posse imaginem Christi adorari latia. h Tertul. de idol. c. 5. i Peref. de trad. p. 3. de im. p. 162. k Altissid. sum. l. 1. c. 15. Non in qualibet signo adorandus est Deus, sed in proprio, sicut Moyse adorauit Deum in rubo in quo loquebatur ei, &c. & Abraham in Angelo: unde non est adorandus in lapide, esset enim idololatria, de non proprio signo Dei, facere proprium. l Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 12. Suar. p. 1. d. 54. §. 3. Deus variis miraculis per imagines factis, hunc cultum sibi placitum esse testatur est.

r Suar. 3. Tho. to. 1. d. 54. §. 3. Dicendum est hanc imaginum adorationem non esse absolutam sed respectuam, quam per eam non abusu tantum, sed proprie imagines adorentur. f Suar. ibid. §. 4. & d. 50. §. 2. Sicut humanitas Christi coadoratur Verbo. Thyr. de appar. spir. append. 1. c. 2. n. 10. Azor. p. 1. instit. mor. l. 9. c. 6. Tac. Graph. decif. aur. p. 1. l. 2. c. 2. n. 15.

t Andrad. orth. expl. l. 9. p. 234. u Sixt. Senenbibi. l. 5. an. 247. Balthasar Hincmarus qui Vicomte exultus. Suar. tom. 1. d. 56. §. 2. Egidius Hispanus negauit crucem esse adorandam, qui propter hunc & alios errores Hispani damnatus est. a Peref. de trad. p. 3. de imag. Neque Scripturam, neque traditionem ecclesiasticam, neque communem sensum Sanctorum, neque Concilii generalis determinationem aliquam, nec etiam rationem, qua hec efficaciter suaderi possit, adducunt. y Bellar. de scriptor. in chronol. z Genebrard. chronol. ann. 794. ubi citeth Ado and Regino. Aimon de gest. Franc. l. 4. §. 5. Hincmar. Rhem. cont. Hincmar. Landan. c. 20. Abbas Viperger. chron. ann. 793. a Reade. B. Biffon of subiect. part. 4. pag. 550. b Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 12. Imagines Cherubin super arcam existences, necessario adorabantur ab iis qui arcam adorabant. Suar. to. 1. d. 54. §. 3. c ממונה מן המלאכים d Genebr. com. Pfal. 98. v. 5.

^a Canus loc. l. 11. c. 4. & 6. Vt iam pudendū fortassis sit, historicos quosdam gentium fuisse veraciores quam nostros.

^b Gabr. Biel. can. dist. l. 49. Aliquando miracula sunt, &c. non virtute imaginum, sed operatione demonum.

^c Lyra super Daniel c. 14.

^d De dogm. eccles. l. 2. c. 3. Aug. in Psal. 135. Vbi impletum est quod significabatur miraculum ablatum est.

^e Antonia. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 27. c. 6. §. 3. Dourol. Iesuit. flores exemplar. cap. 7. tit. 29. §. 6. Vbi coram imagine crucifixi, terris genua flexit, visus est a quo iam sancto viro ad singulas genu flexiones, nobilis illius, Crucifixus caput suum humiliter inclinare.

^f Antonin. lib. 7. §. 11.

^g Malinesb. de gest. Reg. Angl. l. 2. c. 9. Alii literæ docent, Dominicam imaginem expresse loquantur clericos, eorumque fautores confutisse. Polydor. hist. Angl. l. 6. p. 121. Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 13. Diaboli opera interdum idola movebantur. Driedo de eccl. dogm. l. 4. c. 1. Synod. Frankford. Resp. ad arg. 44. Niceni Concilii. Math. Paris. in Henr. 2. p. 115. Die quadam dum vir domini Godricus, in oratorio sedens, Pfalterium ruminaret, vidit ex ore imaginis crucifixi puerulum exire, qui ad imaginem S. Virginis, quæ in parte aquilonis stabat, in eadem trabe descendit, & gremio ipsius insedit. Illa verò manus contra venientem extendens, amplexum fore per tres horas confosuit. Puer quoque quamdiu sedebat in gremio matris, ut viuens in corpore se movebat, & ad eius aduentum pariter & discessum vociferabatur virginis imago ita contremuit, ut in trabe ruinâ minari videretur. Putabat autem amicus Dei Godericus imaginis membra vocali spiritu compleri, & puerum non alium esse quam Iesum Nazarenum: deinde puer eodem modo quo venerat, in os rediit crucifixi.

their Legends, are of no certaine credit by the testimonie of their owne Doctors. Canus ^a denieth the authoritie of the Stories, in which they be reported. Gabriel Biel ^b affirmeth; *That such miracles were many times wrought by the power of the Demill.* Cardinall Lyra ^c saith, *That the people were shamefully deceiued with feigned miracles, wrought by the Priests and their companions for lucre sake.* Driedo ^d; *God (in our daies) doth not declare, that he speaketh, by bearing witnesse with signes and wonders.* Antonine ^e reporteth, that the Crucifix spake to Frier Peter, saying, *O Peter, what wrong haue I done thee? And at another time; O Peter, I haue prayed for thee that thy faith shall not faile.* And Thomas of Aquine, praying deuoutly before the Crucifix, was lifted up a cubit above the ground, and a voice proceeded from the Crucifix, saying, *O Thomas, thou hast written worthily concerning me.* And William Malmsburie ^f reporteth, how the Crucifix at Winchester uttered a speech in fauour of Saint Dunstane, which confounded the Priests. But Polydore speaking of the credit of this miracle, saith ^g; *It was thought by many, that this was rather an Oracle of Apollo than of God, and proceeded from the fraud of men, and not from diuine power.* And as Saran wrought miracles among the Heathen ^h by Images: So he was effectually among the Papiests by lying wonders, 2 Theff. 2. 9.

2. The consequent of the Argument is false; as the Synod of Frankford ^g, in the solution of the Arguments of the second Nicene Councell, answereth: for although God wrought a miracle by the waters of Iordan, in healing Naaman, 2 King. 5. 14. and by the bones of Elizeus; and by the clay and spittle, Ioh. 9. yet the said creatures were not thereby made capable of adoration: euen so admit it were true, that God had wrought miracles by Images, yet from thence it followeth not, that the same ought to be adored.

Secl. 2. Wherein are deliuered some of the Protestants arguments, against worship of Images.

Arg. 1. The Lord hath expressly forbidden the adoration of Images, in the Law ^a, and the Prophets ^b, and in the New Testament ^c.

Obiect. The Papiests except against this argument; that God in the places alleaged, condemneth the Idols of the Heathen, which were Images of false gods ^d; but he condemneth not the Images of the true God, in such apparitions as he made in the Scripture, nor the Images of Christ and the Saints.

Ans. The Lord condemneth in generall all Images and Idols deuised by man, for worship and adoration, Exod. 20. 5. Leuit. 26. 18. And the Israelites erecting Images, in resemblance of the true God ^e are condemned, Exod. 32. 5. 1 King. 12. 28. with chap. 16. 32. and 2 King. 17. 28. Also the adoration of the brazen Serpent ^f, an image of Christ, Ioh. 3. 14. and framed by diuine precept, Num. 21. 9. yet because it was adored, is destroyed, 2 King. 18. 4. And the Lord forbidding adoration of Images, maketh such a description of them, as agrees not onely to the Idols of the Heathen, but to the Images of Christians; to wit, That they be the workmanship of a mans owne hands ^g, haue eyes and see not, eares and heare not, &c. Esa. 44. 13. Ps. 115. 4. Ps. 135. 15. 1 Cor. 12. 2.

^a Exod. 20. 5.
^b Deut. 5. 8. Leu. 26.
^c 1. Exod. 32. Num.
23. 21. & 25. 3.
Deut. 4. 15.
^d Psal. 115. 4. &
135. 15. Esa. 40. 17.
& 44. 8. & 44. 11.
& 46. 5. Hab. 2. 13.
^e Act. 15. 18. &
27. 29. Rom. 1. 23.
35. 1 Cor. 10. 14.
3 Cor. 6. 16. Gal. 4.
3. & 5. 30. 1 Theff.
2. 9. Act. 14. 13.
Apoc. 9. 20. & 19.
26. 1 Ioh. 5. 21.
^f Bellar. de imag.
l. 2. c. 13. Suarez.
Greg. Val. & alii.
Ioh. Arber. Theo.
soph. lib. 1. cap. 37.
Vetari fieri imagi-
nes, & adorari

propter se, & summe, & more gentiliū, &c. Abulens. in Exod. 32. 9. 7. Lorin. com. A. 2. 19. 35. Serpentem æreum confectum iussu Deus, &c. non ita ut adorari vellet, quod cum deinceps populus faceret, aliquo modo incensum adolendo, Deus confregit. Tertul. de idol. c. 5. Chrys. in Gen. hom. 57. Qui vocem habetis & aures, & rationis estis participes, ad ea quæ nullum habent sensum tanquam bruta abducimini. Aug. in Psal. 115. c. 2. Plus valent ad curuandam infelicem animam, quia os habent, oculus habent, aures habent, nares habent, manus habent, pedes habent, &c.

Also the continuall practise of the Jewes, doth shew what was the meaning of Gods law, for by vertue of the former precepts they refused all Images^b, and admitted no Statues or Images, either of God himselfe, or the Angels, or of Abraham, Moses, Elias, &c.

Arg. 2. The primitive Church for many ages, condemned adoration of Images, yea all religious vse of them. Some of them sayⁱ; *There can be no religion where Images are in vse.* Augustine^k condemneth worshipping or praying, looking vpon an Image^l. Ambrose saith; *God will not be worshipped by stones*^m. And Augustineⁿ; *Art thou not ashamed to worship that which a Carpenter hath made?* Clement of Alexandria^o; *Christians are forbidden to exercise the deceitfull Art (of painting or caruing images,) for the Prophet hath said, Thou shalt make vnto thy selfe no likenesse.* And Hierom^p; *The worshippers of God may not adore Images.* And Augustine^q; *They iustly erre, which seeke Christ and his Apostles, not in sacred booke, but on painted walls.* And he condemneth the worshippers of pictures^r. And Irenæus^s, Epiphanius^t, and Augustine^u, condemn the Heretikes which worshipped the Images of Iesus and Paul. And some of our Aduersaries heretofore, and some Iesuites^v at this day confesse, that the primitive Fathers abandoned Images.

Bellarmino^y and Suarez^z pretend, that Heretikes were condemned by the Fathers, not simply for hauing and vsing Images, but because they did the same in an vnlawfull manner, and after the fashion of the Gentiles.

Ans. All imagerie in diuine worship is heathenish^a, 1 Cor. 12.2. Neither can our Aduersaries out of the holy Scripture or Fathers, shew vs any rule for the lawfull worshipping of Images, more than for lawfull adulterie, or lawfull cutting of a mans throat in priuare malice.

Arg. 3. Many famous Papists in all ages, haue condemned the worshipping of Images, which proueth, that this custome is not Catholike.

Holcot saith^a; *No adoration is due to any Image, neither is it lawfull for any man to worship an Image.* And Durand^b; *Forasmuch as neither men nor Angels ought to be adored, let them consider what they doe, who vnder pretext of religion and pietie, doe adore diuers Images: for it is not lawfull to worship any thing made with hands.*

In a prouinciall Synod holden at Mentz^c, it was thus decreed; *Images are not set up that men should adore and worship them, but that they may be put in remembrance by them of things profitable.* And the same is the iudgement of many famous Papists^d; yea, our greatest Iesuites^e are diuided concerning the manner of the adoration of Images.

Argu. 4. No Image made by a Carpenter or Founder, doth so truly resemble God or the Trinitie, as man doth which is indued with grace, Eph. 4.24. Gen. 1.26. But religious adoration is not due to such, no not to the Apostles, Act. 10.26. nor to Angels, Apoc. 19.10. If therefore we may not worship those Images of God with religious adoration which the Lord himselfe hath framed, is it not absurd to worship them which a Caruer makes? And verily an Alse deserueth more iustly to be worshipped than an Image, because an Image is a dead blocke or earth^f, the other a liuing creature: And accordingly Clemens Alexandrinus saith^g; *Images are more vile than any lining creature: and all Images being earth, I haue learned to tread vpon them, and not to adore them.*

Petri & Christi, in tabulis coloribus depictas afferuari vidimus, quod veteres ex gentili consuetudine, eos quos seruatores putabant ad hunc modum adorare soliti fuerunt. ^a Holcot. com. in Sapient. l. 3. c. 154. ^b Durand. Ration. 4. par. Can. Rubr. 9. ^c Synod. prouinc. Mogunt. sub Archiep. Sebastian. c. 41. ^d Anichirid. Colon. expol. decal. Gerf. p. 2. comp. theol. de 10. precept. expol. 1. ad adorandum & colendum prohibentur. ^e Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 10. Suar. to. 1. d. 54. §. 3. & 4. ^f Aug. in Psal. 113. c. 2. Si pudeat adorare bestiam quam Deus fecit videntem, audientem, &c. quam pudendum est adorare mutum & carens vita, sensuque simulachrum? ^g 3. ad Th. 1. c. 2. p. 17.

Paragr. 2. Whether Gregorie be corrupted about worshipping of Images.

T. W. Master White speaking against Images, hee affirmeth, that the Church of Rome forbade the worship of them; as appeareth by the Epistle of

M 3

Gregorie

^h Tertul. contra Marc. 4. c. 22. & apol. c. 16. Orig. con. Cels. l. 5. 10. set. h. con. Apion. Tacitus annal. l. 5. Valq. 2. de aior. d. 4. ⁱ Lactant. instit. l. 2. c. 19. ^k Aug. in Psal. 113. Quis adorat vel orat intuens simulachrum? ^l Arnob. con. gent. l. 6. offic. Rom. ex decr. Conc. Trid. Felt. in. c. t. sanct. ciuicis. O cruor splendidior cunctis altis. mundo ceteris, &c. talia p. genseim. ceterum. ^m Ambros. l. 5. ep. 31. ⁿ Aug. in Pl. 149. ^o Clem. Al. orat. contra gentes, & Strom. l. 5. ^p Hieron. in 3. c. Daniel. ^q August. de conf. euang. l. 1. c. 10. ^r August. de mor. eccl. cath. c. 34. & in Pl. 113. conc. 2. ^s Iren. l. 1. c. 24. ^t Epiphani. hær. 27. & hær. 80. in anacheph. ^u Aug. hær. 7. ^v Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 24. Qui colebant imaginem Christi diuinis honoribus, inter hereticos numerantur ab Irenæo, &c. atque isti sine dubio, imaginem eius propter ipsum colebant. ^y Renan. annor. Tertul. cont. Valentin. in fine. Imaginem Christi iconicā venerabatur. Caftand. in conf. Nich. Clemang. lib. de nouis feliis. ^z Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 16. ^a Suar. p. 1. d. 54. §. 3. ^b Euseb. hist. l. 7. c. 17. Nec mirum videri debet, eos qui ex gentibus olim à seruatore nostro curati sunt, ista fecisse, quando & apostolorum illius imagines, Pauli &

¹ Greg. mag. l. 7.
ep. 109.

Gregorie to Serenus^h, &c. It is this Ministers euill hap, by most of his citations, to manifest to the world his folly and falshood: for who not distracted, would urge that against his Aduersarie which impugneth himselfe, and that in such a manner, as conuinceth him of fraud and wilfull malice? and then he affirmeth, that Gregorie alloweth the vse of pictures in the Church, which M. White and his fellowes refuse: 2. Hee blameth Serenus for breaking them downe. 3. He alloweth the lawfull veneration of them, and onely condemneth that adoration which is proper to God, as appeareth l. 7. ep. 5. where hee calleth the Crosse venerable.

Answ. Master White his words are these: The primitiue Church at the first admitted no Image at all, neither painted nor graven. Next when they began to be used, yet the Church of Rome forbade the worship of them, as appeareth by Gregorie, &c.

¹ Lorin. com. A2.
17. v. 25.

Here be two assertions; 1. That the Primitiue Church admitted no Images; which is so manifest, that Lorinus a Iesuite¹ confesseth it, and this Aduersarie hath nothing to oppose against it.

² Greg. mag. l. 7.
ep. 109.

2. That the Roman Church disannulled the worship of them. And this also is confirmed by the testimonie of Gregorie a Roman Pope, whose words in an Epistle to Serenus² are; *It lately came vnto my eares, that your brotherhood beholding certaine people worshipping of Images, did breake in peeces those Images, and cast them out of the Church. Surely I commend your zeale, in being carefull that nothing made with hands should be adored, but yet I iudge you should not haue broken them, &c. Therefore your brotherhood may both preserue them, and yet prohibit people from worshipping of them: That so the ignorant may haue something to teach them knowledge of Historie, and yet not offend in the worshipping of pictures.* And that Gregorie forbade the adoration of Images, is acknowledged by Gratian¹, Durand^m, Biel^a, and other learned Papists.

¹ Grat. de consecr.
d. 3. c. per lacum
Gloss.
² Durand Ratio-
nal. l. 1. Rubr. de
picturis.
³ Biel in Can.
Missal. 49.
⁴ Laq. ant. diu. in-
stit. l. 2. c. 2. Orig.
contra Cels. l. 7.
Aug. in Psal. 96.
Exstitit nescio quis
disputator, &c. &
ait, non ego illum
lapidem colo, nec
illud simulachrum
quod est sine sensu.
Adoro quod vi-
deo, & serui ei
quem non video.
Et in Psal. 113. c. 2.
Nec simulachrum
nec demonium
colo, sed per effigi-
em corporalem
eius rei signum in-
tueor quam colere
debeo. Sozom.
h. st. eccles. l. 7. c.
15.

But our Popish Priest saith, that Gregorie by adoration, meaneth such adoration as is proper to God onely.

¹ Greg. m. l. 9. c. 9.
² Lib. 7. ep. 5. Vt
sublata exinde,
cum qua dignum
est veneratione,
imagine atque
cruce.
³ Suar. tom. 1. d.
6. §. 1. Quan-
quam reuera ab
eodem habitu pro-
cedit, quo ipse
Christus colitur.
⁴ Tho. Aqu. 3. q.
25. ar. 3. Nos ado-
ramus adoratione
latriæ imaginem
Chr. st.

Answ. 1. It is absurd to thinke, that the Massilians being Christians, did giue absolute Latria, or diuine worship to Images, considering that many Pagans disclaimed this¹. 2. The Images which were commonly in vse at these times, were not the Images of God or of Christ onely; but of other Martyrs and Saints. And Christians vsed not to adore these with diuine honour, but with an inferiour worship agreeing to the sampler. 3. Gregorie in another Epistle to Serenus², commandeth people to kneele and bow downe to the omnipotent Trinitie onely, and not to Images: whereby it appeares, that hee prohibited such adoration of Images as the Papists at this day maintaine.

But this Popish Priest alleageth a place out of Gregorie³, in prooffe that hee maintained the worshipping of Images; willing that a certaine Image of the mother of Christ, and the venerable Crosse, vnlawfully placed in a Synagogue by a certaine Iew, should be removed from thence, with such veneration or reuerence as was meet.

Answ. 1. If theritle venerable proue religious adoration of Images, according to the Popish doctrine; then it may also proue religious worshipping of a Master of Art, because he is called in the Vniuersitie, *Venerabilis Magister*, and perhaps will proue, that venerable Bede was adored religiously when he liued. 2. Veneration in Gregorie, signifieth onely a reuerent vling of the Image and signe of the Crosse, by reason it was (in his iudgement) a sacred monument. But our Aduersaries make their Images the object of religious worship, such as proceedeth from the vertue of Religion⁴; and they cause the people to kneele, bow, offer Incense, and performe other seruice to them, with the same deuotion as to the sampler¹, if it were present.

But T. W. objecteth, that whereas Gregorie forbade the breaking of Images,
and

and approved the vse of them in Churches for Storie, Master White and the Church of England condemne this.

Ans. 1. Master White produceth elder Fathers, and all the primitive Church condemning the placing of Images in Churches^a; and therefore he is no nouellist in this matter. 2. The Church of England hath dealt no otherwise with Images than the holy Scripture warranteth in the example of the brazen Serpent, 2 King. 18. 4. and Saint Augustine^b and the Canon Law it selfe^c approve of in the like cases. 3. Protestants doe not simply condemne the vse of Images for storie and ornament, being not otherwise offensive.

^a Rade Epiphanius his Epistle translated by S. Hieron in the end of Epiphanius works. Cum vidissem in Eccl. fia Christi contra authoritatem Scripturarum hominis penere imaginem, scidi illam. &c.
^b Aug. de Ciuit. Dei, l. 10. c. 8.

^c Gratian d. 63. c. quia. 7. Theses Geneuenses. 10. Est alius multiplex imaginum vsus licitus, &c. Rex Iacobus apolog. of the oath of all. g. pag. 40. I quarrell not the making of Images, either for publike decoration, or mens private vses, &c.

Paragr. 3. The Councell of Eliberis concerning Images.

T.W. Here now I am come to the last corruption, which I intend to display, the which I haue purposely reserved wherewith to close up the taste of my Reader, so notorious is it for the Authors so dextrous & depraued conuicience.

Ans. Although conceit doe many times puffed vp fooles, as wind doth Bladders, yet I can hardly beleue your hope is according to your words. For all the skilfull Surgeons of your Popish sect, hauing experienced their best remedies, faile in the cure of the blow, which the Canon of the ancient Councell of Eliberis hath giuen their Puppets; and therefore it is scarce credible that a land-leaping Empericke can salue this incurable Vicer. But let vs heare what you say.

Socrates, *τὸν δὲ κατὰ νόμον, τὸν ἀνδρῶν δίκον, τὸν δὲ δίκον δὲ ἀπαιτῶν, τὸν σίμω.*

T.W. Whereas euery one of the former deprauations, &c. resteth in abusing the authoritie of some one particular man, this striketh at a whole Councell, consisting of many scores of Fathers; so happy a progresse Master White hath made in the profession of corrupting.

Ans. I perceiue by this entrance what will be the vpsnot of this businesse: Good Sir, at your leasure tell me how many scores of Fathers are contained in nineteene: for if you consult with the Tomes of the Councils^a, and your great Doctores, they will tell you there were onely nineteene Fathers in this Councell.

^a Surius tom. 1. concil. in concil. Elibetia. Baron. annal. to. 1. an. 57. n. 119. Bellar. de imag. l. 2. c. 11. Sixt. Senent. bibl. l. 5. annot. 247. Possuin appar. v. concil. Elibet. Durand. de rit. eccles. cath. l. 1. c. 5. ^b Placuit in ecclesia picturas esse non debere, ne quod colitur aut adoratur in parietibus depingatur.

T.W. Our Minister to overthrow the religious vse of Images, produceth the 36. Canon of the Councell of Eliberis^b; to wit, No picture is to bee made in the Church, lest that be adored which is painted on walls. But the very words of the Canon are; It pleased the Councell, that pictures should not be in the Church, lest that which is worshipped and adored, bee painted on the walls. Bee obseruant here Reader, and marke the difference which is made of the same words, by a wittie enterchange of their place in Translation, and thou shalt see that my delicate Minister here, euen transcends himselfe. The Councell saith; Images are not to be in the Church, lest that be painted on walls, which is to be worshipped: Master White translateth, lest that be worshipped which is painted on the walls. This difference is small in shew of words, but great in sense: for the words of the Councell acknowledging the worship of Images, make the worship due to them to bee the cause why they are not to bee painted on walls: but Master White saith, they are not to bee painted on walls, because they are not to bee worshipped. Now the reason why the Councell would not haue the walls of Churches to be painted with Images,

was

was in regard of the due respect they bare vnto them: for being so painted, they were subiect to be defaced, either by the inuasion of enemies in those times, or by raine or weather, whereas Images drawne in tables, being portable and remouable, doe lie open to no such danger.

Ans. The summe of all the former talke is; That the Elibertine Councell did not prohibit the making and setting vp of Images in Churches, but allowing the same, provided that they should not bee painted vpon bare walls, to prevent that they might not be defaced or destroyed.

But against this toy I oppose as followeth.

1. The Text of the 36. Canon of the Councell of Eliberis, is; *Placuit in ecclesijs picturas esse non debere*: It pleaseth vs of the Councell, that there ought to be no pictures in Churches. Our Aduersaries must answer this first part of the Canon. For howsoever that which followeth bee vnderstood, these words apparently exclude Images out of Churches. If the Councell had said, It pleaseth vs, that there ought to be no Images vpon the walls of Churches, our Aduersaries Glosses might haue caried some poore colour; but they decree generally, It pleaseth vs that there be no pictures in Churches.

2. The most of our Aduersaries confesse, that this Councell decreed against Images, and thereupon they reiect or extenuate the authoritie of it. Canus saith ^c; *It was not onely impudently, but impiously decreed by this Councell, concerning the taking away of Images.* Surius ^d acknowledging it decreed against Images, saith; *That this was necessarily and profitably done for those times, but afterwards the worshipping of Images was decreed in the seventh Councell.* Sixtus Senensis ^e and Baronius ^f confesse; *That this Councell forbade the setting vp of Images, but that the decree thereof took no place.* Andradius saith ^g; *The Councell forbade onely the setting vp the Images of God and the Trinitie; and with him agree Ferdinand Mendosa ^h, and Lorinus the Iesuit ⁱ, saying; That the Councell provided, no pictures should bee in the Church, lest the ignorant people, comming lately from Paganisme, should thinke God to be corporeall.*

Lastly, although Suarez ^k the Iesuit slubber ouer the matter about this Councell with Bellarmine ^l Glosses, yet hee prefixeth these words to the explication; *difficilius explicatur, &c.*

Conclusion of T. W. *Here I make an end of his corruptions &c. onely I must say, that in regard of the impuritie and conscienceless deportment of him in his whole Treatise, I cannot but commiserate such credulous soules as doe highly preiudge of his booke, as being written in all sinceritie and plainnesse, &c.*

Ans. If your performance had equaled your boldnesse, and your declamations were demonstrations, the credulous soules you commiserate (being many of them so iudicious and learned, that you are vnworthy to hold them the Candle) might iustly haue censured Doctor White for negligence, in alleaging these testimonies which you haue excepted against. But forasmuch as you haue plaid the vocallist and worded it onely, your triumph is like the cracking of thornes vnder a Kettle, Eccles. 7. 7. and S. Hieroms reproach may iustly bee applied vnto you, *Cum aureos montes pollicitus fuisset, ne scortum quidam nummum prestitisset: Hanc promissam Reader golden mountaines, you render him not one leatherne mite.*

And whereas you depart this scene, grinning at Master Purchas, because hee graces my brothers booke with the stile of *Via lactea, The white or milken way*; and tax him for being in his owne writings malevolent: I suppose no man will maruell, though he which hath gained respect from so many ingenuous persons in the Kingdome by his paines, cannot please *oculo nequam*, a cankered Romist, whose cie is all enuie, and his tongue venomous as a Serpent.

Finis prima Partis.

^c Canus loc. l. 3.
^d Surius 1. tom. concil. annot. in 36. Can. Concil. Elibert.
^e Sixt. Senens. lib. 5. ann. 247. Cum animaduersione gentes nuper ab idolorum superstitione ad Christum venientes, ad pristinam idololatriam inclinari, &c. indicantur presenti morbo non aliter posse mederique imaginum interdictum.
^f Baron. an. 57. n. 120. Canon de imaginibus non receptus.
^g Andr. orth. expl. l. 9.
^h Mendosa def. Concil. Elib. l. 3. c. 5.
ⁱ Lorin. com. Act. 17. ver. 25. Eu sensu cauit Concilium Elibertinum picturas in ecclesia esse, ne putarent Deum esse quid corporeum.
^k Suarez. tom. 1. d. 94. c. 1.
^l Bellar. de imag. l. 3. c. 9. Alam. Cypus dial. l. 5. c. 14. Sander. de imag. l. 3. c. 4. Peref. de Trad. p. 3. de imag. Possuin appar. v. Concil. Elibert.



The second part of the Booke :

Wherein T. W. P. accuseth Doctor White of deliuering many notorious vntruths, confessed to bee such, by the most eminent Protestants and Doctors of his owne side.

HAuing repressed this Aduersary in his first encounter, wherein consisted the pride of his strength, I am now to proceed to his second part, the entrance whereof is loud and tumultuous, Matthew 7. 25. but of a light and windy nature, and hath more sound than force, as will appeare in the progresse thereof.

T. W. *Lying is the second pillar which supporteth the whole weight and frame of Master Whites worke. He deliuereth false assertions, vast vntruths, grosse lies, acknowledged to be such by his owne breshren; By the most eminent and learned Protestants of Christendome, the most accomplished for their literature that euer liued, &c. I will choakingly and irreplably conuince him of notorious miscarriage: I haue thought good to supererogate with some in disproving his falsehoods, &c.*

Ans. It is reported of Marcellus * the Romane, in the stratagems of warre, that hee leading on a time a small and weake array, caused all the Skullions, slaues, and seruitors of his host, to shout together with the souldiers; and by this meanes affrighted the enemy with a conceit of a terrible encounter. Not vnlike hereunto T. W. P. beginneth with a terrible noise; and as another *Thersitis* or *Shemei*, beroareth Doctor White with the scandall and outcry of false assertions, vast vntruths, grosse lies, &c. and then Thraso-like seconderth them with ostentation: But coming at length to encounter and blowes, he fighteth with a Bull-rush, and the choaking stuffe wherewith he glorieth to strangle Doctor White, (being of lesse force than Pope Adrians flie ^b) melteth into froth and fatuity.

* Iulius Frontin.
Stratagem. l. 2. c. 4
n. 3. Lilius dec. 3.
l. 3.

^b Abbas Viper. in
Freder. 1. Adrian.
apud Anagninam,
musca necatur.
Naucl. gener. 39.

The summe and substance of this second part, may bee comprized in this Syllogisme.

He which in an opposition to a common Aduersary, deliuereth sundry positions, the contrary whereof is affirmed by many learned Diuines of his owne side, he vttereth grosse lies, vast vntruths, &c.

Doctor White in an opposition to a common Aduersary, doth thus; ergo Doctor White vttereth grosse lies, vast vntruths, &c.

Ans. Exchanging the person, this obiection will presently returne the same way it came.

For

For thus I retort : He which in an opposition to a common Aduersary, delivereth diuers positions, the contrary whereof is affirmed by many learned Doctors of his owne side, hee vttereth grosse lies and vast vntruths, &c.

But T. W. D. Whites Aduersary hath done this; for he speakerh *Contrary to Canus, Surinus, Baronius, and Andradinus, about the Councill of Eltheris* ^c; And contrary to Gregory Ariminense, Vasques, and Benius, in expounding Augustine about reprobation or sufficient grace ^d, and contrary to Stapleton ^e, in saying that a man wanting inward vertues, is but an æquiuocall member of the visible Church : and contrary to Pighius and the Doctors of Colen ^f, touching the formall cause of iustification, &c.

^c Part. 1. chap. 9.

paragr. 3.

^d Ibid. chap. 8. pa-

ragr. 2.

^e Ch. 5. paragr. 1.

^f Ch. 1. paragr. 3.

Therefore T. W. P. Doctor Whites Aduersary, vttereth grosse lies, vast vntruths, is an impostor, a fellow without a soule, and I know not what.

^g Biel. Canon. mis-

lett. 41.

^h Guido Carme-

lita de hæres. in

Gen. cap. 7.

If this argument be good, the most Writers, except the Canonically, will proue guilty of grosse lying, and vast vntruth: Gabriel Biel ^g speaking of the Doctors of the Church, saith; *One Saint contradicth another, Saint Augustine opposeth Cyprian, and Augustine and Hierom are of a contrary iudgement.* And Guido de Perpinniano ^h: *Doctors are repugnant to Doctors, and Disciples to Disciples; yea the Schollers to their Masters, and this frequently, and very often.* Now therefore admitting that Doctor White in handling some questions, did vary from other priuate Writers, this can no more conuince him of falshood, than the difference betweene Scotus and Thomas, or Suarez and Bellarmine, doth them and others of the like.

Obiect. Doctor White in some of these vntruths, affirmeth, that not one Father, or any one Protestant taught such, or such a point, &c.

Ans. You should haue done well to haue named, where the Doctor vttereth this large assertion: for finding that you commonly ouer-reach, wee credit you no further than you proue.

ⁱ Briarly, apol. pag. 6.

T. W. *Obiect.* 2. *In that Master Whites vntruths doe make head against the Catholike faith, and strengthen the Protestants Religion: Other Protestants would not contradict the same to the weakening of their owne cause, were it not that the euidence of truth on the Catholike side, doth force them therunto* ⁱ; and therefore the voluntary acknowledgement of any one such learned Protestant, must in reason ouer-balance many scores of others, not confessing so much.

Ans. In this obiection there bee diuers loose branches: 1. All Doctor Whites assertions doe not make head against the Catholike faith; for some of them concerne matter of fact, story, manners, &c.

^k Bocan. pref. opus.

to. 1. nec vnquam

fuerum est, quam-

diu in hac vita

mortali sumus,

quod vnus aliquis

prostiti audeat, se

ita transisse & per-

uestigasse hoc pe-

lagus, vt omnes e-

ius sinus & late-

bras penitus ha-

beat exploratas.

Bergom. chro. an.

1503. Neque om-

nia possumus om-

nes, neque sancti

Euangeliste vnus & idem de Christo scripserunt, &c.

^l Can. loc. theol. l. 6. c. vlt. ad. 11. Bellar. de Pont. l. 4. c. 11. Nonnulli ex catholicis,

Honorum hæreticorum fuisse contendunt, vt Melchior Canus. Baron. to. 8. ad an. 681. quem voluissent scribis potius fuisse canum quam no-

mine. ^m Bellar. de max. l. 1. c. 6. Can. loc. l. 6. c. 5. Pigh. contr. l. 2. Catharin. l. de pecc. orig. Copfist. Colon. & Ansdagm. Bellar. de amiff.

grat. l. 5. c. 16. & de iustif. l. 2. c. 1.

2. Other Protestants may possibly contradict Doctor White, not by euidence of truth, but vpon these occasions. 1. One man sees not all things, and diligence, labour, and longer inquisition bring matters to light, which haue beene formerly not so well knowne. 2. The state of the question may either vary, or be more fully explained and better vnderstood, and accordingly mens speeches may alter. 3. It is common with our Aduersaries, one of them to oppose another in the Controversies which they maintaine with vs. Thus Bellarmine and Baronius contradict Canus ⁱ, about *Pope Honorius his falling into heresie*. And Pighius, Catherinus, Gropper, &c. are thwarted in their rener, concerning iustification, originall sinne, certainty of grace, &c. by latter Doctors ^k.

But letting passe the former proposition, the assumption, which is (Doctor White hath vttered vast vntruths, grosse lies, acknowledged to bee such by the most eminent and learned Protestants, &c.) is insufficiently confirmed by this Aduersary.

For

For first, vpon the examination of the thirty particular instances produced to the former purpose, it will appeare, that *Doctor White* hath not uttered one manifest or notorious vntruth, affirmed to bee such by the testimony of any eminent or worthy Protestant.

2. Where the Popish Priest vndertaketh to make remonstrance of his accusation, by the testimonies of the most eminent and learned Protestants: 1. Sunday of the Authors produced by him, are no Protestants; David George is a damned Heretike^m, Sebastian Francke, an Anabaptistⁿ, Matthew Paris, a Monke of Saint Albion, placed by Bellarmine^o among Popish Writers, and alleaged by him, and by Baronius^r and Sigonius^q, as a Romane Catholike. 2. Some of his Authors dwell at Non-such^r. Diuers are so obscure and meane, that no man respecteth them. 4. Some are male-contents, and men blotted with singularity and nouelty. 5. Many of the testimonies alleaged from such Protestants as are eminent and learned indeed, are recofited Coleworts, gleaned out of Master Briarlies Apology, and are for the more part already cleared by the learned^f of our side.

^m Thuanus to. 2. hist. l. 1. 2.
ⁿ Briarly, apol. tr. 1. §. 3. p. 131.
^o Bellar. de scriptor. eccles.
^p Baron. to. 12. an. 1169. n. 42.
^q Sigon. de reg. Ital. l. 18. Bellarm. Recog. pag. 121.
^r Andr. Brixius cited, vntruth 10. pag. 108.
^f R. Morton Cath. Appeale. D. Whitak. cont. Campian. & cont. Duran. D. Huph. Ies. p. 2.

The first vntruth, wherewith T. W. P. chargeth M. White, concerning triall of faith by antiquity.

T. W. Master White speaking of the Fathers of the Primitiue times, and of their iudgement in matter of faith, betweene the Protestants and vs, writeth; We are so well assured, (meaning of the resolution of the Fathers) that we embrace that kinde of triall which is by antiquity, and daily finde our Aduersaries galled thereby. But this is acknowledged to be a vast vntruth by Doctor Humphrey^e, who taxed Bishop Iewell for giuing the Papists too large a scope: saying; That he was iniurious to himselfe, and after a manner spoiled himselfe and his Church. Also by Doctor Whitaker^u, who writeth; That the Popish religion is but a patched couerlet of the Fathers errors sewed together. Lastly, Luther^x traduceth the Fathers, calling them most blinde and ignorant in the Scriptures, &c.

^e Vita Iuel p. 112. taken out of Briarly by apology, tr. 1. §. 3. pag. 140.
^u Cont. Dur. Iesu. it. l. 6. pag. 423.
^x De seru. arbit. pag. 434.

Answ. No man can better report anothers meaning, than the Author himselfe: and Campian^y the Iesuite in his challenge, obiecting this place of Doctor Humphrey, was answered by the same Doctor himselfe then liuing, in this manner^z: That hee neuer blamed the reuerend Bishop Iewell, for challenging the Papists to a disputation out of the Fathers, but greatly commended the same: only hee iudged that the Bishop had yeilded the Papists a greater scope than was conuenient; to wit, in the largenesse of his offer, which was, that if in 27. Articles propounded by him, the Papists were able to produce one place out of any one Father of the first 600. yeeres, plainly testifying the contrary doctrine to those Articles propounded by him, he would then yeeld them the cause.

Doctor Humphrey affirmes, that Bishop Iewell learnedly maintained his challenge, and failed not at all in the performance thereof, but did supererogare with his aduersaries more than he was bound. See his owne words^a in the margin.

2. Doctor Whitakers in all his writings, is resolute to submit the Protestants cause, to be tried by the Fathers, as witnesses of the truth: and he proclaimeth against Campian^b and all other Papists, saying; Harken, O Campian, the same most

^y Campian. Rat. 5.
^z Huph. Iesuitif. p. 2. ad. 5. Rat. Camp. p. 648. Dixi quidem Iuclum, qua erat multiplici doctrina & heretico animo praedicus, non modo ad scripturas, sed etiam ad tota seculi, &c. prouocasse: sed vobis maiorem animum reclamandi praebuit, & vobis nimium largitus est, vobis plus a quo concessit, sibi interrim nimis iniurius, &c. An cuiquam videri potest hanc oratio acris reprehensio? immo excusatio illius & laudo, quod pugna difficilior sit pulchrior.

^a In vita Iuel. Atque hic protestatio illa & denunciatio, quam vanam & futilem esse aduersarij calumniantur, repetenda est: quam tamen veram esse, ipsi qui paulo maiori ingenio & excellentiori doctrina valent, non negabunt: si QVIS VILVM ANTIQVVM DOCTORVM ET PATRVM, &c. ^b Whitak. cont. Camp. ad Rat. 5. p. 114. alleaged by Briarly, apol. tr. 1. §. 3. pag. 135.

true and constant speech, which I well uttered at that time, when bee challenged all you Papists to triall of antiquity, of the first six hundred yeeres, offering you, that if you were able to produce out of any Father or Councell, during that time, any one plaine and euident testimony, he would yeeld you the victory: This very profession doe wee all of vs make, wee all undertake the same, and will not breake promise.

So farre is this reuerend Doctor from allowing the Primitiue Fathers to bee Patrons of Papistry, that hee affirms, they are wholly ours ^c in all materiall points, and hee honoureth and preferreth them before other writers, commending the study and reading of their bookes, to all iudicious Diuines, and by their testimony in his disputations, hee defendeth the truth of our faith.

Obiect. But he calleth Popery a patched couerlet, framed of the errors of the Fathers.

Ans. It is confessed by our Aduersaries, that the Fathers had their errors^d, and themselues in diuers cases challenge and censure them. There is none of the Fathers, saith Stapleton ^e, in which something erroneous may not bee obserued. And Anselme^f saith; In the bookes of those holy Doctors which the Church readeth as authenticall, some things are found wicked and hereticall: And Mulhusius & the Iesuite; We know the Fathers were men, and erred sometimes.

Chrysostome and other of the Fathers, are charged by Stapleton, Sixtus Senensis, Toler, Pererius, and Maldonate, to haue erred about freewill; and Clemens of Alexandria, Chrysostome, Theodorit, Hierom, Ambrose, and Euthymius, erred about originall sinne, saith Doctor Stapleton^h.

Before the Pelagian heresie arose, Augustine was deceiuedⁱ in the matter of diuine grace and freewill; and although the same Father is many times Orthodox in the question of Purgatory^k, yet at other times he varieth (at the least doubtfully^l) from his owne sounder iudgement.

In these and the like cases it is verified, which Cyril^m speaketh vpon other occasion: That as Horseleaches sucke the naughty blond out of the vesnes; so Papists excerpt that which is most imperfect and vnsound from the Fathers; and thus Popery, according to Doctor Whitakers, is a patched couerlet, framed of the Fathers errors. But hence it doth not follow, that the said Doctor would not stand to their iudgement in such manner as my Brother undertaketh, that is, to the vniuersal consent of the Fathers, or to the iudgement of the learnedest Fathers, or to the aduised or deliberate doctrine of the Fathers. It is possible for some Fathers to erre, and yet others to iudge aright. The same Father may sometimes vtter a straggling and exorbitant sentence, and yet in other places correct himselfeⁿ.

Lastly, the Papists of a small error of the Fathers, may occasionally procreate a great one; as from praying for the dead, vsed in one respect by the Fathers^o, the grosse praying for the dead, with a reference to Purgatory. Now this is the patched couerlet which Doctor Whitaker meaneth, implying no scurrility as this Popish Priest obiecterh, but truly taxing the slippery dealing of Popish Hucksters in abusing Fathers^p.

3. Concerning Luther, euen as in sacred Scripture the Prophets, Esay 1. 11. and 66. 3. and the Apostles, hauing to deale with hypocrites, which placed iustice in outward ceremonies, vtter diuers speeches in disgrace of legall rites, not depressing the same in themselues, but shewing they were vnprofitable to such as abused them: So Luther being opposed by Aduersaries, which preferred the Fathers before the Scriptures, correcting that abuse, vseth some broad speeches, (such as our Aduersary nameth) against the errors of some Fathers, (not generally of all:) But otherwise, When Fathers are lawfully vsed, as mis-

^a Ibid. Toti ad nostras partes perueniant, & vos certissime laceflunt atque oppugnat. In summa causis habemus omnes asipulantes. Patres & magni facimus, & assidue legimus, & cunctis accuratioris theologiae studiosis legendos proponimus. Duplic. cont. Stapl. pag. 187. Plus tribuendum est ecclesiae Primitiuae, quam subsequendum sculo-rum ecclesiae.

^b Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 8. Licet sancti Patres errare potuerint, & de facto errauerint aliquando, &c. Guid. Car. de haeresi generat. c. 7. In dictis Sanctorum extra canonem biblicum non est infallibilis veritas, certa & indubitata.

^c Stapl. Rel. ca. 6. q. 4.

^d Anselm. com. 2. Cor. cited by Sixtus Senensis biblioth. 5. in praef. p. 329. Possuin. sel. bib. l. 12. c. 23. Villaur. de rat. stud. theol. l. 4. c. 6. obleru. 1.

^e Mulhusius. d. sp. de fid. pag. 43. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 8. Errant Bernardus, &c. errant Cyprianus, &c.

^f De iustif. l. 1. c. 10.

^g Aug. de praedest. sanct. cap. 3. Quem meum errorem, nonnulla opuscula mea satis indicant, &c.

^h Aug. de temp. ser. 232. Duo loca sunt, & tertius non est. De verb. Apo. ser. 14. Hypog. l. 5. Tertium locum penitus ignoramus.

ⁱ De fid. & oper. ca. 16. Enchir. cap. 69. Tale aliquid post hanc vitam fieri incredibile non est, & vtrum ita sit quae potest. d. ciuit. D. l. 20. ca. 25.

^k Cyril. l. 6. contra Iulian.

^l Aug. contra Cresc. lib. 2. cap. 31. & 32. De orig. animar. lib. 4. cap. 1. De bon. persec. cap. 22. lib. 1. Retract. cap. 19.

^m Roads Doctor Field of the Church, l. 3. c. 17. 2. Sw Brially, apol. p. 1. §. 3. n. 14. p. 125.

nesses and interpreters of truth, hee esteemeth ^a them according to their worth, and yeeldeth as much vnto them as themselues require^r.

But as for our aduersaries, there is nothing more ordinary with them, than to reiect the testimony of the Fathers^f, and they professe to doe thus whensoever their authorities repugne the Articles of the Romane Church^e.

dei & doctrinae sanctae Catholicae ecclesiae, quam inde vique ab initio, vnanimiter seruauit. Com. in c. 5. Gal. Patres euangelium & fidem in Christum, absque vlla hypocrisi, pure & simpliciter tradiderunt, & ecclesiam ab innumeris erroribus expurgarunt. ^a Aug. epist. 19. & ep. 111. de orig. anim. l. 4. c. 1. & de bon. perfeu. c. 21. Hieron. cited by Biel, Can. Miss. lect. 41. ^f Bellarm. de verbo D. l. 4. c. 11. Can. loc. l. 7. c. 3. Stapl. Rel. c. 6. q. 4. Greg. Val. tom. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. §. 45. Card. introd. l. 4. c. 19. Viguier. iustit. theol. c. 17. v. 2. Valqu. p. 1. d. 12. c. 1. Guid. Carmel. de haeres. in Gen. c. 7. Thyr. de appar. visib. l. 1. c. 25. Stapl. Rel. c. 3. q. 1. ar. 1. Vega de iustit. l. 11. c. 6. Driedo de eccles. dog. l. 4. c. 6. Suar. 3. p. 2. d. 2. §. 3. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 8. ^e Hof. con. Brent. l. 3. pag. 167. Cum ecclesia Doctores admittimus. Baron. annal. 1. ann. 34. n. 213. Marta. de iurisd. par. 4. pag. 273. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. 22. §. Omnes sancti conueniunt B. Virginem contraxisse originale pecc. & tamen, &c. Maldon. com. Ioh. 2. v. 4.

^a Luth. ad March. Brandenburg. to. 2. Germ. p. 243. Periculosum & horrendum est, quicquam vel audire vel credere, quod aduersatur vnanimi testimonio fi-

^f Aug. epist. 19.

^e Bellarm. de verbo D. l. 4. c.

^e Hof. con. Brent. l. 3. pag. 167.

^e Hof. con. Brent. l. 3. pag. 167.

^e Hof. con. Brent. l. 3. pag. 167.

Vntruth 2. *Master White charged to deny that, concerning Tradition, which other Protestants grant.*

T. W. *Master White laboureth to proue, that the Protestants Church receiueth not necessarily any one Tradition; and in his table, No part of our faith standeth vpon Tradition: and page 47. The Scripture proueth it selfe to be the very word of God, and receiueth not authority from the Church: But Master Whites breshren, Doctor Whitaker^a, Master Hooker^b, and Doctor Couel^c, affirme the contrary to this, &c.*

^a Whitak. cont.

Stapl. p. 298.

^b Hook. pol. eccl.

pag. 146.

^c Couel. def. pag.

11.

Ans. None of Master Whites brethren will, or can charge him with falsehood as you pretend, but they generally accord with him in both his assertions, being rightly vnderstood.

1. He maintaineth, that no part of our faith dependeth or is builded vpon Tradition, in the same manner as vpon the Scripture: *Not vpon Tradition, as the foundation of beleefe, or as the last resolution of faith; But as a subordinate helpe, administring cause, or externall testimony to the truth.* And accordingly Doctor Whitaker^d speaketh, and no otherwise. But you haue wilfully omitted the latter part of the said Doctors words, wherein hee explicates his meaning.

^d Whitaker. de

Scip. q. 3. cap. 5.

Non nego tra-

ditionem ecclesia-

sticam esse argu-

mentum, quo ar-

gui & conuinci

possit, qui libri ca-

nonici sunt, &c.

sed dico hoc exter-

num tantum argu-

mentum & testi-

monium esse. Co-

tra Stapl. pa. 300.

Testimonium ec-

clesiae non est causa fidei,

tamquam externo argumento, &c.

^e Bellar. de Sacram. l. 2. c. 25. Stapl. Rel. c. 5. q. 1. ar. 1. ad. 2. Nostra fides

praesentis ecclesiae iudicio & autoritate nititur, non Apostolica, &c. p. 501.

^f Baron. tom. 1. an. 53. n. 11. Scripturarum fundamentum

traditio. Siluest. Prior. cont. Luth. conclus. 56. Indulgentiae non innotuere nobis autoritate Scripturae, sed autoritate ecclesiae Romanae,

quae maior est.

2. In the next assertion Master White acknowledgeth, that the ministry of the Church induceth vs to assent to the Scripture. But you will haue Tradition and the ministry of the Church (vnderstanding the present Church) not onely an adiuuant cause of beleefe, but a foundation and principle thereof^e, of equall or greater authority than the Scripture. And for prooffe hereof you reason as followeth.

Ans. ^e Bellar. de Sacram. l. 2. c. 25. Stapl. Rel. c. 5. q. 1. ar. 1. ad. 2. Nostra fides praesentis ecclesiae iudicio & autoritate nititur, non Apostolica, &c. p. 501. ^f Baron. tom. 1. an. 53. n. 11. Scripturarum fundamentum traditio. Siluest. Prior. cont. Luth. conclus. 56. Indulgentiae non innotuere nobis autoritate Scripturae, sed autoritate ecclesiae Romanae, quae maior est.

T. W. *If any maine Article of faith be taught by Tradition only, then Master Whites assertion is false, saying; No part of our faith standeth vpon Tradition. But some maine part of our faith, to wit, that the Gospell and Acts are the sacred word of God, is taught by Tradition onely; according to the testimony of Master Hooker and Doctor Couel. Ergo, It is false which Master White affirmeth, that no part of our faith standeth vpon Tradition.*

Ans. Master Hooker^g affirmeth two things: 1. *The first outward motive leading men to esteeme of the Scripture, is the authority of Gods Church.* 2. *Afterwards by bestowing our labour in hearing or reading the mysteries thereof, wee finde by the thing or matter it selfe, that which giueth vs full satisfaction.*

^g Hooker. eccles.

Pol. l. 3. pag. 147.

According to this iudicious Author, the authority and testimony of the Church, is the first motiue and meanes to leade vs to the knowledge of the holy Scriptures; and when we are lead by the hand of the Church vnto them, and by the ministry thereof are holpen about the sense and interpretation, they containe in themselves a diuine authority, verity, and light, whereby people come to infused faith.

And from this assertion, I answer the Papists obiection; If any maine Article of our faith doe depend vpon Tradition, as a diuine principle thereof: then it is true which the Popish Priest faith, that some part of our faith is builded vpon Tradition. But if an Article of faith depend vpon Tradition, only as an introduction and administering cause thereof, then it is false, that some part of our faith is builded vpon Tradition.

Obiect. How is it possible to know that the Gospell of Matthew is diuine Scripture, and the Gospell of Nicodemus bearing the same title, is not.

Ans. 1. To the knowing hereof, by an historicall and acquirit faith, the testimony and tradition of the Church (especially the Primitiue Church) is necessary.

Secondly, to know this by a diuine and infused faith, (besides the authority of the Church:) the matter, character, and contents of the very booke, and comparison with other Scripture, doe serue as an inward cause, to produce the said infused faith.

When Onesimus brought Saint Pauls Epistle to Philemon; his bringing thereof, and reporting who was the Author, did authorize the Epistle so farre, as to make Philemon receiue and reade it: but vpon the perusal thereof, Philemon found matter and inward arguments in the very Epistle it selfe, whereby (the Spirit of God co-working) he was fully induced to beleue it as diuine and Apostolicall Scripture.

Vntruth 3. *Wherein Doctor White is charged with a false assertion, of the continuance of the Protestants faith.*

T. W. *Our minister labouring to enammell and beautifie his deformed faith, with the specious title of antiquity and succession, useth these swelling speeches*^b: Against all Papists whatsoever, we make it good, that the very faith we now professe, hath successiue continued in all ages since Christ, and was neuer interrupted so much as one yeere, moneth, or day; and to confesse the contrary were sufficient to proue vs no part of the Church of God. *Words of brasse, but if he be put to prooue, no doubt of leaden performance, &c.* Lutherⁱ and Bishop Iewel^k affirme contrary hereunto, that the truth of Religion was restored, made knowne, and brought to light by Luther himselfe, and Zuinglius, &c.

Ans. Here bee two things to be examined: 1. The truth or falshood of Master Whites assertion in it selfe. 2. The comparing thereof with the speeches of Luther and Bishop Iewel.

Touching the former, the Reader must obserue, that Doctor White^l speaketh of substantiall and primitiue doctrine; not of accessorie and secundarie points. And thus it is true, that the principall articles of the Protestants faith haue continued in all ages, neuertheless, if Doctor Whites words be extended as farre as they literally sound, I suppose they may be defended, and that in all ages, and when Luther beganne to teach, there haue bene Christian Churches in the world

Driedo de ecclef.
dogm. l. 4. c. 4. pag.
339. Enchir. Co-
lon. pa. 70.

^b Way to the Chur.
sec. 17. pag. 86.

ⁱ Luth. epist. ad
Argentin. & loc.
com. cl. 4. p. 51.
^k Iewel apol. p. 4.
ch. 4.

^l D. Wh. *Way to
the Chur.* sec. 45.
d. 335. & digress.
48 p. 337.

world, and publike teachers in the Romane Church, who hauereiected the Trident faith.

1. The Grecians^m, Armeniansⁿ, Waldenses^o, and Bohemians^p, denied the supremacie of the Pope, and authoritie of the Church of Rome.

2. The Greeke Church, the Bohemians, Armenians, and Waldenses denied Purgatorie, praier for the dead, seuen Sacraments, satisfactions, and the single life of Priests^q.

3. The Armenian Churches, and the Waldenses denied Transubstantiation, and the Romish sacrifice of the Masse^r.

4. The Iacobites and Armenians denied auricular confession^s.

5. The Waldenses, Bohemians, and Greekes, denied inuocation of Saints, Popes pardons, Frierish miracles, and the fasts and ceremonies of the Roman Church^t.

6. The Ethiopians denied inuocation of Saints, allowed no Masses^u departed, and affirmed that Church lawes binde not the conscience^v.

7. Among the Papists themselues, Ferus taught the iustification by faith alone^x, and is charged by Dominicus Soto, to haue held the same opinion with the Lutherans in the Article of iustification^y. Also, he condemned merit of works; he affirmeth, that predestinate persons onely haue faith^z, and that the faithfull may be assured of their saluation^a, he denieth the temporall iurisdiction of Popes^b and Prelates: and faith, the Scripture is the onely rule of faith^c. Durand denied transubstantiation, (as our Aduersaries themselues charge him^d) and Caietan held premises, whereupon followeth the destruction of Transubstantiation^e.

Albertus Pighius^f and the Diuines of Colein^g, maintained, that the merit of Christ imputed, is the formall cause of iustification. And Pighius agrees with the Protestants in the matter of the doctrine of merit^h.

Cardinall Caietan, a chiefe Pilot in the Romane Sea, maintaines the lawfulness of publike praier in a knownetongueⁱ, and denies, that the Text of Iohn 20. 23^j. and Ephes. 5. 32. and Iames 5. 4^k. (being the sole grounds of Scripture which Papists haue for three of their Sacraments, auricular confession, matrimony, and extreme vnction,) doe teach any such thing.

Lastly, Lyra^l, Abulensis^m, Caietan, Hugo, Richardus de Sancto Victore, &c. deny sundry of the Apocryphall bookes of Scripture, lately made Canonically by the Trident Fathers: And Galatinus, Pagnine, Iohannes Campensis, &c. deny the authority of the old Latine translationⁿ.

onem, &c. * Ibid. Caietan. affirmat panem transubstantiari in corpus Christi. Concedit nihilominus rem quae erat panis manere, & esse corpus Christi. Hæc est omnino fugienda, ex ea enim sequitur conuersionem istam in corpus Christi non esse transubstantiationem. * Pigh. contr. loc. 2. f. Antididag. Colon. g. Pigh. ibid. In eandem nobiscum sententiam conueniunt. * Caietan. com. 1. Cor. 14. 1. Com. Ioh. 20. * Com. Eph. 5. Com. Iac. 5. i. Lira sup. Eisd. 1. & sup. Tob. m. Abulens. in Mat. n. Can. loc. 1. 2. 10. Petri. com. Dan. l. 16. Bellarm. de verbo Dei, l. 1. c. 7. Galatin. præf. de arcan. fid. cath. Faber. præf. epist. Paul. Sixt. Senens. bibl. l. 4. Santes Pagninus. Ioh. Campens. ep. dedic. paraph. in Psalm. Richard. de sanc. Victor. Except. l. 2. c. 9. Sunt præterea & alij libri, ut Sapientia Salomonis, liber Iesu filij Sirach, liber Iudith & Tobias, & liber Machabeorum, quæ leguntur quidem, sed non scribuntur in Canone.

m. Guil. Carm. de hæres. Græcor. c. 3. & c. 20. n. Ibid. de hæres. Armen. cap. 1. & cap. 15. o. De hæres. Walden. ca. 1. & 4. p. Bohem. de mor. gent. lib. 3. cap. 11. Nich. Hymeric. p. 2. q. 14. Contrad. Viper. an. 1180. q. 1. Cocc. thesaur. Cath. 17. ar. 6. q. Guid. lo Bohem. Concil. Florent. sess. ult. r. Guid. de error. Armen. c. 22. d. error. Græc. 2. Euth. panopl. p. 2. tit. 20. s. Guid. de error. Iacob. c. 2. & d. error. Armen. c. 26. t. Guid. de error. Wald. Bohem. l. 3. de mor. gent. P. B. milius de gest. Franc. l. 2. u. Dresse. de eccl. Ethiop. Dam. Goes de mor. Ethiop. x. Ferus com. Ioh. 1. & Ioh. 16. charged by Do. Sot. in b. annot. y. Com. lib. 3. in Matth. c. 20. charged by Soto. z. Com. Ioh. 17. a. Com. Ioh. 17. b. Com. Mat. 16. c. Com. Mat. 13. d. Flor. theolog. in l. 4. sent. q. 5. ar. 1. An panis in corpus Christi conuertatur? Quatuor sunt opinionēs: 1. est Durandi, qui omnino negat Transubstantiationem.

T. W. Bishop Iewel and Luther affirme, that Protestancie began in their daies.

Ans. They speake respectiue, Et secundum quid, that Luther and Zuiniglius were the first, who in such a manner, and with so good successe, and which in these Westerne parts, by a publike opposition and separation of many nations, and so exactly and powerfully preached the Gospell, and condemned Popery; but they affirme, not contrary to Doctor White, that our Doctrine in such a manner as I haue declared before, was no where professed in the world.

Vntruth 4. *Wherein Doctor White is challenged, for affirming the vnity of Faith and doctrine among the Protestants.*

T. W. *For the iustifying of the Protestants doctrine, Master White saith, of the booke intituled, The harmony of confessions; If the Iesuite can shew in this booke (wherein the particular Churches set downe and name the Articles of their faith) any iarre in dogmaticall points of faith, I am content you beleue him in all the rest. Here the Reader hath a bold assertion, which the more easily to win a credulous eare, is steeped in muske: but I feare Master Doctor, the note diapason, which implieth an absolute and generall concord, will here be wanting, &c.* And then the popish Priest produceth six examples of doctrine out of the Harmony of confessions, which he pretendeth to be discordious with the doctrine of the Church of England, and of the Caluinists in France and Germany.

^o Aq. 2. 2. q. 2. ar. 5. Fidei obiectum per se, &c. per accides & secundario. Stapl. dupl. l. 1. c. 12. n. 3. Omnes qui Spiritum sanctum habent, de rebus ad religionem necessario pertinentibus, &c. perinde sentiunt. Aug. cont. Iul. lib. 1. Alia sunt in quibus inter se, aliquando etiam optimi atq; doctissimi regulę cath. defensores, salua fidei compage, non consonant. De ciuit. D. l. 15. c. 5. Pugnant inter se boni & mali, &c.

Ans. If you will proceed substantially, and prouethat there is discord of faith and doctrine among the Protestants, you must performe these two things: 1. Produce principall parts of doctrine belonging to the maine object of faith, and demonstrate, that the Protestant Churches which are reputed Orthodox, (for wee haue nothing to doe with Anabaptists, Arians, &c.) are diuided in these: 2. You must also giue instance in such persons, as are reputed sound members and vitall parts of the seuerall Churches wherein they liue; not of Nouellists, Incendiaries, and Extrauagants, which are condemned, and resisted by the sound and best parts of the Church, Rom. 16. 17.

These things being premised, let the places produced by you out of the Harmony of Confessions be examined.

T. W. *Wee finde this Harmony to teach; That sinnes are estfoones punished, euen in this life, as Dauids, Manasses, &c. and the punishments may be mitigated by good works. See here how fully it acknowledgeth the abstersiue nature of penance and satisfaction.*

Ans. 1. You doe not faithfully recite the words of the confession of Augsburg, but haue omitted part thereof, and namely that part which explicateth their true meaning. The whole words are; *Wee giue warning of this also, that sinnes are estfoones punished with temporall punishments in this life, as Dauid, Manasses, and many other were punished: and we teach, that these punishments may be mitigated by good works, and the whole practise of repentance, as Paul declareth, 1 Cor. 11. 31. If we would indge our selues, we should not be indged.*

The Popish Priest hath omitted these words; *With temporall punishments in this life:* and also the latter part of the sentence, *The whole practise of repentance, &c.* 1. The confession acknowledgeth onely a temporall punishment of sinne in this life for iust persons: The Papists extend the temporall punishment of sinne to Purgatory in the life to come. 2. The confession teacheth, that good works mitigate temporall punishments by way of impetration, and as they be actions of repentance: The Papists teach, they doe it as a satisfaction and compensation of Gods iustice.

Secondly, whereas you say, that the place alleaged, fully acknowledgeth the abstersiue nature of penance and satisfaction: you should rather haue said *foully*; for the said confession in that Section, expressly reprobeth Popish satisfactions, saying; *that they obscure the benefit of Christs redemption.*

Thirdly, whereas euery difference and contrariety is betweene two or many: you

^p Bellar. de Purg. l. 1. c. 7. ^q Stapl. antidot. apost. 1 Cor 11. pa. 651. Sunt verę compesationes & satisfactiones preteritarum peccat. ^r Harm. Confess. c. 8. ar. 3. de confess. Non oneramus conscientias satisfactionibus, &c. Satisfactiones obscurabant beneficium Christi.

you haue alleaged certaine speeches out of the harmony of confessions, without paralleling the same with any contrary assertion; and to you proue no disagreement of the Protestants by the said booke of confessions, but only deliuer what some of them teach.

T. W. *This obedience towards the law is a kinde of iustice, (marke you this discord) and deserueth reward.*

Ans. These Authors presently after the place alleaged, explicate their meaning, saying; *After that the person is reconciled to God, and made iust by faith, his obedience is accepted and pleaseth God, and is reputed a certaine kinde of iustice.* The Papiſts esteeme inherent righteouſneſſe, to be perfect and absolute iustice, such as God cannot refuse or condemne by his law^f. These Protestants in their confession, teach, that it is iustice in an inferiour manner, or lower degree of iustice, being eleuated hereunto by Gods freeacceptation, and not by rigor of iustice^t: And in this their Tenet other learned Protestants concur with them.

2. Whereas they say, that our obedience deserueth reward; they vse the word merit or deserue, as the ancient Fathers did, and as Gratiāns glosse explicateth the same^u: for to obtaine, procure, and impetrate^v, and not for meriting properly and by condignity, as the moderne Papiſts doe.

^f Vasq. 1. 2. p. 2. d. 122. c. 3. Sunt iusticia perfecte meritoria, vt nullum habeant defectum, ob quem vita aeterna illis denegari possit. Bellarm. de iustif. lib. 2. ca. 10. Maldon. cont. co. 2. de poenit. pa. 84. Deus accepta habere debet, vultis melius, &c.

T. W. *Like as the preaching of penance is generall, euen so the promise of grace is generall, &c. Here needeth no disputation of Predestination, or such like, for the promise is generall.*

Ans. The Preaching and promise of grace is vniuersall, in regard of all kindes and states of people^x, Aēt. 10. 35. Gal. 3. 28. Col. 3. 11. to whom the Ministers of the Gospell must in their preaching and doctrine offer the same in common, without respect of persons^t. But if it bee vniuersall in regard of efficacy, or in respect of the preaching thereof, to euery particular person, and euery nation at all times, how commeth it to passe, that so many infants de cease without baptisme^y (which you say to them is damnable^z) And so many Nations, to wit, the Indians, before your Friars and Bishops came among them^z, wanted preaching, Sacraments, and all meanes of saluation? And wherefore doe Thomas of Aquine, Bellarmine, and the rest of your Doctors handle the doctrine of Predestination, if the same be false or dangerous?

But whereas the confession of Auspurg saith: There needeth no disputation of predestination; it condemneth vndiscreet and curious disputing of predestination², such as passe the bounds of Gods reuealed word, or is diuided from the doctrine of repentance and good works: otherwise you cannot be ignorant that both the sacred Scripture and the Primitive Fathers^b, maintaine the preaching of predestination, and Saint Augustine saith, *Nimia contentio est, Predestinationi contradicere, vel de Predestinatione dubitare*: It is too contentious a part, to oppose predestination or to doubt of predestination.

Lastly, T. W. P. to confirme his supposed discord betwene this confession of Auspurg and the Protestants of England, should haue done well, to haue set downe wherein the Church of England^c varieth from this confession, in any of the former assertions.

^x 16. c. 11. Phil. Camerar. med. hist. p. 1. c. 38. These Authors report, that the Spaniards ſet their mastine dogs with their miserable Indians: and how an old woman pursued by a band of keeled downe, and held out the Capaines letter to the mastine, and escaped: she very dog being more pitifull than the Spaniards, &c. ^y Viē Prosper. ep. de lib. arb. ad. Rufin. ^z Aug. de bono perfe. c. 15. & 16. Prosp. ad excep. Cennens. resp. ad. dub. 10. in fine. ^a Aug. de bono. perfe. l. 2. c. 21. Greg. mor. l. 2. c. 9. quicquid foris futurum est in opere, intus iam factum est in predestinatione. ^b Articles, 1562. ar. 17.

T. W. *As touching priuate confession, &c.* we affirme, that the ceremony of priuate absolution is to be retained in the Church, and we doe constantly retaine it.

Ans. T. W. P. concealing part of the speech, would insinuate, that the confession of Saxony approueth auricular confession and Popish absolution; but that this is false, appeareth by the words of the same confession, *Nec diuinitus mandata est*: Neither is confession of diuine institution, &c.

2. The Church of England approueth priuate confession of finnes vnto the Minister, and alloweth priuate absolution thereupon^e; and yet condemneth Popish auricular confession imposed by necessity, and requiring particular emuneration of all mortall finnes: And also, the making absolution a Sacrament of the Church; and ascribing the efficacy of remission of finnes, to the *external word* pronounced by the Priest.

Suarez^f the Iesuite saith; *That Sacraments* (among which penitentiall absolution is one) *effect grace, not onely by their forme, but also by their very matter, and that they haue a physcall efficiency, in conferring of grace, like Christs humanity*. Bosius saith^h; *They ingenerate Diuinitie, like the tree of life in Paradise, immediatly without any preuius motion or thought of mans minde, and that the Sacrament of Penance conferreth grace without any precedent disposition, more than attrition*ⁱ. And attrition according to sundry Popish Doctors, implieth no formall purpose of forsaking sinne^k, nor any sorrow either sensitiue or intellectuall for the same, but is a velleity^l, or wishing one were able to besorry for sinne and could forsake it^m; or an imperfect sorrow proceeding from feare of punishment or worldly occasions, and not from the loue of God: and according to many other Papists, is a sorrow for sinne proceeding from naturall apprehension of the punishment and deformity of sinne, and not from diuine grace.

This doctrine of Popish absolution, the Saxon confession, and the Church of England condemne: but absolution, publike or priuate, agreeable to the Scripture, both in the outward discipline of the Church, Matth 18. 18. and in the ministry of the word and Sacraments, and remission of finnes, conferred by God therein, we maintaine and iustifieⁿ.

T. W. *In like sort hee saith, that Bishops haue iurisdiction to forgive finnes.*

Ans. Touching remission of finnes, we beleue with the holy Scripture^e and the Primitiue Fathers, that Bishops and Ministers haue receiued the keyes of the kingdome of heauen, Mar. 16. 19. and by preaching the Gospell and administering the Sacraments, 1 Corin. 4. 1. they forgive finnes^d. Iohn 20. 23. 1 Cor. 4. 15. 1 Tim. 4. 16. Philem. v. 10. and wee subscribe to Saint Ambrose, saying, &c^{*}.

The difference betweene sundry Papists and vs, is touching the manner, how they remit finnes: Concerning which, we teach three things. 1. Negative: The whole authority and efficacy of taking away finnes, by way of condonation and inward purging sinne, is in God and Christ onely, Esay 43. 25. Luke 5. 21, 24. And this in former dayes was the iudgement of the

Fathers

^a Apol. Church Engl. p. 2. ch. 6. & Iueli def. pag. 141. & 149. *Abusus & erroris sit apart, we doe no more mislike priuate confession, than a priuate Sermon, Common on booke, visitation of the sick.*

^f Suarez tom. 3. d. 2. § 2.

^h Ibid. d. 9. §. Per veram & physica efficientiam, sicut humanitas Christi

ⁱ Bos. de sig. l. 1. c. 10. & 11. Non per obitum cogitationis vilius, &c. Sacramentorum vis, precedit omnibus factis & cogitatis nostris: diuinitas ingenerat tanquam arbor vitæ in Paradiso.

^k Coster. enchir. c. de penit. Sola attritione, &c. Greg. Val. to. 4. d. 7. q. 8. p. 3.

^l Vega pro conc. l. 13. c. 31. Non est necessarium ad remissionem peccatorum, propositum formale vitandi pec.

Cap. 25. Nollent patrasse, & tamen non dolent, dolere sensitiue aut intellectu. 1. Stapl. Antid. Rom. 7. v. 15. Leuis & debilis affectus, qualem scholastici velleitatem vocant. Acost. de salut. Indor. l. 6. c. 11. Mald. sum. q. 16. ar. 1. Tol. instruat. sac. l. 3. c. 5. ^m Caietan. opusc. tom. 1. tract. 4. quest. 1. Non intendit, actualiter committere pec. mortale, nec intendit mutare statum suum, quo detinetur in peccato mortali, vt patet in concubinarijs, viciarijs, &c. qui consentiunt peccata sua, displicetque ijs peccasse, habentque velleitatem relinquendi pec. non tamen deserunt concubinatum, aut restitunt vfuras, &c. & hæc displicentia cum eiusmodi velleitate Attritio dici potest, &c. est valde communis, & communiter vocatur Attritio. Est à voluntate sine charitate. Calvin. instit. l. 4. c. 11. §. 2. ⁿ Chem. exam. Concil. Trid. p. 2. pa. 221.

^e Mebr. de Clau. n. 31. in disp. Seruice booke of the Church of England in the visitation of the sick. Chem. lb. in absolutione Deus ipse per ministerium euangelij remittit pecc. singulis credentibus.

^{*} Bucer. Script. Angl. pol. ad Edw. Fox, pag. 675. nec dubitant Domini nostrum Iesum, in ecclesia sua nobis presentem, ipsumque pec. remittere in celis, dum ecclesia, eius iussu, & ministerio, peccata, remittit in terris. ^d Aug. cont. Parmen. lib. 2. cap. 11. per euangelium in cuius prædicatione Sp. sanctus operatur. Cyprian. ep. 76. n. 8. Cyprian. Alex. in Ioh. lib. 12. cap. 56.

Fathers* and principall Schoolemen^f, Saint Ambrose, speaking to the Arians, which denied, the God-head of Christ, saith as followeth; *Tu expectas veniam peccatorum? sed nemo potest donare peccata nisi solus Deus: itaque cum verus & solus Deus ego tibi non sim (ego Christus) non possum utique tua peccata donare. Thou, O Arian, expectest remission of sinnes? but none can forgive sinnes but God alone: Therefore (will Christ say) forasmuch as I am no God to thee, I am not able to pardon thy sinne.* 2. The Pastors and Ministers of Christ remit sinnes as morall instruments only: that is, 1. By coopting and preparing sinners, that they may be capable of forgiveness, & haue in them faith, repentance, & all such dispositions, as God requireth to be preuius vnto remission of sins, Mar. 16. 16. 2. As Gods Embassadors & Messengers they deliuer the holy mysteries, and heauenly scales, with the lawfull vse and receiuing wherof, God himselfe concurreth and bestoweth grace and forgiveness of sins. Thomas saith, *The Sacrament of Penance, by that operation reacheth not directly to grace or forgiveness of sins, but dispositiue.* Ferus; *Priests adhibit those things, by which God forgiveth sins, and produceth grace. Driedo; Priests when they baptise, do not effect grace and remission of sins in infants, but they performe that to which it is consequent, that God will confer grace & forgiveness.*

But sundry moderne Papists affirme, that Bishops and Priests forgive sins by the word of absolution, in such manner, as Christ wrought miracles, & forgave sins by his voice*. Job. 11. 4. 3, by a true and physcall efficiency, reaching to the very production of grace, and dissolution & destruction of sin^b. And Baronius^c saith, that God hath left vnto his Church the same power of remitting sins, which Christ as man receiued of his Father.

I. Gab. 2. d. 27. q. vnic. du. 5. Sacerdos absoluendo confitentem, pronunciat eum absolutum, non remittit pec. Scot. 4. d. 18. Sacerdotes demittunt offendendo & manifestando. Bonau. 4. d. 13. Sacerdotes habent se ad modum demonstrantis, &c. * Suar. 3. d. 9. §. 2. Per veram & physcam efficientiam, attingentia veram gratie productionem, sicut Christus sua humanitate, tangendo vel loquendo faciebat miracula. Toller. com. Luc. 5. annot. 4. 1. pari ratione procedunt potestas miraculorum & potestas remittendi pec. Char. Trid. de penit. Neg. aliter accipiendum est vox sacerdotis pec. condonantis, quam vox Christi, qui ait paralytico, Mar. 9. confide fili, remittuntur tibi pec. tua. Stapl. Antid. Ioh. 20. Remittunt pec. vere sicut Christus remisit, verbo absolutionis non prædicationis, verbo efficaci, &c. Non verbo testimonij. ^b Bel de penit. lib. 3. cap. 2. Dedit donum pec. remittendi, non concionando, &c. sed plane extinguendo, & dissolviendo. * Annal. rom. 2. anno Christi, 34. n. 197. negat Aug. tr. 5.

* Aug. cited by Lombard. lib. 4. d. 18. Nemo tollit pec. nisi solus Deus. Hieron. com. Matth. 16. & super 14. ca. Esa. Chryl. in Ioh. hom. 85. Ambros. de Cain. & Abel. l. 2. c. 4. & serm. 66 de natal. Petri & Pauli.

^f Al. Hal. 4. q. 28. M. 1. ad arg. Bonau. 4. d. 18. q. 1. Scot. 4. d. 19. ad quæst. Caietan. cō. Ioh. 20. Vis & efficacia remissionis non in discipulis, sed in Deo remittente. Altiſiodor. sum. l. 4. tr. 6. ca. 8. q. 2. Aq. 4. d. 18. ad 2. Neque sacramentum penitentiz, &c. operando pertingit directe ad gratiam, nec ad culpæ Remiss. sed dispositiue. Ferus com. Matth. 16. Ea adhibent per quæ Deus remittit. pec. & gratia dat.

T. W. Finally, not to rest upon euery particular, wee finde there: We doe not speake of the Church, as if wee should speake of Platons Idea, but of such a Church as may be seene and heard, &c. The eternall Father will haue his Sonne to be heard among all mankind.

Ans^w. 1. All the Orthodox Protestants beleue this doctrine; to wit, that the Church by the ordinance of Christ ought to be a visible society, (and not a Platonicall Idea) of people professing the Gospell of Christ sincerely, &c. But ab officio, from that which ought to bee, to the being it selfe, it alwayes followeth not: and by the frailty and error of man, and especially by the tyranny of Antichrist, it hath hapned that the Church for certaine ages hath wanted some part of this perfection; and yet in the mistie darknesse of superstition, God preserved some Pastors and people visibly professing the truth of religion, in the foundation, though the same were infected with error and superstition in other points. And the state of the question, betweene you and vs, is not, whether there bee alwaies vpon earth a visible Church: but concerning the manner of the visibilitie; whereof I haue treated before^c.

T. W. Now I appeale to Master White, whether there bee in these points, any concordance betweene the Harmony of confessions, and English Protestants, Calvinists, &c.

Ans^w. Your appeale to Master White is ridiculous, and only vsed for oftenration: for you haue not produced so much as one particular instance, of any doctrine taught by the Church of England, repugnant to these points deliuered in the Harmony of confessions; and therefore you may rather appeale to that blacke one, who set you a worke in this businesse, than to Master White, who can obserue nothing but darknesse and folly in you. His niger est, &c.

Vntrush

* Part. 1. Ch. 3. prægr. 2. obseruat. touching Churches visibilitie.

Vntruth 5. *Wherein D. White is accused, for affirming of an immutabilitie of the faith of the present English Church.*

T. W. *Master White insisteth in his supposed constancie of religion here in England, and thus writeth: If the Iesuite can shew the Church of England, since Papistray was first abolished, to haue altered one article of the present faith now professed, I am content, &c.*

For the disproofe of this falshood, we will conuince the same, by discovering the manifold and weightiest alterations of our publike English Liturgie, since the first entrance of Protestancie into England.

^a *Posseuin. Appar. v. Missale & verb. Breviarium. Reads D. Rainold. against Hart, ch. 8. diuif. 2. pag. 412. Platina vit. Sixt. 1.*

Ans. Master White speaketh of the alteration of faith, saying, It is not enough to say, we varie, vlesse he can make true demonstration that the variance is in faith: and you proue a change in Liturgie, and forme of Service; not remembering that your selues haue changed your Breviaries, Portelles, and Missals, more than once euen of late yeeres^a.

T. W. *The Service booke of King Edward, published by Crammer, P. Martyr, and Bucer, and confirmed by Parliament, keeps almost all the praiers and ceremonies of the Masse, with crossing of both their Sacraments, and the accustomed rites of Baptisme, as a formall consecration of the water of Baptisme with the signe of the Crosse, the vsing of Chrisme, and the anointing of the childe. Againe, it retained praier for the dead, and the offering up of our praiers by the intercession of Angels. But when Queene Elizabeth came in, the Liturgie was so altered, that it tooke away praier to Angels, most of the ceremonies: Baptisme by lay persons, and grace giuen thereby; Confirmation of children, and strength giuen thereby; The Priests blessing the Bride and Bridegroom with the signe of the Crosse; The Priests absolution; The speciall confession of the sicke penitent; and the anointing of the sicke.*

^b *Bucer. Script. Angl. p. 418.*

^c *An. 48 for vniu. formis of prayer, anno 5 & 6. Edm. 6. printed by William Whitchurch, 1552.*

^d *Chem. loc. com. p. 1. de angelis, Offerunt orationes nostras Deo. Bernard. ferm. 3. sup. missus est. & in Cant. ser. 7. Aug. epist. 130. Reads D. Field of the Church, lib. 3. cap. 17.*

*Ans. 1. The first Service Booke of King Edward was not altogether approved by Bucer, and Peter Martyr, as you report, but in some things reprobred, as the censure of Bucer^b vpon the same doth declare. Secondly, it was rather accepted of the Protestants by tolleration, because at first they could obtaine no more, than by an absolute approbation. Thirdly, the same was changed and reformed, and those things which you name, were left out of the said Liturgie, by another Edition thereof, established in the fift yeere of Edward the sixt^c. And that later Service Booke of King Edward, is in substance all one with the Service Booke of Queene Elizabeth. And thus since King Edwards reigne, there hath beene no materiall alteration of the English Service Booke. Fourthly, the particulars wherewith you charge the first English Service Booke, are some of them not found in the same, to wit, *Inuocation of Angels*; for the Booke mentioneth intercession of Angels, Reuel. 8. 3. Tob. 12. 12^d. but no inuocation.*

2. The said booke prescribeth not Popish praying for the dead, with reference to Purgatorie^e, but praier of gratulation and thanksgiuing, and request for the happy resurrection of the bodies, and remission of sinnes at the day of iudgement, by an open and solempne application and promulgation of the sentence of remission. 3. The anointing of the sicke with oyle, was not vsed as a Sacrament, according to your doctrine, but as an adiaphorous rite: and the same was tollerated for the present, as the Apostles winked at the Legals, vntill the

the truth of the Gospell was fully reuealed. 4. The other ceremonies named by you, were retained in the infancie of reformation for outward peace, and being in their nature contingent and mutable, it was in the Churches liberty to alter or take them away.

And thus, as my Brother affirmed, there was neuer since Protestancie first came in, any alteration in substance, or in the maine bodie of doctrine and religion in the Church of England, but either in ceremonie or in lesser points of faith, which deserue no more to be called a change of faith, than the putting off old garments a transmutation of the substance of mans bodie ^f.

Lastly, whereas you produce Master Parker and Master Cartwright, testifying the change of our English Seruice booke, and requiring new alterations.

1. If these men had beene peaceable and friends to the Church wherein they were bred, their testimonie might haue stood you in some stead. 2. But being, as they were, both you and they may take notice, if you please, that the Church of England is not carried about with euery blast; and rather wisheth you to change your mindes, and cease to rend the vnseamed coat of Christ ^g, than vnjustly to depraue the religion, against which you haue nothing solid or effectually to oppose.

^f Aug. epist. 86.
Ea quoque ueris,
&c.

^g Cypr. de unit.
eccles. n. 5.
Qui pacem Christi
& concordiam
rumpit, aduersus

Christum facit. n. 16. In euangelio, tunica Domini nostri Christi non diuiditur omnino, nec scinditur: possidere non potest indu-
mentum Christum qui scindit & diuidit ecclesiam Christi. Greg. Nazian. orat. 1. de pace, Τὴν ἀντικρίστον, ἣ ἀμείνων, ἣ ὑπερὶν ὅλ-
λων χριστὸν κατασκευάσας ἡ πνεῦμα, &c. Ambros. de sp. sanct. l. 1. c. 20. Sanctum ecclesiae vestimentum impietate sua scindunt, &c.

Vntruth 6. *Dofter White accused for deliuering an vntruth, concerning the
Romane Churches mutabilitie, in matters of faith.*

T. W. *He confidently auerreth, that the Church of Rome is varied from
her selfe in matters of faith, since shee began to be the seat of Antichrist, &c.*

Ans. Master White affirmeth, that the moderne Church of Rome is varied from her selfe in matters of faith, (to wit, in some, not generally in all or in euery one) and he nameth in the place alleaged by you, fise points, wherein the same hath changed. Also he saith, it is varied from that it beleued formerly, (namely, before it was the seat of Antichrist) and since the time it began to be so. But T. W. pareth off the limitation of D. Whites speech, and produceth him auering in generall and confusedly, a mutabilitie of the Romish beleefe; and accordingly he disputeth against him; prouing a perpetuities of faith in some points, (which is not denied) whereas he ought to haue defended a perpetuity in all, at least in those fise examples alleaged by his aduersarie. Also, he should haue ascended higher, and proued his perpetuities, as well before as after the arising of Antichrist. But he perceiued that this was too hot for him, and thereupon he chuseth rather to beat the aire, and proceed as followeth.

T. W. *The most receiued opinion of the Protestants, touching Antichrists
comming, is, That S. Gregorie the Great was the first Antichrist. And
Augustine the Monke professing the same religion with him, and planting it in
England, it is confessed by D. Humphrey, that the said doctrine containeth the
chiese points wherein we differ from the sectaries of these times, &c.*

Ans. 1. The most receiued opinion of the Protestants, is, that Gregory the Great was not Antichrist: The definition of Antichrist, (saith our learned Sonnius ⁱ) agrees to the Romane Pope, after the death of Gregorie the Great, and after the murder of Mauritian. And the most receiued opinion of all Pro-

ⁱ Sonn. disp. de
Antichristo, n. 47.

testants,

1. Plat. Bonifacius
3. a Phoca Imperatore obtinuit, magna tamen contentione, ut sedes B. Petri, quæ caput est omnium ecclesiarum, tradideretur ab omnibus. Beda de 6. ætat. mundi. Paul. Diacon. hist. Longob. l. 4. c. 21. Abbas Viperg. in Phoca. 1. Greg. lib. 4. epist. 36. Ipse est rex super omnes filios superbiz. l. 6. epist. 30.

Ego fidenter dico, quisquis se universalem facere docet vocat aut vocare desiderat, in elatione sua Antichristum præcurrit, &c. 1. 5. c. 18.

Puer dici potest homo, secundum quid, si ad virum perfectum comparatur. d. Espenc. com. 1. Tim. digress. l. 2. c. 7. p. 275. * Plat. in Paschal. 2. Episcopus Florentinus affirmavit Antichristum natum esse. Sabel. A. nead. 9. l. 4. Auentin. annal. l. 7. Hildebrandus ante annos 170. primus, specie religionis Antichristi imperii fundamenta iecit. Matth. Paris. chron. Angl. in Henr. 3. Robertus Episcopus Lincolnienfis: Nonne Antichristus merito dicendus est, &c. * Greti. def. Bel. de verb. Dei, de summo Pope, agur authenticæ ac Scripturæ. P. Cluniac. lib. 1. ep. 2. Eius testimonius sicut Apostolicus, absque vlla contradictione, acquiescendum est. P. Papir. Massin. de episc. vrb. in Leo. 10. ex Longolio. Te non tam quasi Pontif. Maximum, quam ut principem Romanum, id est, Regum omnium plane regem, &c.

1. Iesuitism. p. 3. Rat. 5. pag. 627. * Centur. 6. Index, at the word, Gregory.

testants, is, that the Romane Pope began (and yet but in part) to be Antichrist, when by the donation of the parricide Phocas^k, he tooke vnto him the title and authoritie of vniuersall Bishop, formerly condemned as Antichristian by Gregorie the first^l: But yet as a babe and suckling differs from a strong man, and (according to your Bellarmine) is a man, *secundum quid*^m: So your Pope became not a perfect Antichrist, vntill the direfull monster, Gregorie 7. and after him Paschalis 2. Adrian 4. Alexander 3. Boniface the 8. of hissing Snakes, turned into fiery Dragons. In those daies the Pope became a perfect Antichristⁿ, playing the hypocrite and tyrant in the Church, by these foure actions: 1. Exalting himselfe as a King and Monarch ouer the house of God. 2. Making his owne word and definition of equall authoritie with the holy Scripture^o. 3. Vsurping temporall iurisdiction ouer Kings and Ciuill states^p. 4. Cruelly murdering the seruants of Christ which denied obedience to his traditions and tyrannie.

Secondly, concerning Gregorie the Great, we beleue that he was superstitious in diuers things, and entertained some erroneous conceits, which in processe of time became scandalls, and occasioned others to erre more dangerously: yet we denie that himselfe was Antichrist, either generally, or in the principall articles maintaining the same doctrine, which our Aduersaries at this present doe.

T. W. D. Humphrey^q, chargeth Augustine the Monke with many Popish opinions, which he receiued from Gregory: and the Centuries^r tax Gregory with Popish and erroneous doctrine in sundry articles.

Ans. It is true, that Gregory maintained diuers superstitious opinions, which in processe of time, by his followers, were intended or increased, vntill they became Antichristian: but he maintained no capitall article of Popery in such manner as the same is now professed. But admit that sundry of his opinions were Popish, yet this disproueth not D. Whites assertion, affirming that the Romane Church is varied from it selfe, as it was in the prime age, and as it held since it became Antichristian; for besides these points, specified by you, there be sundry other wherein the said Church is varied from it selfe, to wit, the Supremacie, Adoration of Images, Communion in one kinde, the perfection of the Scripture, &c.

T. W. But all this ariseth from an inward repugning of the Minister against our Church, in regard of the vchangeable certaintie and constancie of faith professed by her: whereas the want thereof in our Aduersaries religion is most notorious; as appeareth not onely from their seuerall confessions, one euer impugning another, but also from their different translations of their Bibles, still made to sort with their faith, of the last edition, &c.

Ans. 1. Touching your concord and the Protestants supposed discord, we shall inquire in the sections^s following. 2. To your obiection taken from diuersitie or translations, whereupon you would inferre a mutabilitie of faith, I answer: 1. The primitive Fathers approoued variety of translations, and themselves did frame and publish them. Saint Augustine saith; *They who haue tran-*

^s Vnder 7. & 7.

^t Aug. de doctr. Christ. li. 2. c. 11. Quæ quidem res, plus adiuuit intelligentiam, quam impediuit. Ioh. Arbor. Theosoph. com. 1. l. 3. c. 11. Sacra litera olim verba erant in vulgarem linguam, & eas Hieronymus in Dalmaticam linguam vertit.

placed

stated the Hebrew into Greeke may be numbred, but the Latine interpreters are innumerable, which thing bath rather holpen vnderstanding than hindered it. Origen's great worke of compacting together the originall texts, with diuers translations, was highly commended by the primitiue Church^u. And when Saint Hierom after many other translated the Scriptures, who reprobued him but ignorance or malice? Secondly, many learned Papists, to wit, Augustine Nebiensis, Pagnine, Vatablus, Arius Montanus, the Doctors of Rheims, and others in France, Poland and Germanie, haue translated the Scriptures, some into Latine, and some into other languages^x. Thirdly, whereas you calumniare, saying, that we translate partially, and with correspondence to our faith of the last edition, who (as Augustine^{*} speaketh) can hinder the forge of a seduced heart, to forme what fancie it listeth? and your tongues and pens are your owne, &c. Psalme 12. 4.

^u Epiphani. hzref. 64. in principio. Sixtus Sement. Bibl. l. 3. Hexapla. Octopla.

^x Sixt. Sement. bibl. l. 3. de Translatione. Posteuin. biblioth. l. 2. c. 12. ^{*} Aug. in Psal. 80.

But for the thing it selfe: 1. The originall texts are extant to reprove vs, if we goe awry.

2. There be many precedent translations, Greeke, Caldie, Latine, and the primitiue Fathers, and other Doctors of the Church, as guides to goe before vs: also the skilfull Linguists of euery age, would controll vs, if we should deale corruptly.

3. Touching matters in controuersie, we freely offer to be iudged by former translations vsed by the Fathers, and by the translations of Pagnine and Vatablus being Papists.

4. If the old Latine translation be authentickall^y, why haue so many Popish Doctors impeached the credit thereof? Cardinall Caietan^z, the learnedst of his age, saith, *The vulgar edition of the New Testament is many times unfaithfull, or not to be trusted.* Iohannes Campensis the Hebrew Professor at Louan^a; *The vulgar translation is unworthy to be accounted Saint Hieroms:* and Vega,^b *It was neuer the intent of the Trent Councell to make the same authentickall.*

^y Trid. Conc. sess. 4. decret. 2. ^z Prefat. in Matth. ^a Prefat. in Psal. ^b Vega pro Conc. Trid. l. 5. c. 9.

T. W. In respect of their wonderfull mutabilitie, and variance among themselues, whereby they indignifie and wrong the nature of true faith, we haue reason to demand of any of the professors, of what thinking he is, rather than of what faith.

Ans. 1. Behold the miserie of one blinded with superstition and partiality: God neuer giues him grace to looke backe to his owne faith, which cannot possibly exceed the nature of opinion, depending onely vpon humane traditions and fables^c, and the credit of a deceiueable Pope^d. And on the contrary, the faith of our Church is builded vpon the foundation of the Prophets and Apostles, and resolu'd into the very hand-writing of the most true God^e, and receiued from thence by the sacred meanes which Christ hath left to search out the truth by, can be nothing else but Christian Orthodox, and infallible faith. Secondly, if famous Papists themselues say true, times haue beene, not long since, wherein diuers of the Court of Rome haue not had so much as an opinion of the truth of Christian faith: for thus writeth Petrarch the Arch-deacon of Parma^f; *Faith, charitie, hope of eternall life, and those things which are reported of hell, &c. are reputed fabulous and trifling toys among these men.*

^c Gers. de sig. Rum. eccles. sig. 8. Fabulæ & non sanz doctrine sunt, quæ nen in reuelatione Spiritus Sancti, sed secundum traditionem hominum consistunt. ^d Can. loc. l. 5. c. 5. Negat ex fide certum esse quod Pontifex errare non possit. Hadrian. 4. de sacr. Confirm. p. 26. Certum est quod possit errare. Alph. Castro cont.

in iis quæ tangunt fidem hæresim per suam determinationem aut decretalem asserendo. Concil. Basil. Resp. synodal. hzr. l. 1. c. 4. Non credo aliquem esse adeo impudentem adulatorem Papæ, vt ei tribuere velit ne errare possit. Gerson. de pot. eccles. l. 8. 11. ^e Aug. in Psal. 144. Chirographum Dei, quod omnes transeuntes legerent. ^f Fra. Petrarch. ep. 13. Fabelosa omnia, &c. Inter nuntias habentur, &c. Conrad. Clingius lo. com. lib. 3. cap. 52. Sacram scripturam reputant fabulas, & in ea mediantes iudicant phantasticos.

Vntrech 7. Touching Protestants concord in matters of Religion.

^a Medit. in Psal.
132.
^b De ecclef. q. 5.
c. 2.
^c Cont. Louan.
thes. 27. & tom. 7.
Witcomb. pa. 381.
&c. Et tom. 2.
Germ. de corna
Dom. p. 174.

T. W. Dissentions among the Protestants, are not meere personall, or about points adiaphorou, but they concerne most profound doubts of their religion: since otherwise they would neuer anathematize or condemne one another with such acerbities of words. And it is affirmed by D. Willet ^a, D. Whitaker ^b, and Luther ^c, that the differences are not in small points of government and ceremony, &c.

^a Sect. 33. n. 2.
^b Tho. Aqu. 2. 2.
q. 29. ar. 3. ad. 2.
^c Aug. de ciu. Dei.
l. 15. c. 5. Profici-
entis nondumque
perfecti inter se
pugnare possunt,
&c. Driedo l. 1. de
ecclef. dogmat. c.
4. pa. 20. col. 2.
^d Digress. 2. 1.
^e Stapl. Rel. c. 1.
q. 3. ar. 6. notab. 1.
& 2.
^f Vide Clem. Alex.
l. 7. Strom. Cum
veritas sit ardua &
difficilis, prope-
rea fuerunt quæ-
siones, &c.
Aug. enchirid. ca.
59. Non inutiliter
exerceatur inge-
nia, si adhibeatur
disceptatio mode-
rata, & absit error
opinionum se
scire quod nesci-
unt.
^g Aqu. 2. 2. q. 2.
ar. 5.
^h Stapl. Rel. c. 1.
q. 3. ar. 6. Licet &
uile est, de rebus
difficilibus in ec-
clesiam aliter atq;
aliter disputare,
nec hoc unitatem
violat, sed veritatē
illustrat.
ⁱ Euseb. vita Con-
stant. l. 1. c. 40. & l.
3. c. 12. Socrat. hist.
l. 1. c. 3. Sozomen.
hist. l. 1. c. 15.
Chrys. in 1. c. Gal.
Desiderio facti
sumus & gentibus,
& Iudeis, dum ec-
clesia in mille par-
tes scinditur.
^k De ciuic. Dei,
l. 15. c. 5.
^l Aug. in Psal. 3.
^m Aug. cont. Ia-
lian. l. 1. c. 2.

Ans. 1. Master White acknowledgeth, that there be differences and iars among the Protestants ^a. 2. He denieth that there is any such discord, or difference among them as dissolueth the vnitie of faith, essentiall to the true Church. 3. The difference among the Protestants is no other, than such as hath formerly beene in the true Church of Christ ^b, since the Apostles age. 4. Comming home to the Church of England, he affirmeth that there is no contrarietie or iars betweene the same and other Protestant Churches; or at home in it selfe, in points of faith, meaning (according to Stapleton ^c, and Thomas ^d their distinction) in primitiue articles of faith, or about things essentiall in the obiekt of faith. But the difference is either in accidentall, probable, and secondarie points, or touching things difficult in religion ^e, for the searching out of the veritie whereof, it is profitable, that learned men proceeding modestly, dispute pro and con^f. Or else the disagreement is personall, either among priuate men, or raised by priuate men, schismatically and factiously against the Church.

Now what hath D. Whires aduersarie to except against this? 1. If he dispute the question of vnitie in it selfe, the Scripture, and Fathers, and the Historie of the Church will conuince him, that vnitie in the substance of faith and religion obserued by the firmest members of the Church, is simply necessarie and an essentiall propertie; and other vnitie is of the perfection and well-being of the Church, and yet contingent and variable, sometimes greater, sometimes lesse, and at no time absolute in all the parts: and the same many times by reason of the malice of wicked imps, is greatly wanting. In the daies of Constantine, wherein it is acknowledged by all men, that the visible societie of Christians was a true Church, there hapned so greuous and vnseemly contentions among the Bishops and Pastors, that the discord of Christians was brought vpon the stage, and religion derided and traduced by Infidels ^g.

Saint Augustine acknowledgeth that the concord of godly men in this life, wherein they are not perfect, but proficient, is sometimes interrupted with discord, and dissention ariseth euen among brethren ^h and Saints ⁱ. And there be diuers things, (saith he) wherein the best learned and most worthy defenders of the Catholike rule, without preiudice to the bodie of faith, doe not accord, and one of them speaketh more truly than another of the same thing ^j.

2. The Popish Priest endeououring to impeach the truth of D. Whires assertion in matter of fact, and concerning his report of the concord of the Church of England, proceedeth insufficiently in two respects.

1. He relateth his assertion imperfectly, omitting diuers branches thereof, as appeareth by my former collection out of D. White, compared with this mangled relation of the Popish Priest.

2. The testimonies produced out of D. Willer, D. Whitaker, and Luther, containe no more than my Brother acknowledgeth. 1. D. Willer blameth some priuate men, to wit, Master Hooker, &c. (how iustly, let him selfe vpon second thoughts reuise:) for singular and new opinions. Secondly, he taxeth the Puritanes, for disturbing the peace of the Church about ceremonies. This censure

sure of D. Willer opposeth not my Brother, hauing for the generall affirmed the same; and such differences destroy not the vnitie of the Church, for two reasons. 1. The latter strue, but preuaile not: and therefore euen as a furious assault against an Armie strongly keeping his order and rankes; or waues beating against a rocke and dissolued into froth; so these blasts* and waisting encounters being resisted, vanish into nothing, the bodie and firme parts of the Church, like an inuincible Armie and immouable rocke, still persisting in vnitie. 2. The contrary disputations of priuate men, about hard questions of Theologie, impeach not the vnitie of the Church any more, than the contrary pleading of Lawyers, subuerteth the publike concord of the State.

D. Whitakers speaketh of oppositions and contentions, vied by learned men in disputation for the finding out of the truth, and increasing knowledge, and which your selues maintaine to be lawfull and profitable.

Luthers personall and frefull speeches, proceeding from passion against such as were contrary minded to him, proue that godly men haue infirmities, and are sometimes ouer bitter one against another: like as Cyprian was against Pope Stephen, calling him proud, ignorant, and of a blinde and wicked minde; and Epiphanius against Chrysostome, &c. But they are insufficient to demonstrate that Protestant Churches want the note of vnitie; neither doth condemning and anathematizing one another, imply dissention in profound points of religion, but may proceed from affection and want of charitie, as appeareth by Pope Victor, proclaiming anathema against the East Churches about an adiaphorous ceremonie; by Pope Stephen, and by Sergius, condemning their predecessor Formosus, and raking him being defunct, out of his graue, &c.

* Cyprian. de vnit. eccles. Triticum non rapit ventus, nec arborē solida radice fundatam procella subuertit: inanes paleæ tempestas iactantur, inualidæ arbores tempestatis incurſione subuertuntur. Et lib. de mortal. Arbor quæ alta radice fundata est, ventis incumbentibus non mouetur; & nauis quæ forti compage solidata est, pulsatur fluctibus, sed non foratur, & quando aræ fruges terit, ventos grana fortia & robusta contemunt, inanes paleæ flau portante rapiuntur.

o See August. ep. 19 de ciu. Dei, lib. 11. c. 19. De doct. Christi. lib. 1. c. 36. De Gen. ad lit. c.

18. Hieron. ep. 13. p. Bellar. de Pontif. lib. 4. cap. 7. q. Socrat. hist. lib. 6. cap. 17. Niceph. lib. 13. cap. 17. & 21. Chryf. 2. Cor. hom. 17. Nomina fratrum habemus, opera autem hostium: & membra omnes dicimus, & sicut bestie dissidemus. 1. Euseb. hist. 1. 5. c. 23. Niceph. hist. lib. 4. c. 28. Socrates hist. lib. 5. cap. 21. o The iuane Eusebii de iustis & iustis de iustis, &c. pag. 249. f. Luip. de vitis Pontif. Rom. in Formoso. Martin. Polon. in Sergio 3. Formosum ē sepulchro extractum, & in sede Pontificali sacerdotiliter indutum, decollari præcepit, & in Tiberim iactari, & omnes per ipsum ordinatos deordinauit, &c.

Vntruth 8. Touching the disagreement of Papists in their faith.

T. W. The Doctor seeing his owne synagogue torne in sunder with diuisions and contentions, and well knowing how preiudiciall the want of vnitie is to the true religion of Christ, (for God is not a God of dissention, but of peace) doth maliciously endeuour to cast the like aspersions upon our Catholike Church, saying; They which know Rome and Papistrie, are sufficiently satisfied in this matter, to wit, that the Papists liue not in that vnitie which is pretended: and he saith, The contentions of our Aduersaries touch the faith, and, The Papists are diuided about the principall articles of the faith. But contrary to this, D. Whitaker, D. Fulke, and Duditius, acknowledge our vnitie and consent in the mysteries, and other fundamentall points of religion, &c. And Catholikes must needs haue vnitie, because they follow not their owne iudgement, but the supreme resolution and current of the Church.

Ans. 1. I haue maintained in the former section, that the Church of England hath as great vnitie as the primitiue Church had, and wanteth nothing of that vnitie which is essentiall and necessarie to the being of the Church; and in regard of the maine bodie and principall parts, our Church enioyeth as perfect

fect vnitie, euen in government, order, and the accidentall branches of faith, as any true Church of Christ vpon earth: neither is it distracted and torne asunder, as you declaime, but is an vnanimous societie, according in the faith of the Scripture, and in the faith and orderly government of the primitiue Church.

2. Your testimonie taken out of the Apostle, to wit, God is not a God of dissention, but of peace, 1 Cor. 14. 33. concludeth not as you would haue it, that there can be no discord in a true Church: for then the like assertion, to wit, God is not the author of pride or enuie, but of humilitie and charitie, would proue that there can be no pride or enuie in the true Church, Phil. 1. 15.

3. D. White affirming, that your contentions touch the faith, and are in the principall articles of faith, &c. explicateth himselfe, saying *1*, *Your difference is in all the points of religion, wherein you differ from vs, and wherein Papistry properly consisteth*. If therefore the matters in which you and we differ, be articles of faith, as your Doctōrs affirme *2*; and the Trent Councell pronouncing anathema *3* to the deniers, seemes to declare: then D. White deliuered no more than what he confirmed by many particular instances, which you make no haste to answer.

4. The contrary testimonies produced by you, doe not proue against D. White that Papiſts haue no contentions *4*, (for your Doctōrs proclaime them in euery question which they handle, as appeareth by Suarez, Henriquez, Vasques, Azorius, &c.) but that you haue one kinde of vnitie, to wit, a superstitious and hypocriticall crouching to the Popes tribunall, which Protestants detest. But what can this auaille you, when the Turkes at this day and the obstinate Iewes, are found as vnanimous in their sects as you are in your Popish superstition? And neuer boast of externall vnitie *5*, vnlesse (as Gregorie Nazianzen *6* speaketh) you can proue the same *to be in good, and for God*.

1 Digress. 24. n. 19.

2 Bellar. prefat. oper. prefixa.

Agendum est non de rebus leuibus, sed de grauiss. questionibus, quæ ad ipsa fidei fundamenta pertinent, &c.

3 Grat. cauf. 11. q. 3. c. Nemo &c.

Al. Hal. 4. q. 31. m. 1. Gabr. can.

Miss. lect. 26.

Anathema æternæ

mortis est damnatio, quod non nisi

pro mortali, &c.

4 Gerſ. defect. vi.

ror. eccles. n. 54.

Fides est debilis, virtus imperfecta, schismatici abund.

Chumel. disp. var. ad. 1. 2. d. 4. p. 50.

Res quæ in hac quarta disp. à nobis proponitur differenda continet difficultatem, quæ in ore om-

nium, hodierna die versatur de auxilio sufficienti & efficaci. In qua re multi, tam multa dixerunt, vt vix quid vnusquisque sentiat dicere possimus. Bonavent. 2. d. 26. q. 2. n. 14.

Circa hanc questionem sapientes opinantur contrarium sapientibus. Ruard. Tap. art. 7. Difficultates istæ, obscuræ sunt & perplexæ, circa quas Doctores nostro seculo, contra hæreses scribentes varia sentiunt, & contrarias sequuntur opiniones.

5 Greg. mor. li. 34. ca. 2. Hostis malignus, sibi in peruerso opere, à primis vsque ad extrema concordat &c. sic peruersa vnanimiter sentiunt, vt nulla contra se vicissim disputatione diuidantur. Nulla eos diuersitatis altercatio scindit, & idcirco contra bonos vehementer prævalent, quia in male se concorditer tenent. cap. 3.

Leuiathan contra electos, ad augmentum suæ malitiæ, vnitatem in reprobis habere permittitur, vt tanto contra nos robustius vires suas exerceat, quanto non solum nos idem fortitudinis, sed etiam mole adnationis impugnat. Si malorum vnitatis noxia non fuisset, nequaquam diuina providentia, superbientium linguas in tanta diuersitate dissipasset. Gen. 10.

Hilar. con. Auxent. Pulchra opinio vnitatis, sed quæ euangelii & Christi est. Aug. de verb. Dei, ser. 6. Hæretici, Iudæi & Pagani, vnitatem fecerunt contra vnitatem.

6 Orat. 1. 2. in ioh. bapt. 2. 2. &c. pag. 118. gr.

Vntruth 9. Touching the Popes supremacie.

T. W. *The Doctōr writeth in his 27. digression thus: The primitiue Church did not acknowledge the Popes supremacie. Here I see Master White will euer be Master White. I meane, that he will be euer like vnto himselfe, first in coyning, and after in maintaining most impudent vntruths, &c.*

Ans. My Brother did not onely write, that the primitiue Church acknowledged not Papall primacie, but confirmed the same with weighty authorities, all which you cowardly dissemble and ouerlook; and yet to salue the credit of your cause, you bandy words, and then (skipping ouer the premises and proofes,) assault the conclusion with certaine broken testimonies: but that the imbecillitie of your proceeding may the better appeare, first I will deliuer the state of the question, and then examine your proofes.

The mysterie of Papall primacie challenged by your late Doctōrs, is, That the

the Pope is a visible monarch over all the militant Church^a. And his monarchie implies these particulars: 1. That all Ecclesiasticall power both of order and iurisdiction, is deriued from him to all other Bishops and Pastors of the Church^b. 2. That he hath a proper and direct authoritie over all the Christians in the world, both ecclesiasticall and secular^c, the principall actions whereof, are these following.

1. To frame and set out for all Christians the rule of faith and good manners^d: to point out the bookes of Canonickall Scripture and the traditionarie word^e, and to deliuer the sense and interpretation hereof, and to conclude and to determine all controuersies of religion with an inerring sentence.

2. To prescribe and enact lawes to the whole Church, equally obliging the conscience to obedience with the diuine law^f.

3. To exercise externall power of directing and commanding^g as aforesaid; and also of censure and correction over all Christians. To grant dispensations, indulgences, absolution from oaths^h, vowes, &c. To canonize Saints, institute religious Orders, deliuer from Purgatorieⁱ, to call and confirme generall Councils^k, to dethrone and conculcate Kings^l, &c.

And this is the Popes primacie which Doctor White affirmeth, that the primitive Church did not acknowledge.

^a Bellar. Recog de sum. Pontif. ex illis verbis, Ioh. 21. Paſce oues meas, collegi authoritatē imperandi regio more. Bos. de fig. l. 18. c. 1.

^b Bellar. de eccles.

l. 3. c. 5.

Bonauent. p. 6.

Breuillog. ca. 12.

Grat. d. 19. c. ita Dominus.

P. Blesensis ep. 45.

Durand. 4. d. 24.

q. 5. Ali. Pelag. de pl. in eccles. lib. 1.

ar. 38.

^c Bald. proem. de-

cretal n. 6. Est Do-

minus Dominorū,

& quacunque po-

testas est sub celo,

est in summo Pon-

tifice. Ioh. Bromi-

ard. sum. pradic.

c. 17.

^d Bellar. de Pontif.

l. 4. c. 1. Gress. def.

ib. pag. 1015.

^e Azer. instit. mor. 2. l. 5. c. 4. Stapl. dupl. l. 2. c. 10. §. 3. • Gregor. 7. ap. Baron. 11. anno 1076. n. 33. Nullum capitulum, nullumque liber canonicus habetur absque eius autoritate. Zanc. Iustinian. de obed. cap. 12. Ioh. Capistran. de author. Pap. & Concil. fol. 93. ^f Bellar. de Pontif. l. 4. c. 15. ^g Azer. instit. mor. 2. l. 5. c. 3. ^h Id. part. 1. l. 11. c. 9. Syluest. sum. v. iuramentū. Lesseus de instit. aur. l. 2. c. 42. dub. 12. Gratian. c. 15 q. 6. c. Nos sanctorum. Baron. 11. ann. 1076. n. 33. ⁱ Azer. 2. l. 5. c. 26. ^j Ib. lib. 4. ca. 13. ^k Stapl. Rel. c. 3. q. 5. ar. 2. conclus. 6. Potest nouos principes facere & alios tollere. Baron. an. 1076. n. 33. Azer. 2. l. 10. c. 2. & l. 4. c. 19. Extra de maior. & obed. c. Vnam sanctam. Gloss. in fine.

T. W. The Popes, by the acknowledgment of our learned Adversaries, did in the 400 yeere after Christ (which age for wisdom and grauitie, is most approved by the graue iudgement of the Kings Maiestie^m) exercise authoritie and soueraigntie over all other Churches. This appeareth by Iulius Bishop of Rome, who, as Cartwright writeth^a, over-reached in claiming the hearing of causes that did not appertaine vnto him: and of Damasus he shamed not to write, that the Bishop of Romes sentence, was aboue all other to be attended for in a Synod.

^m Confer. before bñ
Mausius, pag. 97.

ⁿ Reply 2. p. 1. pag.
501, 502.

Ans^r. Omitting your cleanly skipping ouer the first 300 yeeres of the primitive Church, colouring the matter with a speech of his Maiesties, &c. I answer to the testimonie of Master Cartwright, 1. That this Writer (such as he is) affirmeth not that Pope Iulius or Damasus, enioyed the supremacie vsurped by later Popes: but he saith of Pope Celestine, That as Iulius had done at the Council of Antioch, so he over-reached in claiming the hearing of causes which appertained not vnto him. And of Damasus, That he shamed not to write, that the Bishop of Romes sentence was aboue all other to be attended in a Synod.

But first your consequent from claiming to hauing, is claudicant; for Pope Paul the first claimeth many things at this day, which the Church of Christ will no more yeeld him, than the African Churches formerly yeelded Zosimus and Celestine their claime^o. 2. The soueraigntie claimed by these Popes, was not the same which moderne Popes challenge.

^o Concil. Affric.
ca. 101.
^p Reade Bishop
Bilson against the
Iesuites apol. p. 43.
Theod. Balsamon.
Nomenclat. tit. 8.
Socrat. hist. l. 2. c.
5. & 13. Trip. hist.
hist. l. 4. c. 9. Sozō
hist. l. 1. c. 9. Ni-
ceph. hist. l. 9. c. 5.
& l. 11. c. 13.
Reade Iewel
def. pag. 470.
Whitak. de script.
pag. 325.

T. W. Saint Hierom speaking of Damasus, saith; I following none chiefe but Christ, hold the fellowship of communion with your Blessednesse, that is, with Peters chaire; vpon that rocke I know the Church to be built, whosoever shall eat the Paschall Lambe out of that house, is a prophane person, &c. whosoever gathereth not with you scattereth^q.

^q Hieron. ep. 12.

^r *Reads B. Biffon of subject, p. 60. D. Rainold ag. H. ch. 7. d. 8. & ch. 8. diuis. 6. Erasmi. schol. Hieron ep. 57. Super illam petram: non super Romanam: nā fieri potest, ut Roma quoque degeneret: sed super eam fidem quam Petrus professus est, & hæc ætæ Romana seruauit ecclesia. Hieron. l. 1. cont. Iouinian. Dicis, super Petrum fundatur ecclesia, licet idipsum in alio loco, supra omnes Apostolos fiat. Ioh. Arbor. to. 1. Theoph. l. 5. c. 5.*

^r *Centur. 5. c. 10. 1014.*

Ans. Saint Hierom consulting with Damasus about the doctrine of the Trinitie, which was opposed at this present by the Arrians, professeth that he holdeth communion with him, being his Bishop and Ordinarie, and who succeeded Peter in the chaire; that is, in the ministerie and teaching of wholesome doctrine. 2. He saith, that the Church was built vpon the rocke of heauenly doctrine and veritie; first taught by Peter & the other Apostles, and now professed by Damasus. 3. That whosoever varieth from this doctrine, and the communion of Damasus now professing the same, is a prophane person and enemy of Christ. But how doe these things proue such a Supremacie as our Aduersaries desire?

T. W. The Centuries acknowledge, that Theodorit a Greeke Father, being deposed by the Councell of Ephesus, making his appeale to Pope Leo, was by him restored to his Bishopricke: And Chrysostome appealed to Innocentius, who decreed Theophilus, Chrysostome his enemy, to be deposed and excommunicated.

^r *Theod. ep. 113. ad Leon. Cent. 5. c. 10.*

Ans. 1. Theodorit being in miserie, supplicates to Leo Bishop of Rome, being the first of the Patriarchs, and in grace with the Emperor, and highly respected, because of the Orthodox faith, (which he learnedly propugned against Heretikes) desiring to be releued by his mediation and personall authoritie, which accordingly Leo performed. 2. The Centuries saying, that Leo restored him, affirme nothing of the manner, neither say, that he restored him by Papall authoritie; but signifie rather that he restored him in regard of his owne consent, and approbation of his innocency, and by motion to the Easterne Bishops. And this appeareth to bee true, because Theodorit is actually restored in the Councell of Chalcedon, and not before.

Touching Chrysostomes appeale, the Centuries speake not in the page alleged by you: and the report which is made concerning the excommunication of the Emperour Arcadius, and Eudoxia his wife, and Theophilus, &c. is taken out of Nicephorus, a late Author, and wanteth credit for these reasons: 1. Because it is omitted by Theodorit, Socrates, and Sozomen, Historians of that time, and which purposely wrote the whole Storie of Chrysostome. 2. Because other graue Historians affirm, that the first Emperor excommunicated by any Pope, was Henry the fourth.

^r *Chalced. Council. act. 8. Gloriosissimi iudices dixerunt, omnis iam dubitatio de Theodorito soluta est, quippe Nestorium eorum nobis anathematizauit, & a sanctissimo archiepiscopo senioris Roma Leone susceptus est. Theod. hist. l. 6. Sozom. hist. l. 8. Trip. hist. l. 10. y. Otho Frising. l. 6. c. 35. Lego & relego Rom. imperatorum gesta, & nusquam inuenio quendam eorum, ante hunc Henricum a Pontif. Rom. excommunicatum. Eipenc. com. 1. Tim. l. 2. digr. 8. pag. 275. Primus Hildebrandus, nouo, &c.*

T. W. Thus we finde how dissonant our Ministers assertion, touching the primacie, is to the practise of the Primitive Church, &c. And that Saint Peter and his Successors were euer to be accounted, the visible bases or foundations of Gods Church, and all other Bishops but Columnnes. And as this foundation immediatly supports these pillars, so these pillars, the rest of this spirituall edifice and structure.

^r *Greg. li. 28. c. 9. mor. solida basis non est, quia dum fundamento non iungitur, ipso suo pondere in ima præcipitatur. Rupert. d. glor. f. Trin. li. 1. c. 17. Sancta Romana Ecclesia, Latine Ecclesie Columna &c. Stapl. Rel. c. 3. q. 1. ar. 1. ad. 4. y. Otho Frising. Columnar. &c. y. Stapl. &c.*

Ans. 1. You make a distinction betweene Bases * and Columnnes: against which I obiekt. 1. How will you reconcile your selfe with Doctor Stapleton, who saith; All the Apostles were foundations, but all were not rocks? 2. If your distinction be solid, then Peter was no Columnne, but onely a basis or foundation; and the other Apostles were onely Columnnes, but no foundations. But the Scripture confuteth this, calling Peter a Columnne, Gal. 2. 9. and all the Prophets and Apostles foundations, Ephe. 2. 20. Reuel. 21. 14. 3. Gregorie

gorie in his Morals *, maketh the Title of *Bases* common to all godly Pastors, and Doctors of the Christian Church, saying; *Quid aliud huius terre bases, quam sancta Ecclesia Doctores, &c.* What other thing is meant by the pillars of the earth, Job 38. 4. than the Doctors of the holy Church? For upon the *Bases* are the *Columns* raised, and upon the *Columns*, the whole weight of the building is placed. Not unworthily therefore are the holy Doctors signified by the name of *Bases*, because, while they preach right things, and by godly living agree with their Doctrine, they sustain the whole weight of the Church, by the immovable granitic of their manners, &c.

2. From a basis and foundation of the Church, by way of ministry and doctrine, you cannot prove a visible Monarch in your transcendent acception, because all the Prophets and Apostles were foundations, Eph. 2. 20. and yet no Monarchs.

3. From a bare and naked succession of place, founded onely upon report of men ^b, you cannot conclude a real succession of your Pope to Saint Peter, in the perfection and latitude of his spirituall power, more than Caiphas could prove, that he was the legitimate Successor of Aaron in maintaining truth, when hee condemned Christ and his Apostles, because he locally succeeded him in outward Priest-hood ^c.

* Greg. m. li. 28. ca. 9. Moral. sup. Job. & in Euang. ho. 17.

^b Dom. Bannes 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 10. Sor. 4. d. 24. q. 2. ar. 5. Aug. Triumph. & Th. Walden. cited by Cordubensis. l. 4. q. 1. de potest. Pap. prop. 3. d. 1. Zabarel. de schif. pag. 551. Hunc esse Papam; vel illum, non est de iure diuino.

^c Hieron. epist. 3. d. 1. 4. Non sanctorum sunt filij, qui tenent loca & nomen, sed qui exercent opera eorum.

Vntruth 10. Whether Gregorie the Great impugned the present Supremacy.

T. W. Master White for the impugning of the Popes Soueraigntie, among other things, saith; Gregorie had no such iurisdiction as now the Pope usurpeth, but detested it in Iohn of Constantinople, and in himselfe. &c. where the Reader may be instructed, that the reason why this Gregorie is by some supposed to disauow the doctrine of the Primacy, is, in that he reiecteth in Iohn of Constantinople, the title of vniuersall Bishop as sacrilegious, which his saying was grounded onely in taking the name of vniuersall Bishop, to exclude the true being of all other Bishops, as is confessed by Andreas Brixius ^d.

Ans. Here is a beggerly and desperate shift: for Gregorie the Great chokingly and irreparably confounds the present Papacie, and that by two assertions.

1. He affirmes, that no Bishop ought to be vniuersall, either in title or iurisdiction. 2. He confesseth himselfe to be the seruant and subiect of the Emperor.

Touching the former, He calleth the title of vniuersall, prophane ^e, proud ^f, foolish ^g, Antichristian ^h, blasphemous ⁱ, scelerious, &c. Touching iurisdiction ouer the other Patriarchs, He acknowledgeth that he hath no power to command them, but onely as a Brother to aduise them ^k. Concerning the latter, no Minister in the Church of England can carrie himselfe more submissly to the Kings Maiestie, than Gregorie the Great did to the Emperor and his wife, acknowledging, that the imperiall power was higher than any other, and that himselfe and all men were subiect to the same by the ordinance of God, and that he was the seruant and subiect of the Emperor ^l.

But the Popish Priest saith, as Bellarmine ^m and others haue done before him, that Iohn the Bishop of Constantinople meant to ingrosse all Episcopall authoritie to himselfe, and to exclude the true being of all other Bishops, making them his Vicars, and no Bishops.

Ans. 1. Iohn of Constantinople challenged no more, than (as Gregorie saith ⁿ) the Fathers of the Councell of Chalcedon, would haue yielded his

dominium meorum imperii cunctis data est. Sacerdotes meos tuae manus commissi. Ego iussioni subiectus. Imperatori obedientiam praestiti. vide l. 4. ep. 31. 32. Bellar. de Pontif. l. 2. c. 31. ^m Greg. l. 4. ep. 36. Mihi per sanctam Chalcedonensem synodum Pontifici Apostolice sedis: hoc vniuersalium nomen oblatum est.

^d De Ecclesia. c. 10.

^e Greg. l. 4. ep. 36. Nullus decessorum meorum hoc prophano vocabulo uti voluit, &c.

^f Ibid. epist. 36.

^g Ibid. 38.

^h Lib. 6. ep. 30.

ⁱ Lib. 4. ep. 32.

^k Lib. 7. ep. 30.

^l sicut iussisti: quod verbum iussionis, peto a meo auditu remouere, quia scio quis sum, qui estis. Ioco enim fiatris estis, moribus patris. Non ergo iussi, sed quae vestra visa sunt iudica e volui, &c.

^m Lib. 2. ep. 61.

Ego indignus pietatis vestrae famulus, &c. Dominorum legem suscepimus, &c. potestas super omnes homines

* Plat. in Bonif. 7.
 Bonifacius à Phoca
 Imperatore ob-
 tinuit, &c. Vt sedes
 B. Petri, quæ est
 caput omnium ec-
 clesiarum, ita &
 diccretur & habe-
 retur ab omnibus,
 quem quidem lo-
 cum ecclesia Con-
 stantinopolitana
 vindicare cona-
 batur.
 * Card. Cusan.
 concord. Cath.
 l. 1 c. 32.
 * Greg. l. 4. ep. 38.
 Cuncta eius men-
 bra conaris tibi
 supponere, &c.
 Cupis te ipsum
 præponere, &c.
 * Centur. 6. a. 7. de
 primatu. pag. 440.

predecessors: but they neuer intended in that offer, to exclude themselves from being Bishops, and to become Vicars, but onely to yeeld him superioritie ouer them. 2. What Iohn challenged at this time, Boniface the third obtained afterward vnder Phocas^a; which was no more but to haue other Patriarchs subiect to him. 3. It is confessed by Cardinall Cusanus^o, that Gregorie condemned Iohn of Constantinople, because he desired to haue all other subiect to him. 4. It is plaine by Gregories words, that the Patriarch of Constantinople did onely challenge Primacy ouer other Bishops, and not the subuersion of the Episcopall order: for thus he speaketh^p; *Saint Paul reproues the Corinthians, because they would subiect themselves to other heads than Christ; what will you therefore answer Christ the vniuersall head of the Church at the day of iudgement, which endeavour by the name of vniuersall, to subiect or place vnder you all his members?* And then presently produceth the example of Lucifer; *Who, saith he, Nulli subesse, & solus omnibus præesse, &c. would be ruler ouer all, and subiect to none.*

T. W. That Gregorie did both claime and practise the primacie, is acknowledged by the Centurists, &c.

Ans. 1. The Centurists^q confirme by diuers examples, that the Roman Bishop attained not the supremacie in this age.

2. They censure Gregorie and other Popes for boasting too much of the excellency and preheminance of the Romane See, and for vsurping ouer other Churches more than was meet: But none of the particulars wherewith they tax Gregorie, doe proue, that he challenged the supremacy which our Aduersaries at this present maintaine.

1. Appointing watch ouer the whole world by way of counsell, instruction, and brotherly admonition, as the first of the Patriarchs, or as the first member of the vniuersall Church, or ouer the whole world by a Synecdoche, Luke 2. 1. will not proue Supremacy more than Saint Pauls taking care for all Churches, sheweth him to haue beene a visible Monarch, 2 Cor. 11. 23.

2. To be called head of all Churches^r, importeth not Papall domination: for it may be giuen to men in regard of preheminance in place and order, or in respect of gifts and graces; and it may also imply such authoritie ouer others, as is common to more than one, &c.

3. The Centurists were mistaken about the Constantinopolitan Church, for *Bizansenus primas* in Gregorie^s, is not the Patriarch of Constantinople, but the Primate of Africke, as the Glosse of the Canon law^t, lately set forth by Gregorie the thirteenth, and Baronius^u, Binius^v, &c. affirme.

4. To command Archbishops, to place Legats, to appoint Synods, &c. was done by the Romane Bishop as a Patriarch, and the other Patriarchs within their circuit might doe the like. And thus none of the things here objected proue Supremacie, as the same is now challenged by the Pope.

* Gregor. Registr.
 l. 4. c. 4. Paulus caput
 nationum.
 Prud. Bethlem
 caput orbis.
 Cyril. tom. 4. ep. 5.
 Episcoporum caput.
 * Lib. 7. ep. 64.
 * Gratian. d. 22.
 de Constantino-
 pol.
 * Baron. an. 599.
 n. 4.
 * Binius tom. 2.
 concil. pag. 508.

Vntruth 11. Doctor White challenged, for saying Priests are more vicious than Protestants.

T. W. For the extenuating and lessening of the sinfulness of the Protestants, the Doctor much extolleth their imputative and supposed vertues, and as much depresseth the liues of Catholikes in generall, and thus he intisuleth shas lease, The Protestants people as holy as the Papists.

Ans. You begin this Section with vntruth, and prosecute the same with falsification thorowout.

1. Doctor

1. Doctor White neither extenuates the sinfull liues of Protestants, nor mentions imputative vertues: and whereas you couertly reproach the Protestants, teaching the imputation of Christs obedience in the matter of our redemption and iustification, Esa. 53. 5. Rom. 5. 19. it had beene more reasonable for you: 1. to haue consulted Augustine^a and Bernard^b, yea sundry of your owne Doctors^c, before you had quarrelled vs. 2. To haue considered whether it be not more credible, that Christs merits are imputed to the penitent and beleeuers, than that the vertues of Dominicke, Francis, Katherine, and other Saints are imputed^d.

2. You affirme, that most of the testimonies produced by the Doctor from Popish Authors against your wicked liues, are found in Sermons or exhortations, vttered in the heat of amplification, and deliuered generally, and without any reference or comparison to the liues of Protestants.

Ans. Two of those testimonies onely are alleaged out of Sermons; the rest are positieue and Historicall speeches, seriously vttered by famous Papiſts, who testified that, whereof themselves were eie and eare-witnesses.

Antia Christi, qua pro nobis satisfecit, &c. illa enim per communicationem sic nostra est, vt perinde nobis imputetur, ac si nos ipsi satisfecissemus, &c. *Leſſ. de iust. iur.* l. 3. c. 1. d. 2. Voluntas Christi, qui est caput, ipsis (infantibus) veluti membris tribuitur, cum aliam habere nequeunt. *Gieg. Val. tom. 2. d. 8. q. 5. p. 4.* Infantes & ij. qui per petuo caruerunt vſu rationis, &c. Vt per alienam Christi voluntatem & obedientiam iusti constituantur, &c. pag. 1304. *Azor. instit. mor.* 1. l. 4. c. 11. *Anton. hist. p. 3. tit. 23. c. 2. §. 1.* Vide *Courad. Cling. loc. com.* l. 3. c. 52.

T. W. I will proue from the Protestants owne confessions, that the liues of Catholikes are generally more vertuous than the Protestants: for Luther^e saith; The world is growne worse and worse, &c. and whereas in Poperie people did willingly follow good workes, now they doe contrary, &c. And *Iacobus Andrea^f* complaineth; That they doe not exercise any good workes, but in stead of fasting spend their time in drinking, and turne praying into swearing, &c.

Ans. You haue filched these stale and ouerworne allegations from Coccius and Brierly, and both they and you peruert the same against the Authors meaning, who intend not thereby to censure all Protestants, as delinquent in this manner, but they accuse onely the hypocriticall and imperfect members of the Church, which appertaine to the same, as the Chaffe and Tares to the Wheat. And such reprooves as these, are vsuall in the primitive Fathers, who notwithstanding intend not thereby to disgrace the godly members of the Church, but onely to rebuke the wicked. *Cyprian* saith^g; All sorts of people gaue themselves to worldlinesse, and forgetting what the faithfull did in the Apostles daies, and what they ought at all times to doe, they gaue themselves to increasing their patrimony with insatiable conetousnesse, and there was not any sincere faith to be found in Priests, nor any mercy in mens deeds. And *Chrysostomeⁱ*; The Church in former daies was a very heauen, the diuine spirit guiding all things in it, &c. but we haue onely some small remnants hereof. And the Church seemeth to be like a woman, which is decayed and false from her ancient happinesse, and retaineth onely chests and old caskets, as tokens or badges of the treasures and happinesse, which are wasted and lost.

2. The said Authors words being vttered by Rhetoricall amplification, in sermon fashion, must not bee set vpon the centers, but confined to their true meaning, which was rather by such inuestiues, to deterre people from sinne, and to set before them the vglinesse of sinne, in those who were lately come from Popish superstition and professed reformation: In whom euen ordinarie offences were hainous, by reason of this circumstance.

Quasi, &c. *Chryſ. 2 Cor. hom. 27.* Sicut corpus mortuum Ecclesia video multitudinem abiectionis, & quemadmodum in corpore recens mortuus, est videre oculos, manus, pedes, ceruicem & caput, sed nullum membrum facit quod debet: ita & hic omnes fideles praesentor, sed non est efficax fides. Feruorem enim extinguit, & corpus Christi mortuum facimus.

^a Aug. in Pſa. 118. conc. 3. & enchirid. c. 41.

^b Bern. in Cant. c. 23. & ep. 190. Omnes mortui sunt, vt vnus satisfactio omnibus imputetur.

^c Enchirid. colon. d. sacra. nou. Test. pa. 132. legem imputatiue implemus. *Vega de iustif. l. 15. §. 2.* *Stap. de iustif. l. 7. c. 9.* Aliquid singulare est in illa iustitia, & obedi-

stia, ac si nos ipsi satisfecissemus, &c.

^e Dom. 26. post Trin. Dom. 1. Aduent. Sermon coniuual. pag. 55. ^f Conc. 4. in c. Luc. 21.

^g Cocc. Theſaur. Cath. l. 8. ar. 12. Canus loc. lib. 6. c. 8. Quasi non a Prophetis sepe populus arguatur, in quo multi essent, ad quos reprehensio, nullo modo attineret.

^h Cypr. de lapsis, n. 4. & ep. 8. Fecit Dominus noster voluntatem Patris, & nos non facimus Domini voluntatem, patri monio & lucro studentes, superbiam seantes, emulatione & dissentioni vacantes, simplicitatis & fidei negligentes, saeculo verbis solum, & non factis renunciantes, vnusquisque sibi placentes, & omnibus displicentes.

ⁱ Chryſ. hom. 36.

1. Cor.

Aug. Pſal. 30. Qui sunt inimici Ecclesiae? Pagani Iudaei. Omnibus peius viuunt mali Chri-

But

But we are able to produce licerall assertions, both out of your Doctores and Stories, which directly and historically charge the maine body of your Popish Church, with generall and monstrous wickednesse.

* Apolog. ad Guilielm. Abbat.
1. Gers. p. 1. serm. de Circumcis. confid. 1. Et de potest. eccles. lect. 10. Et part. 2. serm. de vita Cleric. Et tom. 4. epist. Bragis scripta.
m. Hist. Ang. in Henric. 3. pag. 353. & 441.

* Hodoepor. Hierusal. prolog. ad lector.

* De mortif. c. 4. pag. 35. Vide Stell. in Luc. 17. pa. 182. & 205. Espenc. com. Tit. 1. digress. 2. pag. 71. Adam Sasbooth. hom. 3. super Scriptur. Eritis mihi sancti. Innocent. 3. serm. 1. fest. Pentecost. Hec mundus fere totus liquefactus est vitij, fere liquefactus totus in peccatis. Nam super abundavit iniquitas, & refregit charitas multorum, &c. Bergom. supplem. chron. lib. 13. ann. 1218. Tanta clericorum & improborum hominum licentia, ut nulla religionis facies, in ecclesia Dei dignoscatur, &c. Ruard. Tapp. orat. 10. pag. 373. Agnoscimus, & ingenus conitemur, &c. in corpore ecclesiar, a planta pedis usque ad verticem capitis, non esse sanitatem, & corrupta esse omnia, &c.

Bernard saith ^k; *We haue not onely lost the vertue of ancient religion, but we retaine not so much as the apparance thereof.* And Gerson ^l; *The state of the Church in our daies, is wholly become brutish, and all the vigor of Ecclesiasticall discipline is languished, withered, and faded away; and the Church-men which should reforme the world, are become more vile than any other: and from the crowne of the head to the sole of the foot, the ouzing matter of filthinesse hath ouer-spread the whole body.* Mathew Paris ^m; *The Church of Rome is become like a shamelesse and common strumpet, confounding right and wrong, setting all things to sale, regarding neither iustice nor honestie, accounting vsurie for small, and symonie for none offence.*

And many moderne Papists testifie the like. Dubliuius ⁿ saith; *Even among our selues the ancient flame of charitie is not onely cooled but extinct, and there seemeth to be left no small tracke or footstep of former pietie and faith.* And Fatius the Iesuite ^o; *There is such penurie of men lining after the rule of reason, that one had need haue a candle to finde them out.*

T. W. *Let vs a little enter more particularly into the courses of such our Ministers, as from whom wee are to expect the greatest satisfaction in this point: that so in an euen libration of the matter, the Reader may rest fully satisfied, and Master White more cleerely and irrepiably convinced of his former vntruth, &c. I will content my selfe onely with the example of Zuinglius and other Ministers of Heluetia ^p, who preaching our new Enangelicall doctrine to that Common-wealth, petitioned to the State in this manner: Wee earnestly request, that the vse of mariage bee not denied vnto vs, who feeling the infirmities of the flesh, perceiue that the loue of chastitie is not given to vs of God: for if we consider the words of the Apostle, wee shall finde with him no other cause of mariage, than to fulfill the lustfull desires of the flesh, which to burne in vs wee may not deny, seeing that by meanes thereof we are made infamous before the congregation; for the loue not of lust, but of chastitie, lest that the soules committed to our charge, by example of our sensuality, should bee any longer offended. Wherefore seeing we haue made triall, that the weaknesse and infirmities of our flesh hath beene (O the grieve) the cause of our falling, &c. hitherto we haue tried, that the gift of chastitie hath beene denied vs. We are not otherwise of such vnciuill conuersation, that we should be euill spoken of among the people committed to our charge, this one point excepted. We haue burned so greatly, that many things we haue committed vnseemly: we cannot be charged for any wickednesse, this point onely excepted.*

^p Zuingl. tom. 1. supplem. c. 12. p. 1. ad ex. Constant. Et paranes. ad com. Heluet. ciuitat.

A stander. These words are none of theirs.

They insisted further with the Heluetians in the like Dialect, &c. Since according to the doctrine of our reuerend Father Luther, (which we are bound to teach and practise) nothing is more sweet and louing vpon earth than a woman: Alas, why should wee, who haue of late reuealed the Gospell of Christ, heretofore so long eclipsed, be recompensed therefore with the want of that most delightfull and naturall comfort of a

woman,

woman, being forced to imitate the superstitious Papist, in imbracing a votarie and barren life? Or why should the Heluetian State so seuerely exact at our hands, that we who onely vncorruptly preach the Christian faith, should onely herein be depriued of our Christian libertie? *Hec quanta patimur!*

Anw. Here this Painter hath vsed his blacke art, in pourtraying a Chymæra or Idoll for his friends to stare vpon. For the discouerie of whose falshood, the Reader is to be aduertised of these particulars.

1. That he hath plaied the Falsarie in translating and alleaging the words of Zuinglius, and the rest. They say the desire of chastitie, meaning by chastitie single life^q, (that is, a minde and purpose to leade a single life) is not giuen vs by God. The Popish Priest racketh their words, as though they affirmed, they had no loue of honestie or chastitie in generall.

^q Studium castitatis, &c. Socrat. hist. l. 1. c. 8.

2. He produceth them, as saying; There is no other cause of mariage deliuered by Saint Paul, but to satisfie the lustfull desires of the flesh; and then despitefully enfileth them illuminated brethren. But the Ministers say, If we consider the words of Paul, 1 Cor. 7. we shall in him finde no other cause of matrimonie^{*}, than the boiling heat, or burning of the flesh to lust: that is, Saint Paul writing to the Corinthians, doth in that seuenth Chapter mention no other cause of vsing matrimonie, but to be a remedie to restrain inordinate lust, in such as haue not obtained the gift of continency from God: as if he should say, although single life haue many commodities, and in these times of persecution, especially be very profitable, yet I preferre honestie before any other commoditie, and thereupon for the repressing of inordinate lust, I allow matrimonie to all such as haue not the gift of continency. And other necessarie cause of mariage (at this present) I make none but this.

^{*} Alioquin sim. l. 3. tract. 7. c. 6. q. 6. Tempore Apostoli erat matrimonium ad remedium tantum.

See how wretchedly this Impe of Antichrist peruertereth their words; for that which they say of *repressing lust*, he detorteth to the *satisfying of the lusts of the flesh*. The Heluetian Ministers reason in this manner: All people ought to haue libertie to embrace that state of life, wherein they may vse the meanes which God hath appointed to preferue them from sinne. But the meanes appointed by God, to preferue such as haue not the gift of continency, from secret burning or open filthinesse, being sinne, is matrimony; and Saint Paul nameth no other cause of choosing wedlocke before single life, but onely this. Therefore both Ministers and all other people, according to Saint Pauls doctrine, are to be permitted their Christian libertie in the matter of wedlocke, for the repressing of sinne.

^{*} Tom. 1. parænesis ad com. Heluet. ciuit. Supplic. ad episc. Constant. f. Castitatem ipsâ, præclarum rarumque donum Dei esse non negamus, & illis magnopere congratulamur, qui tantam in seip. his gratiam experiri.

3. The third abuse of this Popish Priest, is yet more impudent; for in the last place he hath himselfe coyned and composed an abusive speech, which he produceth as vttered by the Heluetians; and then flings dirt and dung about him, crying, libidinous, and goatish Ministers, &c.

[†] Vetus Heluetiorum institutum, qui nouum aliquæ sacrorum antistitem receperunt, in iungere eidem concubinari habere propriam, ne aliarum vxores vagâ libidine comprimat. Nos non libidinis castro excitati, sed honestatis veræque pudicitie amore permoti. Quod si voluptati hac in re voluissimus indulgere, nunquam essemus passuri, capistro vxorum implicari, &c.

But if the Reader please to peruse the writings of Zuinglius^r, from whence this sycophant hath pared his broken sentences, he shall, if he carrie an honest minde, finde nothing vttered lewdly or vnseemly; yea, the whole discourse breathing honestie and vertue: The Ministers esteeme and honor single life, in all such as haue the gift of continency^r, and require no more but that whereas in poperie, the Clergie by sale or permission, generally retained Concubines^r, and liued in brothelsome impuritie with many women, that they might haue the libertie of mariage, and leade a chaste and honest life.

Concerning the speeches in particular, I answer; 1. These men particularly confesse their incontinencie: and did not Dauid and Paul acknowledge, the one his adulterie, the other his blasphemie and persecution of Christs Church? 2. They desire to liue in a married state of life, according to Gods ordinance and commandement, 1 Tim. 3. 2. 1 Cor. 7. 2. That they might neither defile their

owne

^a Greg. Naz. carm. aduers. carnem, & carn. de rebus suis. Baion. ann. 359. n. 13.
^x Ex epist. 22. ad Eustoch.

⁷ Ep. 50. Virginitatem in colum sero, non quia habeam, &c. Epist. 43. Ego lapsus sum.

² Meditation. Tu anima mea perfida Deo, perira Dei, adultera Christi, de virginitatis sublimitate miserabiliter demissa es, in barathrum fornicationis, &c. Delictus es in volubro turpitudinis.

^a Legend. aur. de S. Francis Bonau. & Sur. de cod. ca. 5. Antonin. sup. hist. tit. 24. c. 2. §.

¹ Legend. aur. c. 33. de sancto Leone.

^a Greg. Naz. orat. 4. in sancto Baptismo. Punitatis tibi ratio, etiam initio matrimonio constabit, nec enim quia honore praestat virginitas, idcirco turpe & ignominiosum est matrimonium, &c. Chrysost. var. in Math. hom. 31. primus gradus castitatis, est sincera virginitas: secundus autem si-

owne conscience with burning and filthinesse: nor by scandalous and dishonest life, discredit their profession, and offend others.

3. They utter not much more of themselves in this matter, than some ancient Fathers haue done: and Popish Votaries and Saints haue said farre more.

Gregorie Nazianzene ^a complaineth, that in his old age, he was vexed with unchaste and libidinous motions, and had much adoe to keepe his bodie in subiection. Saint Hierom saith ^x, that he reckoned it no shame to confesse his frailtie: acknowledging that his minde burned with uncleane desires, and that the flames of lusts boiled within him, and he professeth more than once that he was no virgin ⁷. Bernard saith, that he was neuer able to flee the lusts of the flesh, and that they did alwaies pursue him. Anselme ² confesseth, that he had lost his virginity, and defiled his soule with fornication, and wallowed in the dungeon of uncleannesse, and beene perfidious to God, perjured (or a vow-breaker) and an adulterer to Christ, &c. Saint Francis ² the deuout limitor, was so oppressed with lust, that he was faine to lie naked in the snow to quench his flame; and to cast himselfe into a pond in a great frost, that so he might subdue his bosome enemy. The Golden Legend reporteth, that Pope ^b Leo the first, by the meanes of a woman kissing his hand, was so vehemently tempted with lust, that he was faine to cut his hand off: but the Virgin Marie, hauing compassion of her high Priest, ioyned the hand to his bodie againe.

T. W. Libidinous and Goatish Ministers, whose very pens spumant vnerem, and with whom, euen to meditate of a woman, is the center of your most serious thoughts, &c. wholly absorpt in lustfull and fleshly cogitations ^a.

Ans. Ignatius ^c saith, whosoever tradmeth lawfull marriage and procreation of children, by the name of uncleannesse, or defilement, the same nourisheth in his bosome the apostating Dragon the Denill. The infamous termes of libidinous and goatish, agree to the brothelhouse impuritie of the Popish Synagogue ^d, with whom it is more honest to keepe 600 queanes ^e, than to liue with one wife: of which Bernard ^f speaketh, If you take away out of the Church honorable wedlocke, and the undefiled marriage bed, you fill the same with Concubinarie, ribbalds, incestuous persons, Seminiſtians ^g, and Gonorrhoeas, yea with male Sodometry, and all kinde of uncleannesse.

Aug. d. bono vid. c. 8. filiorum procreationi operam dare, non canino more per vñum promiscuum seminarum, sed honesto ordine coniugali, non est in homine improbandus affectus. ca. 3. vides coniugalem pudicitiam, & tori Christiani matrimonialem fidem donum esse, & hoc à Deo. Ambros. ad. virg. Bona castitas coniugalis, & castitas vidualis. Munda omnis castitas, &c. ^e Ignat. ep. ad Philadelph. Aug. con. Iulian. lib. 5. c. 10. Bern. in Cant. ser. 66. Turpitudinem in solis exstimatione reputandam vxoribus: cum vel sola sit ea, quæ cum vxore est, quæ turpitudinem excusat, &c. ⁴ Bern. de concurs. cler. c. 19. Bern. in concil. Rhem. Quæ in occulto sunt ab Episcopis turpe est dicere, &c. masculi in masculos turpitudinem operantes, &c. ⁵ Auen. annal. l. 5. Pro vna vxore, sexcentas mulieres inire licebit. Caſter. de concub. c. 17. prop. 9. Or. Val. op. de concub. in fine. ⁶ Bern. in Cant. serm. 66. ^g Gerf. par. 2. de pollutione diurna, & de pollut. nocturna. Nauar. Man. c. 16. n. 6, 7. Siluest. verb. pollutio Tolat. instruct. fac. l. 5. c. 13.

Vntruth 12. Concerning auricular Confession.

T. W. Discourſing of auricular confession, he saith; That the Primitive Church knew it not, pag. 227 ^b. But contrarie to this, the Centurists ¹ doe confesse, that in the times of Cyprian and Tertulian, priuate confession was used, euen of thoughts and lesser finnes. And Doctor Whitaker ² writeth, that most of the Fathers were in an error about confession, &c. Thus we see how little blood was in Master Whites cheekes, &c.

Ans. Doctor White in the place alleaged, saith not as you charge him, but as followeth. Auricular confession was not receiued in the Fathers daies, as necessarie to saluation, or as Christs immediate commandement. 2. In disproofe of his assertion, you bring testimonies concerning priuate confession, and hee speaketh of Popish auricular confession.

The

^b Digress. 33.
¹ Centur. 3. c. 6. col. 127.
² Cont. Camp. Rat. 5.

The Protestants acknowledge, that private confession is profitable, yea many times necessarie for instruction and consolation¹. The difference betweene vs is, touching Sacramentall confession, consisting of an intire and particular enumeration of all mortall sinnes, of thought, word, and worke, together with all materiall circumstances of the same, to be made to a Romane Priest, to this end, that the Priest as a Iudge may absolue the sinner of the guilt of his sinne^m: And this manner of confession, vrged as necessarie to saluation, was vnknowne to the primitiue Church; neither doe the Centurists or Doctor Whitakers affirme the same, to haue beene vsed by the Fathers; but they speake of other confession, and onely censure some inconuenient speechesⁿ of Cyprian and others, about satisfaction, wherein they seeme to attribute too much thereunto concerning expiation of sinnes.

And in the Centurists there is an apparent mistaking of Cyprian, about the confession of thoughts and smaller sinnes^o.

& in confessional. depura confc. Concil. Trid. sess. 14. c. 5. Suar. 3. to. 4. d. 22. n. 1. Wald. sum. q. 18. ar. 3. 4. 8. Tolet. infr. fac. l. 3. c. 7. Lochmaier. paroch. pag. 33. *Quodam monialu Abbatisa quae valde continentur vixit, obitus vnum pecc. carnis, ideo fuit aeternaliter damnata.* Henric. sum. mor. l. 5. & l. 6. ^a Whitak. cont. Camp. Rat. 5. de penitentia admodum incommode, &c. ^o *Reade D. Mortoni Appell. l. 2. c. 14. §. 2. pag. 254.*

¹ Bellar. de pen. l. 3. c. 1.

^m Alex. Hal. 4. q. 18. m. 3. ar. 1. Sacerdos iudex & arbitri inter Deum & peccatorem. Ar. 2. Omne pecc. est confitendum, siue occultum siue manifestum: cordis, oris, operis, &c. Gerl. Opul. Tripartit. de confess. Gabr. 4. d. 17. q. 1. Bonavent. 4. d. 17.

Vntruth 13. Concerning Fasting.

T. W. Our delicate Minister as a professed enemy^p to all austeritie of life, writeth thus against fasting: All antiquitie can witnesse, that in the primitiue Church fasting was held an indifferent thing, and euery man was left to his owne minde therein.

Ans. Doctor White was an enemy to your hypocrisie and superstition, and iustly condemned you in these particulars: 1. That you deliuer a false definition of fasting^q, 2. That glorying as much as the Pharisees, and ascribing such transcendent effects thereunto, yet indeed you retain the name and shadow thereof onely without the substance and matter^r.

But religious fasting, such as is conformable to the precepts and examples of holy Scripture, and to the practise of the primitiue Church^s, and the wholesome lawes of present Churches, we maintain and vrge as a pious and godly exercise, and ascribe all such effects thereunto, as we finde warranted by sacred Writ, and the vniforme doctrine of the ancient Church.

The Prophet Ioel saith; Chap. 2. 12. *Turne vnto the Lord with all your heart, with fasting.* &c. Dauid saith; *I humbled my soule with fasting.* &c. Psal. 35. 13. And Daniel; *I was in heauinesse for three weekes of daies, I ate no pleasant bread, neither tasted flesh nor wine.* Chap. 10. 2. 3. Our Sauour deliuereth a rule for fasting, and promisseth a reward thereunto, Math. 6. 6. 17. 18. And the Disciples of Iohn Baptist, Math. 9. 14. 15. The Apostles of Christ and the primitiue Christians, duly exercise the same, Act. 13. 2. 2 Cor. 6. 5. 1 Cor. 7. 5. Saint Luke saith of Anna: *She serued God (λατρεῖσα) with fastings and prayers.* Luke 2. 37. And of Cornelius, that he fasted and praied, &c. Act. 10. 30. And the primitiue Fathers^t with an vnanimous consent, maintaine the necessitie and benefit of fasting, composing whole tracts in commendation hereof: and God hath by sundry examples testified his respect, and approbation of this holy dutie^u.

ad ingluuiem prandemus, probe poti & melius pasti, non pro naturae sustentatione, aut vnus duntaxat diei, sed in tanta quantitate, vt vel Miloni olim pro tribus diebus satisfacere potuisset. Taceo qualiter & quantitatem cibariorum, & condimentorum, quando iam neque mare, neque terra, neque aer, neque saluberrima gulæ nostræ sufficiunt, &c. Sum. Armilla. v. ieiun. n. 12. Facientes collationem grossam, secundum consuetudinem Romanæ curiæ, non frangunt ieiunium. * Aug. d. Bono. vid. ca. 21. ieiunia, &c. si orando, psallendo, legendo, & in lege Dei meditando sumantur, in deliciis spirituales, &c. vertuntur. Prosp. d. vit. contempl. li. 2. c. 24. ^t Tertul. apol. cap. 40. Cypr. ferm. de ieiun. & tentat. Iustin. orat. ad Anonin. Plum. Orare ieiunantes, & petere à Deo priorum pecc. remiss. docentur. Orig. hom. 4. in diuers. Basil. hom. de laude ieiunij. Chryl. ser. 1. de ieiunio, & ser. 2. Ambros. lib. de Elia & ieiunio. Aug. de temp. ser. 65. ^u Iren. l. 2. c. 56. Postulante per ieiunium & supplicationem multam reuerfus est spiritus mortui, &c. Cypr. ferm. de ieiun. & tentat. Tertul. ad Scapul. c. 4.

^p Way to the Church, p. 214.

^q Salmeron. to. 4. p. 1. tr. 11. p. 105. Nihil aliud est ieiunium, nisi à carnibus abstinere. Illamas method. p. 3. cap. 5. §. 22. *Reade my answer.* par. 1. ch. 2. §. 1. p. 268, 69. ^r Cassian. defens. lib. de offic. boni viri, pag. 119. Lindan. Panopl. l. 3. c. 11. Horant. loc. cath. l. 5. c. 11. Me loqui pudes, de hac virtute sacrosancta ieiunij, quæ nomine tenus hodie in ecclesia obseruatur, &c. neque apud nos qui merito ea defendimus, in vsu sunt, sancta ieiunia, nisi tantummodo secundum quandam externam ceremoniam. Putamus enim nos ieiunare si semel in die, vsque

In

■ Hooker eccl.
pol. l. 5, §. 72. p. 2.
387. *The world be-
ing bold so surfeit,
doth now blasb so
fast: supposing that
men when they fast,
doe rather bring a
disease, than exercise
a vertue.*

* Chemnit. harmon. euang. Luc. 2. v. 37. Anna cultum Deo præstitit, iunium. Hooker positionibus & ieiunati. Aug. serm. 68. de 5. 8. 72. Much but *poor*, but only so to the virtutum fundamen

* Aug. epist. 86.
Sozom. lib. 1. cap.
21. historia Spiridion. & Niceph. I.
S. c. 42. Socrat. hist.
com. Aet. 13. Cling.
cap. 19.

T. W. Aerius was condemned by Epiphanius and Augustine, for taking away all set daies of fasting; which is acknowledged by Doctor Fulke, Doctor Whitaker, Pantaleon, &c. And the Lent fast was holden in the primitive Church more than arbitrarie. Whereupon Master Cartwright reproveth Saint Ambrose, for saying it is sinne not to fast in Lent. Thus you see how familiarly this Ministers pen drops lie after lie, &c.

b Hooker eccl.
pol. l. 5. §. 72.
Acritus worthily con-
demned for opposi-
tion against fasting.
Epipha. har. 75.

* Caletan. Clin-
gius, &c. See *Ar-
borans* before.

T. W. Our Doctor in further disgrace of Fasting, thus writeth; *Montanus* a condemned Heretike, was the first that ever brought in the lawes of Fasting, from whom the Papists have borrowed them. But Master Hooker^d acknowledgeth that *Montanus* was condemned for bringing in unaccustomed fasting daies, and new kinds of fasting, diuers from the Catholike Church, and the Protestant Writer of *Querimonia Ecclesiæ*, professeth the like^e.

4 Eccles. pol. 1. 5.
§. 72.

• Pag. 110.

he enacted lawes concerning fasting ^f. 2. Although there were difference betweene his lawes of fasting and the Popish, (which Doctor White denieth not) yet the Popish superstition might take it beginning from this Heretike; euen as the Saracens in their Alchoran, hauing borrowed sundry things from the Iewes, differ in the kinde and manner of superstition.

^f Euseb. hist. eccl. l. 5. c. 16.

Vntruth 15. Whether Protestants make God the Author of sinne.

T. W. Master White being desirous, that his Religion should decline all contumelious reproach and staine, touching the author of sinne, thus writeth: The Doctrine of the Protestants doth not make God the Author of sinne, nor inferreth any absolute necessitie constraining vs, that we cannot doe otherwise than we doe. But contrarie to this ^a, Zuinglius saith ^b; that God moueth the sheefe to kill. And that the sheefe killeth, God procuring him; and the sheefe is enforced to sinne. And Beza ^c: God excitet the wicked will of one sheefe to kill another, guideth his hand, &c. And Calvin ^d; In sinning the Deuill is not Author, but rather an instrument, &c. This doctrine is condemned by Castalio, Hooker, Couel: and Iacobus Andrea ^e chargeth Beza with making God the Author of sinne. Thus wee see how Antipodes like, and oppositly our Doctor treadeth to the feet of his owne brethren.

^a Briarly apol. tr. 2. c. 3. pag. 577. barb. the same.
^b Zuing. de prouid. Dei.
^c Beza. display of Popish abuses.
^d Calvin. instit. l. 2. c. 4. §. 4.
^e Colloq. Montif. belg. pag. 47.

Ans. Protestants affirme, that it is blasphemy and damnable heresie, to reach that God is the Author of sinne ^m. And some learned Papists acquite the Protestants of this imputation commonly obiected. Suarez saith ⁿ; The Heretikes (Protestants) know well, that God intendeth not that which is formall in sinne, nor inclineth the will of man to intend it. And Vasquez ^o, Calvin, Zuinglius, and Beza, doe plainly affirme, that sinne as it is sinne, is not to be referred to God as the cause thereof.

^m Reads before part. 1. ch. 8. Paragraph. 1. obseruat.
ⁿ Suarez. opusc. l. 2. c. 2. pag. 111.
^o Valq. 1. d. 99. c. 4. n. 22. Plane dicunt, &c.

T. W. The former sayings of Protestants, although they doe not actually imply so much, yet they doe it potentially, and by necessarie inference.

Ans. 1. The like formes of speech are vsed by Papists themselues: Canus ^p saith; God vseth his minister Satan as an instrument, and thus is said to effect that which his minister being strengthened by his authoritie, doth. And Vasquez ^q: Diuers moderne Schoolemen affirme, that God hauing no respect of mans owne determination of himselfe to sinne, doth apply, excite, and impell to the deed of sinne.

^p Can. loc. l. 2. c. 4. & 7. Valq. 1. d. 96. c. 10. n. 64. Quia Deus vtitur ministro suo satana tanquam instrumento, & ita dicitur efficere quod suus minister, auctoritate sua roboratus facit.
^q Valq. ib. 99. c. 4. n. 22. Nulla habita ratione determinationis nostrae, ad opus pecc. nos applicare, excitare, regere, impellere, &c. Ib. c. 3. n. 9. Recentiores theologi doctrinam S. Thom. & antiquorum Theologorum, sic putant intelligendam: vt

2. Zuinglius, Beza, Calvin, &c. speake of the substance and matter of the act of sinne, not of the wickednesse or qualitie. Zuinglius ^r hath these words; Ad opus, non ad crimen, To the worke, and not to the fault: Neither simply to the deed, but as it serues to the end prefixed by him. To the worke, Ratione passionis & euentus, In respect of the passive euent.

3. This Popish Priest notoriously abuseth Calvin ^r: for whereas he saith, that Satan is Gods instrument, in agendo, in doing; the Popish Priest produceth him, saying, that he is Gods instrument in peccando, in sinning: And that which this learned Author speaketh of the positive act of sinne, this Romist applies to the qualitie: as if one saying, the motiue facultie in the naturall bodie, effecteth motion, therefore it effecteth halting.

Deus ab eterno praesinit singulas nostras operationes, eiusque praesinitio fuerit prior ordine causae, nostra determinatione & cooperatione: quia nulla habita ratione illius, ex se Deus, singula opera nostra decreuerit: id quod non solum in operibus gratiae censent esse verum, sed in alijs operibus etiam peccati, si sermo sit, non de malitia, sed de substantia actus. ^r De prouid. Dei. ^s Instit. lib. 2. c. 4. n. 4.

* Eccles. pol. l. 5.
pag. 104.

4. Master Hooker^c in the place objected by this Priest, treating of the twofold will of God, affirmeth, that Gods secret will is not the rule of morall actions, but speaketh nothing concerning this present question.

5. Castalio, and Iacobus Andrea, being Aduersaries to Calvin and Beza, and the one of them a phantastike, and the other a turbulent Vbiquitarie, are not indifferent censors to passe vpon the credit of these worthy men.

Vntruth 16. Whether Saint Bernard were a Papist.

T. W. He is not afraid to publish, that Bernard was a Papist, in none of the principall points of their religion: and then he addeth, He stood against the pride of the Pope. But whosoever will obserue what is confessed by the Protestants, must acknowledge, that impudencie it selfe would be ashamed to haue mentioned such a groundlesse vntruth. For it is granted by Simon de Vojan^a a Protestant, that he was Abbot of Clareuax: and by Oslander^b, that hee was thought to be the Author of 140 Monasteries: and the Centuries^c say, he worshipped the God Maōzām: and Doctor Fulke^d, and Doctor Whitaker^e charge him, for defending the Popes Ecclesiasticall authoritie; and yet if we beleene Master White, he stood against the pride of the Pope, &c.

Ans^r. Doctor Whites words are; Bernard knew not the present Romane Faith; he was indeed a Monke, and in many things superstitious, but he was a Papist in none of the principall points of religion: For he held the sufficiency of the Scriptures without Traditions^b, Iustification by faith alone^c, that our workes doe not merit (condignely^d): that no man is able to keepe the law (in perfection according to the commandements^e). That a iust man, by the testimonie of the spirit within him, may be assured of grace^f; and there is no such free will as many Popish Schoolemen teach^g, he stood against the pride of the Pope^h, and the opinion of the immaculate conception of the Virgin Marieⁱ. And then Doctor White explaining his meaning more fully, saith; Bernard professed not the Romane faith as the Councell of Trent, and the Iesuits haue set it downe, at the least, in the fundamentall points thereof.

Against this our Popish Priest produceth certaine Protestants, saying; That Bernard was an Abbot, and builded Monasteries, and honored the Masse, and eagerly defended the Pope, &c. And from hence inferreth, that Doctor White hath dealt vntruly, affirming that hee was no Papist, and in saying he stood against the Popes pride. But this illation is not coherent: Bernard was a Papist in some things, (as an Æthiopian is white in some things, namely, his teeth) ergo he was a through Papist in the maine articles concluded by the Trident Councell.

D. White proueth he was no through Papist, in certaine articles specified by him, according to the present Tenet of Poperie: and the Popish Priest produceth other points, wherein Protestants confesse he was Popish.

And besides the former Articles named by my Brother, it seemeth vnto me that Bernard was no through Papist, in sundry other articles; and namely in the doctrine of Transubstantiation, of which he is altogether silent in his works^k. Also, he taught that the Eucharist was a commemoratiue sacrifice onely^l, and he held not the precise number of seuen Sacraments^m, nor the Physicall efficiency of any Sacraments. He neuer taught adoration of Images: he beleeued habituall concupiscence to be sinneⁿ, maintained the authoritie and preheminance of

^a Upon the Catalogus taken out of Brerly.

^b Epitom. cent. 12

^c Centur. 12. c. 10

^d Ag. Rheum. Luc.

^e Cont. Duranum,

pag. 154.

^f Serm. de vit.

verbi Dei, & sup.

Cant. ser. 86. &

ep. 91. & l. de prop.

cept. & disp.

^g Sup. Cant. ser.

25. & ep. 77. & ep.

290.

^h Ser. 4. Annun-

ciat. Martin Cant.

ser. 61. & de grat.

& lib. arb. in fine.

ⁱ Serm. 1. fest.

omn. Sanct. De

verb. Esā. ser. 5. Et

de dedic. eccles.

serm. 5. Et in

Psal. Qui hab.

ser. 7. Et in Cant.

ser. 37. & ser. 50.

& in vigil. natal.

Dom. ser. 2.

^j Ser. 1. de An-

nunciat. de dedic.

eccles. ser. 5. in

Psal. Qui hab.

ser. 7. In Cant. serm.

37.

^k In Cant. ser. 81.

^l De confid. ad

Eugen. l. 3. & 4.

^m Epist. 174. in

fine.

ⁿ Vide Bernard.

serm. 1. in fest.

Martin. & Psal.

Qui habitat. ser. 3.

& Cantic. ser. 71.

& tract. de dilig.

Don.

^o Ser. in Cena

Dom.

^p Serm. de sac.

Altar. & ablut. pe-

dum & ser. also de

Cena Dom.

^q Serm. 6. de Ad-

uene.

of the civill Magistrate, and the generall subiection of the Apostles and all the Clergie vnto him. He censured the single life of the Clergie, the hypocrisie of Popish fasting, and plainly confesseth in termes, that the Romane Church was degenerate from ancient Religion.

And lastly, what he thought of the Popes pride, (because the Popish Priest doubteth) let his owne words testifie: who speaking to Pope Eugenius, saith; *You come abroad glistering with gold, abounding with all varietie, &c. but what doe your sheepe receive from hence? If I durst be bold to reveale my thoughts, I would say, these are rather pasture for Devils, than food for men. Forsooth Peter did thus, and Paul in this manner deluded the world. Surely, the zeale of the Church is fervent for nothing, but onely to maintaine dignitie: Every thing is referred to honor, but little or nothing to sanctitie. Saint Peter neuer came abroad adorned with gemmes, araied with silke, attired with gold, mounted upon a white Palfrey, guarded with Souldiers, or attended with ruffling Servitors; without all these he fed Christs sheepe, and herein you have not succeeded Peter, but Constantine.*

• Epist. ad episc. Senon. cited by Episc. pence. com. Tit. 3. digress. 10.

† In Cant. ser. 66.

‡ Epist. ad Goli.

Abbat. & ser. 7. in

Psal. Qui hab. &

epist. 42. ad Hen-

ric. Archiep.

• Apol. ad Goli.

Abbat. Religionis

antique non solum

virtutis amittunt,

sed nec speciem

retinent.

† Lib. 4. de confid.

Vnto 17. Touching the miracles of Saint Bernard and Saint Francis.

T. W. Doctor White saith, what is reported of Bernard and Francis, are lies. This is spoken to the dishonor of the Romane faith, diuers of whose professors through Gods omnipotency, and for the manifestation and strengthening of his truth, haue at all times bene able to exhibite great miracles: the which prerogative resting onely in our Church, much displeaseth our Minister, &c. And then he produceth Osiander, granting a certaine miracle of Bernard: and Mathew Paris reporting, that there appeared certaine wounds like vnto our Saviours, in the hands, side, and feet of Francis, a little before his death, &c.

• Osiand. epist.

cent. 12. c. 6.

† Praestig. js Sa-

thanicis effecta

exillimo, &c.

• Can. loc. l. 11.

c. 6. Nec ego hic

libri illius authorē

excuso, qui specu-

lum exemplorum

inscribitur, nec hi-

storia etiam eius

quae Legenda au-

rea nominatur: in

illo enim miracu-

lorum monstra se-

pius quam vera

miracula legas:

hinc homo scrip-

sit, ferreus, plu-

bei cordis, animi

certe parum severi,

& prudentis. Ca-

teran. opus. de co-

cepte. viig. c. 1.

Episc. com. 2.

Tim. 4. digr. 21.

7 Gen. par. 1. Que

ver. credend. Pri-

mus gradus respi-

cit legendas &

miracula sancto-

rum, &c. quae om-

nia suscipit ecclē-

siā, & legenda per-

mittit, &c. magis

attenditur id quod

plā. recogitatione

fieri potuit, quam

illud quod factum

est.

• Baron. an. 1028

n. 5.

• Antonia. sum.

hist. p. 3. et. 33. ca.

4. §. 6. & c. 7. §. 8.

& c. 1. §. 4. Can.

loc. 11. c. 6.

Math. Paris. hist.

Angl. in Henric. 3.

pa. 92.

Ans. Osiander doth not acknowledge any true miracle wrought by Saint Bernard, in confirmation of Poperie, but speaking of a certaine maruell reported to haue bene done by him, he admitteth by a concession, that possibly such an outward act might be done; but he supposeth Saran to haue bene the author thereof for the confirmation of error, and hence inferreth, it was no true miracle according to all the causes.

2. Admit Osiander were deceiued, and that Saint Bernard wrought true miracles, yet might God concur with him in this worke, not in maintenance of his superstition, but to confirme other parts of his Christian faith and profession; euen as when Iudas wrought miracles, Christ concurred with him for confirmation of faith, and not for approving his couetousnesse.

But against Popish miracles, whereupon our Aduersaries much relie, making the same a signe of truth and note of the Church, I obiekt: 1. The credit of these miracles dependeth onely vpon the testimony of Legends, which Papists themselues discredit. And omitting the Authors alleaged by my Brother, for prooofe hercof, let this testimonie of learned Gerson bee considered: *The Church permitteth Legends to be read, not determining that they be certainly true, but such as possibly might be true; and howsoeuer true or false, yet not vnprofitable for stirring up deuotion.*

2. The matter of these Popish miracles, is in it selfe so absurd and ridiculous, that it will rather prouoke laughter or indignation, than cause beleefe.

Baronius telleth, that Saint Fulbert suckt our Ladies breasts. Antonine reports, that Saint Dominicke walkt in the raine and was not wet; and his bookes lying all night in the Ruer, were taken out dry, and no more hurt than a fish. The said Frier espied the Deuill sitting in the Church like a Sparrow, and

* Can. loc. theol. li. 11. c. 6. illud quam ridiculum, Diabolus Dominico pariter ostro, sevel obstreptem, a Dñs esse coactum ut lucernam haberet in manibus quoad illa absumpta non molestiam solum, sed incredibilem dolorem etiam afferret.

† Antonin. lib. c. 7. n. 8.

‡ Vita Bern. praefixa operibus eius.

§ Lib. 1. c. 13.

¶ L. 2. c. 6.

‡ Ibid.

§ Lib. 1. c. 11.

¶ Lib. 4. c. 4. Iacob. Remig. le-

suit. mur. ciuit. sanct. fundam. 8.

pag. 210. Sancti

Francisci mirabilia opera, tanto

numero, a sancto

Bonaventura optima fide enarrata.

§ Surius tom. 5.

de prob. sanct. hist.

vit. Francisc. ex

Bonau. c. 2. & c. 5.

§ c. 15.

† Antonin. sum.

hist. tit. 24. c. 2.

§. 3.

‡ Seruauerunt & lupi passionem

serui Dei. Sur. c. 8.

§ Sur. ib. c. 12. An-

tonin. ib. c. 1. §. 5.

¶ Sur. ib. c. 8. Mo-

nebat vir pius ouiculam, ut & lau-

disbus diuinis at-

tenderet, & ab om-

ni fratrum offensa

caueret, &c. Ipsa

ecclesiam ingredi-

ens sine alicuius

informatione ac-

cedebat genus, &c.

Durale. Iesuit. flor.

exempl. c. 5. tit. 6.

n. 2. Ouis Fran-

cisci adorat eucha-

ristiam.

‡ O discant ha-

retici, vel a pecude

venerari matrem

Christi & eucha-

ristiam adorare.

Lib. conform. p.

93. S. Francis

saying Mass, saw a

Spider in the Cha-

lice, which he would

not cast forth, but

dranke it up with

the blood of Christ:

afterwards feeling

his thigh to itch, he

scratched it, and

above the Spider

came forth, without

burning the Friar.

§ Surius ib. c. 5.

¶ Bonauent. &c.

Sur. ib.

† Ib. c. 15.

‡ Ibid. c. ultimo.

calling him to him, deplumed him, and so put him to a great reproach. Also, he compelled the Deuill to hold him the candle in his bare fingers, vntill they were well burnt *. And on a time a certaine lecherous Priest kissing this Saints hand, was cured for euer after of incontenencie.

Thomas of Aquine c was so rauished in his meditation, that hee suffered the Candle whereby he read, to burne his fingers, and neuer felt it. And Notaries attended him in his sleepe, and wrote Dictates from his mouth.

The Author of Saint Bernards life d telleth, that he by saying a peece of the Lords Praier, made a horse that had broken his bridle, and was runne farre away into a meadow, of his owne accord to come againe to him e. A woman laying his staffe by her in the night, thereby draue away the Deuill, who had carnally vsed her many yeeres before f; and he excommunicated the Deuill, and thereby disabled him for medling in this sort with any more women g. At another time hee blessed good Ale, and giuing the same to certaine lewd persons, caused diuine grace to enter into them h. Also by excommunication he destroyed flies. And on a time the mother of an Infant deceasing, hee enables the Grandame of the childe, being aboute eightie yeeres of age, to giue her Grandchilde sucke i.

But the miracles of Saint Francis, reported by Vincentius, Antonine, Bonauenture, the golden Legend, Lippoman, and Surius, are more than maruellous.

This Saint and limitor, Francis, vnderstood the secrets of mens hearts k, which the Apostles seldome did. He changed water into wine by the signe of the Crosse, and a Capon into a fish l: He causeth water to spring out of a hard rocke, equalling Moses: and excelling Elizeus, hee maketh Ankers to float aboute the waters; speaking to Wolues m, and calling them brethren, hee mollified their feritie, that they deuoured no cattell.

He preacheth to Birds and Fowles n, exhorting them to praise God; and they were attentue to his doctrine, and suffered him to touch them, and would not depart vntill he blessed them with the signe of the Crosse, and gaue them leaue. Hee caused Swallowes and Grashoppers, and a wilde Faulcon, to ioine with him in praising God.

He exhorted a Cade-lambe o to be attentue to the praises of God, and to beware of offending her brethren; and hereupon the Lambe daily frequented the Church, and without any instructor, kneeled before the Altar of our Ladie at the eleuation of the Host, in honour of her Maker. (Ob, saith Surius p, let heretikes learne to worship the blessed Virgin, and to adore the blessed Sacrament, by the example of this sheepe.)

The same Friar had a second Cade-lambe, which hee gaue to one Ladie lane, and the said Lambe, when her Ladie lay long a bed, or was negligent in her deuotion, would come and bleat at her Chamber doore, and push her with her hornes, and by diuers signes and gestures, admonish her dame to goe to Church.

This great Limitor saying to the fire, *Frater ignis*, O brother fire paine mee not, alswaged the violence thereof, so that he felt no paine when one burne him with a hot Iron q. The holy Angels came to him and were his Minstrels r; and his horse bridle being put vnder a woman traouelling in childe, caused her present deliuerance s. And after his death a peece of his hempen cold where-with he girded himselfe, did the like to other women t. And the water in which this hempen girdle was steeped, being drunke, cured the murrion of beasts, and the water wherein hee bathed himselfe, was a present remedie for the pestilence.

But nothing is more famous about Saint Francis, than that which D. Whites Aduersarie vndertakes to iustifie, and to confirme his Popish faith by, (according to a saying, Like lips like Lettuce) to wit, the impression of Christs wounds

in

in his body^u. The manner hereof according to Matthew Paris^{*}, was this.

The fiftene day before the departure of Saint Francis out of this life, there appeared wounds in his hands and feet, continually bleeding, such as were the wounds of Christ when hee was nailed on the Crosse. Also his right side was open and bloudie, so as one might see his very intrals and hearr. And hee told the Cardinals and others, who demanded of him what this vision meant, That the same hapned in confirmation of his doctrine, concerning Christ crucified, &c. And further hee said, that after his death, the wounds which did now bleed, should be presently dried vp, and become like his other flesh.

The Popish Priest accuseth D. White of soule vntruth, because hee reiecteth this part of Saint Francis his Alchoran, confirmed by testimonie of many great Doctors, and according to Bonauenture and Surius^y, by the Pope himselfe.

But Master White requesteth this Popish Priest and his fellowes, before they enforce him to fix his Credo vpon this maruell, that they will remoue some few obstructions which hinder his beleefe concerning the same.

1. Matthew Paris^z saith, that Saint Francis was branded with these markes fiftene daies before he died: and that being defunct, they were dried vp, and appeared like the other flesh of his bodie. But Bonauenture, Vincentius and Surius^{*} report, that they were imprinted in him two yeeres before his death: and that they were seene of few whiles heliued, because hee sought in humilitie to couer them, but at his death they appeared to many. And they further report^b, that Pope Gregorie the ninth, doubting (like Saint Thomas) of the truth of this matter, Saint Francis after his death appeared to him in the night, and lifting vp his right arme, shewed him the wound in his side, and calling for a pot, there issued forth so much bloud from the wound, as filled the pot vp to the brim.

2. I demand how Saint Francis could liue two yeeres, or so much as fiftene daies, hauing so many wounds in his hands and feet, bleeding either continually, or (as the booke of Conformities saith^c) bleeding once euery weeke from Thursday Euen to Friday Euen, in imitation of Christ bleeding on the Crosse. But suppose what you will of the other foure wounds, the fift wound in the right side was absolutely mortall, and piercing the caull of the heart, and letting out the virall spirits, doth according to the doctrine of our Aduersaries^d, writing vpon the passion of Christ, instantly destroy life.

3. If Frier Francis his deuotion^e towards Christ crucified, caused this impression of wounds in him, how happened it that the Apostle Paul and other Martyrs, before whose eies Christ Iesus was alwaies crucified, wanted the like characters? Either you must affirme with the author of the Conformities^f, that this Frier had a preheminece greater than Iohn Baptist and the Apostles, and assigne him the high chaire in heauen, from whence Lucifer fell: or else with Auentine^g, leaue these fooleries and old wiues tales to lying Papists, whose eies like Night-rauens, take pleasure in darknesse, and cannot endure the light of truth.

^huit quam Iohannes Baptista, &c. § Annal. lib. 4. Huiusmodi ineptias atque nenas, noctuis relinquo, quarum oculi lumen solis terre acqueunt, &c.

^{*} Surius & Bonauent. ib. c. 15. §. 1. de miraculis Liber confirm. Vincentius, Spec. hist. li. 30. c. 119. Benignus Ies. &c. Bonif. de sig. l. 15. c. 3. Antonin. sum. hist. p. 3. tit. 24. c. 2. §. 18. Viegas sup. Apoc. com. 1. §. 18. pag. 553. ^y Hist. Angl. in Henric. 3. pa. 329.

^y Sur. & Bonau. ib. c. 15. &c. 15. Vid. Cor. Lap. in Ep. Gal. c. 6. v. 17. n. 178. pa. 316.

^z Hist. Angl. in Henr. 3. p. 329. Quinta decima die, &c.

^a Ib. c. 13. Biennium antequam spiritum redderet celo, &c. In morte vident permulsi, &c.

^b Ibid. cap. 15.

^c Barthol. Pisan. lib. conformit. A singulo vespere die Iouis, ad sequentem Veneris vespere, &c.

^d Tolst. com. Ioh. 19. v. 34. Torniel. anal. sac. anno mundi 4084. n. 24.

^e Bonauent. Itinerar. ment. prolog. adeo mentem Francisci abtortuit, quod eius in carne patuit, dum sacratissima passionis stigmata, in corpore suo ante mortem, per biennium deportauit.

^f Barth. Pisan. lib. conformit. Dæmon per mulierem Ravenatensem, confectus fuit quidam Iacobo presbytero Bononensi. Franciscum occupare Luciferi cathedram, &c. pag. 18. Franciscus plus

Vntruth 18. Doctor White affirming the Protestant Churches euer-viſibilitie.

T. W. In defence of the continuance of his owne Church, he thus saith; The learned among vs confesse and proue against all that contradict it, that euer since Christs time without interruption, there hath beene a companie of men visibly professing the same faith that wee doe: Though the Church of

Rome degenerating into the seat of Antichrist, persecuted them, and so many times drave them out of the sight of the world, that so it they were not visible.

^a Sect. 45. pag. 335.

Ans. You pare and mangle D. Whites speech ^b, omitting two parts thereof, which being added explicate his assertion, in such manner, that they deprive you of all occasion to cavill.

Pag. 335.

1. He saith, that ever since Christs comming, there have beene a companie of men, professing the same truth which we doe, *In the affirmative, that is, in matters of faith and godly life, necessary to salvation.*

Secondly, he addeth, the sincere professors of Orthodox truth were not alwaies visible to the world, vnder the notion of true beleaguers: but though the world many times knew them, as men different from them in profession, yet being blinded with malice and vnbeleefe, they knew them not to be the Church of God.

And thus Doctor Whites assertion may be reduced to these two propositions:

1. *There were alwaies found in the world a visible companie of beleaguers, professing the same faith which the Protestants doe in all affirmative articles, necessary to salvation.* 2. *There were alwaies in the world some Christians who resisted the chiefe points of Papistris as they came in, and the same Christians were visible in such manner, as Gods people use to be in time of persecution.*

Now what haue you to say against this?

T.W. *Before I conuince this, I would demand where our Ministers head-peece was when he thus wrote: since these few lines doe inuolue an irreconcilable contradiction: a company of men visibly professing, yet to the world not visible, this is as much as inuisible visible, and white remaining white, to be blacke; the Moone to shine in her greatest eclipse. And if the Church were latent to the world, then it was scene onely by some out of the world.*

Ans. Did you neuer heare of one that was visible to his friends and latent to his enemies? of one visible to the seeing, and inuisible to the blinde? And is it an apparant contradiction to say, our Sauour after his resurrection, was visible to his Disciples, and other faithfull people by the space of fortie daies, Act. 1. 3. and yet hee was inuisible the same time to the Scribes and Pharisees? The true Church was alwaies visible to the friends and louers of truth, to such as had eies of faith and spirituall prudence, to discern the sheepe of Christ from the members of Antichrist: but it was not at all times generally visible to Infidels and Tyrants. It was often vnkowne to the world, speaking of that part of the world; *Qui ab amando mundum disti sunt mundus*ⁱ, who are called the world, because they peruersly loue the world, such as in whom the loue of the Father is not: It was visible to the world, speaking of that moitie of the world, *Qui carne versantur in mundo, sed corde inhabitant caelum*; Which are bodily conuersant in the world, and in their hearts bee the inhabitants of heauen.

ⁱ Aug. in Ioh. tr. 9. & tr. 76. Mundus, quo nomine significati sunt, a regno eius alieni.

T.W. *Napper writeth, that Gods true Church was latent and inuisible 1260. yeeres: and Sebastian Francke, that for 1400. yeeres, the Church hath beene no where externall and visible; and Doctor Fulke^k, that in the time of Boniface the third, which was Anno 607. the Church was inuisible, and fled into the wildernesse, &c. And sundry Protestants acknowledge the Churches not being untill Luther, &c. From all which it is ineuitably concluded against this architect of lies, that the Protestants imaginarie Church consisting of airie supposals, had no subsisting or being in the world for these last 1000. yeeres, &c.*

^k Napper. con. Recus. prop. 17. Sebastian. Franc. epic. de abrogand. statu. eccles. D. Fulke. *answ.* to a counterf. Cath. Thow sitchd from Briarly, tr. 1. S. 9 p. 326. See the same pag. 329.

Ans.

Ans. 1. You pitifully abuse Sebastian Francke, calling him a famous Protestant, who was an Anabaptist, and an vnlearned, and malapert hot-spur¹.

2. Speaking of some manner of Churches visibilitie, and respectiue to the state thereof in the primitiue Church, and as it is now since the restoring of the Gospell, the Church may bee said to haue bene inuisible since Pope Boniface the third.

3. Whereas you conclude that the Protestants Church had no being in the world for the last 1000. yeeres; if you meane it had no being in respect of the name of Protestant Church, or in regard of the personall teaching of Luther; or in regard of externall separation from the Romane societie, I will not contest: but then I retort, that your Church in regard of the late Trent faith, had no being at all in the world for 1500. yeere: But if you inferre that our Church had absolutely no being, in respect of the maine and primitiue articles of our faith, and such things as be essentiall in Religion: I answer, it had the same subsisting and being with the best members of your Church, and at this present differs no otherwise from them, than a bodie which hath recovered health, from it selfe being sicke^m.

¹ Chemnic. loc. com. to. 3. p. 260. Sebastian. Frank. homo petulans & indoctus.

^m Read before page 1. chap. 3. Paragraph. 3. observations of the Churches visib.

Vntruth 19. Touching Priests mariage.

T. W. The Doctor much apologizing and defending the mariage of the Clergie, affirmeth that the Church of Rome holdeth contrarie herein to that which was taught in the primitiue Church.

But contrary to this, Cartwright confesseth of the first Nicene Councell, that it prohibited mariage to such as were entred into Orders, although it allowed the mariage of such as were contracted before. And Master Jewel confesseth, that in the matter of Priests mariage, Harding had many Fathers on his side. And Chemnicus granteth, that Origen, Ambrose, Epiphanius, and Siritius, teach this doctrine of single life of the Clergie.

Briarly pag. 71.

Now I referre it to the iudgement of any indifferent Reader, whether hee will beleene the former learned Protestants, confessing the practise of this our Catholike doctrine in the primitiue Church, or Master White denying the same.

Ans. If that which you say were to the purpose, you might with credit request your Reader to take notice of it: but that which you haue brought out of learned Protestants (whose words, because they are impertinent, it is needlesse to examine) is heterogenious to the question.

Doctor White affirmeth truly, that you are varied from the Primitiue Church in the matter of the matrimonic of the Clergie; and by the Primitiue Church he vnderstandeth the whole primitiue Church, the flower and principall part whereof was the first 300. yeeres. Now your owne Doctors^a grant, that in the primitiue Church thus vnderstood, mariage of the Clergie was reputed lawfull. Bonauenture saith; *Continencie was not enioined the Clergie in the primitiue Church*: And with him agree Gratian, Scotus, Gerson, Hugo Cardinall, and in a manner all your Doctors, of which I haue cited many before^o. And this being so, why doe you beraile Doctor White for affirming an euident truth, which Papists themselves deliuer?

^a Bonauent. 4. d. 37. ar. 1. q. 1. Scot. 4. d. 37. q. 1. Gratian. d. 56. cont. Ceno- man. Caietan. opusc. to. 1. tr. 27. ^o Part. 1. chap. 6. paragr. 1. *disser. touching mariage.* &c.

T. W. But learned Protestants acknowledge, that sundry primitiue Fathers maintaine single life of the Clergie.

Ans.

Answ. 1. It followeth not, from some primitive Fathers after the 300. yeare, to the primitive Church in generall, whereof Doctor White speaketh: for although some primitive Fathers taught, that Christ preached forgiveness of sinnes to those which were in hell^p, yet you will not admit that the same was the generall doctrine of the Church.

^p Iren. l. 4. c. 45.

2. None of the primitive Fathers maintaine your Popish doctrine of single life of the Clergie: to wit, that their marriage is simply vnlawfull, and they are to be reputed Heretikes if they marrie; and that it is better for a Priest to bee a fornicator^q, and to use 600. queanes, than to keepe his owne wife^r: and especially that Priests marriage is therefore vnlawfull, because the Pope hath decreed it to be so*. I suppose in these assertions, you shall not by confession of learned Protestants haue many primitive Fathers consenting with you.

^q Pigh. loc. 15. pag. 233. Tolerabilis in fornicationem incidere quam coniugem fieri.

^r Auerin. annal.

^s 13. Coster. de celi-

bat. c. 17. prop. 9.

Bonauent. 4. d. 37. ar. 1. q. 3.

Hic morbus maxime viget in clericis.

* Bonauent. 1. b. Istud statutum impositum fuit au-

thoritatis praelatorum, sed maxime pontificis summi.

Vntruth 20. Concerning Images.

T. W. Inuicighing much against the religious use of Images, hee saith; Touching Images, the Church of Rome holdeth contrary to that was formerly holden. And after that he alleageth, that the ancient Christians of the primitive Church had no Images. But diuers Protestants, to wit, the Centurists, and Doctor Fulke acknowledge, that Lactantius attributed too much to the signe of the Crosse. And Paulinus caused Images to bee painted on Church walls. And Ambrose reported sundry things superstitiously, touching the Crosse: and Tertullian is thought to affirme, that Christians had the Image of the Crosse in the places of their publike meetings, and primately in their houses, &c.

^t Pag. 345. §. 47. num. 5.

Answ. Doctor White saith^t; The Church of Rome not onely worshippeth Images, but commandeth to doe it with diuine honour, &c. and herein it is departed from the primitive Church. Now this being my brothers principall assertion, about the matter of Images: and prouing directly his maine intent, which is, that your Church is departed from the primitive faith: why doe you cowardly passe it ouer, and snatch at another sentence, the truth or falshood whereof is not greatly materiall? It is very probable, that the primitive Church in the prime ages thereof, for two or three hundred yeeres, had no Images: For Irenaeus taxeth the Gnosticks for hauing Images^u. And Clement of Alexandria: We are expressly prohibited to use the deceitfull Art of painting, according to that of Moses; Thou shalt not make unto thy selfe the likenesse of any thing. But whether they had any pictures and Images or not, is not materiall to the Controuersie betweene the Papists and vs; For we reckon pictures and Images used for storie and ornament, out of the case of scandall, among adiaphorou things: The difference betweene vs is concerning adoration of Images.

^u Iren. l. 1. c. 34. Clem. orat. ad gentes, pag. 35.

^v Centur. 4. c. 10.

Obiect. Lactantius is censured by the Centurists^v, for affirming many superstitious things of the efficacie of Christs Image.

^x Lactant. de vera sap. l. 4. c. 17. Si afficit aliquis figuram frons genens, &c.

Answ. 1. The Centurists were many times ouer rigid in censuring the Fathers, whom we imitate not; and about this matter of Lactantius^x, the very inspection of the place will manifest, that hee spake not of the Image of the Crosse, but of the signe: And the signe of the Crosse was no Image, but a significant action.

^y Bel. de script. vixit 400. au.

Paulinus, of whom Doctor Fulke speaketh, liued after the 400. yeere: and Saint Ambrose in the yeere 374. 7. But Doctor White speaketh of the former ages,

ages, saying, ancient Christians of the primitive Church had no Images. Tertullian is thought by the Centuries, to intimate in his Apologie, that Christians had the Image of the Crosse, either in their publike assemblies or private houses. But this is onely the thought and surmise of those authors, vnable to conuict Doctor White of vntruth. We expected choaking and irrepliable testimonies, according to your glorious ostentation, in the maine body of the Controversies, and you produce a poore coniecture, concerning an vnprofitable branch of a question.

Vntruth 21. Concerning Transubstantiation.

T.W. Doctor White writeth: The Romane Catholikes haue altered the faith of ancient Fathers in Transubstantiation. But in affirming this, Master Whites credit and estimation is particularly in this, most dangerously wounded by the hands of his owne brethren. For the Centurists say ^a; Chrysostome is thought to confirme transubstantiation, and other Protestants affirme, that Theophylact and Damascene doe evidently incline to Transubstantiation. And Doctor Humfrey writeth, that Gregorie the Great brought in Transubstantiation. This giues fit occasion to the Reader, to take notice how cleere, perspicuous and shining, our Catholike faith of Transubstantiation was, in those primitive times, &c.

Ans. 1. Sundry learned Papists haue affirmed, that the Doctrine of Transubstantiation is neither ancient nor perspicuous, but perplexed with many difficulties ^b.

2. How can that bee cleere and perspicuous, which expressely contradicth the holy Scripture, affirming Bread and Wine to remaine after consecration? Luke 22. 18. 1 Cor. 10. 16. and 11. 26. and is reprobued by the testimonie of all the senses ^c, and cannot bee defended but by destroying the true quantitie and figure of Christs Body ^d, or giuing it a manner of existing after the nature of spirits, yea, of God himselfe ^e; and multiplying the presence thereof in many places at one time? and the patronizing whereof inuolues the defenders with inexplicable perplexities ^f and contradictions ^g. And doth all this without reason, considering the same doctrine of Transubstantiation is not deliuered in the Scripture ^h, and meereley deuised by the Pope.

Obiect. 1. According to the Centurists, Chrysostome is thought to confirme Transubstantiation.

Ans. The Centurists say; Chrysostome seemeth to confirme Transubstantiation: but it followeth not from seeming to doing or being, Prou. 26. 16. Chrysostome may seeme to ignorant and partiall Readers, to confirme that which indeed he doth not.

^a Durand. 4. d. 10. q. 2. Ocham. in 4. q. 4. & tract. 3. d. euchar. ca. 39. maior. 4. d. 10. q. 2. Gabr. 4. d. 10. ar. 2. conclus. 2. & lect. 43. in Canon. 4. Bellar. de euchar. l. 1. c. 3. Corpus Christi non est in eucharistia corporaliter. Bellar. ib. l. 1. c. 4. Quomodo Deus est in loco, &c. Gabr. can. Miss. lect. 43. Humanam videtur excellere intelligentiam, quod corpus tam speciosum in sua quantitate & lineamentis, & figura perfectissima, cum omnium membrorum & organorum perfecta distinctione, est in paruo hostia, cuius quantitatem longe excedit. Videatur enim incomprehensibile quomodo caput sit prae se. ubi digitus, pes, vel oculus: cor & hepar, ubi manus, &c. salua partium distinctione & sine earum confusione. Camerac. 4. sent. quart. 5. ar. 2. Quomodo idem corpus numero, possit secundum se totum existere in pluribus locis, &c. Quomodo rursus partes eiusdem corporis, possint simul existere vni & eidem loco, &c. † Aq. 3. q. 75. ar. 2. ad. 3. in hac conuersione sunt plura difficilia, quam in creatione. • Greg. Valeram. myst. Calu. in his verbis, Hoc est corpus meum: Demonstratum hoc, non demonstrat proprie Christum, nec panem, nec indiuiduum vagum: sed substantiam illam indiuiduam determinatam, contentam sub sensibilibus accidentibus panis: idque secundum substantiae rationem communem & indiuiduam, vage per ordinem ad illa accidentia: Quae substantia secundum hunc rationem in principio illius enuntiationis est panis, & in fine corpus Christi. † Suar. to 3. d. 46. §. 3. Caietan. locut. seculi ecclesiae auctoritate, verba illa, Hoc est corpus meum, ad veritatem hanc confirmandam non sufficere. Egid. Crenick. d. sacram. q. 75. ar. 1. n. 13. Merito à Pio quinto, in Romana editione expunctum quod docet Caietan in hunc art. scilicet non posse ex verbis Euangelij, demonstrari realem praesentiam corporis, & sanguinis Christi, in hoc sacramento: & verba Christi, Hoc est corpus meum, quod pro vobis tradetur, posse metaphoricè accipi, probat à simili, quia Apostolus 1 Cor. 10. ait, Petra autem erat Christus: & vt ait Caietan, potuisset addere, qui pro vobis crucifixus est.

^a Cent. 5. p. 517. taken out of Briarty tract. 2. §. 7. pag. 185. answered by D. Morion, Appeal. pag. 94. 95. 488.

^b Suar. 3. d. 50. §. 1. Sunt scholastici qui hanc doctrinam de transubstantiatione non admodum antiquam esse dixerunt, &c. Bellarm. l. 3. de Euchar. c. 23. Scot. 4. d. 10. q. 1. & d. 11. q. 3. Gabr. lect. 41. in Canon. Miss. Camerac. 4. sent. q. 5. ar. 2.

^c Aug. de Trin. l. 15. c. 12. Absit à nobis vt ea quae per sensus corporis didicimus, vera esse dubitemus. Vega. d. iustif. li. 9. ca. 39. neque possibile est, vt quod euident est falsum sit, & quicunque euidentiam habet de aliqua veritate, certus est, se non decipi, &c.

Obiect. 2. Theophylact and Damascene incline to Transubstantiation, according to Oecolampadius, &c. Damascene taught the said Doctrine.

Ans. You pretend that your faith of Transubstantiation is cleere, perspicuous, and shining; and yet you flie to obscure Authors living after the 800. yere for the confirmation thereof. Also, your selues in other cases affirme, that the doctrine of one or two Fathers, doth not make a matter to bee of Catholike faith. 2. Although Damascene, by his new manner of speaking, gaue occasion to the error of Transubstantiation, and for that cause is censured by Vrsinus and others, yet hee neuer expressly or plainly taught the same doctrine: and the *transubstantiation* or transmutation of Bread and Wine, in Damascene, is not an essentiall conversion of the substance of the elements, but a mysticall and ratiocinall transmutation, in regard of the use and effect &c.

Obiect. 3. Gregorie the Great, by the confession of D. Humphrey, confirmed Transubstantiation.

Ans. 1. D. Humphrey uttered this, not from any knowne doctrine of Gregorie^b, or expresse sentence out of his workes, but onely from the report of the Legend: and hee doth this by a concession, rather to make way to an intended discourse against his aduersarie, than by a simple approbation of the truth of the report.

^a *Read* Orthod. consensus, pag. 140. where this is proved. D. Bilton, differ. p. 4. pag. 751. Holpin. hist. sacram. l. 3. c. 7. pag. 256.
^b *Read* D. Morton. Appeals, l. 5. c. 6. n. 2.

Vntruth 22. Touching conversion of England by Augustine the Monke.

Briarly tt. 1. §. 1. pag. 57.

T. W. To deprive Saint Augustine the Monke of the honour and reuerence due unto him by vs English for our conversion, Doctor White writeth; That Augustine converted not the Countrey of England to the present Romish faith; and that his conversion was onely the planting of some trifling ceremonies. But contrarie to this the Magdeburgians acknowledge, that Augustine converted England, and he converted it to the same faith, which Gregorie the Great professed, and the Centuries and D. Humphrey affirme, that this faith was the Popish faith.

ⁱ *Centur.* 6. c. 10. pag. 687.

^k *Vide* Godofri. Mon. de orig. & gest. Britan. l. 8. c. 4.

^l *Tol. instr. fac.* l. 2. ca. 4. *Azor. instr. mor.* l. 10. c. 3. ^m *Centur.* 6. c. 10. pag. 682.

ⁿ *Lib. 1. cap. 3.*

Ans. 1. The Centuristsⁱ doe not affirme, that Augustine the Monke converted England; but they say, *Dicitur conuertisse*, He is reported to haue converted that Nation from Paganisme to Christ; Sed Galfridus Monumetensis, &c. But Ieffry of Monnemuth writeth; That before this, truth was preached, and sincere doctrine deliuered^k, &c.

Secondly, it is vntrue, that the Centurists or D. Humphrey affirme Gregorie to haue professed your present Romane faith: they censure him for some superstition, but his errors were different from yours, which I will manifest in one of your particulars, to wit, the Masse. The Centurists (you say) charge him with the celebration of the Masse: but they also cleere him from the error of your idolatrous Masse, wherein you pretend^l, That Christ is truly in the very substance of his Body and Bloud, offered to God by the Priest, as properly as he was by himselfe on the Crosse: saying^m; The doctrine of Saint Gregorie, which concerneth the matter of the Supper is very sound, onely he maketh often mention of Masse and oblations. In other particulars also which you produce out of Gregorie, there is apparant difference betweene him and you, as it is proued against Briarly, by the reuerend Bishop D. Morton in his Appealeⁿ.

And you must bee aduised, that a materiall agreement in some particulars, doth not make a formall concord: and all that can be produced out of Gregorie is onely such; but when he denied the Supremacie, hee cut the throat of your Poprie,

Poperie, and destroyed the basis and last resolution of Romane faith, which vanissheth like smoake, if it haue not a domineering Pope of infallible iudgement to animalize and support it.

Vntruth 23. Concerning conuersion of Countries.

T. W. *Conuersion of Heathen Countries to the faith of Christ, foretold so long since by the Prophets of God, to bee accomplished onely in the true Church of Christ, Doctor White affirmeth, to haue beene done by that Church which conspired in faith and doctrine with the Protestants, and not by the Church of vs Catholikes.*

Ans. 1. Conuersion of Countries to the faith of Christ entirely professed, is proper to the true Church. But it may happen that a corrupt Church, which holdeth not the faith entirely throughout, but erreth in some parcels thereof, may conuert Heathens; and this conuersion shall be mixed; in some things to true faith, in other to erroneous beleewing: like as diseased parents when they procreate children, doe together with their nature and kinde propagate hereditarie sicknesse. And thus the Ecclesiasticall storie reporteth, that the Arrians conuerted the Gothes to Christianitie^o. It is therefore false which you affirme, that conuersion of Heathen Countries is onely accomplished by the true Church^p, vnderstanding by true Church, a societie of Christians, teaching incorrupt doctrine in all points.

2. In reporting Doctor Whites speech, you doe according to your manner omit part thereof: He affirmeth that diuers Heathen Countries, to wit, the Indians, Hiberians, Burgundians^q, &c. were conuerted by other Churches, and not by the Roman; and then, that none of those ancient conuersions made 1000. yeeres since, were to the present Roman faith, consisting of Supremacie, Transubstantiation, Traditions, &c. but to the Catholike and Orthodox faith of the primitiue Church.

^o Socrat. hist. l. 4. c. 27. Sozom. hist. l. 6. c. 37. Epiphani. panar. li. 3. hær. 70. in fine. Freulph. chron. to. 2. l. 4. c. 20. ^p Bellar. de eccl. l. 4. c. 12. Bossius de sig. l. 4. c. 1. ^q Socrat. hist. l. 1. c. 19. Sozom. hist. l. 2. c. 24. Niceph. hist. l. 14. c. 40.

T. W. *It is confessed by Protestants, that the Roman Church hath beene Antichristian more than a thousand yeeres, and that the true Orthodox Church hath beene latent all this time, &c.*

Ans. I haue before in the proper place^r, where these things were objected, made answer.

^r To the 19. vntruth.

T. W. 2. *The Protestant Church, by the confession of Castalio, a learned Caluinist, &c. and David George neuer wrought any conuersion, neither hath that appeared in the Protestant Church which the Prophets foretold, of the enlargements of the Church, and conuersion of Nations thereby: and Castalio thereupon deemeth those prophecies to be as yet not fulfilled.*

Ans. 1. The Protestants haue conuerted many Nations from dumbe Idols, 1 Cor. 12. 2. and from grosse superstition, not much inferior to the impietie of Heathens: and thus according to the Prophets, Esa. 2. 20. they haue beene Gods instruments in a notable and welnigh miraculous conuersion.

2. They haue their share in all the precedent and ancient conuersion of Heathens by former Churches, by reason of consanguinitie of their doctrine with them.

3. Castalio, whom you instile a Caluinist^s, saying, that many propheticall predictions are not performed, meaneth such predictions as concerne the Church

^s Briarly tr. 1. 5. 10.

Church in generall, whereof the triumphant is a part. Many things uttered by the Prophets, touching the glory and happinell of the Church, *Are but in semine and plantation, in the Church militant, and shall receiue their perfection and glorious consummation in the life to come.*

4. Dauid George^c affirmed himselfe to bee the Messias, and was a blasphemous wretch: and yet as bad as he was, your friend Briarly^c and you belie him. The ground of his heresie was not as you say, that because the predictions of the Prophets, touching the enlargement of the Church and conuersion of Nations were not fulfilled, therefore the Messias was not come: but hee inferreth^a, that the Apostles doctrine was imperfect, because it continued not purely in the succeeding Church, and because the frame of Religion which they had erected, was euered and ruined.

^c Thuan. hist. to. 2. lib. 12. Mellif. histor. part. 3. pag. 451. Scap. Prompt. cath. p. 1. sect. Petri & Pauli. pag. 155.

^a Briarly pa. 302. ^a Hist. Dauid. Georg. Holland. per Rechor. & Academ. Basil. to. 3. Germ. &c. artic. 8. Si Apostolorum & Christi doctrina, vera illa & perfecta fuisset: Ecclesia quoque quam sua doctrina excitauit & firmavit necessario permanisset, neque perisset. Quia aduersus ecclesiam ne orci quidem portæ preualent, iam vero constat per quosdam, Apostolorum doctrinam & struam funditus euerfam esse, ex quo consequitur necessario Apostolorum doctrinam & ædificationem, mancam & imperfectam fuisse.

Vntruth. 24. Concerning the Popes authoritie in calling of Councils.

T. W. Doctor White charging the Pope with inuocation of his iurisdiction, saith: *The beginning of the Popes Supremacie ouer Councils was of late, since the Councils of Constance and Basill, decreed within this 100. yeere, in the Council of Lateran, by a few Italian Bishops, whereas in the ancient Church it was otherwise.*

Briarly p. 107.

^a De Concil. q. 9. c. 1. pag. 43. ^b Rcip. ad Bellar. par. 1. pag. 593. ^c Centur. 5. col. 781.

But contrarie to this, it is confessed by Doctor Whitaker^a, that Pope Iulius challenged by an Ecclesiasticall Canon, to assemble a Council. And Damasc^b confesseth the same, &c. and the Centurists^c in the first age censure the Popes of that age, for challenging to themselves power of celebrating Councils, and reiecting Councils, &c.

Ans^r. Doctor White speaketh of that Supremacie ouer Councils, which moderne Popes vsurpe; which besides the claiming the sole right of calling and appointing Councils, and prescribing the forme of proceeding in the same, implieth the disallowing, or ratifying the decrees thereof by his sentence; and maintaineth that Councils are to decree nothing but that which the Pope doth first by his preinstructions recommend and ratifie^d.

For the maintenance of this Supremacie, which subuerteth all generall Councils^e, and makes them to bee nothing but the Popes stalking horses, and opposeth the practise of the primitive Church, which gaue the highest Ecclesiasticall power of iudgement to the generall Council, our Aduersarie bringeth nothing, but alleageth Doctor Whitaker and Danæus, acknowledging that Pope Iulius by a Canon of the Church^e, (not by diuine Law) challenged a prerogative, that he ought to bee called to the generall Council, and without his sentence no decrees might be concluded. But 1. that which Pope Iulius doth challenge, was common to the other Patriarchs, and they had the same right^f. 2. The Patriarchs claimed this by ecclesiasticall law, and not by diuine law, 3. It implied no more, but that the Pope as a principall member of the Church, ought to haue his voice in generall Councils^g, and assent vnto such decrees as passed in the same^h.

^d Bolde sig. l. 5. c. 9. Pœst Pontificis Rom. qua parte voluerit, habet concilia rata, eademque ubi placuerit, reprobare. Est enim Petri successor, &c. Quod ipse sancti ab vniuerso concilio sancitur. Bellarm. de Pontif. l. 3. c. 16. & de concil. l. 3. c. 17. Greg. Val. anal. l. 3. c. 7. Azor. inst. mor. p. 1. 4. c. 11. ^e Ea. Silu. de gest. concil. Basil. pag. 15. Affertur generalia concilia, nullius esse penitus efficacie, nullius omnino momenti, nisi Rom. Pontifex illa indixerit, &c. Quorum sententia si ut ipsi volunt, inuoluta persistit, ruinam ecclesiæ secum habet. Quid enim remedium erit si criminolus Papa perturbat ecclesiam, si animas perdet, si peruerit exemplo malo populos, si denique contraria fidei prædicet, hæreticisque dogmatibus imbuet subditos? &c. ^f Socrat. l. 3. c. 13. ^g Socrat. hist. l. 7. c. 28. ^h Reg. iuris Quod omnes tangit ab omnibus debet approbari. ⁱ Vide Whitak. de scripte. q. 5. c. 6.

The

The Centurists speake not of the supremacie in question betweene our Adversaries and vs, but onely censure a swelling humourⁱ of some Roman Popes, who laboured to exceed the ancient bounds allotted them by the Church, although they neuer so much as dreamed of the vsurpation, which their successors, against all right of God and man, did make.

ⁱ Lud. Viveschol. in Aug. de Ciuit. Dei, l. 20. c. 16. Illa demum ijs videntur concilia, quæ in rem suam faciunt: reliqua vero non pluris

estimanda, quam conuentum muliercularum, in texterina, vel thermis. Paralip. Vrsperg. in concil. Basil. Eugenium Papam tantum abesse, vt generalibus concilijs debeat obedire, vt tunc se dicar maxime mereri, cum concilij decreta contemnunt.

Vntruth 25. Concerning merit of Works.

T. W. For the more disauthorising of the doctrine of the merit of workes, our Minister thus outlaibeth: The doctrine of the merit of workes, was lately begonne by the Schoolemen. But contrarie to this assertion, the Centurists, Luther, and D. Humphrey^k, censuring the writings of the Fathers, for teaching the Doctrine of merit.

^k Centur. 5. col. 1178. Luth. com. Gal. 4. D. Humph. Iesp. 3. pag. 530.

Ans. Doctor White speaketh of the merit of condignity, and of the merit of congruity, by the power of nature: and hee truly chargeth the Schoolemen, to haue beene the Authors of the doctrine hereof^l: and the Centurists, Luther, and D. Humphrey, deale not with the Fathers about this kinde of merit, but onely note them for vsing some broad speeches, which gaue occasion to subsequent error.

^l Wald. sacram. tit. 1. c. 7. pag. 30.

Vntruth 26. Touching the sacrifice of the Masse.

T. W. The Minister endeavouring calumniously to dishonour the most healthfull and incruent sacrifice of the Masse, writeth, that the Masse began not all at once, but by degrees.

Ans. The word Masse, was for a good season vnkowne in the Church^m. In latter times it was vied to signifie the forme of publike prayer, and administration of the Sacramentsⁿ; and then more strictly, the administration of the Eucharist^o: whereunto, the conuents vn timerized, (*catechumens*) were not admitted, but dismissed, and commanded to depart, by the words of the Deacon, *¶ Ite, missa est*. This Masse of the Primitiue Church, Doctor White impugneth not.

And further, to the Eucharist and Supper of the Lord administred according to the ordinance of Christ, Doctor White yeeldeth all due honour: 1. Hee acknowledgeth, that it is a memoriall and true representation of the sacrifice of Christ vpon the Crosse, 1 Cor. 11. 26. Secondly, a diuine instrument and scale authentically, really applying the body and bloud of Christ to euery worthy receiuer, for the remission of sinne, and the impetrating of spirituall and worldly blessings, 1 Cor. 10. 26. Thirdly, it is a sacrifice of commemoration, praise and thankgiuing, seruing to the glorifying of God, and giuing thanks to Iesus Christ for the gracious worke of our redemption.

^m Henric. sim. mor. l. 9. c. 10. Vox, missa, est plane Latina: & illa nunquam veniunt Apostoli, &c. nec vltus ex Patribus Graecis aut Syris, &c. Ambros. lib. 5. ep. 33. *¶ Ite, missa est*. ⁿ Enchir. Col. de Euchar. Missa vocabulum est ex Hebraea lingua mutatum: quo significare voluerunt Patres, quod Graeci λειτουργiam vocabant. Concil. Mileuitan. cap. 13. ^o Isidor. orig. l. 6. c. 19. Missa tempore sacrificij est, quando catechumeni foras mittuntur, &c. Al. Hal. 4. q. 10. tr. 1. de Missa. Cassal. de sacrific. miss. lib. 1. cap. 3. Moserat vt dum sacerdos celebraturus esset, catechumeni, energumini, & penitentes admitterentur, vt decantationes Psalmodiarum, ad lectionem Scripturarum: postea vero ante mysterium celebrationem, extra delubrum educerentur &c. ^p Diaconus illis exiturus dixit, *Ite, missa est*, id est, sacra oblationis, cui vos interesse non licet, iam est exordium, ideo secedite. Dionys. Areopag. cap. 3. par. 2. Aegid. Coenit. d. Sacra, q. 83. ar. 2. dub. 3. n. 47.

q Chryl. sup. Ioh.
hom. 45. & sup.
2 Cor. hom. 24.
Cyril. in Ioh. 15. l.
10. c. 13. Ambros.
de ijs qui mystanti-
antur. c. 9.

r Cypr. ep. 64.

s Cypr. ep. 63.

t Enchir. Col. de

Euchar. principa-

lis finis huius sa-

cramenti, vt Chri-

sto incorporemur,

deque remissione

peccatorum, & fu-

tura gloria, tan-

quā pignore quo-

dam certi redda-

mur. Vide Cypr.

ser. de Cena Dom.

Chryl. ser. de eu-

char. in Encenys

& hom. 26. in Mut.

Aug. de pec. mer.

& remiss. lib. 1.

c. 24. Damasc. l. 4.

theolog. cap. 14.

u *Sermones Boetii in*

the Communion.

x Iren. l. 4. cap. 34.

Percipiens vocati-

onem Dei, &c.

y Calaub. Resp. ad.

ep. Card. Perion.

pa 52. spe ecclē.

Anglicana p. o. f. c.

sa est de verbo. se

nullam licet mor-

turam, si modo im-

petrari a vobis

posset, vt, pristina

fide in integrum

restituta, quæ con-

tra vsum veteris

ecclēsiæ a vobis

viuipantur, tolle-

rentur.

Aug. de Gen. ad

lit. lib. 4. c. 5. Dum

res cognoscitur,

non esse de voca-

bulis laborandū.

y Cypr. ep. 63. In

sacrificio quod

Christus obtulit,

non nisi Christus

sequendus. Suar.

20. 3. d. 54. §. 2. &

d. 55. §. 3.

z Eistius 4. sent. d.

12. §. 11. si tantū

offeritur Eucharis-

tia Deo, nulla pre-

terea accedente

circa ipsam muta-

tione, sicut olim

frugum, reliquarū-

que rerum primiti-

ua offerebantur

Deo, a populo &c.

poterit quidē hac

ratione eucharistia

oblato dici, non tamen sacrificium, &c.

In the holy vse of this Sacrament, the faithfull glorifie God; and truly in an ineffable manner partake the body and bloud of Christ q, 1 Cor. 10. 16. and thereby obtaine an augmentation of spirituall graces, faith, hope, charity, repentance r, &c. They are armed against temptations, comforted in misery s, made more spirituall and religious, assured of the fauour and loue of God, the forgiveness of their sinnes t, and the possession of celestiaall happinesse, Iohn 6. 50, 51, 54, 56, 57.

Touching the name and title of Sacrifice, our Church giueth the same to the holy Eucharist u: and that, not onely in respect of certaine pious actions annexed vnto it, to wit, prayer, thanksgiuing, almes, &c. Rom. 1. 12. 1. 1 Pet. 2. 5. But in regard of the Eucharist it selfe, wherein, first, the outward elements of bread and wine, receiuing the calling of God x, are made sacred, and appointed to diuine worship, 1 Cor. 11. 26. and become instruments of grace to men. Secondly, the body and bloud of Christ, present to the soule, are by the faith and deuotion of the Pastor and people which receiue these mysteries, presented and tendered to God, with request, that he will vouchsafe, for the merit thereof, to bestow grace and remission of sinnes, and other benefits vpon them.

But as touching the Popish doctrine of the Masse, 1. Although we will not be contentious about words, if the truth of matter may be had y: yet wee iudge that the name of sacrifice doth not in a proper or vniuocall sense, belong to the Eucharist; because our Sauour, vpon whose example and doctrine the Sacrament is founded y, neither made choice of any altar z, nor ordained any Priests in the New Testament, nor himselfe vsed any words or action sacrificall.

Our Aduersaries affirme, that the consecration of the Elements a, vsed by our Sauour, was an oblation of them to his Father: But although consecration be a kinde of oblation, yet it is not such as is requisite to a reall sacrifice b, as appeareth in the water of Baptisme: and in Chrisme b the element of Popish confirmation, which is consecrated by the Bishop before the vnction: and in oile Oliue, the element of extreme vnction c, which is consecrate in like sort by the Bishop.

Our Aduersaries therefore further say, that the consecrating of the Elements of the Eucharist, in such manner that they lose their substance, and are conuered into the body and bloud of Christ d, is in manner of a sacrifice to offer them to God.

But then 1. the sacrifice depends vpon Transubstantiation, and vnlesse that be granted, there can be no proper sacrifice e.

2. Euery externall sacrifice must be visible and sensible f: but the conuerion of the Elements into the body and bloud of Christ, by the words of consecration, is inuisible g.

3. If consecration be sacrificing, then the matter and thing consecrated is the host: but the matter and thing consecrated are the creatures of bread and wine, and not the body and bloud of Christ h. Whereupon it will follow, that the Host or thing offered in this sacrifice, shall be only the outward Elements i, (which according to our Aduersaries Tenet, alone are changed by consecration) but this is repugnant to the present doctrine of Pontificians k.

Finding therefore many difficulties in their opinion, which maintaine the

q Chryl. sup. Ioh. hom. 45. & sup. 2 Cor. hom. 24. Cyril. in Ioh. 15. l. 10. c. 13. Ambros. de ijs qui mystanti- antur. c. 9. r Cypr. ep. 64. s Cypr. ep. 63. t Enchir. Col. de Euchar. principa- lis finis huius sa- cramenti, vt Chri- sto incorporemur, deque remissione peccatorum, & fu- tura gloria, tan- quā pignore quo- dam certi redda- mur. Vide Cypr. ser. de Cena Dom. Chryl. ser. de eu- char. in Encenys & hom. 26. in Mut. Aug. de pec. mer. & remiss. lib. 1. c. 24. Damasc. l. 4. theolog. cap. 14. u *Sermones Boetii in the Communion.* x Iren. l. 4. cap. 34. Percipiens vocati- onem Dei, &c. y Calaub. Resp. ad. ep. Card. Perion. pa 52. spe ecclē. Anglicana p. o. f. c. sa est de verbo. se nullam licet mor- turam, si modo im- petrari a vobis posset, vt, pristina fide in integrum restituta, quæ con- tra vsum veteris ecclēsiæ a vobis viurpantur, tolle- rentur. Aug. de Gen. ad lit. lib. 4. c. 5. Dum res cognoscitur, non esse de voca- bulis laborandū. y Cypr. ep. 63. In sacrificio quod Christus obtulit, non nisi Christus sequendus. Suar. 20. 3. d. 54. §. 2. & d. 55. §. 3. z Eistius 4. sent. d. 12. §. 11. si tantū offeritur Eucharis- tia Deo, nulla pre- terea accedente circa ipsam muta- tione, sicut olim frugum, reliquarū- que rerum primiti- ua offerebantur Deo, a populo &c. poterit quidē hac ratione eucharistia oblatio dici, non tamen sacrificium, &c. a Lessius de iust. & iure, lib. 2. ca. 38. dub. 2. Ad sacrificium requiritur sacerdos & altare. b Greg. Val. to. 4. d. 6. q. 11. Can. loc. lib. 12. c. 13. c Bellarm. de confirm. l. 2. ca. 8. d Bellarm. de extrem. vñt. l. 1. c. 7. e Coffer. enchir. de sacrif. Miss. Hoc sacrificium peragitur, conuersione panis & vini, in corpus & sanguinem Christi Saluatoris, dum peragitur consecratio. Lessius de iust. & iur. l. 2. c. 38. d. 2. n. 16. Suar. tom. 3. d. 75. §. 6. Nauar. enchirid. c. 25. n. 111. missa est actio, quæ ex in- stitutione Christi, in memoriam eius passionis panis & vinum in eiusdem corpus & sanguinem, transubstantiatur, & illa, sub eorundem specie, Deo offeruntur. f Alex. Hal. 4. de euchar. quest. 10. m. 7. ar. 3. §. 1. Resol. quomodo posset oblatio reiterari, nisi presens esset in sacramento, cuius oblatio in ipso iteratur? Azor. instit. mor. 1. l. 10. c. 8. Tol. instr. fac. l. 2. c. 4. Agid. Coen. c. de sacr. q. 83. ar. 1. dub. 1. n. 16. & dub. 2. n. 41. g Agid. Coen. c. de sacr. q. 83. ar. 1. dub. 4. Cum hoc sacrificium sit humanum & sensibile, eius hostia debet aliquo modo esse sensibilis. h Ib. num. 78. Realis eius immutatio non est sensibilis, &c. Mald. disp. to. 1. de euchar. par. 3. p. 119. Sacrificium est oblatio sen- sibilis, rei sensibilis, &c. p. 322. In cruce corpus Christi forma visibili oblatum est, in eucharistia inuisibili. i Agid. Coenick. de Sa- cram. q. 83. ar. 1. d. 4. Circa Christum, &c. nulla fit realis immutatio, &c. l. Ibid. num. 79. Dicit non potest quod species sunt pars huius hostiæ. k Suar. disp. 75. conclus. 3. & vlt. & c. fere communis. Coen. lib. n. 74.

Eucharist to be an externall and proper sacrifice, wee content our selues to hold with the Primitiue Fathers *, that the same is a sacrifice according to a large acceptation of the word, and in a figuratiue meaning, so called, because it is a representation and exhibition of the reall sacrifice of Christ once offered vpon the Crosse f.

2. The things which wee simply condemne in the Popish Masse, are these.

1. That Christ existing in earth, covered with the formes of bread and wine, is in his very substance offered to God his Father g.

2. Wherein priuate Masses, in which the Priest eateth alone h, and vnder-taketh for a fee to apply the fruit thereof to particular persons i.

3. That it is of equall force with the sacrifice of Christ vpon the Crosse k.

4. Or conferreth grace by the outward worke done to some kinde of iniust persons l. 5. That it satisfieth, *ex opere operato*, for temporall punishment m.

6. And is beneficiall to the defunct, as well as to the liuing n. 7. That it depelleth all euill, both of punishment, fault, and misery o.

8. Or is auailable as a sacrifice of Christs Body, to procure plenty of the fruits of the earth, and to be a remedy against pestilence, inundation, tempest, scar-fire p, &c. 9. And the administration thereof in an vnknowne tongue, together with inuocation of Saints, and praier for soules departed, with reference to purgatory.

um in persona ecclesie potest eius fructum & virtutem alicui vel aliquibus specialiter applicari. Scot. Quodl. 20. 1. 9. c. 19. Ita prodest missa ac si nunc Christus pateretur, & recens illius sanguis, qui in Missa offertur, fluere de latere eius in calicem & in os celebrantis. 1. Tol. instr. sac. l. 6. c. 14. Angelus & Syluester, verb. eucharistia. Remittitur mortale quando existens in mortali, non habet conscientiam ipsius nec affectum. Vnde reuerenter accedens, quamuis antea non fuerit contritus, consequitur gratiam charitatis, quae contritionem perficit, & remissionem peccati. * Suar. 3. d. 79. §. 6. Henric. sum. mor. l. 9. c. 12. m. Henric. ib. c. 16. Non solum viuis, sed animabus defunctorum profuit sacrificia Missarum, &c. 1. Ib. c. 12. n. 1. g. Ac depelleret omne malum non solum poena, sed culpa, miseria & indigentia nostra, &c. 1. Ibid. c. 13. n. 3.

T. W. Now here to instruct the Doctors ignorance, or at least to detect his malice, I am to lay downe the iudgement of the Catholike Church, teaching what is maintaimed to be essentiall to the sacrifice of the Masse, and what but accidental.

Ans. You vndertake to deliuer the iudgement of the Catholike Church, touching what is essentiall to the sacrifice of the Masse, when you are altogether vnable to yeeld vs any common resolution from your owne Doctors P.

T. W. The true nature then and essence of this sacrifice, we hold to consist in the oblation of the most sacred body and blood of Christ, and consumption thereof. What prayers or ceremonies doe either precede or follow the words of the institution, are no essentiall part of the Masse, and if they were all omitted, yet were the sacrifice true and perfect, &c.

Ans. Why do you beare your Reader in hand, that Doctor White hath proued the nouelty of the Masse, only in such parts thereof as be accidental? 1. He proueth Transubstantiation, which is so essentiall to your Masse, that it enters into the definition of it q, to be a nouelty.

2. Hee produceth some of your Doctors r, acknowledging that no sacrifice was offered by our Sauour in his first institution of the Eucharist.

3. Affirming that Thomas Aquinas was ignorant of this sacrifice, hee speaketh of the essence, and not only of the contingent parts thereof.

T. W. It is the Catholike doctrine of the Church, that the essence of the sacrifice of the Masse consisteth in the oblation of the body and blood of Christ, and the consumption thereof.

Ans. The iudgement of the Catholike Church about the Eucharist, is grounded

* Prosper. li. sent. citatur. d. consecr. d. 1. cum frangitur hostia dum sanguis de calice in ora fidelium funditur, quid aliud quam Dominici corporis in cruce immolatio designatur.

f Aug. ep. 23. Ex similitudine ipsarum rerum nomina accipiunt. Chrys. in Heb. 10. hom. 17. Theodor. cona. Heb. 8. Aug. 83. quæst. q. 61. Cyprian. ep. 63. Theoph. com. heb. 10. De Consecr. d. d. 2. c. Quid sit sanguis.

g Catec. Trid. de euchar. Tol. instr. sac. l. 2. c. 4. Rhem. Heb. 9. §. 7.

h Henric. sum. mor. l. 9. c. 1.

i Biel. can. miss. lect. 26. Sacerdos offerens sacrifici-

um Henric. sum. mor.

l. 9. c. 12. m.

n Henric. ib. c. 16.

o Non solum vi-

uis, sed animabus defunctorum profuit sacrificia Missarum, &c.

p. Suar. co. 3. d. 75.

q. 1. Variæ opinio-

nes in præsent

quæstione ortæ

sunt. §. 2. Sex acti-

ones, de quibus

dubitatur, in qua

vel quibus eorum

essentia sacrificij

consistat.

r. Tol. instr. sac. lib.

2. cap. 4.

s. Cited by Azor

instr. mor. l. lib. 10.

cap. 3.

^f Suar. 3. d. 75. §. 3. Nulla actio est de substantia huius sacrificij, quia Christus in cena non exerceuit. Cyprian. ep. 63. sue lib. 2. ep. 3.

^g Canus loc. l. 12. c. 13. Suar. 3. d. 74. §. 2.

^h Concor. Euang. cap. 131.

ⁱ Suar. to. 3. d. 75. §. 5. Respondeunt Evangelistae Christum Dominum, consecrasse Eucharistiam: non autem ita referunt sumptisse.

^j Becan. de trip. sacrific. c. 8. Suar. ib. Tho. Aqu. 3. q. 79. ar. 5. & q. 83. ar. 4. ad. 1. & q. 83. ar. 4.

^k Bonan. 4. d. 14. ar. 1. q. 4. Egid. Coenick. de Sacr. q. 83. ar. 1. dub. 5. conclus. 4. & 6.

^l Maior. 4. d. 14. q. 9. Alan. de sacrific. miss. c. 25. Cassal. de sacrific. l. 2. c. 5. Oxomen. de sacrific. c. 11. Catha. opuscul. de sacrific. miss.

^m Palac. 4. d. 8. q. 1. & 4. Turrian. l. 8. const. in schol. ad. c. 5. 10, 11, 13, 14.

ⁿ Loc. lib. 12. cap. 13. Vide Soc. 4. d. 13. q. 2. ar. 1. Qui requirit quatuor actiones, &c. * Cont. her. lib. 10. verb. Missa. ^o Bellar. d. Miss. lib. 1. cap. 27. Greg. Val. 4. d. 6. q. 11. p. 1. * Stapl. Annot. Euang. Matth. 26. pag. 360. ^p Scot. 4. d. 13. q. 2. ar. 1. Eckius de sacrific. Miss. cap. 9. ^q Suar. 3. d. 75. §. 5. Becan. de trip. sacrific. c. 8. Less. de iust. & iur. l. 2. c. 38. dub. 2. Coster. enchirid. Miss. pag. 335. Coenick. de Sacram. q. 83. ar. 1. dub. 5.

grounded vpon the words and deeds of our Sauour at his last Supper^f. But our Sauour therein vsed no sacrificall oblation, nor sacerdotall consumption.

Touching the former, 1. This position was maintained by Cornelius Mus^g, a famous Bishop of your Church, at the Trident Councell. 2. Iansenius^h affirms; That no sacrifice can be proued effectually out of the Euangelists, or any other Scripture. 3. Your Doctores are vnable to demonstrate any sacrificall words or deeds of our Sauour in his administration.

2. And that consumption of the Elements can be no essentiall part of the sacrifice, appeareth, 1. Because according to many Doctores it is vncertaine, whether Christ in his first institution being then the Priest, did himselfe receiue the Sacramentⁱ. 2. Although Bellarmine and Gregory of Valence make consumption to be of the essence of the sacrifice, yet Becanus^j, Suarez^k, Egidius Coenick, &c. deny the same, saying; *That sole action is essentiall to the sacrifice, which the Priest as a minister doth exercise in the person of Christ: But this is consecration onely, for herein the Priest speaketh in the person of Christ, but in the receiving he doth nothing in Christs person, but in his owne^l.*

3. It is presumption in you, to affirme that to be the doctrine of the Catholike Church, which is neither determined by any publike sentence of the Church, nor maintained by the common consent of your owne Doctores.

Melchior Canus^m your learned Bishop saith: *There be foure things essentiall in the sacrifice of the Masse, consecration, oblation, fraction, and consumption.* Alphonsus Castroⁿ; *There be three, &c. consecration, oblation, and consumption.* Bellarmine and Gr. Valence^o; *There be two, Consecration and Consumption.* Stapleton^p; *The sacrifice consisteth in benediction, thanksgiving, and consecration.* Scotus and Eckius place the essence of the sacrifice in that oblation which is made after consecration^q. But Suarez, Becanus, Lessius, Costerus, Egidius Coenick, place it only in consecration^r.

T. W. In the other part of this Section the P. produceth Calvin, Hospinian, and others, affirming that the doctrine of the Masse was vniuersally taught in the Primitiue Church.

^a Calvin. instit. l. 4. c. 18. §. 10.

^b Hospin. hist. sacr. lib. 1. cap. 6.

^c Cum illi Eucharistia omnino repudiarint, ne veritatem carnis Christi propter symbola eucharistica faceret cogere.

^d Senec. de ira, l. 1.

Ans. Calvin affirmeth^a, that the Fathers held the true and Orthodoxall sense of the mystery of the Eucharist. So farre is he from condemning the Primitiue Church for error in doctrine about this Sacrament, or for beleauing the Masse; only he and other Protestants obserue in the Fathers some inconuenient speeches.

Hospinian^b is wretchedly abused by you; for when he saith, the Deuill did deceiue men more about this Sacrament, euen in the first age, the Apostles yet liuing, than about Baptisme; Hee speaketh not of the Orthodox Fathers, as though they had bene deceiued by Satan, but 1. of the Corinthians who erred about this Sacrament, and are reprov'd, 1 Cor. 11. 2. of the Simonians, Menandrians, and other Heretikes, who vtterly reiected the Eucharist, because they would not acknowledge the verity of Christs humane nature^c.

And thus you which exclaime against Doctor White, saying; If you cannot blush for shame, grow pale for feare, haue need to place the said monition in the forepart of your wallet, vnlesse you desire to bee of their number, of which Seneca^d speaketh: *Aliena vitia in oculis habes (or rather habere te fingis) à tergo tua sunt: Tu place other mens faults in sight, and hang your owne behinde your backe.*

Vntruth

Vntruth 27. Concerning Wafer Cakes.

T. W. The Doctor inueighing further against the Masse, saith, that Wafer Cakes were first brought into the Sacrament in the eleventh age, or Century after Christ: But it is confessed by Doctor Bilson, that in the dayes of Epiphanius it was round in figure: and Cartwright saith, it was brought in by Pope Alexander, &c.

Ans. The words of Doctor White are these: Honorius is noted for bringing in of Wafers into the Sacrament; and then hee produceth Cassander^a, reporting, that the Author of the exposition of the Romane order tooke it grieuously, that the leaues of bread anciently used in the Church, were turned into slender plates, &c.

^a Cassand. Leitur. cap. 27. pag. 66, 68.

And other learned Papists affirme, that Wafers were vnknowne in the Primitive Church. Durandus^b saith, In the Primitive Church all that were present at the celebration of the Masse, did euery day communicate. Their oblation was a great loafe, sufficient for all, which the Grecians are said to continue to this day. And Salmeron^c the Iesuite; In ancient time euery communicant had a portion broken vnto him out of one loafe. You should therefore rather haue accused your owne Doctors of falshood if their report offend you, than Doctor White.

^b Durand. Rational. diu. offic. lib. 4. cap. 53.

^c Salmer. in 1 Cor. 10. disp. 17. p. 138.

But you produce Doctor Bilson, confessing, that in the dayes of Epiphanius the Sacramentall bread was round in figure: and Master Cartwright saying, that Pope Alexander brought in Wafer cakes. I answer, that you reason wildly from the figure to the matter, as though loafe-bread or leauened bread might not be fashioned in a round figure.

Vntruth 28. Concerning Adoration of the Sacrament.

T. W. The Minister persisting in his serpentine and venomous disposition against the most blessed Sacrament, lyingly forgeth, that the adoration thereof is a late inuention, following vpon the conceits of the reall presence, and prescribed 1220. yeeres after Christ by Honorius the third.

Ans. Doctor White iustly condemned the adoration of the outward materials and elements of bread and wine in the Eucharist, with *latria* or diuine worship, maintained by your greatest Doctors^d, (although some of you dissemble this Idolatry^e.) But of the other side (if the disease of the Seminary had not transported you) you might haue obserued, that my brother (intending only to propugne the publike doctrine of the Church of England) could not be carried with any euill disposition against the blessed Sacrament.

^d Henric. sum. moral. 8. ca. 32. Speciebus eucharistic &c. semper datur latria, propter Christum quem continent, sicut imagini Christi & signo crucis. Suar. 3. d. 65. Eadem adoratione est adorandum qua ipse Christus. Greg. Val. tom. 4. d. 6. q. 11. p. 2. diuino cultu latrie interno

Our Church and all the godly Pastors of the same, most religiously honour and esteeme the holy Eucharist, being one of the sacred seales of the New Testament, (conduicts of life, and conueiances of heauenly grace vnto vs) and vnto the person of Iesus Christ, and vnto his body and blood united personally with the Deity, and once vpon the Crosse offered for our redemption, and now re-

& externo illud adorandum esse, &c. Antonin. sum. hist. tit. 23. c. 7. §. 10. * Stapl. promp. cath. p. 2. ferm. in die Epiph. p. 29. Nec catholici species quas vident, adorant, sed totum Christum. f. Chryl. sup. Genes. hom. 4. 1. Malitia obseuerat rationem. & eum qui semel a via aberrauit, per abrupta precipitem dat. § Hooker Eccles. pol. lib. 5. §. 67. These holy mysteries receiued in due manner, doe instrumentally both make vs partakers of the grace of that body and bloud which were giuen for the life of the world; and besides also impart vnto vs, even in true and reall, though mysticall manner, the person of our Lord himselfe, &c. What merit, force, and vertue fouer there is in his sacrificed body and bloud, we freely, fully, and wholly haue it by this Sacrament. This Sacrament is a true and reall participation of Christ.

Q 3

presented,

presented, made present, communicated, and received in a mysticall manner, in the lawfull and holy vse of this Sacrament, 1 Cor. 10. 16. 1oh. 6. 54, &c. we yeeld the same Adoration^b (both inward and outward) whereof Saint Paul speaketh, Heb. 1. 6. and Saint Augustineⁱ; *No man eateth Christs flesh, but hee first adoreth Christ.*

^b Gomar. specul. eccles. p. 68. *Christum esse in cena praesentem, agnoscimus, et adoramus, &c.*

ⁱ Aug. sup. Psal. 98. vide Aug. de doct. Christ. l. 3. c. 8.

² Hospinian. hist. Sacram. par. 1. l. 4. cap. 6.

And as touching the Doctors assertion; That Honorius the third seemeth to haue beene the first Author, who solemnly decreed and appointed the superstitious adoration of the outward signes of the Eucharist: Hee was induced to thinkethus by no serpentine malice (as your Adders language, Psalme 140 3. stileth) but by probable collection of Story, and by the report of learned Diuines, who (before him) affirmed the same^k.

T. W. Now that there was no innouation touching the adoration of the Sacrament at that time, is euident from two reasons; 1. Because no Historiographer doth giue the least insinuation of any such institution brought into the Church; onely Honorius decreed, that the Priest should more diligently admonish the people thereof, in regard of some former negligence crept in concerning the same.

Ans. 1. If your argument from negative authority bee good, to wit, No Historiographer doth report any such institution of Honorius; ergo, there was none: then mine will not be euill, No Historiographer doth report, that any such deuotion was vsed before Honorius commanded it; ergo, it is probable that he was the first Author.

¹ Decret. 3. de celebr. miss. lib. 3. tit. 41. cap. Sane cum olim.

2. In the decree of Honorius^l there is no intimation of any such like adoration formerly vsed: but a strict precept hereafter to doe it. And if you contend that this adoration was more ancient, produce testimonies, and make it so appeare; otherwise we must fether this superstition vpon Honorius, vnlesse you deriue the pedigree from an elder parentage.

^m Suar. to. 3. d. 65. §. 1.

3. Your learned Doctors, which propugne the Trent doctrine touching adoration, doe make the decree of Honorius^m next vnto the Trident Councell, the principall ground (in respect of Church authority) for this manner of adoration.

T. W. The former point is proved from the abundant testimonies of our Aduersaries, charging the times precedent to Honorius, with the said adoration. Auerroes lining eighty yeeres before Honorius, charged Christians for adoring the Sacrament. The Centurists speaking of the prayers of Saint Ambrose, say; Those prayers containe the adoration of the bread in the Sacrament. Chemnicus produceth diuers sentences of Augustine, Nazianzene, and Ambrose, which in his iudgement affirme the adoration of the Sacrament.

Now all these authorities doe demonstratiuely conuince, that the adoration of the Sacrament was not introduced into the Church as an innouation in the time of Honorius.

Ans. 1. What manner of adoration vsed by Christians in the Eucharist, Auerroes the Saracen reprobeth, I suppose it is doubtfull: and if you speake to purpose, you must proue that hee condemned such adoration as is now in vse among you, and that your manner was then in generall vse among Christians.

ⁿ Centur. 4. ca. 4. pag. 394. *Brasimus non esse Ambrosij censuit, &c.*
^o Chem. exam. concil. Trid. p. 2. pag. 92.

2. The place of the Centuries which you obiekt, is not in the 43. page of the fourth Century. The Centuristsⁿ refuse this booke of Ambrose named by you, as a counterfeit, and therefore they cannot out of the same charge Saint Hierom with a false opinion.

3. You abuse Chemnicus^o, by saying that hee produceth certaine Fathers, affirming

affirming the adoration of the Sacrament in your Popiſh manner: for hee ſaith, they adored the perſon of Chriſt in ſpirit and in truth, who is preſent in the Sacrament; and maintaineth that it is Idolatry to adore the formes of bread and wine.

Vntruth 29. Concerning the ſucceſſion of Catholike Paſtors.

T. W. After the Doctör hath Thraſonically boated of the ſucceſſion of the Proteſtants in his owne Church, he proceedeth further, affirming that the ſucceſſion of the Paſtors and Biſhops in the Church of Rome, hath beene interrupted, &c. Now the queſtion here intended, is not of ſucceſſion of doctrine, by which ſleight, diuers of our aduerſaries uſe to decline the teſtimonies of the ancient Fathers, alleaged by vs for ſucceſſion, but only of externall ſucceſſion of Biſhops and Paſtors, &c.

Anſw. 1. Few men are better able to diſcouer a Thraſo than your ſelfe, being no meane Artiſan in this myſtery: and yet you are here miſtaken, ſaying; Doctör White Thraſonically boated, &c. For without any word or ſigne of oſtentation, he onely affirmeth, That our Engliſh Biſhops ſucceed lineally in their places, from the firſt Apoſtles of our land: which is a matter more eaſie to bee proued, than that Pope Paul now liuing, ſucceedeth Hildebrand or Gregory the ſeuenth.

2. Where you ſay, that the queſtion intended by Doctör White, is not of ſucceſſion of doctrine; his owne words reprove you, ſaying; *Lineall ſucceſſion is, when the perſons ſucceed as well in doctrine as place*, Pag. 412. and after againe; *We doe not deny but they haue a ranke of Biſhops externally ſitting one after another, but lawfull ſucceſſion ſtands not herein*. From whence it appears that Doctör White ſpeaketh of ſucceſſion, as it is deſcribed by your Doctörs, and whereof there be two parts; one as it were the outward body, to wit, locall and lineall ſucceſſion of perſon: the other is as the ſoule, or the animalizing part, to wit, the ſucceſſion of doctrine. And ſurely you are diſpoſed, euen to proclaime your ſelfe a liar, who terme it a ſleight and euation of the Proteſtants, to call for true doctrine in lawfull ſucceſſion, ſeeing your ſelues make the ſame eſſentiall in ſucceſſion, and deny the Greeke Church, which hath perſonall ſucceſſion, as well as yours, to be a true Church, becauſe of hereticall doctrine.

T. W. Doctör White denying that the Romane Church hath externall ſucceſſion of Biſhops and Paſtors, uttereth a malicious lie, and is controlled by his owne brethren: for the Centuriſts in the tenth Chapter of euerie Century doe elaborately ſet downe the particular ſucceſſion of the Biſhops of Rome, euen from Saint Peter to their owne time. Doctör Fulke in like manner ſaith; You can name the notable perſons in all ages, in their gouernment and miniſterie, and eſpecially the ſucceſſion of the Popes, &c.

Anſw. 1. Doctör White ſpeaketh of true and lawfull ſucceſſion, and you produce teſtimonies out of Doctör Fulke and others, for ſucceſſion in generall.

2. The Centuriſts report the interruption of lawfull ſucceſſion in your Romane Church by ſchiſmes of Popes, & alſo the corrupt entrance of many Popes into the Papall throne; which argueth, that they iuſtified not your ſucceſſion as lawfull, but only for ſtory, related the ſame ſuch as it was. 3. You affirme, that the Centuriſts ſet downe the particular ſucceſſion of Roman Biſhops vntill their owne age, whereas their worke endeth in the 1300. yeere, which was 250. yeeres

• Hof. cont. Brent. l. 5. p. 233. Quando nos de ſucceſſione gloriatur, de eo gloriatur quod in Episcoporum Catholicorum quorū loca tenemus, doctrinam ſucceſſionis. Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 4. ar. 2. nota. 1. Succesſio de qua agitur, nec locorū tantū eſt, nec perſonarum: ſed etiam vere atq; ſanę doctrine ſucceſſio. Et princip. doct. l. 1. 3. c. 6. Gr. Valto. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. §. 25. Bel. de eccl. l. 4. c. 8. Greſ. deſ. Bella. de verb. D. p. 172. o p Succesſio perſonalis nulla eſt, vbi ſucceſſio doctrine coniuncta non eſt. Stapl. l. 1. 3. c. 6. princip. doct. 9 Stapl. ib. Grece eccleſia, ab ipſis Apoſtolorum, ſignamētis, perſonarum ſucceſſionem demonſtrare poſſunt.

• Centur. 10. ca. 8. pag. 1189.

Luther, and produceth Erasmus and some other, giuing testimony of his integrity. But Doctor White did not so highly commend Luther, as though he had beene a celestiall Angell, and inculpable in all his sayings and deeds, or free from whatsoeuer might seeme worthy of reprehension, as T. W. hauing a loose tongue, pretendeth, Saint Hieroms speech^e is remarkable, *Where shall you finde any, in whose manners some blemish, like a wart or mole in a faire body, may not be spied?* And if the Prophets Esay, Daniel, &c. Esay 6. 5. and 64. 6. Dan. 9. 5. and the Apostles of Christ confesse their frailty, Rom. 7. 24. 1 Ioh. 1. 8. Let it be no reproach to the Protestants that Luther was a sinner.

^e Cont. Pelag. l. 1.

T. W. *I will insist onely in two points: 1. In displaying Luthers sensuality. 2. His pride.*

His lust and incontinency is proued by his words and confession. Hee giueth counsell: If the wife will not, or cannot, let the maid come.

Ans^r. This speech being diuorced from the occasion whereupon it was vttered, and from the other parts of the discourse, seemeth grosse: But the whole contexture being laid together, affordeth no more but this: *That if a disobedient wife refuse to liue with her husband according to the Apostles rule, 1 Cor. 7. 3. And by her obstinacy giue occasion of adultery, the husband may threaten her with diuorce, and cutting her off from his flesh, Eccles. 25. 26. And terrifie her with the example of Queene Vashti, who being rebellious was put away, and Hester a maid was chosen in her place, Hest. 1. 12. And if vpon admonition of her husband and others, she still continued obstinate, Luther esteemed this to bee a kinde of desertion, 1 Cor. 7. 15. And iudged it a lawfull cause of diuorce^d. Now although this opinion of his concerning diuorce, bee not so iustificable; yet the Papists doe shamefully abuse him, in detorting his words to a giuing liberty^e to adultery and dishonesty, which he neuer intended.*

^d Luth. to. 6. de uita coniug. par. 3. de diuort.
^e Bol. de sig. l. 12. c. 3. Fas esse decernunt cum ancillis concumbere, &c. Serrar. Iesuit. com. Hest. l. 1. q. 12. Campan. rat. 8. Coccius thesaur. par. 1. de sig. eccl. p. 125

T. W. *Luther hath these speeches: As it is not in my power that I should be no man, so it is not in my power that I should be without a woman. It is as necessary, as to eat, drinke, purge, &c. I am almost mad through the rage of lust and desire of women. Eight daies are now past, wherein I neither write, pray, nor study, being vexed partly with temptation of the flesh, partly with other trouble, &c.*

Ans^r. 1. Some of these speeches are taken out of a counterfeit Treatise^f, going vnder the name of Luther. 2. Other of these sayings are peruerted to a false meaning: for Luther intendeth no more, but that in regard of such persons as are not called by God to a single life, and haue not receiued the gift of continency, the obtruding of forced chastity is a violence to nature: a resisting of Gods ordinance, and a cause of intolerable filthinesse. And against them which by externall bonds and lawes did endeavour to make men chaste, being indeed inept thereunto, he saith truly, *It is no more in the power of man to alter the constitution of nature in this kinde, than in other naturall conditions: as eating, drinking, purging, &c.* Martin Luther liued in a time wherein the contagion and sulphurean smoake of Papisticall whoredome darkned the Church, and infected all the world with filthinesse^g: and therefore he was more vehement in reprobuing their hypocrisie, which for the maintenance of this tainted single life depressed matrimony: & in his zeale against this horrible hypocrisie, he vttered some broad speeches, which being set vpon the racke, may seeme inconuenient.

But could our Aduersaries produce out of Luther any such positive doctrine as we reade in some decretall Epistles of the Popes^h; to wit, *that all things in this world, and among the rest, mens wines ought to be common*; we should suspect Luther in such sayings to haue beene guided with no good spirit.

T. W.

^f Colloq. mensales.

^g Summa Prædictio de Luxuria, lect. 7. Fatui leccatores, & specialiter sacerdotes illas (ancillas) infatuant dicentes illud peccatum (luxuriam) minus esse quam sit: & senon esse sacerdotes nisi quando sint in Missa.

^h Clem. Rom. ep. 5. Communis usus omnium, qui sunt in hoc mundo omnibus hominibus esse debuit, &c. In omnibus autem sunt sine dubio coniuges.

T. W. *Luthers pride is accused by sundry learned Protestants: Zuinglius saith; Behold how Satan laboureth wholly to possesse this man. Occolampadius admonisheth him to beware, lest being puffed vp with arrogancie and pride, he be seduced by Satan. Urbanus Reginus; God by reason of the sinne of pride, wherewith Luther was puffed vp, hath taken away the true spirit from him as he did from the Prophets, 3. booke of Kings 22. and in place thereof hath giuen him a proud, angry, and lying spirit.*

¹ Hieron. eg.
Rufin.
Epiphanius eg.
Chrysostom.

Ans. 1. It falleth out many times that holy men in the heat of contention doe censure each other ouer hardly^h, and yet charitable censurs vse not to ballance their liues in generall by the reproach and accusation of their Aduersaries.

¹ Lomb. 4. d. 14.
Albert. ib. d.
31. 32.
Richard. ib.
ar. 8. q. 1.
Scot. 4. d. 22. q. 1.
Gab. 4. d. 14. q. 3.
ar. 3. d. 3.
Almain. q. 1. ar. 1.
Ocham. Marfil.
Durand. lo. Me.
dina. Valqu. &c.

2. It is possible for a good man at some times to be eleuated with pride, 2 Chron. 32. 25. transported with anger, 1 Sam. 25. 13. and Dauid a man of a perfect heart, was guided by Satan in one of his actions, 1 Chron. 21. 1. The holy spirit of God forsaketh iust men in some actions, and corrupt affections may transport and blinde them, vntill diuine grace reuiuing in them, they are restored, and deliuered from the tentations of Satan. And our Aduersaries acknowledge, *That iust men may fall into mortall sinneⁱ, and although they cease to be iust, during the time that such sinne hath dominion ouer them; yet when they are recovered by repentance, their former iustice is re-imputed vnto them.*

This might befall Luther and any other godly man; and during the time he persisted in error, other Protestants might admonish and reprove him, and yet againe, vpon his ceasing from his froward waies, acknowledge him to be the seruant of Christ.

T. W. *Now hauing displayed in part, Luthers deportment, &c. I referre to the Readers consideration: 1. Whether our Doctor did auerre an vnt ruth or no in iustifying, that whatsoever could be produced against Luthers life and conuersation, was malignantly forged by vs his enemies.*

¹ Aug. de Ciuit.
Dei, l. 14. c. 9.
Nunc sitis: ene
vultus, si sine cri
mine, sine pecc. au
tem, &c.
² Antio. sim. hist.
p. 3. c. 7. §. 11.
Coram Deo testi
ficor, et purum
inueni, sicut pueri
quinqueannorum,
qui nunquam sen
sit lux carnis con
tagium, nec ha
buit alicuius mor
salis criminis in
voluntate consen
sum. Tho. Aquin.
Nunquam habuit motum inanis gloriæ. Surius de S. Francisc. c. 14. Tanta in eo carnis ad spiritum erat concordia, tanta obedientia
promptitudo, quod cum ille ad omnem miteretur sanctitatem pertingere, ipsa non solum non repugnaret, sed præcurrere nitetur.

Ans. 1. Doctor White neuer intended to iustifie Luther, or any other seruant of God in euery personall^h action, (but it is common with you, to magnifie sinfull men¹ in this manner.) The summe of that which he professeth, is; *That Luther was an holy man, free from the foule and grievous crimes objected against him, and that many Romane Popes haue liued and died worse than he.* And against this, T. W. P. hath brought nothing, but endeavouring to doe his worst, produceth onely a few broken sentences, diuorced from the bodie of his discourse, and peruerred against his meaning; and alleageth some Protestants, who in an opposition which hapned betweene Luther and them, reprove his deportment in that particular businesse. And from hence it appeares, that in truth you haue nothing to except against him, and that he was a most worthy man, considering that notwithstanding your wicked eye which hath searched euery corner to detect him, you cannot finde where to fasten your nailes.

T. W. *The second, (and that much more importing) whether it standeth with probabilitie of reason, or the accustomed course of Gods proceeding; so make choise for the restoring and replanting the truth of his Gospell, of a man, whose course of life, writings, and doctrine, doe breathe onely pride, contumacie, sensualitie, Sardanapalism, and luxurie.*

Ans. Although God at sundry times by the preaching and ministerie of wicked persons, doe plant grace in others; euen as he fed Elias by Ravens,
1. King.

1 King. 17. 6. being vncleane birds, Deut. 14. 14. and according to Saint Augustine, *Such is the power of diuine grace, that by euill men it winneth good, and by such as he reprobate and wicked, it gathereth the iust:* Yet I assent herein to T. W. P. that it scarce standeth with the accustomed order of Gods prouidence, to make choise of a man, whose course of life, writing, and doctrine, doth breathe out onely pride, luxurie, &c. for the restoring and replanting of the truth of his Gospell. And from hence I inferre two things: 1. That it is improbable, that the frame of Religion should leane vpon the shoulders of Popes, and that conuersion of Countries hath bene wrought by them, considering, that (as D. Stapleton^a affirmeth,) *There can scarce any wickednesse (heresie excepted) be deuised, or named, wherewith the Romane See hath not bene defiled in a shamefull manner since the 800. yeere.* And before him Papirius Masson; *No man at this day looketh for any sanctitie in Popes. They are reputed exceeding good, if they be good in any small measure, or lesse wicked than other men vse to be.*^{*} 2. It is probable, that Luther was an holy man, because God by him did restore and replant the truth of his Gospell.

But whereas in your conclusion, you defame Luther with sensualitie, Sardanapalism, and luxurie; I doe not a little maruell, that you are so profuse in words, and so sparing in proofes: for you haue onely produced testimonies of vnseemly words uttered by Luther; but you are not as yet able to taxe him for any lewd or vicious deed^o.

T. W. *I will end with Luther, from whom you did originally sucke your lying doctrine: onely since you are entred with our vulgar multitude into the number and catalogue of our Euangelicall Prophets, I would wish such your followers, to entertaine an impartiall view and consideration of this, and other your forgerie and sleights; which if they doe, they shall finde you are guided by the ghostly enemy of mans soule, who once said, I will goe forth, and be a lying spirit in the mouth of all his Prophets.*

Ans^r. Whosoeuer doth impartially consider your proceeding, may perceiue that you raile well, but reason badly. D. White was a plaine teacher, and brought vp in no forge. And whereas you thwart him with the ghostly enemy of mans soule, beware lest your selfe be this enemy his interpreter, or carry his traine. To the Reader I will multiply no words: onely thus much I affirme, that if he indifferently compare your cauls and

Whites answer, *Inueniet conuicta conuicta, He shall finde railing conuicted by veritie.*

^a Stapl. Rel. c. 1. q. 5. ar. 3. pa. 158. Ad reliquas vexationes accesserunt enormia & horrenda Rom. Pontificum peccata & flagitia: vix enim vllum peccatum, sola heresi excepta, excogitari potest, quo illa sedes turpiter maculata non fuerit, maxime ab anno 800. & infra, &c. ^{*} Papir. Masson. de epis. Verb. l. 6. in Paulo 3. In Pontificibus nemohodie sanctitatem requirit. Optimi putantur, si vel leuiter boni sint, val minus mali quam ceteri mortales esse soleant. ^o Chremutius apud Tacit. lib. 4. annal. Verba rari arguuntur, adeo factorum innocentium.

Aug.

Finis secunda partis.



AN ANSWER TO THE third part of T. VV. P. his obiections, concerning Impertinencies and ab- surd Illations.

T. W. P.



*Having in the two precedent parts, set downe many cor-
ruptions and lies (coined by your selfe, and not) by
M. White : It now followeth, according to my inten-
ded method, (of impudencie and calumniation)
that I (being more fit for a stage, than the Do-
ctors chaire) display diuers of his absurd and imper-
tinent inferences, (which are made to seeme so by
your deprauing.) For these three points, to wit, cor-
rupting, lying, and idle or absurd disputing, are the three severall heads (the
threefold basis, whereupon the frame of Poperie leaneth) whereof the
whole worke of this Treatise is woven.*

*Now touching those his Impertinencies, the Reader is to conceiue, that they
consist in his alleaging of such testimonies, both of Scriptures, Fathers, and
Catholike writers, as being truly set downe, doe not neuerthelesse impugn
that point of our Catholike doctrine, against which they were by him so urged.*

*Ans. 1. It seemes the Doctors illations are more sufficient than you pre-
tend, because you decline the weight of them, as you finde them in him ; and
haue your selfe, according to your blacke myserie, distorted and mis-shapen
them, to make them appeare absurd.*

Publ. Minus.

Nihil est, quin male narrando possit deprauari.

*2. Your selfe in euery passage transgreisse in the same kinde of absurd reason-
ing, wherewith you charge your Aduersarie ; and your whole Treatise scarce
affordeth one tolerable consequent.*

Let the Reader consider these few examples among many :

*God is not a God of dissention, but of peace, 1 Cor. 14. 33. Ergo, the Prote-
stants Church, because there is some discord in the same, is a false Church.*

*Psal. 19. He hath set his Tabernacle in the Sunne : Ergo, the Church teach-
ing in corrupt doctrine in all points, is euermore gloriously visible.*

*The Church of England hath altered the Service booke of King Edward :
Ergo, it is mutable and inconstant in the substance of Religion.*

*Pope Iulius claimed authoritie and voice in the Councell of Antioch : Ergo,
the*

the supremacie of the Pope, according to the present tenor of Iesuites, was received in the Catholike Church in Iulius his daies.

The Church hath alwaies bene visible: Ergo, it hath alwaies had a lawfull succession of Bishops and Pastors: witness the Greeke Church.

3. If you can so clearly discern insufficient arguing, and wrong connexion of conclusion and premises in D. White: how hapneth it, that you and your fellowes are as blinde as Moles in obtaining the foule impertinencies of your owne Popes and Doctors, even where they maintain the weightiest articles of your faith?

Boniface* 8. reasoneth for the supremacie, the grand article of your superstition, as followeth: Christ said to Peter, Feed my sheepe: Ergo, the Pope is vniversall Monarch of the Church.

The Disciples say, Here be two swords: Ergo, the Pope hath spirituall and temporall iurisdiction.

Christ commanded Peter to put his sword into the sheath: Ergo, the temporall sword must be at the Popes command.

Paul saith, All power is of God, and the things which be of God, are ordinate: Ergo, the temporall sword is subiect to the Popes authoritie.

Moses saith, In the beginning, not in the beginnings, God created heauen and earth: Ergo, there must be one vniversall Monarch of the visible Church.

Pope Innocent* 3. proceedeth in the like kinde, as followeth: Deuteronomie is a second law, and causes of blood, in Deuteronomie, came before the Priest: Ergo, in the New Testament, which is a second law, they must be decided by the Pope.

Pope Alexander* profoundly argueth for holy water, from the ashes of a Cow, Numb. 19. &c.

Siricius and Innocent* from Leuit. 11. Bayce holy, because I am holy; and from Rom. 8. They that be in the flesh, cannot please God, in seire, Ergo, Priests marriage is vnlawfull.

The Schoolemen and Iesuites illations out of Matth. 16 and Ioh. 21. for the supremacie, are so dissolute, that one may as easily make ropes of sand to hang together, as the conclusions and premises of such arguments to cohere.

The testimonies of holy Scripture and other Doctors, produced by M. White, are not therefore impertinent, because Romists by a colour and shift of wit can euade them: for if these hucksters might haue the hammering of Christ and his Apostles illations, their skill and conscience would serue them (the Catholike cause so requiring) to make the same a nose of wax: and had the Sadduces and Pharisees been trained vp in the Iesuiticall forme, our Saviours consequent about the resurrection, Matth. 22. 32. or concerning his domination, Matth. 22. 45. or his prooffe against the Pharisees, Ioh. 8. 39. If you were Abrahams children, you would doe the markes of Abraham, would easily by these hypocrites haue bene defeated. A serpentine wit, attended with superstition and malice, can easily finde euasions to escape, and weapons to oppose any truth.

res secundum exemplar vel monitionem facti debent. Cum igitur in ecclesia triumphanti sit unus princeps supremus, claus obedientie tota ipsa ecclesia est perfectissime subiecta, scilicet Deus: necessario sequitur, totum militiam unum supremum principem praesidere, scilicet Papam, cuius preceptis omnes obedire tenentur. Chrys. serm. 2. sup. Rom. Ea est ratiocinationum natura, ut labyrinthi cuiusdam ac Gyphi similes sint, nullum proflus finem habentes, neque permitcentes sermonem super petre certitudinem consistere, radices principium ex arrogantia ducunt.

T. W. But howsoeuer it is, I am to aduertise the Reader, that in perusing such authorities produced by Master White, he would neuer recurre to the true state of the question; and particularly, that he would apply the said sentences to that very point, or touch, wherein the life of the question consisteth: and then he shall finde how roundly and wandringly they are directed, still glancing by, upon some wilfull or ignorant mistaking or other, neuer reaching the marke intended.

R

Ans^r.

* Extr. de maior. & obed. c. Nos Sanctorum.

Innocent. 3. in Concil. Lateran. ca. 50. Prohibitio copule coniugalis quareum consanguinitatis & affinitatis gradum non excedat &c. quaternarius enim numerus bene conuenit prohibitioni coniugii corporalis, de quo dicit Apostolus, quod vir non habeat potestatem sui corporis, sed mulier: neque mulier habet potestatem sui corporis sed vir: quia quatuor sunt humores in corpore, quod consistit ex quatuor elementis.

* Ca. per venerabilem, lib. 4. tit. 17. c. 13. decretal. De consecr. d. 3. ca. Aquam sale, &c.

* Siricius ad Hincm. Tarracon. to. 1. concil. Grat. d. 51. c. Tene. Bellar. de matrim. l. 1. c. 5. Clem. de heret. c. ad nostrum. gloss. Est ecclesia militans exemplata d' uinitus a triumphante, dicente Ioh. Apoc. 21. Vidi Ierusalem sanctam nouam descendentem de celo. Et Moisi dictum est Exod. 25. quod omnia fac-

Answ. I intreat the Christian Reader, in all disputations betweene Papists and vs, to obserue this admonition, and to fix his vnderstanding vpon the true state of the question: which if he performe, he shall finde that verities of the Romists, which Saint Augustine said of the Donatists, *Right sayings, illuſtrious for verities, doe these men obscure with peruerſe expoſitions.*

T. W. That we may the better behold how valiantly our Minister impugneth all Traditions, we are here to call to minde what the Catholike Church teacheth in this point.

Answ. In your very first entrance you depart from the state of the question, and falsifie the Doctors Tenor: Who impugneth not all Traditions, but admitteth such as are subordinate and homogenous to the Scripture, yea all those which you are able to proue Apostolicall, by the generall testimonie of the Church.

T. W. Then it teacheth, that the word of God is to limit and confine our faith, and that nothing is to be accounted matter of faith, but that which receiveth prooffe from thence.

Answ. Your great Doctors say otherwise. Bosius^a; The Scripture is not to be placed among the principles of faith. And Stapleton^b; Our faith dependeth not vpon the sole word of God, (either written or vnwritten) but vpon the voice of the Church speaking vnto vs. And Bellarmine^c; The definitions of Generall Councils, and the decrees of Popes are principles of faith, with the holy Scripture. And Gretser^d; The definition of the Pope is as authentick as the Scripture. And the Councell of Basil^e; The custome of the Church is of equal authoritie, and to be received with the same pious affection with the Scripture.

^a Bosius de sig. lib. 14. cap. 10. Scimus articulos esse valuti principia quendam, quibus per cunctas habenda fides: ac Scriptura non refertur inter eiusmodi principia, &c.

^b Stapl. Rel. c. 4.

^c Bellarm. de Concil. lib. 2. cap. 1.

^d Basil. Concil. sess. Synodal. tom. 4. Concil. Sess. 143. 145.

T. W. Hereupon it teacheth, that the word is either written, namely the Scripture; or else deliuered by Christ and his Church, namely Tradition: Both these we beleue to be of infallible authoritie, because they proceed from them who were immediately inspired, &c.

Answ. There is a riddle in your words. For coniointing Christ and the Church, if you meane that Christ and the Church of his Apostles deliuered this traditionarie word which you stand for, I freely grant you every part of this word, if you can reduce it (which is impossible) by the current of all precedent ages to Christ and the Apostolike Church. But if by the Church you vnderstand the present Romane Church, and will haue these Traditions = a part of Christs word, which your Pope hath brought in, and which want the vndoubted testimonie of the primitive Church, I affirme, that this word is so far from being equall to sacred Scripture, or any part of the rule of faith, that the same is the doctrine of Devils.

^a Richard. Col. cap. 1. syn. Patrum doctrina expendenda est, non solum traditio, presens, sed etiam, vel illius particularis ecclesie, huius vel illius interpretis, sed etiam traditionem, ab initio, a temporibus Apostolorum, concordant Patrum sententia, ad nos usque deductam. ^b Gret. de Rel. de verb. Dei, l. 4. c. 3. pag. 171. 1715. Rel. de sig. l. 1. c. 6. = Chrys. in Gen. hom. 14. Videre quanta absurditas & quanta blasphemia, quando quis non ipsam diuinam Scripturam exponem sequitur, sed suis opinionibus locum dat, quae mentes disturbant, &c.

T. W. Written or vnwritten are but extrinſicall, and not of the true and inward reason, of being the word of God.

Answ. Written and vnwritten, considered in themselves be many times accidental: But if the Gospell and Testament of Christ be onely written, and no part thereof nuncupatiue, then to be written, is a condition essentiall.

T. W.

T. W. Our Doctor, to prove that the written word is onely the rule of faith, and consequently that there are no Traditions of the Church, which may also in part be a rule thereof, vrgeth severall places of Scripture, Prov. 2. 1. 9. Esa. 8. 20. Mal. 4. 4. Luk. 16. 9. Now that the Reader may see, how well these texts are applied to the point controuerted, I will set some of them downe in forme of argument, &c. The Scripture will make a man understand rightousnesse, and iudgement, and equitie, and euery good path: ergo, now in the time of Christianitie there are no Traditions, but the Scripture of the Old Testament is the onely rule of faith, &c.

Remember the law of Moses my seruant, &c. They had Moses and the Prophets, ergo, no Traditions, &c.

Ans. 1. Doctor White in this placeⁿ, produced many other texts of holy Scripture, 2 Tim. 3. 15. 2 Pet. 1. 19. Apoc. 22. 18. 1 Cor. 4. 6. and proueth his conclusion not from any one sole testimonie, but from all the places coniunctly; euen as the Apostle, Rom. 3. 10. &c. and Hebr. 11. throughout, proues a position by many Texts, which doth not so euidently follow vpon any one.

2. Whereas D. White hath expressely set downe his owne consequent, this Sophisticator in stead thereof, substitutes a mishapen birth of his owne creation. Doctor White argueth from the premised testimonies, in manner following: The Holy Ghost speaking of the Scripture, affirmeth, That the same is able to reforme vs to euery good worke, 2 Tim. 3. 15. and to make vs wise to saluation: to teach vs Christ crucified, wherein is the summe of our saluation; to giue vs light in darknesse; to beget our faith: and we are renoued from all other teachers to the Scripture, Esa. 8. 20. Luk. 16. 29. And there is no counsell, no comfort, no doctrine, no resolution needfull for vs, but there it may be found; and the Holy Ghost declineth the like concerning no other doctrine; ergo, the Scripture is the onely rule.

T. W. What reference haue these Texts with the rule of Faith, the which is not so much as glanced at in any one of them?

Ans. 1. Bellarmine^{*} himselfe produceth many of these Texts, to wit, Esa. 8. 20. Matth. 22. 29. Iohn 5. 39. 2 Pet. 1. 19. &c. to proue that the holy Scripture is a rule of faith, and therefore, according to your selues, they haue reference thereunto.

^{*} Bellar. de verb. Dei, li. c. 2.

2. That is a rule of faith, which is appointed by God as a doctrine and law to direct and gouerne our beleefe and spiritmall actions. But according to sundry Texts alleged by Doctor White, the sacred Scripture is such a doctrine and law; ergo, &c. Esa. 8. 20. Mal. 4. 4. It is called a Law, 2 Pet. 1. 9. the most sure word, whereunto we must attend as a light, &c. 2 Tim. 3. 15. It instructeth and maketh wise to saluation. It is written, that we may be certaine of that wherein we are instructed, Luk. 1. 4. and that we may (by a right faith) beleue in Christ Iesus, Ioh. 20. 31. Christ referred him that desired to be saued, to the Scripture for direction, &c. Matth. 22. 29. &c. Hence it followeth, that the Scripture is a doctrine and law appointed by God, to direct our faith and manners, and so is a rule, &c.

T. W. Why should the Old Testament be a patterne for the faith professed in the New Testament? Since all Christians doe grant, that the time of grace is enriched with many privileges, whereof the old Law was altogether deprived?

Ans. 1. You were best to demand of our Sauour Christ and his Apostles, why they alleged so many testimonies of the Old Testament, and permitted their

Greg. expof. 1.
Reg. lib. 2. c. 1.
Electorum mentes
non folum noui,
fed etiam veteris
Testamenti fcien-
tia innouat.

Beaumont.

their doctrine to be examined by the Law and the Prophets, Ioh. 5. 39. Act. 26. 22. if the Old Testament be no part of the rule of the faith professed in the New?

2. The Apostle Paul speaking of the whole Scriptures, whereof the Old Testament is a moitie, faith; *They are able to instruct or make wise to salvation through faith, which is in Christ Iesus.* And Saint Peter writeth to Christians, *We haue the more sure words of the Prophets, whereunto you doe well to attend, as vnto a light shining in a darke place,* 2 Pet. 1. 19.

T. W. After these and such like texts of Scripture, he descendeth to proue the foresaid point from the testimonies of the ancient Fathers, &c. He alleageth Tertullian, saying, The Scripture is the rule of faith: which we grant, that it is regula partialis fidei, a rule of our faith in part: but hence it followeth not, that it is a totall, entire, and sole rule of faith, without Traditions, &c.

• Tertull. cont.
Hermog. c. 22.

Officina.

Ans. If according to Tertullian^o in the foresaid booke, nothing may be receiued as dogmaticall in Religion, but that which is written, then the holy Scripture is the onely rule: but Tertullian faith, *Let the new forge of Hermogenes teach, that this is written; and if it be not written, let him feare the woe denounced to them, which adde or take away.*

• Aug. de nupt. &
concupisc. 2. c.
33.

T. W. He alleageth Saint Augustine^r, thus writing: This controuerfie depending betweene vs, requireth a Iudge: let Christ therefore iudge, and let the Apostle Paul iudge with him, &c. *As if Christ and his Apostles could not as well speake in Traditions as in writing: or granting, that that particular controuerfie there meant by S. Augustine, was proued from the writings of S. Paul, therefore all other articles of Christian religion should thence also receiue sole prooffe.*

• Greg. def. Bellar.
de Script. 1. 3. c. 4.
Spiritus Sanctus,
&c. non est iudex
controuerfiarum
vt per Scripturam
loquitur, sed vt per
ecclesiam, cuiusque
caput loquitur.

• Aug. ep. 112. ad
Paulin.

Ans. 1. The Iesuites denie that Christ and S. Paul are a iudge of controuerfies, as they speake by the Scripture, but as they speake by the Pope^q.

2. Saint Augustine in the place alleaged, produceth our Sauour and Saint Paul, giuing iudgement by the Scriptures. And he nameth sundry places of Scripture, Matth. 26. Rom. 8. Rom. 4. Math. 19. but maketh no mention of Traditions, or of the Pope.

3. Whereas you restraine Saint Augustines words to that particular controuerfie onely; my brother in his Booke ioyned another sentence of this Father^r to the precedent, wherein he yeeldeth the priuilege of indubitate veritie to Scripture onely, saying; *If a matter be grounded vpon the cleare authoritie of holy Scripture, &c. it is to be beleened without all doubt: as for other witnesses and testimonies, vpon whose credit any thing may be vrged to be beleened, it is lawfull for thee to credit or not to credit, according as thou shalt perceiue the weight and desert, &c.*

T. W. Gregorie Nissen calleth the Scripture a straight and inflexible rule for those points it proneth, not generally.

• Greg. Nissen.
orat. de iis qui
adeunt Hieroso-
lymam.

Ans. Gregories words^r are, *Si ad regulam ipsam respiciamus, &c. If we haue respect to the very rule, which God hath giuen vs, &c.* And then he alleageth holy Scripture, where obserue; 1. that he mentioneth no more rules but this one. 2. adding the word *ipsa*, to rule, he declareth the same to be an adxquare and onely rule.

T. W

T. W. Saint Augustine saying; whatsoeuer thing it be that a man learnes out of the Scripture, if it be hurtfull there it is condemned, if it be profitable there it is found; speaketh of vertue and vice, of both which the Scripture most fully disconfereth: But how it may condemne Apostolicall Traditions, which may deliuer supernaturall and high mysteries of faith, I leaue to the censure of any iudicious man.

Ans. Then it seemes you acknowledge the perfection of the Scripture in things concerning vertue and vice: but herein you disagree with your fellows¹, who make things morall as well as doctrinall, the object of Tradition. 2. Saint Augustine² in the ninth chapter of the same booke, expressly opposeth your restriction, saying; In the things which are plainly set downe in holy Scripture, all those things are found which containe faith and good manners.

¹ Greg. Va. tom. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 7. Doctrina quedam dogmata, aut morum instituta.
² Aug. de doct. Christ. l. 2. c. 41.

T. W. Thomas Aquinas, who saith, The doctrine of the Prophets and Apostles is canonicall, because it is the rule of our understanding, speaketh not peculiarly of the Scripture, but in generall of the doctrine of the Prophets and Apostles, which whether it be written or unwritten, is canonicall.

Ans. Thomas in the place alleaged³, speaketh of the doctrine of the Prophets and Apostles, whereunto Moses, Deut. 4. 32. and S. Iohn, Reuel. 22. 18. commandeth that no man shall adde or put to any thing: but this word of Moses, and of S. Iohn was written, Deut. 31. 9. Reuel. 1. 19. and 22. 18, 19. therefore Thomas of Aquine, by the doctrine of the Prophets and Apostles, vnderstandeth their doctrine written in the holy Scripture.

³ Th. Aqu. com. 1. Tim. 6. lect. 1. Si quis aliter docet, &c.

T. W. Again he vrgeth Saint Thomas the second time: Our faith resteth and staeth it selfe upon the reuelation giuen to the Apostles and Prophets which wrote the Canonicall bookes, and not upon reuelation (if any such haue beene made) to other Doctors. But who denies that the Prophets and Apostles did write the Canonicall bookes? or who teacheth⁴ that our faith ought to rest upon the reuelation of other Doctors, than the Prophets and Apostles?

⁴ Greg. 12. de agnosc. Scienc. can. Hec testandi de Scripturis canonicis auctoritas, nec à Prophetis est in ecclesia, nec ab Apostolis, &c.

Ans. 1. Aquinas⁵ in the place alleaged, speaketh of the bookes of Canonicall Scripture, and not onely of the Writers of those bookes. Solis Scripturarum libris, &c. To the bookes of holy Scripture onely. 2. He attributeth infallibilitie of doctrine to those bookes onely, and maketh the arguments taken from thence to be necessarie. 3. He excludeth from this prerogatiue and perfection, all other authorities whatsoeuer. Reade his words in the margent.

⁵ Aqu. 1. q. 1. ar. 8. ad. 2. Auctoritatibus Canonicis Scripturæ, vtur proprie ex necessitate argumentando: auctoritatibus vero aliorum doctorum ecclesiæ, quasi arguendo ex

propriis, sed probabiliter. Innititur enim fides nostra, reuelationi Apostolis & Prophetis factæ, qui canonicos libros scripserunt: non autem reuelationi, si quæ fuit aliis doctoribus facta: unde dicit Aug. Solis Scripturarum libris, qui Canonici appellantur, didici hunc honorem deferre, ut nullum autorem eorum in scribendo errasse, aliquid firmissime credam: alios autem ita lego, ut quantalibet san-ctitate & doctrina præpollant, non ideo putem verum, quod ipsi ita senserunt vel scripserunt, &c. Aug. 10. 2. ep. 19.

T. W. Who teacheth that our faith ought to rest upon the reuelation of any other Doctors than the Prophets and Apostles?

Ans. Doctor Stapleton writeth thus⁶: Euen as we beleene God reuealing vs any thing, because he is true and cannot deceiue; and if any man demand why he is true, we make no answer, &c. Euen so, we altogether beleene the Church, teaching and testifying any truth to be beleued, &c. And if it be demanded, wherefore it is so infallible a witnesse of truth: we answer, because God speaketh by the same, and hath constituted it an infallible witnesse; and here we stay our selues and doe not answer,

⁶ Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 1. ad. 7.

^b De fig. l. 16.
c. 10.

answer, because the Church seemeth to speake things consonant to the sacred Scripture, &c. And Bosius^b; *The Church by reason of the neere coniunction is bath with God, is not builded upon truth, but contrarily, truth leaneth upon it, as the column and fortresse thereof.*

Now according to this doctrine, our faith resteth not vpon the reuelation of the Prophets and Apostles, but vpon the present Popish Church.

T.W. *Shew any reason why the reuelations of the Prophets, and especially the Apostles may not as well comprehend Traditions, as the written word?*

Ans. 1. The Reuelations of the Prophets comprehended no doctrinall Traditions, because the Prophets themselues, and after them our Sauour and his Apostles, who were the guides and Pastors of the Church, did at no time mention any such, or refer people vnto them, or alleage and confirme any part of their doctrine by them.

2. If the Reuelation of the Apostles had comprehended Traditions: 1. The said Traditions would haue bene homogenous to their written word. 2. The same would haue bene generally receiued and beleued in the first Churches planted by the Apostles. 3. The Apostles would haue left behinde them some certaine rule, whereby to know them, and haue taught the faithfull from whence they should receiue them.

T.W. *He bringeth in Gerson, saying; The Scripture is the rule of our faith, which being well understood, no authoritie of men is to be admitted against it, &c. We willingly acknowledge, that the Scripture is the rule, but not the sole rule: no authoritie of man is to stand against the Scripture; but what doth this impeach Apostolicall Traditions, which are no more the bare authoritie of man than Scripture is selfe?*

^c Gers. de exam.
doct. p. 3. confid. 1.

Ans. Gerson in other places declares his meaning to be, that the holy Scripture is the only rule; for thus he writeth^c: *The Scripture is giuen vnto vs, as a rule sufficient (not a rule in part) and infallible, for the government of the whole Ecclesiasticall bodie, and all the parts thereof, to the end of the world. And all reuelation is to be suspected, which the Law and Prophets with the Gospell doth not confirme.*

T.W. *Traditions are no more the authoritie of man than the Scripture is selfe, both equally proceeding from the Holy Ghost.*

^d Gers. p. 3. de
spir. vit. anim. lect.
3. in princip.

Ans. This assertion is your owne, but not Gersons, who affirmeth not, that Traditions are of the Holy Ghost, equal with the Scripture: but he saith^d contrary to this, *That your Prelates by their Traditions destroyed the commandments of God.* 2. You are neuer able to iustifie your Popish Traditions to haue proceeded from the Holy Ghost, by authentick records of the primitive Church.

^e Perusinus.

T.W. *He comes in with Perusius, writing, that the authoritie of no Saint is of infallible truth; for Saint Augustine giues that honour onely to the sacred Scripture. But here Perusius^e and S. Augustine speake of particular Saints and private Doctors: and our question is onely, touching the Traditions of our Sauour and his Apostles, and the whole Church.*

^f De ratione con-
cionand. l. 3. c. 19.

Ans. You slip over the latter part of Perusinus^e his words, *To be of infallible truth, is the honour of the sacred Scriptures onely.* Now if it be the honour of

of sacred Scripture onely to be of infallible truth; then Traditions, which are no part of sacred Scripture, haue not this prerogatiue of infallible veritie.

T. W. Such vnprofitable and waste testimonies, *M. White* is accustomed to heape together in his booke, the which that they shall not so easily be espied, he subtilly minglesh them with other authorities more pertinent; like a good Captaine, who rangeth his worst and weakest souldiers in the midst of other more experienced, onely to increase the number, and not the force.

Ans. You are vnable to put off the weakest of these testimonies, but by coining distinctions, which the Author himselfe was ignorant of.

2. It was not Doctor Whites intent to argue singly or distributiue from his testimonies, but he produced many witnesses, whereof some auerre one part, and the rest, another part of his position; and his conclusion proceedeth iointly from them all, as a streame flowes from many springs.

3. It being granted, that some weake testimonies are found among diuers which are strong: Is it not cowardise in you to let the maine battell stand vnshocked, and to fight with a few stragling souldiers, which whether they fall or stand, is nothing to the maine cause?

Paragr. 2. Concerning the Scripture hauing the outward authoritie, whereupon faith is built, and not the Church.

T. W. The next subiect of this loose kinde of inferences, is touching the absolute and supreme soueraigntie of the Scriptures, in determining of controversies, without any needfull explication of Gods Church. This assertion being indeed a head theoreme or principle with the sectaries of this age.

Ans. Your assertion, that the Doctor and other Protestants exclude the explication of the Church, is false. We affirme^f, that the teaching of the true Church is the ordinarie meanes to determine controversies, and to proponnd and explicate the obiect of faith.

T. W. For the better vindicating vs from all calumnies, touching our supposed contempt of the Scripture, as also for the discouerie of *M. Whites* arguing, the Reader is to take notice, that the Catholikes doe ascribe all due reuerence, &c. to the Scripture; acknowledging it to be Gods embassadour, unfolding to man on earth, the sacred will of our heavenly King; the spirituall tenure, by which we claime our testiall inheritance: It is the word of God, before it receiue any approbation from the Church, and this or that, is the true sense of any particular text, before the Church confirme the same.

Ans. We doe not calumniate, but truly report the sayings of your Doctors, who if they speake not contemptuously of the sacred Scripture, let the Reader iudge. Andradius^g saith; There is no diuinitie in the very bookes themselves wherein the sacred mysteries are contained, which may tie vs with any bond of religion to beleene them. Gretser^h; We should haue had fewer controversies if we had no Scriptures. Stapletonⁱ; The word of God is no formall obiect of our faith, nor any part thereof. Costerus^k; The Scripture is a thing without any soule or sense. It is like a nose of wax and Lesbian rule; affirmed by Pighius^l, Turrian^m, Mulhu-

^f Whitak. de scrip. q. 3. p. 104. & duplic. cont. Stapl. l. 1. c. 8. §. 2. Zeeman, de colloq. Ratib. p. 2. m. l. c. 1. pag. 62. Reade my answer to the first part.

^g Defens. orth. fid. Trid. l. 2. pag. 257.
^h Gretser. de Bel. de Script. l. 4. c. 12.
ⁱ Rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 1.
^k Enchirid. de Pontif. pag. 135.
^l Pigh. cont. loc. 3. pag. 92.
^m Turrian. apud Sadacl. p. 382.

* Mulhusin. di. p.
 2. de fide.
 * To. 3. d. 1. q. 1.
 p. 7. pag. 164.
 * Rel. c. 4. q. 1.
 ar. 1. ad 2.
 * Bos. de fig. l. 16.
 c. 10.
 * Stapl. dupl. l. 1.
 c. 7. s. 9. Deum
 quidem in Scrip-
 turis loqui, sed no
 per Scripturas nos
 alloqui.

Mulhusinus^a, &c. It is rather an occasion of controuersies and discord about the doctrine of faith, than a remedie, saith Gregorie Valence^b. The Church is not subiect to the word of God, saith Stapleton^c. It is in a manner a dumbe and feeble writing, vntlesse the minde of the Church (Romane) be present to it, saith Bosius^d. And your Doctours doe not acknowledge, that the Scripture is Gods Embassadour; they say^e it is dumbe, and speaketh not vnto the faithfull, and a dumbe Embassadour is no Embassadour. Neither doe you make the same the spirituall Tenure, whereby you claime your inheritance, but onely a part and peece thereof, and yet such too as hath no force in it, in regard of any profitable vse for vs, but according to the prompting and vnfoldings of your Church.

T. W. Seeing the true sense of the Scripture is as it were the very soule which informeth the bodie of the letter: and that the Scripture is to be vnderstood by the spirit with the which it was written, to wit, with the spirit of the Holy Ghost: therefore we hold, that so far as concerneth our taking notice, that this or that is the Scripture, or this is the true sense of the passage thereof intended by the Holy Ghost, we are to recurre to the authoritie of the Church, which we beleene to be directed and guided therein by the same Holy Ghost, according as the Scripture it selfe assureth vs, 1 Tim. 3. 15. Matth. 18. 17.

* Hilari. ad Con-
 stant. Aug. p. 281.
 * Hieron. cont.
 Lucifer. p. 67.

Ans. 1. We agree in this, that the true sense of the Scripture is as it were the soule, &c. And Hilarie^f, and Hierom^g haue truly said, *The Scriptures consist not in the bare reading, but in the right vnderstanding.*

* Bos. de fig. l. 18.
 c. 6. Senire, di-
 cere, docere, scri-
 bere, heretica po-
 test.

2. We beleue that the Scripture is to be vnderstood by the same spirit whereby it was written; but this spirit resteth not in your Popes breast, who is a man subiect to error^h, but in the very Scripture it selfe, from whence the Pastors of each Church must receiue the same, and not from any new reuelation.

3. We acknowledge, that people must recurre to the true Church, speaking by the Scriptures, to be directed in the sense thereof.

4. Your last assertion, that the Church (meaning your present Romane) is guided and directed by the same Holy Ghost, (according to the same manner and degree of direction) is false. And the places of Scripture, 1 Tim. 3. 15. Matth. 18. 17. make very much against you, because they giue the same priuileges which you would appropriate to your Romane Church, to euery true particular Church of Christ on earth. For 1 Tim. 3. 15. the Apostle speaketh of the Church of Ephesus: and Matth. 18. 17. our Sauour speaketh literally of the Church of the Iewes, and consequently, of euery particular Christian Church, wherein there is the lawfull exercise of outward iurisdiction.

T. W. Let vs now come to the proofes and testimonies produced by M. White to conuince, that the Scripture so far forth as we are to take knowledge thereof, needeth not any authoritie or approbation of the Church: and he produceth 1 Pet. 1. 23. 1 Cor. 2. 4. Heb. 4. 12. &c. Now let vs see how towardsly our Minister can conclude from these texts against our former doctrine: The Scripture is an immortall seed, &c. therefore it ought to receiue no authoritie, touching the manifesting of its true sense to vs from Gods Church, which is guided by the Holy Ghost, &c. What inferences are these? Who would thinke that a learned Minister of Gods word, the via Lactea, a Doctor made onely for desert, &c. would thus extrauagantly conclude, &c.

Ans. You haue quit your selfe like a man: first to frame a Maukin or Giant of straw, and then to let driue at it; and hauing beaten it downe, to proclaime

a conquest. But proceed as you lust, and let your fautors run after you. Doctor Whites position is; *The Scripture hath that outward authoritie, whereupon our faith is built, and not the Church:* (he meaneth) *the holy Scripture is the sole outward principle and formall object, whereupon our faith is built, and not the Church.* And thus much (to trouble the Reader no further) his very first place taken out of S. Peter, 1 Pet. 1. 23. evidently proues.

The immortall seed whereby we are regenerate and made faithfull, is the onely formall principle of faith: the word of God alone is that immortall seed: *Ergo*, the word of God alone, is the onely formall principle of faith.

And euen as in husbandry, although diuers instruments and meanes be requisite and necessarie, to wit, plowing, sowing, &c. yet the seed is the beginning, and sole immediate cause of the graine springing vp: Euen so in the spirituall plantation of faith, in which our soules are *agri animati, liuing fields* *. The immortall seed which the Apostles first preached, 1 Pet. 1. 25. and afterwards committed to writing †, produceth faith, as the sole principle, immediate motive ‡ and formall object of beleeuing; and the ministerie, authoritie, and calling of the Church, produce the same as the adiuuant and instrumentall cause, or as the meanes of applying the word and seales thereof, but not as the first principle.

And the subsequent testimonies of Stapleton †, Ambrose, &c. conclude this assertion of D. White.

The authoritie of the Church (saith D. Stapleton) is a thing create, and distinct from the first veritie. Hence it followes, *ergo*, it is not the formall object or first principle of faith; because the formall object of faith is diuine and prime veritie reuealed by inspiration †, 1 Thess. 2. 13. 2 Tim. 3. 16. &c.

It is needlesse to insist vpon the other testimonies of Ambrose, Augustine, Saluianus, &c. because the Priest hath either mistaken or peruered the state of the question, pretending that Doctor White alleaged these authors, *To exclude the Churches ministeriall authoritie from being an instrumentall cause of faith*, which he neuer maintained. For let vs haue Gods written word to be the sole object of our faith, and giue vs a true Church, which preferreth not her owne helts before the sacred law of Christ, and which obserueth the holy meanes prescribed by the Apostles and primitive Church, in searching out and deliuering the truth reuealed in the Scripture: and we are ready in all things to heare this Church, and to submit our selues to Gods truth deliuered by it.

But if Satan change himselfe into an Angell of light, and Antichrist ascend into the throne of Christ; or false Prophets come vnto vs in sheeps cloathing, and with glorious pretexts of antiquitie, succession, visibilitie, &c. will seeke to leade vs away from the integritie of truth and godlinesse, we cry anathema against them, and will as soone credit the Deuill in his owne likenesse, as such hypocrites and carrions, who vnder the cloake of Religion make a prey of the bodies and soules of men.

An obseruation, concerning the object of faith.

The Schoolemen diuide the object of faith, into *objectum quod*, that is, into the *materiall object*, and into the *formall* †.

The *materiall*, are the articles and things beleued †, as that God is one essence, and three in persons; that Christ rose againe the third day, &c.

The *formall object*, is the foundation and last and maine principle whereupon faith relieth †, or that whereinto the assent, which faith yeeldeth vnto the matter beleued, is resolued.

Ratio formalis obiecti fidei, est id, quo, vel per quod, fides alicui assentitur, & quo nititur tanquam fundamento. vltimo resolutur.

Example,

* Clem. Alex.
† Iren. l. 3. c. 3.
‡ Bonau. 3. d. 24.
q. 1. Loquimur de obiecto fidei secundum propriam acceptionem: prout significat obiectum quod habet rationem motiui, &c. omniaque in sacra Scriptura continentur, tenent rationem obiecti proprii & motiui, respectu ipsius fidei, &c. quia sacra Scriptura est edita à veritate increata, & à Spiritu Sancto.
† Lib. 8. doctr. princip. c. 2. §.
† Reade Bonauenture cited immediately before, lit. 1.
Aqui. 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 1.
Alex. Hal. 3. q. 38.
m. 6. Albert. 3. d. 23. ar. 7. 1. 2.
Durand. ib. q. 7. ar. 11.
Capreol. ib. d. 24. q. vnic. ar. 1. conclus. 4.
Caietan. 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 1. Can. loc. l. 12. c. 3. Aleffed. l. 3. sum. tr. 3. c. 1. q. 3.
Marfil. 3. q. 14.
Rich. 3. d. 23. ar. 4. q. 3. Gabr. 3. d. 23. q. 2. ar. 1.

† D. Barnes 1. 2. q. 1. ar. 1.
Greg. Val. to. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 1.
† Gabr. 3. d. 24. q. vnic. not. 2.
Obiectum fidei est veritas credita, &c.
† Greg. Val. ib. In quam assentitur

Example: when I beleue the resurrection, &c. This article is a part of the materiall obiekt of faith. But the cause and maine reason, wherefore I giue assent to this and all other articles, is the authoritie of diuine reuelation: and this is called the formall obiekt of faith.

Many former Papists speaking more plainly than the Iesuities doe, *Haue made the formall obiekt and last resolution of faith to be the authoritie of the Church: Durand, Scorus, Gabriel, Almain, Michael Medina, &c.*

The moderne Papists in substance hold the same, yet to colour the absurditie of the former Tenet, they say; that *God reuealing diuine truth* is the formall obiekt, &c.

But forasmuch as God worketh mediately, and reuealeth no truth vnto vs but by externall meanes; and diuine authoritie in it selfe is hidden and vknownne; therefore the thing whereinto our faith is resolued, must be something externally knowne which we may reade or heare. And our aduersaries must either yeeld vs an externall foundation and formall obiekt of faith, or else leade vs to secret reuelation, which in termes they pretend so much to defie.

But reiecting the Scriptures, whatsoever they glose in words, they neither can nor doe name vs any other indeed, but their Romane Pope and Church.

The Protestants beleue, that *the canonically Scripture is the foundation and the principall externall cause and formall obiekt of Christian beleefe.*

And the veritie of this our doctrine is proued by these reasons.

1. The formall obiekt of faith must be something which is purely and simply diuine, admixt with no error, yea subiect to no error; the indubitate word and reuelation of Christ. But such is the holy Scripture onely; for the Romane Church and Pope are subiect to error, Rom. 11. 20. neither haue they any truth immediatly, or by diuine inspiration, but by second meanes.

2. Whatsoever credit the Church hath, it receiue the same from the Scriptures, as is acknowledged by some of our principall Aduersaries^b, and confirmed by the Apostle, who saith, *We are built vpon the foundation of the Prophets and Apostles*ⁱ, Eph. 2. 20. Chrysostome^k saith, *We know the Church onely by the Scriptures.* And Augulline^l, *In the Scriptures we learne Christ, in the Scriptures we learne the Church.* And in another place^m, *Let them demonstrate the Church by nothing but by the Canonically bookes of the diuine Scriptures: Andⁿ, The Church is our mother, and her breasts are the two Testaments of diuine Scriptures.*

3. The present faith of Christians, is of the same kinde with the faith of the Prophets and Apostles, Ephes. 2. 20. But the faith of these holy men was founded vpon immediate diuine reuelation, and not vpon the authoritie of the Church.

And yet when we yeeld this preheminance to sacred Scripture, making the same the sole formall obiekt of faith; *We doe not deprive the Church of that prerogative and office which Christ hath giuen it, to be an adiutant and administering cause in producing faith*, Rom. 10. 17. (as this Aduersarie ouer-reacheth.) But the Papists and we differ in these two points:

1. We maintaine, that the office of leading men to faith, belongeth to euery true Church, as well as to the Romane.

2. We affirme, that no Church bringeth people to faith by it owne doctrine or Tradition, but by the doctrine of the holy Scripture. Neither is any Church in the world of right to be beleued in matters which are meere of faith or diuine veritie, further than it maintaineth the doctrine taught by it, by warrant of sacred writ, and teacheth and commandeth things consentaneous to the Scriptures.

* Azor. instit. mor. p. 2. l. 5. c. 24. ubi citat hunc Doctorem.

† Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 1. conclus. 2. pag. 413. Testimonium ecclesie Cath. (Rom.) esse obiectum fidei Christiane externum, sapienter scriptum Waldensis doct. fid. l. 3. c. 21.

‡ Gerf. de potest. eccles. lect. 11. Summus Pontifex est peccabilis, & potest potestatem in destructionem conuerti: similiter collegium quod ei datum est, &c. non est in gratia confirmatum.

Lyra super Matth. 16. Multi principes & summi pontifices, & alii inferiores, inuenti sunt apostatare.

§ Azor. instit. mor. 2. l. 5. c. 24. Ecclesie fidem non habemus, nisi quia ex Scripturis docemur, ecclesie esse credendum.

¶ Greg. Val. 3. d. 1. q. 1. p. 1. Super adificationem super fundamentum Proph. & Ap. id est, vt commentarius Ambrosii interpretatur, super vet. & nou. Testam. ab Apostoli conscripserunt.

‡ Chrys. imperf. Matth. hom. 49. l. Aug. tom. 2. ep. 116.

§ De vnit. eccles. c. 16.

¶ Exposit. ep. Ioh. tr. 3.

‡ Casaubon. resp. ad. Ep. Card. Per. Rex indicat vt ante omnia, de hac regula inter omnes conueniat: Dogmata fidei, & quicquid ad salutem meretur credi, & sola Scriptura sacra peti debere, neque a quorumvis mortaliu authoritate pendere: s. d. e. verbo Dei duntaxat, quo suam ipse nobis voluntatem, per Spiritum Sanctum declarauit.

§ Aug. l. 3. cont. Peul. Don. c. 6.

Paragr. 3. *Wherein are examined some of Doctor Whites proofes, against the visibilitie of the Church.*

T. W. Another passage, whereupon our Minister spendeth his frothie and immateriall proofes is, touching the inuisiblenesse of the Church, first bearing the Reader in hand, that by inuisibilitie he meaneeth not an utter extinction or disparition of the true Church and faith; and yet after in effect he recalleth the same, and thus writeth: *When we say the Church is inuisible, we meane that all the externall government thereof may come to decay, in that the locall and personall succession of Pastors may be interrupted, the discipline hindered, the Preachers scattered, and all the outward exercise and government of religion suspended; whereby it shall come to passe, that in all the world you cannot see any one particular Church, professing the true faith, &c. by reason persecution and heresies shall haue overflowed all Churches, as Noahs floud did all the world, &c.*

Ans. If the Reader confer this 3. Paragr. of the P. Priest, with D. Whites 17. digression, he shall obserue that he hath proceeded most dishonestly.

1. My Brother in the same Digression deliuereth three positions, wherein he comprehendeth a summe of our doctrine concerning the Churches inuisibilitie; and yet T. W. rehearseth onely one of the three, containing but a part of our doctrine.

2. Alleging this second branch, he leaueth out the most materiall word in the sentence. And whereas the Doctor saith; *It may come to passe, that in all the world you cannot see one particular Church publicly professing the true faith, &c.* he hath left out the word *publicly*. And from the latter end of the sentence, he pareth off other words, to wit, *or obscured their light, as the Sunne is eclipsed, or corrupted the sinceritie of religion, as a leprosie or scab ouergroweth the whole bodie of a man; and hideth euery member, &c.* Which words being added, shew the true meaning of my Brothers assertion, and which without them, seemeth other than it is.

3. He ouer-reacheth in charging him with saying, that Catholikes doe generally teach the like inuisibilitie of the Church. For speaking indefinitely, *in materia contingenti*, to wit, Papists say, that the Church is inuisible; he chargeth onely some Papists with saying thus.

4. Whereas my Brother alleageth Pererius and Ouendus, onely to proue the finalnesse of the number of professors, and adioyneth their testimonie to the first member of his three assertions; the Priest cauillet against the same, pretending that they were produced to proue an extinction and generall inuisibilitie of the Church.

5. Omitting his detorting of the testimonies, of Bossius, Soto, Greg. Valence, &c. which are alleaged to one purpose by my Brother; and the Priest maketh his illations from them, as though they had bene vttered to another: He saith, pag. 162. *After our Doctor hath ended with Catholike writers, he beginneth to proue the inuisibilitie of the Church from the authoritie of the Fathers, Chrysostome, &c.* Now in all this Section, he alleageth neither Chrysostome, nor any other Father. In the 18. Digression he produceth Chrysostome, to proue that the Church is tried by the Scriptures, but not to shew the Church is inuisible.

6. Our Aduersarie himselfe hauing egregiously plaid the Fox or Goose-eater, breaketh off full grauely, and as becometh a Catholike Priest, with a conceit of a Lancashire dish, intending, it seemes, to let the Reader vnderstand, that he is better qualified for the chaire of a scorne, than the office of a Divinus.

T. W.

T. W. Now if the discipline may bee hindered, the Preachers scattered, &c. Then shall not the word be preached, nor the sacraments ministred, which are by our Adversaries principles, inseparable marks of the true Church; and they being taken away, the Church for the time be utterly extinct.

Ans. These two assertions; The true Church shall never bee extinct, and the discipline of the true Church may be hindered, and the Preachers scattered, involve no contradiction, as the examples following doe shew. In the Acts of the Apostles, chap. 8. 4. the Preachers were scattered, and in the daies of Cyprian the discipline was hindered: In the times of the Arrians, godly Pastors lurked in woods, caves, deserts, &c. and yet the true Church was not extinguished.

That which is hindered, is not utterly destroyed, and Preachers may bee dispersed, and forced to cease from open preaching in publicke congregations, and yet exercise their function of preaching and administering Sacraments in secret, to such of the faithfull as will joine with them.

And I entreat the Reader to consider, whether Suarez the Iesuite doe not vpon the matter, deliuer as much touching the inuisibilitie of the Church in the time of Antichrists reigne, as my brother; setting aside onely the difference of longer and shorter time?

1. He saith*, That the persecution moved by Antichrist, shall be farre more cruel, tyrannicall and bitter, both in regard of the end and meanes, than any precedent persecution of Heretikes or Tyrants.

2. This persecution shall principally bend it selfe against the very faith and profession of Christianitie, and it shall compell Christians to denie Christ, publickly to forsake all the worship of God, and all rites and ceremonies. And hee produceth Irenaeus, Hippolytus, &c. saying: *That through the acerbities of this persecution, all divine worship accustomed to be exhibited by Christians, and the principal part thereof, to wit, the sacrifice of the Eucharist, shall cease.*

3. The said persecution shall be the most vniuersall of all other.

4. The greater part of the faithfull shall fall away by Apostacie from Christ.

5. The faithfull which remaine and many Confessors, shall continue in caves and secret places, and in them exercise the vse of Sacraments.

6. Bartholomew Iandonecius taught, That the Church in Antichrists reigne, should consist onely of Infants baptiz'd.

7. It is probable, that in the miserable daies of Antichrist his reigne, The Pope himselfe shall professe his faith in secret.

Now if Antichrists persecution must exceed all others in tyrannie, in vniuersality, and in effect or preuailing: it shall make both a greater haucke and destruction of faithfull persons and religion, and also a greater latencie and dissipation of the Church, than any former persecution euer did. But in the daies of Antiochus Epiphanes, and vnder some persecuting Roman Emperors, and in the great persecution of the Arrians*, the visible state of the Orthodox Church, was so obscured and betrampled, that outward religion, preaching, &c. in publicke view and toleration of the world, was interrupted and suspended, and the Church exercising religion, by preaching, sacraments, &c. was latent. Therefore in the persecution of Antichrist, so farre exceeding all the former which are named, there shall be a greater inuisibilitie of the Church.

Lastly, concerning the peruerse and absurd illations which our Priest propoeth, the Reader is to be aduertised, that the same are the mishapen birth of his owne pate, and not one of them extant in D. White.

He indeed affirmeth, that the true Church publickly exercising Christian re-

ligion

* Cyp. de lapsis.
Aug. cont. parmen. l. 3. c. 3.
* Hilar. cont. Auxent.

* Suar. in 3. to. 2. d. 54. sect. 6.
Sotus in 4. d. 46. q. 1. ar. 1.
Suar. def. fid. Cath. cont. sect. Angl. l. 5. c. 5. Tribulatio Antichristi erit ita magna, vt nulla similis antea fuerit, vel futura sit postea p. 658. Ludolph. vita Christi. p. 1. c. 46. lb. In sanctis & Christianis incredibilem defolationem efficit.
Ruard. Tapper. artic. 16. de sacr. Missae.
* D. Bannes 2. 3. q. 1. ar. 10.
Director. inquisit. p. 3. q. 11. d. 15.
Maluend. d. Antichristi. l. 8. c. 16.
Suar. l. 5. cont. sect. Angl. c. 31. Aug. Triumph. sum. d. eccles. postest. q. 31. ar. 4. Illo tempore vt glossa dicit, particulares ecclesie vndique per orbem diffusa, subtrahent se ab obedientia Rom. pontificis, ita vt pauci ei obediant, & Papa tunc temporis, circa partes Romanas se recluderet cum paucis: alij ab obedientia eius subtraherent.
* Hieron. in Psal. 133. Ante viginti annos, heretici omnes ecclesias has possidebant, &c. Basil. epist. 69.
Barr. harmon. to. 3. l. 4. c. 13. postest hic loc. (Luc. 18. 8.) explicari de fide simpliciter: illa vt significet Christum, extremo illo tempore fore paucos fideles Christianos. Si quidem persecutione Antichristi agitati, a fide recedant plerique, pauci vero constentabunt. Maluend. d. Antichristi. l. 8. c. 4. 9. 11. 12. fugies tunc Ecclesia, cruculenta persecutionis contrita, in loca deserta, semota, in antra, speluncaeque in vios saltus, loca cuncta densissimis arboribus & fruticibus. Supremus ecclesie pastor cum sanctis delinset, &c. Caluan. Luc. 18. 8.

ligion, by preaching and Sacraments, may at some times be *respectively*, (that is, to the enemies of Religion, and greater part of the world) unknowne and latent: but also he teacheth, that at the same time it is visible to such of the faithfull as haue communion therewith. And to this scope hee hath alleaged the testimonies of his authors.

Now T. W. pretendeth, and accordingly to euery testimonie annexeth a sequele, that Doctor White holdeth the Church may bee absolutely inuisible, and that all profession of faith (yea, hee shameth not to charge him with saying, all true faith) may cease to be. And this abusive demeanor is so much the more iniust, because my brother, in the very place whence these things are taken, hath expressly deliuered the contrary, saying; *That the true Church neuer ceaseth, either in regard of being, or profession of faith, nor is simply and generally latent and inuisible at any time, but respectiuely onely, to Infidels, Heretikes, and Tyrants, who haue not spirituall prudence to know and discern it.*

Dynamic of Antichrist usurped the Temples of God. Upon Apoc. 12. n. 1. The true members of the Church were knowne, though not alwaies to their enemies. D. Whitaker. de nat. eccles. cont. Bellar. 3. c. 1. pag. 160. Iam cont. Bellar. l. 4. c. 15. Bradf. all. mon. The Church is visible to them that will put on the spectacles of Gods word to looke upon her.

D. Fulke against Rhem. Math. 5. n. 3. The Church can neuer be hid from them which will diligently seek her in the Scriptures. And Act. 2. n. 13. No Papist is able so proue that there was any visible Church for five or six hundred yeeres after Christ, that maintained all the chiefe points of Poperie, wherein we differ. Lu. 10. l. 1. n. 1. The messings of Christians were as obscure in time of persecution, as they haue bene since the

Paragr. 4. Concerning the Protestants markes of the Church.

T. W. Master White p. 104. &c. undertaketh to proue, that the true doctrine of faith, and lawfull use of the Sacraments, are the proper and infallible markes, whereby it must be iudged which is the true Church. And in prooffe hereof, hee produceth diuers passages of Scripture, Ioh. 10. 27. &c. But from these places, My sheepe heare my voice, &c. what Alchymist can extract that sense or meaning, which shall prouethat true doctrine is a sufficient marke to vs, whereby wee may infallibly discern which is the true Church of God?

Ans. 1. In stead of proper and infallible markes, which my brother saith, you foist in the word, *sufficient*. It is possible for a thing to bee proper and infallible, and yet not sufficient of it selfe without other meanes, to apply or declare it.

2 Doctor White Digress. 18. Numb. 3. declared how his assertion was proued by the said places, Ioh. 10. &c. which you dissemble, and shape no answer to.

3. It is no Chymicall feat, but a proper and solid manner of concluding, to demonstrate the subject by the actions & properties. Thus a wise man and a iust man are notified and described, and thus the tree is knowne by the fruit. Euen so our Saviour and the Apostles deliuer certaine operations and properties of the Church and people, whom they call by the name of a flocke and house, Luk. 12. 1 Tim. 3. and Doctor White by the same proueth and differenceth the Church in this or the like manner of reasoning.

Those are the notes of the Church, which make people to bee the sheepe of Christ and household of God, and demonstrate them to bee such. But hearing of Christs voice, and building themselves by faith vpon the foundation of the Prophets and Apostles, make people the sheepe of Christ and household of God, and demonstrate them to bee such, Ioh. 10. 27. Ephes. 2. 20. Ergo, hearing Christs voice, and building themselves by faith vpon the foundations of the Prophets and Apostles, are notes of the Church.

Obiect. 1. But this proueth not true doctrine to be a note.

Ans. The voice of Christ and true doctrine are equipollent, and of the same notion. Ioh. 17. 17. 1 Tim. 2. 4. 2 Thess. 2. 12. Iam. 1. 18.

Obiect. 2. It proueth not true doctrine contained in the Scripture to bee a sufficient note.

Ans. Presupposing the Scripture to bee the onely obiect of Catholike faith, (which Doctor White hath elsewhere confirmed) it proues, that true doctrine contained in the Scripture, is a sufficient marke.

T. W. How shall we know who are Christs sheepe? you will say, by their hearing of Christs voice, or profession of true doctrine. But how can wee know, abstracting the authoritie of the Church, who haue true doctrine, and which are they that heare Christs voice?

Ans. Christ hath set this brand vpon his sheepe; that if they heare his voice, they are of his flocke. Now there be two meanes to know that they haue true doctrine, and heare his voice. 1. One principall, to wit, the Scripture, which by it owne authoritie demonstrates the same. 2. The other instrumentall, to wit, the ministerie of the Church, which by declaring the Doctrine of the Scripture, as an adiuuant cause, leadeth vnto the knowledge thereof.

Obiect. Before Luther there was no other Church but the Romane, and the same described Christs sheepe by doctrine and markes, which Protestants refuse.

Ans. 1. Besides the Romane, there was the ancient primitive Church, whose testimonie the faithfull might from their writings enquire.

2. In the Church Romane, there were some firme members, which maintained the same doctrine in the principall parts which we now doe.

3. True doctrine in the foundation, beleueed with a right faith, is a note of Christs sheepe, and many in the Romane Church professed that doctrine, by whose ministerie the Protestants received the said fundamentall truth; and also these, by searching the Scriptures, and by the ministerie of such as departed from the corruptions of the Romane Church, attained a farther increase of truth, and freedome from errors.

T. W. How should I be ascertained that people doe beare the word truly preached, and enioy a right administration of Sacraments? Here my answer is as a stand, and flicth for sanctuarie to his Apocalypsicall and reuealing spirit, &c. Thus it is cleere in what circles and mazes Master White walketh.

Ans. You must first know the doctrine before you can be ascertained hereof by infused faith: euen as before you can know a iust and wise man, you must vnderstand what iustice and wisdom are.

2. It is the absurditie of the Romane Church to relie vpon an Apocalypsicall and reuealing spirit, to wit, the Popes spirit. But Protestants, 1. In regard of the obiect of faith, relie vpon the publike doctrine of the Prophets and Apostles reuealed in the Scripture. 2. And in regard of the meanes of receiuing and vnderstanding of that doctrine, they relie (as vpon the rules of a skilfull and faithfull master) vpon the ministerie of the present Church wherein they liue, when the same is not euidently corrupt: or so farre as it is incorrupt: And in apparent corrupt times, vpon the ministerie of the firme members of the Church: and if they cannot haue access to such, vpon the ministerie of the precedent orthodox Church. And lastly, in case of necessitie, to wit, when they are solitarie (as Ioseph in Ægypt, Daniel in Babylon, &c.) vpon the holy Scripture it selfe, and true doctrine thereof, which by their owne meditation therein, God enableth them to finde out.

¹ Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 3. not 4. In conclusione est prophetica & diuina, &c. Gred. def. Bel. de Script. l. 3. append. Authoritas summi Pontif. est humana diuinitus inspirata. ² Greg. Val. l. 3. c. 1. q. 1. p. 1. Supra fundamentum Proph. & Apost. Eph. 2. id est, vt commentarius Ambrosij interpretatur, supra nouum & vetus testamentum, ab Apostolis conscripsum.

³ Btius 4. sent. d. 23. 6. 13. quoniam nunc ordinariū medium sit ecclesie reuificatio, & doctrina, constat tamen alijs vijs seu medijs, fidem collatam, fuisse aliquando, & adhuc conferri. Suar. def. fid. cath. cont. sect. Angl. l. 1. c. 10. Neque negam interdum Spiritum sanctum priuim docere aliquos de mysterijs fidei, vel de vero sensu Scripturæ, tali modo, &c. Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 3. ar. 3. s. ad. 1. Sola interna reuelatio, ad fidem aliquando efficaciter inducit: cum externa media, non contemptus docentis ecclesie, sed articulus necessitatis excludit. See the example of Ananias the Hermit, in Aug. prolog. lib. de doctr. Christi. Cassiod. de offic. boni viri. 49.

And

And our Aduersaries, when their facing is past, are faine to relie vpon a private spirit as much as Protestants doe. Bannes^a saith; *This is the reason of beleening, that Christ is God, because we haue receiued the testimonie of God within vs, God himselfe illuminating our mindes.* And Stapleton^b: *The last resolution of faith is God, inwardly reuealing in the heart.*

And as the Popish Priest demandeth of mee, how I know that this is the Scripture, or the sense thereof; so I demand of him, how hee knoweth by diuine faith, that this is the Church, or that the Church teacheth truth? And in his answer (rejecting diuine illumination by the Scripture^c) he shall either resolve his faith touching these things into humane authoritie, to wit, the generall opinion of former ages, the multitude of such as beleue the same, his forefathers beleefe, &c. or else puzzle himselfe in mazes and circles which hee can neuer vnfold^d.

^a Deo, intus operante in nobis, &c. Dicimus verum esse, omnes Christianos credere euangelio, ex inspiratione Spiritus sancti intus loquentis & docentis. ^b Greg. tract. de agnosc. Script. canon. c. 4. p. 1888.

^a 2. 2. q. 1. ar. 1. concl. 6.
^b Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 1. ar. 2. ad 3.
^c Stapl. ib. ad 5. Omne lumen & alia demonstrat & seipsum. Pers. Aiala de Trad. p. 3. Sicut sensus visus, per ipsum lumen videt ipsum & alia, &c.
^d Driedo, d. ecclesi. dogm. li. 2. ca. 3. Nos neque falli neque decipi, reuera nobis persuasum habemus

T. W. He produceth Epiphanius^e saying of an heretike, *This man is found altogether different from the Scriptures, &c. If then hee bee dissenting from them, he is altogether an alien from the Catholike Church. Here wee grant, that hee which in faith dissenteth from the Scripture, dissenteth from the Church; but it proueth not, that the doctrine of faith and ministration of Sacraments, are markes to demonstrate the Church.*

^e To. 1. l. 2. h. 2. ref. 45.

Ans. That is a marke of the Church, the want whereof maketh one altogether an alien from the Church; but want of true faith doth this, according to Epiphanius. The maior is proued from the description of a marke or note belonging to spirituall things, which is something proper to them, and which being present, doth demonstrate them, and being absent proueth their not being.

T. W. He produceth M. Reynolds^f his words, saying: *The true Church and the true faith are so knit together, that the one inferreth and concludeth the other: for from the true Church is concluded the true faith, and from the true faith, the true Church. But these words proue not that faith is more knowne to vs than the true Church, or serueth as an euident marke as well to learned as vnlarned to point out the Church.*

^f Caluiniture. l. 4. c. 9. pag. 859.

Ans. If according to Master Reynolds, true faith concludeth the Church, then it is better knowne to them to whom it serueth for a prooffe; for in concluding, the orderly proceeding is from better knowne to lesse knowne.

Obiect. It concludeth it not to the ignorant and vnlarned.

Ans. No more doth any thing else. And it is impossible for such as are altogether ignorant of the doctrine, to know the Church by diuine faith, vntill they attaine knowledge; euen as vntill a man haue some wisdom, hee is vnable to know a wise man, as such, but onely by opinion.

T. W. Doctor White produceth Picus Mirandula^g, saying: *That the Scripture is knowne vnto vs before the Church, &c.*

^g Pic. Mirand. ap. Posseu. bibl. l. de Cicerou. c. 11. pag. 18.

Ans. My brother produceth this Author, to proue that the Scriptures may be discerned to bee Gods word, (of such as with wisdom and vse of the meanes conuerse in them) by certaine characters and qualities existing in themselves; and that therefore our beleefe of them dependeth not solely or principally vpon the authoritie of the Church: but also vpon the very Scriptures themselves.

Paragr. 5. Concerning the examining of the doctrine of the Church.

T. W. Master White labouring to depresse the Churches authoritie, &c. giueth the reines to every priuate and ignorant fellow, vnder the tecture and pretext of Gods secret illuminations, to iudge his owne Iudge, and so to call in question the reputation and honour of the Church, &c.

^b Cyr. ep. 31. Exorto gubernaculo nauum ecclesiastica salutis in scopulos illidas, &c. Item. 3. c. 20. Confugere oportet ad ecclesiam, & eius sum educari, & dominici scripturis enutrir.

^c Cyr. d. vnic. eccles. Episcopatus vnus est, cuius a singulis in solidum pars tenetur, &c. Gerf. de auct. Papaz. confid. 8. Marculus de Padua sentit quemlibet episcopum in sua diocesi, aequalem esse Papaz.

^d Gerf. de Circuncis. confid. 3. Papa vsurpauit omnia membrorum officia, &c. Zabarel de schilf. pag. 560. Ex hoc innuitur secuti sunt errores, quia Papa occupauit omnia iura inferiorum ecclesiarum.

^e Aug. in Ioh. tr. 30. quidam in scripturis tam manifesta sunt, ut potius auditorem quam expostorem desiderant.

^f Basil. reg. contr. 235.

^g Hier. c. Vigil.

^h Clem. Alex.

Strom. li. 7. intelligitur ab ijs qui a domino sunt electi ad cognitionem, id est qui sunt (ut ait Apostolus) exercitati sensibus probos dicat & eos qui venientes ad fidem, maiore electione accedunt ad doctrinam dominicam, tanquam probos argentarios, qui nummum domini adulterinum discernunt ex falsa impressione.

ⁱ D. Biffon. subiect. par. 2. pag. 353. Chrys. 2 Cor. hom. 13. Quomodo non absurdum propter pecunias, alij non credere, sed ipsas numerare: pro rebus autem amplioribus, aliorum sententiam sequi simpliciter, praesertim cum habeamus omnium exactissimam veritatem, & promissionem, & regulam, diuinarum legum assertionem. Ideo obsecro, & oro vos ut relinquatis quidam huic aut illi videatur, deque hijs a Scripturis omnia haec inquirite. Greg. m. in 4. ca. Cantic. in Baptismo electi quique donum spiritus sancti accipiunt, quo illuminati, scripturae sacrae sensum intelligunt. Origen. in Mattheum. 25. Lectio scripturarum magnam & venerabilem facit sensum. Ephrem. d. patient. & consum. ser. audis frater, quod Dei scientiam accipias, qui simplici veritate corde, diuinis vacas scripturis. Greg. m. non audent impugnare sed credere. Cusan. exercit. I. 6. Sicut tumentum obedit domino suo, Bonau. & Sur. vita Francisci. c. 6. Cetera obedientia ut quis sit sicut corpus exanime, quod requiescit ubi quis praeuerit sine motu.

^k Aug. in Ioh. tr. 30. quidam in scripturis tam manifesta sunt, ut potius auditorem quam expostorem desiderant.

^l Basil. reg. contr. 235.

^m Hier. c. Vigil.

ⁿ Clem. Alex.

Strom. li. 7. intelligitur ab ijs qui a domino sunt electi ad cognitionem, id est qui sunt (ut ait Apostolus) exercitati sensibus probos dicat & eos qui venientes ad fidem, maiore electione accedunt ad doctrinam dominicam, tanquam probos argentarios, qui nummum domini adulterinum discernunt ex falsa impressione.

^o D. Biffon. subiect. par. 2. pag. 353. Chrys. 2 Cor. hom. 13. Quomodo non absurdum propter pecunias, alij non credere, sed ipsas numerare: pro rebus autem amplioribus, aliorum sententiam sequi simpliciter, praesertim cum habeamus omnium exactissimam veritatem, & promissionem, & regulam, diuinarum legum assertionem. Ideo obsecro, & oro vos ut relinquatis quidam huic aut illi videatur, deque hijs a Scripturis omnia haec inquirite. Greg. m. in 4. ca. Cantic. in Baptismo electi quique donum spiritus sancti accipiunt, quo illuminati, scripturae sacrae sensum intelligunt. Origen. in Mattheum. 25. Lectio scripturarum magnam & venerabilem facit sensum. Ephrem. d. patient. & consum. ser. audis frater, quod Dei scientiam accipias, qui simplici veritate corde, diuinis vacas scripturis. Greg. m. non audent impugnare sed credere. Cusan. exercit. I. 6. Sicut tumentum obedit domino suo, Bonau. & Sur. vita Francisci. c. 6. Cetera obedientia ut quis sit sicut corpus exanime, quod requiescit ubi quis praeuerit sine motu.

^p Aug. in Ioh. tr. 30. quidam in scripturis tam manifesta sunt, ut potius auditorem quam expostorem desiderant.

^q Basil. reg. contr. 235.

^r Hier. c. Vigil.

^s Clem. Alex.

Strom. li. 7. intelligitur ab ijs qui a domino sunt electi ad cognitionem, id est qui sunt (ut ait Apostolus) exercitati sensibus probos dicat & eos qui venientes ad fidem, maiore electione accedunt ad doctrinam dominicam, tanquam probos argentarios, qui nummum domini adulterinum discernunt ex falsa impressione.

^t D. Biffon. subiect. par. 2. pag. 353. Chrys. 2 Cor. hom. 13. Quomodo non absurdum propter pecunias, alij non credere, sed ipsas numerare: pro rebus autem amplioribus, aliorum sententiam sequi simpliciter, praesertim cum habeamus omnium exactissimam veritatem, & promissionem, & regulam, diuinarum legum assertionem. Ideo obsecro, & oro vos ut relinquatis quidam huic aut illi videatur, deque hijs a Scripturis omnia haec inquirite. Greg. m. in 4. ca. Cantic. in Baptismo electi quique donum spiritus sancti accipiunt, quo illuminati, scripturae sacrae sensum intelligunt. Origen. in Mattheum. 25. Lectio scripturarum magnam & venerabilem facit sensum. Ephrem. d. patient. & consum. ser. audis frater, quod Dei scientiam accipias, qui simplici veritate corde, diuinis vacas scripturis. Greg. m. non audent impugnare sed credere. Cusan. exercit. I. 6. Sicut tumentum obedit domino suo, Bonau. & Sur. vita Francisci. c. 6. Cetera obedientia ut quis sit sicut corpus exanime, quod requiescit ubi quis praeuerit sine motu.

^u Aug. in Ioh. tr. 30. quidam in scripturis tam manifesta sunt, ut potius auditorem quam expostorem desiderant.

^v Basil. reg. contr. 235.

^w Hier. c. Vigil.

^x Clem. Alex.

Strom. li. 7. intelligitur ab ijs qui a domino sunt electi ad cognitionem, id est qui sunt (ut ait Apostolus) exercitati sensibus probos dicat & eos qui venientes ad fidem, maiore electione accedunt ad doctrinam dominicam, tanquam probos argentarios, qui nummum domini adulterinum discernunt ex falsa impressione.

^y D. Biffon. subiect. par. 2. pag. 353. Chrys. 2 Cor. hom. 13. Quomodo non absurdum propter pecunias, alij non credere, sed ipsas numerare: pro rebus autem amplioribus, aliorum sententiam sequi simpliciter, praesertim cum habeamus omnium exactissimam veritatem, & promissionem, & regulam, diuinarum legum assertionem. Ideo obsecro, & oro vos ut relinquatis quidam huic aut illi videatur, deque hijs a Scripturis omnia haec inquirite. Greg. m. in 4. ca. Cantic. in Baptismo electi quique donum spiritus sancti accipiunt, quo illuminati, scripturae sacrae sensum intelligunt. Origen. in Mattheum. 25. Lectio scripturarum magnam & venerabilem facit sensum. Ephrem. d. patient. & consum. ser. audis frater, quod Dei scientiam accipias, qui simplici veritate corde, diuinis vacas scripturis. Greg. m. non audent impugnare sed credere. Cusan. exercit. I. 6. Sicut tumentum obedit domino suo, Bonau. & Sur. vita Francisci. c. 6. Cetera obedientia ut quis sit sicut corpus exanime, quod requiescit ubi quis praeuerit sine motu.

^z Aug. in Ioh. tr. 30. quidam in scripturis tam manifesta sunt, ut potius auditorem quam expostorem desiderant.

^{aa} Basil. reg. contr. 235.

^{ab} Hier. c. Vigil.

^{ac} Clem. Alex.

Strom. li. 7. intelligitur ab ijs qui a domino sunt electi ad cognitionem, id est qui sunt (ut ait Apostolus) exercitati sensibus probos dicat & eos qui venientes ad fidem, maiore electione accedunt ad doctrinam dominicam, tanquam probos argentarios, qui nummum domini adulterinum discernunt ex falsa impressione.

^{ad} D. Biffon. subiect. par. 2. pag. 353. Chrys. 2 Cor. hom. 13. Quomodo non absurdum propter pecunias, alij non credere, sed ipsas numerare: pro rebus autem amplioribus, aliorum sententiam sequi simpliciter, praesertim cum habeamus omnium exactissimam veritatem, & promissionem, & regulam, diuinarum legum assertionem. Ideo obsecro, & oro vos ut relinquatis quidam huic aut illi videatur, deque hijs a Scripturis omnia haec inquirite. Greg. m. in 4. ca. Cantic. in Baptismo electi quique donum spiritus sancti accipiunt, quo illuminati, scripturae sacrae sensum intelligunt. Origen. in Mattheum. 25. Lectio scripturarum magnam & venerabilem facit sensum. Ephrem. d. patient. & consum. ser. audis frater, quod Dei scientiam accipias, qui simplici veritate corde, diuinis vacas scripturis. Greg. m. non audent impugnare sed credere. Cusan. exercit. I. 6. Sicut tumentum obedit domino suo, Bonau. & Sur. vita Francisci. c. 6. Cetera obedientia ut quis sit sicut corpus exanime, quod requiescit ubi quis praeuerit sine motu.

^{ae} Aug. in Ioh. tr. 30. quidam in scripturis tam manifesta sunt, ut potius auditorem quam expostorem desiderant.

^{af} Basil. reg. contr. 235.

^{ag} Hier. c. Vigil.

^{ah} Clem. Alex.

Strom. li. 7. intelligitur ab ijs qui a domino sunt electi ad cognitionem, id est qui sunt (ut ait Apostolus) exercitati sensibus probos dicat & eos qui venientes ad fidem, maiore electione accedunt ad doctrinam dominicam, tanquam probos argentarios, qui nummum domini adulterinum discernunt ex falsa impressione.

^{ai} D. Biffon. subiect. par. 2. pag. 353. Chrys. 2 Cor. hom. 13. Quomodo non absurdum propter pecunias, alij non credere, sed ipsas numerare: pro rebus autem amplioribus, aliorum sententiam sequi simpliciter, praesertim cum habeamus omnium exactissimam veritatem, & promissionem, & regulam, diuinarum legum assertionem. Ideo obsecro, & oro vos ut relinquatis quidam huic aut illi videatur, deque hijs a Scripturis omnia haec inquirite. Greg. m. in 4. ca. Cantic. in Baptismo electi quique donum spiritus sancti accipiunt, quo illuminati, scripturae sacrae sensum intelligunt. Origen. in Mattheum. 25. Lectio scripturarum magnam & venerabilem facit sensum. Ephrem. d. patient. & consum. ser. audis frater, quod Dei scientiam accipias, qui simplici veritate corde, diuinis vacas scripturis. Greg. m. non audent impugnare sed credere. Cusan. exercit. I. 6. Sicut tumentum obedit domino suo, Bonau. & Sur. vita Francisci. c. 6. Cetera obedientia ut quis sit sicut corpus exanime, quod requiescit ubi quis praeuerit sine motu.

^{aj} Aug. in Ioh. tr. 30. quidam in scripturis tam manifesta sunt, ut potius auditorem quam expostorem desiderant.

^{ak} Basil. reg. contr. 235.

^{al} Hier. c. Vigil.

^{am} Clem. Alex.

Strom. li. 7. intelligitur ab ijs qui a domino sunt electi ad cognitionem, id est qui sunt (ut ait Apostolus) exercitati sensibus probos dicat & eos qui venientes ad fidem, maiore electione accedunt ad doctrinam dominicam, tanquam probos argentarios, qui nummum domini adulterinum discernunt ex falsa impressione.

Ans. 1. Master White acknowledgeth the lawfull and healthfull authoritie of the Church, and beleueeth the same to be no lesse needfull, than the Pilot in a ship^h, and the watch of a Shepherd in a flocke; but euen as each ship and every flocke are to haue their seuerall Pilots and Shepherds: so the Churches of England, Rome, Denmarke, France, &c. must haue Bishops and Pastors to gouerne and feed the flocke, which dependeth vpon them, and the gouernment of each nationall Church is perfite and sufficient in it selfe: wee doe not therefore oppose the authoritie of the Church, but the vsurpation of the Pope, who transgressing the bounds of his owne Dioces, inuadeth the rights of other Churches^k.

2. You ouer-reach, in saying, that Doctor White giueth the reines to every priuate and ignorant fellow, by a secret illumination to iudge the Church. For hee maintaineth, both, that all iudgement of Doctrine must be made by the rule of faith and the holy Scriptures, in the plaine passages thereof^a, with other conuenient helps and meanes, and not by any priuate spirit and illumination. And also, that the triall and examining of Doctrine in the Church, belongeth to the faithfull^l respectiue, according to their gifts and calling. A blinde man cannot iudge of colours, and a rude and ignorant person is lesse able to examine Controuersies and deepe points in religion^t. But Doctor White maintaineth, that such of the faithfull in Christs Church, as by reason of vlc, haue their senses exercised to discern good and euill^a, Heb. 5. 14. Coloss. 1. 9. Rom. 15. 14. haue a right^m, To use that kinde of iudgement which is called the iudgement of discretion, whereby they may bee enabled with vnderstanding, to yeeld assent and obedience to the right faith propounded vnto them by their Pastorsⁿ; and to eschue the poisoned doctrine of heretikes and deceiuers.

It is the manner of our Aduersaries in disputations, to decline the true state of the question, and to impose some absurd tenet vpon vs: and thus they deale in this matter; for the purpose of the Protestants, in the same, is onely this, to maintaine against the Romists, *The right of every true Church*, in examining the doctrine which they receiue or professe, by the holy Scripture, and other helps and meanes of true iudgement: and to oppose the Popish tyrannie, who would haue all Churches like a blinde Mill-horseⁿ, ready to receiue whatsoever faith a proud and vallettered Pope shall obtrude vpon them.

Against this vsurpation we defend, that every nationall Church hath a right within it selfe, to trie and examine by the lawfull rule, the Doctrine which it receiue and professeth. And every member of the Church *respectiue to his calling and gifts*, (not otherwise) hath a proportionall share in the same.

But it is farre from vs, to place each presumptuous and ignorant fellow in a Consistorie of iudgement, or to set a blinde horse to go before others, or to suffer

any vulgar person so bee his owne caruer, in receiuing or refusing publike doctrine according to a priuate humour, but wee assigne to euery member of the Church, a function fitting for him, and no other; obseruing in this matter especially the Apostles precept, Let euery thing be done in good order, 1 Cor. 14.

T. W. *Catholikes teach, that the bond of subiecting ones selfe to the Churches authoritie, is properly incumbent vpon Christians who are baptized, and not vpon Infidels or Iewes.*

Ans. We acknowledge, that Christians are subiect to the Churches authoritie, but with these limitations. 1. The authoritie thereof must be lawfull, and builded vpon the foundation of the Prophets and Apostles, Eph. 2. 20. 2. The Romane Church hath no greater authoritie than other Churches: And Christians are subiect to the Church when they obey the Lawes of their owne nationall or prouinciall Church, directing them according to godlinesse and truth, &c.

T. W. *Although Heretikes sinne in doubting of the Churches authoritie, yet they doe not enill to examine the doctrine of the Church, if they proceed herein with a desire of finding out the truth.*

Ans. What if the Pastors of the Church be Hereticall, Act. 20. 29. and all or some of the people orthodox; shall it not bee lawfull for beleeuers to examine the doctrine of these corrupt and blinde guides? Luke 6. 39. Indeed your Cardinall Tolet^e affirmeth; *That it is meritorious for a vulgar person to beleene hereticall doctrine propounded to him by a Popish Bishop, untill it be manifest to him, that the same is against the Church.*

his eloquia (Deut. 13. 1. 3.) respexerunt, & prophete atque pastoris sui licet admirarentur eloquentiam, sententiam tamen non ignorarunt, &c. Ambrosii. li. 1. Ep. 2. Sapientia diuina inenarrabilis, impermixta, atque incorrupta, sanctorum animis sui insudat gratiam, & cognitionem reuelat, vt speculentur eius gloriam.

Tolet. inst. Sacerd. l. c. 3. Vincent. Lyrin. c. hær. c. 16. Soudbene quod commissæ ipsi oues Christi, multum pro Catholica fide vigilantes, & caute, cito ad præmonitis Mo-

T. W. *To proue his former positions, Doctor White vrgeth these places of the Apostle, 1 Thess. 5. 21. 1 Ioh. 4. 1. Matth. 7. 15. Act. 17. 11. &c. But these places, some of them onely proue, that such persons as by their calling, are appointed watchmen ouer the house of Israel, namely Bishops and Pastors, are to examine doctrine and spirits, and not euery particular member of the Church.*

Ans. 1. But you will permit no Watchmen in the house of Israel, to try or examine your Popes spirit; and although he draw innumerable soules after him to Hell, no man may say, Our Lord Pope why doe you so? And if you will bee constant in this you haue spoken, touching the watchmen of the house of Israel, and permit the Bishops and Pastors of the Church of England to try and examine your Trent doctrine by the rule of holy Scripture, and modell of the primitiue Church, and to refuse the same so farre as it is repugnant to right faith; Master White will giue you leaue to abound in your owne sense, in the other branch of your assertion, about the plebeitie and vulgar people.

T. W. *Christ saith, beware of false Prophets; therefore euery primate man is to examine the doctrine of all the Prophets and Pastors of the Church assembled together in a generall Councell.*

Ans. Silence would haue honored you, (Prou. 17. 28.) rather than this impudent belying your Aduersarie. Gods Prophets are our Iudges, 1 Ioh. 5. 45. we presume not to iudge them*, but without farther inquisition, we presently submit our faith to their doctrine, when it is manifested vnto vs by the true Church. But indeed we examine and refuse the Councils which your Pope at

* Aug. de verb. Apost. serm. 29. * Greg. m. li. 20. mor. ca. 1. non iudicaturi, sed securi- tati audiant, &c.

q De verb. Dei,
l. 4. c. 10.

these daies assemblen, vpon these grounds: 1. Your Cardinall Bellarmine q saith; That without question the cleere testimonies of holy Scripture are to bee preferred before all decrees of generall Councils: But we haue cleere testimonies of holy Scripture, that many things are false which are decreed in your Trent Councell, and by name communion in one kinde, Matth. 26. 27. Seruice in a strange tongue, 1 Cor. 14. 15. &c.

r Sch. in Aug. de
Ciu. D. l. 20. c. 26.
Espenc. com. Tit. 1.
p. 42. Factum est
posterioribus se-
culis, vt quod
merito in Basili-
ensi Concilio, Ludouicus Arelatenfis querebatur: in concilijs id demum fiat, & necessario fiat, quod nationi placeat Italica: vt quae sola
Episcoporum, qui & ipsi soli vocem illuc decusum habent, numero nationes alias aequat, vel superet. Hac illa est tiel. na, quae nuper Tri-
denti obtinuit.

2. Ludouicus Viues^r a famous Papist, speaking of your Councils, saith; *Those onely seeme Councils to them (Romists) which make for their auantage: they esteeme the rest no better than a consent of women in a weaning house or com-
mon bath.*

T. W. *The men of Berhaa (who were no Christians) were allowed to try the doctrine of Saint Paul: Therefore euery Christian may examine, controll, and reiect the publike doctrine of the Church.*

Doctorlike inferred, as though there were no difference betweene him that is no Christian, and consequently acknowledgeth not any submission to the Church, and another, who is a Christian, and in his baptisme doth implicitly resigne himselfe and his iudgement to the authoritie of the Church.

Aug. c. Crescon. li.
2. c. 14. vide obli-
cro in quod preci-
pium compule-
rit homines angu-
stia, non inuenien-
di qua exierent.
Aug.
f. Antid. Ad. 17.
v. 11. Istos Thes-
salonicenses ante
hoc scrutinium ex
Scripturis factum
vere credidisse:
verba Lucæ mani-
festum faciunt, &c.
r Rhem. annot.
Ad. 17. n. 3.
o ei ipse testis
fuit, old test. Si
hæc ita se habe-
rent.
a Caietan. com.
Ad. 17. v. 11.
r Lorin. com.
Ad. 17. v. 11.

Ans. How many turnings and by-nookes are our Aduersaries forced to take, *Vt retia effugiant veritatis*, that they may slip besides the net of Gods truth?

1. Doctor Stapleton^r and the Rhemists^r affirme, that the Berhæans were Christians, and already beleueed Saint Pauls doctrine, and they searched the Scriptures onely to confirme their faith: but this answer is refelld by the letter of the Text, which saith, they searched the Scriptures, if these things, or whether these things were so^a. Cardinall Caietan^r saith: *They searched the Scriptures of the Prophets, to see whether the Gospell was conformable to them.*

2. This Popish Priest hath another deuice, mentioned by Lorinus^r the Iesuit, which is, that the Berhæans being not as yet beleueers, and thereupon owing no subiection to the Pastors of Christs Church, had a libertie of examining S. Pauls doctrine by the Scriptures, which beleueers haue not. But against this I obiekt.

1. That the Berhæans being before Profelytes and Iewes by profession, were implicitly obliged to the same obedience of the Church of Christ, when the doctrine thereof should be preached vnto them, as baptized Christians are: because the Prophets and Moses whom they beleueed, commanded the Iewes to follow Christ, whensoever he should come, Deut. 18. 18. Ioh. 1. 45. Act. 3. 21. and 7. 37.

2. Baptisme doth not absolutely tie Christians to obey the Romane Church, but to beleuee the faith of Iesus Christ, into whom they were baptized, and to embrace the doctrine of that or any other Church, so long as they preach that faith, Mar. 16. 15, 16. 1 Cor. 1. 13. But if they deliuer a contrarie doctrine, then the Sacrament of Baptisme, like an oath of allegiance, obligeth vs to adhere to Iesus Christ our King, and his written law; and to renounce Antichrist and other Traitors, who vnder the cloake of subiection to the Church, seeke to make vs rebels to Christ.

3. If the Berhæans, men not instructed in the religion of Christ, were able to examine and discern the truth of doctrine by the Scriptures, with spirituall profit to their soules; how much more may others doe the like?

4. If it were commendable in the Berhæans, when they doubted of Pauls preaching, to trie the truth of it by the Scriptures; why should it bee a discom-
mendation

menadation for Christians, when they are not assured of any doctrine, to make a like triall by the same meanes?

5. One principall reason why the Papists will not allow the faithfull to examine the Churches doctrine by the Scripture, is, because they haue onely a priuate spirit. But the Berhæans spirit was in like manner, and equally priuate: therefore they could haue no greater libertie of examining the Churches doctrine, than baptized Christians.

T. W. *With the like want of connexion or true reference, Master White presseth the testimonie of certaine ancient Fathers; and by name Chrysostome, &c. but the scope hereof, is onely to refute the doctrine of euery new sectarie, euen from the Scriptures, a course which we willingly admit and allow. Thus you see, our Minister is not ashamed to peruert and detort the graue authoritie of this Father.*

Ans. 1. You omit a cleere testimony of Basil^a, which expressly affirmeth; *That it becometh the hearers that are learned in the Scriptures, to try those things which are said by their Teachers, and receiuing that which agreeth with the Scriptures to reiect the contrary.* And your owne Gerson affirming the same, is also slipped over by you. Thus you haue eies and see not, &c.

^a Basil. sum. moral. def. 72. c. 1.

2. Chrysostome^b pursueth you harder than you will bee aknowne of. You wipe him off, *Leui brachio, with a slant a tow side*, saying, his scope is only to refute the doctrine of euery new sectarie, euen from the Scripture, &c. But he cometh point blanke vpon you, and teacheth; 1. That a Gentile by searching the Scriptures, may iudge of the truth of the doctrine of Christian Religion. 2. Amidst the diuersitie of opinions, a man hauing a minde and iudgement, may by hearing and reading be a Teacher to himselfe of that which is the truth. 3. That by the rule of the Scriptures, and by praier to God, who will reueale things to them that seeke him, people may easily finde out deceiuers, and such as lie. 4. He earnestly exhorteth lay men to search and vse the Scriptures, saying; *I beseech you to be in the ranke of Teachers, and not onely hearers of our sayings, &c.*

^b Chrys. hom. 33. in Act. in moral. Venit Gentilis ac dicit, &c. Cum Scripturas accipimus, & illæ sunt simplices & veræ, faciletibi (Gentilis) fuerit iudicare, &c. Dic mihi, mentem ne habes & iudicium? Quomodo possum nesciens, vestra iudicare? Discipulus fieri vellem, tu me doctorem facis. Si

empturus vestem, &c. non hæc verba dicis, &c. Recta ratione inquire à Deo, & omnia tibi reuelabit. Si regula esset, secundum quam omnes dirigi oportebat, non multo opus prætecto, sed male merentem, facile deprehenderemus: ita & nunc, &c. Chrys. prol. ep. ad Rom. Et vos silectioni cum animi alacritate volueritis attendere, nullo alio præterea opus habebitis. Verus enim est sermo Christi, cum dicit, Quærite & inuenietis, pulsate & aperietur vobis, Matth. 7. ^c Hom. 8. in Genes.

T. W. *Master White, under the shadow of ascribing all honor and reuerence to the Scriptures, &c. impugneth the venerable authoritie of the Church, and declineth the force of all authorities, deduced from the unanimous consent of Fathers, and oecumenicall Councils, &c.*

Ans. 1. It is maruell you will boast of an vnanimous consent of Fathers, when in many questions you haue not one euident testimonie of any ancient Father: also, why doe you so shamefully counterfeit and corrupt Fathers, if of themselves they be so cleere for you? 2. The fourth oecumenicall Council^d, verbally and vnanswerably controlleth the supremacy of the Pope, which is the basis of your Romane faith.

^d Chalced. Concil. Actio 6. E-quantissima fedid nouæ Romæ (Constantinopoli) privilegia tribuerunt, &c.

Paragr. 6. Concerning vnitie of Papists, &c.

T. W. *Master White as well knowing the force of vnitie in faith, seeing it is true that God is not the Author of dissention, but of peace, goeth about to shew, that Papists enioy not any vnitie and concord in their doctrine.*

Ans. Vnitie of faith in the primitiue Articles, after they be once reuealed, is simply necessarie, *necessitate medijs*, as a requisite meanes to saluation: and vni-

tic

tie in other Articles is needfull, in desire, *necessitate finis*, as a marke whereunto Christians must aime, and come as neere as they can. Howsoever it is possible, that among holy men * difference of iudgement may be, without the maine breach of vnitie in faith: neither is euery difference of opinion a dissolution of vnitie ^f.

* Aug. de Ciu. Dei. l. 15. c. 5. & in Psal. 83. Chryf. 2. Cor. hom. 18.

f Cyrian and the Rom. differing about baptism. Aug. de bapt. cont. Don. l. 1. c. 18. Aug. cont. Iulian. l. 1. c. 2. Greg. Naz. apol. fugz. Chryf. 2. Cor. hom. 27. Sicut bestie diffidimus. Arboreus Theoph. l. 5. c. 10. Sapenunero contingit vt inter viros pios atque doctos, non conueniat de eadem re, &c.

T. W. *If Master White or any other man can proue, that Papists haue no vnitie in doctrine, it greatly aduantageh his cause.*

g Rhenanus. Auct. tin. annal. l. 5. pa. 386. Facilius inter horologia, quam inter Theologos conueniet.

h Possuin. appar. Tho. Aqu. Expuncta sunt in iisdem commentarijs, &c. Bellar. de amiss. grat. l. 5. c. 5. Sanctus Thomas, quē impij Catholici sequuntur. Innocent. 3. ser. Receptus quā Salomō hic. Scripturis cunctis exceptis Canonis præponit.

i Can. loc. lib. 6. cap. 1. Alph. Castr. cont. her. l. 1. c. 4. Gerson, Adrian. Almain. Thom. Walden. Gratian. eund. by Alex. p. 1. instit. mor. l. 5. c. 4. Bellar. de Pont. l. 4. c. 2.

k Arbor. Theoph. l. 5. c. 5. Ecclesia fundata est super petram, non super Petrum.

l Apol. præfat. §. 20, 21, 22, &c. m Sander. visib. monarch. l. 2. c. 4.

n Rel. c. 3. q. 5. ar. 2. concl. 3 p. 393. Bellar. de Pont. l. 5. c. 7. Azor. instit. mor. to. 1. l. 8. c. 12.

o p. 2. l. 12. c. 5. Greg. Val. tom. 3. pag. 570. Victoria. Bannes. Sixtus Senens. Bosius de sig. Baron. annal. tom. 11. pa. 302.

p Stapl. Rel. c. 4. q. 2 ad 5. & qu. 5. p. 495. Giesl. def. Bel. de Script. p. 1515. 1042. 3443, &c.

q Dried. de dog. eccl. l. 2. c. 3. Concedimus maiorem esse auctoritatem sacra Scriptura, quam Ecclesia quā nunc est in terra, &c.

r Dried. ib. p. 55. q. Suarez. tom. 3. d. 65. Henriq. sum. mor. l. 8. c. 32. Greg. Val. to. 4. d. 6. q. 11. p. 2.

s Stapl. Prompt. Cath. p. 2. ser. Epiphani. p. 29. Sacramentis conferre gratiam non est illis instrumentis; et sic Physicall. Comick. pa. 43. 46, &c.

Ans. Doctor White in his 24 Digression, hath proued this: 1. By the confession of some of your Doctors, charging the Schoole-men with as great discord as was among the Heathen ^e. 2. By particular examples of the aduerse and contradictious writing of your Doctors one against another, in sundry questions. 3. By your purging of former Papists workes, of such assertions as bee repugnant to your moderne stile. *In doing whereof, you haue not spared Thomas himselfe ^h, the grand pillar of the Lateran Church.*

Now in his answer to this matter of discord: 1. The Priest omitteth such testimonies as are pregnant, and concerne the principall and weightie Articles. 2. He salues the former imputation of discord, saying, that the contentions are in points scholasticke, and not defined by the Church.

But against this Apron of fig-leaues, I oppose the examples following.

1. These positions: *The Pope cannot erre in his definitiue sentence*; and the contrary, *The Pope may erre in his definitiue sentence*, containe a weightie article of Poperie; and yet each of these positions, are contradictiously maintained by the Popish schoole ⁱ.

The Church was builded on Peter, the Church is not builded on Peter but vpon the Rock, are contradictiously maintained ^k.

2. The Popes temporall authoritie ouer Kings and Monarchs; his dispensations and prohibitions about the oath of Allegiance; his banning, bulling, binding, blading, suborning, and the rest, are more than scholasticall litigations. The falling and rising of the greatest powers in Israel; the safetie or confusion of Common-wealths and States dependeth thereupon: and yet in this matter (being plainly determined by the written word of God, and by the tradition and vnanimous consent of the *Primitiue Church*, and all Catholike Doctors in the world, vntill the age of Hildebrand, a famous incendiarie and root of the gall and wormewood of rebellion in the Clergie) both our homeborne and forreine Babylonians, are rent and diuided.

And omitting others, Master Blackwell the Arch-priest, and the scarlet roabed Iesuit haue lately beene in open conflict, concerning this question; and Master Briarly ^l, washing his hands from the powder-treason, solemnly propugneth the royall authoritie against the priestly vsurpation: but in this assertion he is opposite ^m to Doctor Stapleton ⁿ, and sundry other English Priests, and also gain-sayerh the most accomplished Doctors of the moderne Roman Church, in Italy, Spaine, Germanie ^o, &c.

3. Our Aduersaries thwart and contradict each other, concerning the authoritie of the Church and Scriptures. Some, and those most respected, giue the precedency to the Romane Church; others preferre the Scripture ^p.

Some Papists esteeme the originall Texts of Scripture, and make them the authenticke rule ^q. But a great number exalt the Latine vulgar, &c.

Suarez, Henriquez, &c. maintaine the diuine Adoration of the *Sacramentall Elements* ^r, but Stapleton ^s denies. And in the question of iustification, merit, satisfaction, freewill, &c. the discord betweene them is such, that some of their

Tenets differ nothing from vs, but onely in termes and manner of speaking; but according to others, the difference is so wide, that it admitteth no reconciliation.

I omit your different Tenet concerning the conception of the Virgin Marie, and touching reprobation, sufficient grace, adoration of Images.

T. W. *Against praier in an unknowne tongue, he alleageth Cantarenus^c, saying, The Praiers which men vnderstand not, want the fruit which they should reape. But what kinde of Logicke is this, Praier for some particular reasons, is better in a vulgar tongue than in a strange; Ergo, it is absolutely vnlawfull in a strange tongue?* ^c Contaren. Chrit. instr. p. 212.

Ans. In stead of your conclusion, Therefore it is absolutely vnlawfull, I pray you substitute Doctor Whites conclusion, which is, Therefore the same is vnlawfull, as it is commanded by the Romane Church: and the Authors produced by him, will in good Logicke confirme his assertion: For thus I reason.

That forme of praier is vnlawfull, which depriueth people of the fruit of their particular intention to God, and their owne edification. But praier in an vnknowne tongue, prescribed by the Romane Church, doth thus: *Ergo*, it is vnlawfull.

The maior proposition is Saint Pauls, 1 Cor. 14. as he is expounded by the primitiue Fathers, and by Haimo, Lira, &c. The assumption is vpon the matter, deliuered by Cardinali Contarenus, Caietan, Thomas^d, &c.

^c Caietan. som. 1 Cor. 14. Hac Pauli doctrina habetur, quod melius est ad edificationem ecclesie, orationes publicas, quae audiente populo dicuntur, dici lingua communi clericis & populo, quam Latine. Tho. Aqu. com. 1 Cor. 14. lect. 3. Plus liceturi, qui orat & intelligit, quam qui lingua tantum orat, &c. Chrys. de fide. Annae, hom. 2. Illa potissimum est deprecatio, quum ab intimis vocis solum feruntur, haec praecipue mentis est exercitatio, non intentione vocis, sed animi seuore precationem absoluerit. Vide Caland. Leisung. c. 36.

T. W. *He bringeth in Thomas Aquine and Caietan affirming, that it were better for the edification of the Church, if praier were in a vulgar tongue: but what Catholike denies this, if he haue onely respect to the edification and instruction of the hearers, and nothing else? But publike praiers are directed to other ends.*

Ans. 1. It is certaine, that Caietan opposeth the practise of the Romane Church, because Catharinus^e the Archbishop doth so grieuouly censure him, saying; *That the doctrine which his words imply, was inuented of Luther and the Devil.* 2. Thomas and Caietan, by edification, vnderstand not onely instruction, but also inflaming of the desire and affection vnto deuotion; and those praiers which haue both these effects, are more profitable than praiers in a strange tongue, wanting the same.

T. W. *For the euacuating of the force and operation of confession of sins, he bringeth in Caietan, saying; A man by contrition without any confession is made cleane, and a formall member of the Church.*

Ans. Doctor White in this place speaketh not of euacuating confession, but onely affirmeth, that Papists haue diuers opinions about the same, which is true. For some say, that it is onely an institution of the Church^f; others, it is not prescribed in holy Scripture, but by tradition^g; others, it is of the law of nature; and others, that it was ordained in the old Law^h. But if the institution thereof and precept of Godⁱ, concerning the same be vncertaine, then the necessitie of a desire and purpose thereof to be included in contrition, is vncertaine.

^e Petr. Oxom. quem citat Suar. 4. d. 35. f. 1. Hug. Viët de Sac. l. 2. p. 14. Tho. Wald. de Sac. tom. 2. c. 135. Wil. de Rabiou. 4. d. 14. q. 1. ^f Suar. 4. d. 35. §. 1. Neque in ipsa contritione includi votum confessionis, secluso precepto.

T. W. *Touching iustification by workes, which according to our Catholike doctrine are to be done in the state of grace, and deriue their worth not from the*

the worker, but from the promise of God, as also from the blood of our Saviour, &c.

Ans. The learnedst of your Church deny, that workes receiue dignitie from the promise of God, affirming it to be Catholike doctrine, that they haue their perfect value and dignitie by their first production, before any promise of God be added vnto them^b.

^b Reads before
part. 1. chap. 1.
paragr. 2.

T. W. The seuerall opinions of (Roman) Catholikes, about secundarie questions of Transubstantiation, are onely points of indifferency, Philosophicall questions disputed in the schooles, and by seuerall men, seuerally maintained without any breach of faith; where as diuisions in doctrine among the Protestants are such, as doe wound the soundnesse of faith.

Ans. Our Aduersaries are in extremities; for many times they will haue the smallest matter in religion an article of Faith, to wit, That Tobias his dogge had a taile^c, but at another time, great differences^e in maine questions of Theologie, are but scholasticall contentions. And thus it is verified of them, which Augustine saith of the Donatists, *Quod volumus sanctum est, & quando volumus, &c.* They make our differences in accessorie points, fundamentall, and their owne in the same kinde, accidentall.

But in their doctrine of Transubstantiation, there is a reall difference between the elder and moderne Papists.

The elder affirmed, that the flesh of Christ was made of the bread^d; and the substance of Bread and Wine, were conuered into the substance of the bodie and blood of Christ^e. And hereupon they called a Priest a Creator of his Maker^f. Yea, the Trident Councell^g saith: *There is a conversion of the whole substance of bread into the substance of the bodie of Christ, &c.* But Bellarmine, and Becanus affirme, that the bread is not made the bodie of Christ, and the conuerion thereof into Christs bodie, is by way of Addition^h, and not production.

But this opinion changeth the old definition of Transubstantiation, & in stead of a conuerion of one substance into another, bringeth in a translocation or position of one substance in the roome of anotherⁱ, and conioyneth Christs body with the signes, but transubstantiates not the signes into his bodie.

2. The old Popish faith concerning the reall presence, was, that the body and blood of our Lord Iesus Christ, are verily, and indeed handled and broken in the Priests hands, and ground or chewed in the teeth of the faithfull^k, and not onely the Sacrament hereof: but Bellarmine denies this faith^l, saying; *That attrition or grinding of Christs bodie in the teeth, is not necessarie, but only the taking thereof into the mouth, and swallowing it downe whole into the stomach.* And if they will colour Pope Nicholas his definition, saying with the Glossator, that his speech is figuratiue, they depart from their owne principles; who when wee speake of admitting a figure in the Sacrament, exclude the same with all reproach, calling vs Tropists Sacramentaries, &c.

^c Tanner. Iesuit colloq. Ratisb. sess. 11. pag. 353.
^d Flores. Theolog. quest. in l. 4. tent. q. 5. ar. 1. An panis in corpus Christi conuertatur? Resp. Quatuor sunt opiniones. Prima est Durandi, qui omnino negat Transubstantiationem. Secunda est Caicani, affirmat panem transubstantiari in corpus Christi, concedit nihilominus, rem quæ erat panis, manere, & esse corpus Christi. Hæc est omnino fugienda; ex ea enim sequitur conuerionem istam in corpus Christi non esse transubstantiationem.
^e Lomb. 4. d. 8. Ex pane fit corpus Christi, & vinum fit sanguis d. 10. De pane fit caro Christi.
^f Extr. de sum. Trin. tit. 1. & cap. Cum Marthæ.
^g Biel in Can. Miss. l. 2. c. 4. ser. discip. f. 111. cited by Bishop Jewel, repl. ar. 11. pag. 452.
^h Trid. Concil. sess. 13. c. 4.
ⁱ Bellar. de Euchar. l. 1. c. 11. & l. 1. c. 18. & de Miss. l. 1. c. 27. Becanus de Euchar. Cath. c. 3. Secus 4. d. 10. q. 6. & q. 1. quantum ergo ad istud. & d. 11. q. 3. 9. Mairo. d. 10. q. 1. Argentin. q. 2. ar. ultimo. Gabr. ar. 2. concl. 10. & l. 2. c. 47. Okam. q. 6. Aliaco q. 5. ar. 1. Marfil. q. 8. ar. 2. concl. 7. & 8. Paludan. d. 11. q. 3. ar. 2. n. 24. Claudius Repet. 7. c. 2. 6. 1. Suar. 3. d. 75. §. 4. Per solam actionem adductum reuera non explicatur vera conuerio substantialis & transubstantiatio, sed solum translocatio quadam. Quando vna substantia solum succedit loco alterius, non potest proprie dici, vna conueri in aliam. Henriquez sum. li. 8. ca. 24. si actio esset tantum adductiva & per accidens adiungitur definitio panis, sequitur, mutationem hanc, non esse substantialem, sed accidentalem ad nouum vbi.
^k De consecr. d. 2. c. Ego Berengarius. Sensualiter non solum Sacramentum: sed in veritate manibus sacerdotum tractari, frangi, & fidelium dentibus atteri. Guzman. d. sacram. in principio. l. 1. 1. De Euchar. l. 1. c. 11.

FINIS.

THE INDEX.

A



<i>Resolution of sins, pag.</i>	126
<i>Adoration of Images.</i>	110. 152
<i>Adoration of the Virgin Marie.</i>	109
<i>Adoration of sacramentall signes.</i>	161
<i>Augustine of inherent iustice, that it is imperfect.</i>	6
<i>Custodie of Angels.</i>	27
<i>Adoration of the crosse.</i>	29
<i>Appeales.</i>	38
<i>Antichrist.</i>	124
<i>Attrition.</i>	126
<i>Author of sinna.</i>	103. 145

B

<i>Bellarmino about merits.</i>	4
<i>Bernard no Trent Papiſt.</i>	146
<i>Bishops and Priests remove finnes.</i>	126
<i>Bishops to appoint and direct the meanes for expounding Scripture.</i>	68

C

<i>Candles in day time at burials.</i>	35
<i>Canonick houres.</i>	33
<i>Church may erre.</i>	38
<i>Churches viſibility and inviſibility.</i>	41
	42. 127. 149. 179. 180.
<i>Churches perpetuities.</i>	44. 150
<i>Churches notes.</i>	45. 47
<i>Churches authoritie.</i>	74. 61
<i>Churches office in expounding Scripture.</i>	67
<i>Churches ministry in delivering Scripture, and leading people to it.</i>	121. 178
<i>Concord of iust men imperfect.</i>	132
<i>Conversion of England and other countries.</i>	154. 155
<i>Concupiscence.</i>	12
<i>Contrarieties in Popery.</i>	73
<i>Contrition.</i>	94
<i>Council of Elberis.</i>	115
<i>Confession auricular.</i>	142
<i>Councils made ſubiect to the Pope.</i>	156
	186
<i>Crosse whether adored.</i>	29
<i>Signe of the Crosse.</i>	ib.
<i>Cyprian touching Appeales.</i>	38
<i>Cyprian condemneth the Popes iudgement.</i>	59
<i>Cyprian touching Scripture.</i>	62

D

<i>Discord of Papiſts.</i>	131
<i>Devils tormented.</i>	30

E

<i>Englands conversion.</i>	154
<i>English Letyrgie.</i>	128
<i>Eucharist.</i>	158. 161

F

<i>Fathers.</i>	118. 120
<i>Fasting.</i>	32. 33. 87. 143
<i>Frier Francis his wounds.</i>	149
<i>Friers prodigious habit.</i>	32
<i>Formall cause of iustification.</i>	3. 4

G

<i>Gregory the Great about Images.</i>	113
<i>No Trent Papiſt.</i>	130
<i>He denied ſupremacy.</i>	137

H

<i>Whether Hierom a Papiſt.</i>	24
<i>Hypocriſie of Popiſh fasting.</i>	33
<i>Hairecloth.</i>	32
<i>Holy water.</i>	

I

<i>Ignorance and implicite faith.</i>	24
<i>Iudges of Contrarieties.</i>	62. 73
<i>Images.</i>	110. 152
<i>Inherent iustice.</i>	10. 18
<i>Formall cause of iustification.</i>	3. 4
<i>Invocation of Saints.</i>	25
<i>Inherent iustification forſaken by Papiſts.</i>	15
<i>Iustification.</i>	10

L

<i>Lines of Protestants not deteſted.</i>	139
<i>Lay men no expoſitors of Scripture.</i>	21
<i>No Iudges of Contrarieties.</i>	184
<i>Lay men reading the ſcripture.</i>	21
<i>Luther his liſe.</i>	164

M

<i>Merie of condignitie.</i>	17. 18
<i>Primitive Fathers of Merit.</i>	19
<i>Confidence in Merit.</i>	5
<i>Maſſe.</i>	157. 159
<i>Matrimonic of the Clergie.</i>	88. 151
<i>Markes of the Church.</i>	45. 48
<i>Mortall finnes deſtroied as well as pardoned.</i>	9
<i>Monastiſcall liſe.</i>	30
<i>Miracles.</i>	91. 111
<i>Francis his Miracles.</i>	148
<i>Feigned Miracles.</i>	147

INDEX.

O		
Obiect of faith.	177	Scriptures edifie all sorts of people.
Blinde Obedience.	66	no cause of heresie to lay men more than to Priests.
P		21
Papall usurpation ouer Princes.	82	Sense, and interpretation thereof.
& Epist. Dedicat.		94
Papalutius of Matrimonie.	86	Scripture acknowledged the onely rule by
Peters chaire.	59	Papists. 75. in what sense the onely
Perpetuitie of the Church.	43. 150	rule. 70. 75. the sole principle of faith.
Pilgrimage.	28	177
Popes warres.	69	Service in a strange tongue.
Whether the Pope may make a Creed.	56	36
Popes authoritie.	57. 156	Schismes of Popes.
Popes supremacie.	134	55
Popes iudgement.	63	Prophane speeches of Papists about the
Popes vitious deeds.	63	Scripture.
Popes unlearned.	65	63. 175
Promise of grace whether vniuersall.	125	Scriptures containe the grounds of their
Protestants faith perpetuall.	112	owne exposition.
Providence of God about sinne.	103. 105	70
Powerty.	31	Their perfection.
Private spirit.	184	171. &c.
R		Single life of the Popish Clergie, and
Rhemish translation.	1	the impuritie thereof.
Reward of workes.	2. 17	89. 142
Remission of sinnes.	3. 9. 126	Simes veniall and mortall.
Reliques of Saints.	39	14. 34. 102
Roman Church changed into a temporall		Difference of sinne acknowledged by
Monarchie.	82	Tertullian.
Reprobation.	108	2
Rome in what sense a principall Church.	59	Some sinnes neuer forgiven until they be
Reading Scripture. See Scripture.		forfaken.
S		9
Sanctitie.		Succession.
Satisfactions. 96. how farre admitted by		51. 52. 163
Protestants. 97. and by Primusius		Synodus a Bishop his marriage.
Fathers.	97	85
Some Papists receive satisfactions of con-		T
firmities.	98	Temporall punishment of sinnes.
Sacrifice whether it agree to the Eucha-		124
rist.	158	Traditions. 75. in what manner admis-
Sacraments efficiency according to the Sa-		ted by Protestants. 76. 121. See 170
uites.	126	174. &c.
Scripture, and the reading of the same.	20. & 37	Transubstantiation.
Apocryphall Scripture.	123	93. 153. 196
St. Hierom requireth reading of Scrip-		Translation of Scripture.
ture.	12	130
Roman Church depriveth people of rea-		Trial of doctrine.
ding Scripture.	23	182. 187
V		
Pardon of Veniall sinne, by what means		
procured.	9	
Vicious lines of Papists.	149	
Visibilite of the Church.	42. 127. 149	
Virtue.	133	
Vniuersalitie.	52	
Voluntarie penitentie.	31	
W		
Wasser Cakes.	161	
Protestants faith about good Workes.	16. &c.	
Workes whether meritorious.	1	
They impetrate diuine fauour.	16. 18	
what manner they purge sinne.	ib.	
Women reading Scriptures.	28	
Worshipping of Saints.	25	
Z		
Zwinglius and the Heluetian Ministers		
touching marriage.	140	

FINIS.

